



Fighting Corruption in the Education Sector:

Methods, Tools and Good Practices

An Advance Copy of
UNDP Commissioned Study

Authors: John Wood & Laetitia Antonowicz¹

October 2010

¹ The authors are affiliated with the “Education for Change (EfC)”, an independent consulting and research company with an active portfolio of work in the UK and internationally. The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of UNDP. This study was commissioned by the Democratic Governance Group of the Bureau for Development Policy, UNDP. This is an advance copy published to solicit inputs and comments from anti-corruption and development practitioners. For more information, please contact: pacde@undp.org.



Contents

1 Introduction..... 1

1.1 About this report..... 1

1.2 Overview..... 1

1.2.1 Towards the MDGs 1

1.2.2 Governance and corruption 2

1.2.3 Special issues for the study in the education sector..... 4

1.3 Corruption in the development discourse..... 5

2 Methodology..... 5

2.1 Scope..... 5

2.2 Sources..... 6

2.2.1 Limitation 6

3 Overview of documents..... 7

3.1 Types of documents 7

3.2 Classification..... 7

4 Findings..... 9

4.1 Rule of law/integrity 9

4.1.1 Legislation 9

4.1.2 Sanctions..... 10

4.1.3 Codes of Conduct 11

4.2 Public administration and systems reforms..... 12

4.2.1 Better financial systems..... 12

4.2.2 Better systems–independence and externality..... 16

4.2.3 Better IT for administration..... 19

4.3 Transparency and accountability..... 20

4.3.1 Advocacy and awareness-raising 20

4.3.2 Anti-corruption education 21

4.3.3 More open and transparent systems or procedures..... 22

4.3.4 Participatory monitoring and social accountability..... 23

4.3.5 Information and the use of media and information technology..... 26

4.3.6 Initiatives to curb teacher absenteeism 27

4.3.7 Surveys 27

4.4 Capacity development 29

4.5 Development aid to education 30

5 Conclusions..... 30

5.1 Gaps in the reportin 30

5.2 Context matters..... 31

Annex 1. Internet sources 32

Annex 2. Bibliography 34

Annex 3. Draft TORs for the country studies 42



Abbreviations and Acronyms

CEF	Commonwealth Education Fund
CIMU	Central Independent Monitoring Unit
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
DFID	UK Department for International Development
DP	Development Partner
EFA	Education for All
EMIS	Education Management Information System (see Glossary)
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (German Society for Technical Cooperation)
IMF	International Monetary Fund
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MTBF	Medium Term Budget Framework
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
Norad	Norwegian Agency for Development
NTRCA	National Teacher Registration and Certification Agency (Bangladesh)
PETS	Public Expenditure Tracking Survey
PFM	Public Financial Management
QSDS	Quality Service Delivery Survey
SMC	School Management Committee
SWAps	Sector Wide Approach
TA	Technical Assistance
TI	Transparency International
TMIS	Teacher Management Information System (see Glossary)
UNCAC	United National Convention against Corruption
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UPE	Universal Primary Education
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WARO	West Africa Regional Office
WCARO	West and Central Africa Regional Office

Glossary

EMIS: Education Management Information System	The ways in which management data on the education sector are collected, analysed and made available to administrators, policy makers and others. Normally uses computerised data storage and transmission and sometimes the term is used to describe the replacement of manual systems.
Formal education etc ² .	<p><i>Formal education:</i> the hierarchically structured, chronologically graded 'education system', running from primary school through the university and including, in addition to general academic studies, a variety of specialised programmes and institutions for full-time technical and professional training.</p> <p><i>Non-formal education:</i> any organised educational activity outside the established formal system - whether operating separately or as an important feature of some broader activity - that is intended to serve identifiable learning clientele and learning objectives.</p> <p><i>Informal education:</i> the truly lifelong process whereby every individual acquires attitudes, values, skills and knowledge from daily experience and the educative influences and resources in his or her environment - from family and neighbours, from work and play, from the market place, the library and the mass media.</p>
Parents-Teachers Association (PTA)	Normally used for group with less management responsibility than the SMC but providing a forum for discussion on school practices and for parents to organise support to schools.
School Management Committee (SMC) and school boards	Normally used for the group with management and oversight responsibilities for schools, which may include planning and financial oversight. Characteristically representation of school community, including parents and, increasingly, children. Roles and representativeness vary enormously between countries.
TMIS: Teacher Management Information System	The ways in which management data for teachers are collected and used, including for payment and career assessment.
Universal Primary Education (UPE)	Where all children attend primary school. Commonly used to identify policy actions, notably the abolition of fees, intended to encourage full enrolment.

² These, essentially administrative definitions come from Combs with Prosser and Ahmed (1973), based on the influential Faure report, *Learning to Be*, Unesco (1972). For extended discussion see, for example, <http://www.infed.org/biblio/b-nonfor.htm>.

1 Introduction

1.1 About this report

This report is a desk review of tools and methods to tackle corruption in the education sector. It was commissioned by the UNDP Global Thematic Programme on Anti-Corruption for Development Effectiveness (PACDE), as one of three such sector studies, the other two being in the health and water sectors. The reviews are to inform a series of regional/local studies on anti-corruption practices in the education sector and inform an analysis of the drivers and conditions for good practice and their replication.

The report follows a desk review of documents, including reports of anti-corruption interventions, academic papers and others, and consultations with an expert group.

1.2 Overview

1.2.1 Towards the MDGs

Corruption hinders efforts to achieve Education for All (EFA) goals (Box 1) and the education based Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) (Box 2) by diverting resources away from investments in infrastructure, institutions and distorting incentives for quality service delivery.

Box 1: Education for All goals

EFA goals

1. Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children.
2. Ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to and complete, free and compulsory primary education of good quality.
3. Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life-skills programmes.
4. Achieving a 50 per cent improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.
5. Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.
6. Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognised and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills.

The anti-poverty MDGs Goals 2 and 3 are directly related to education: the indicators for Goal 2 focus on the completion rates for primary education, those for Goal 3 include eliminating gender disparities in education, with a 2005 target for schools. The MDGs are central to assistance frameworks and programmes, including the poverty reduction strategies and have framed development cooperation in the education since 2000.

Box 2: MDGs

Millennium Development Goals for 2015

1. Halving extreme poverty and hunger
2. Achieving universal primary education
3. Achieving gender equality
4. Reducing child mortality by two-thirds
5. Reducing maternal mortality by three-quarters

- 6. Reversing the spread of HIV/AIDS, malaria and other major diseases
- 7. Ensuring environmental sustainability
- 8. Creating a global partnership for development

Goal 2 of the MDGs-achieving universal primary education-can imply increasing the capacity of the school network with facilities and learning resources, tacking disincentives to enrolment (particularly the costs) and ensuring services are delivered. They require increased financial commitments for expansion and operation, additional teachers and administrators and outreach to marginalized groups. The additional procurement, staff employment and deployment and additional demands on any systems for oversight increase the risks of corrupt practice and highlight the threat that corruption could present to achieving the MDGs.

In most countries the education sector is one of the largest beneficiaries of public finance and employers of public servants, all activities that are at risk. Education is also a human right for the individual and is critical for social, economic and political development of societies. The potential impact of corruption is therefore high.

1.2.2 Governance and corruption

In the discourse following the MDGs and in pursuit of MDG 8's global partnership, broadly defined "good governance" has been recognised as an important (perhaps necessary) pre-condition for the achievement of EFA and the education-specific MDGs.³ Governance concerns the way that those with the power and responsibility exercise it- their democratic processes, accountabilities, administrative efficiency, the rule of law, participation and fairness. Definitions vary slightly (Box 3) but, interestingly, none mention corruption *per se* although all point to a state of affairs inimitable to corrupt practices by government and its agents.

Box 3: Some definitions of governance

Some definitions of governance

"GOVERNANCE is the exercise of political, economic and administrative authority to manage a nation's affairs. It is the complex mechanisms, processes and institutions through which citizens and groups articulate their interests, exercise their legal rights and obligations, and mediate their differences." (UNDP)

"GOVERNANCE is the manner in which power is exercised in the management of a country's social and economic resources for development. Governance means the way those with power use that power." (ADB)

GOVERNANCE is "... the traditions and institutions by which authority in a country is exercised for the common good. This includes (i) the process by which those in authority are selected, monitored and replaced, (ii) the capacity of the government to effectively manage its resources and implement sound policies, and (iii) the respect of citizens and the state for the institutions that govern economic and social interactions among them." (World Bank)

Definitions of "corruption" have proved problematic, particularly in formal and legal documents⁴. The UNDP Anti-Corruption Practice Note of 2004, referring back to a policy paper approved by the Executive Committee in 1998 defines corruption as: *the misuse of public power, office or authority for private benefit – through bribery, extortion, influence*

³ EFA Global Monitoring Report, Unesco , Oxford 2009 is the most thorough exploration of the issues

⁴ See for example the discussion in UNODC, (2004) Anti-Corruption Toolkit

peddling, nepotism, fraud, speed money or embezzlement. Although corruption is often considered a sin of government and public servants, it also prevails in the private sector.

Transparency International have encapsulated this in their work as: *the abuse of entrusted power for private gain*. These definitions are adequate for this review of the education sector...

Corruption in the education sector takes many forms and may occur at national, sub-national and institutional levels. The examples of corrupt practices in different arenas of educational planning and management in Table 1 are not exhaustive but show the range of risk and locus of corrupt practice that have been identified by commentators.⁵

Table 1 Corrupt practices in the education sector

Areas	Corrupt practices
Finance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transgressing rules/procedures; • Inflation of costs and activities in budget estimates • Embezzlement
Specific allowances (fellowships, subsidies, etc.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Favouritism, nepotism • Bribes • Bypassing criteria • Discrimination (political, social, ethnic)
Construction, maintenance and school repairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fraud in public tendering • Collusion among suppliers • Embezzlement • Manipulating data • Bypass of school mapping • Ghost deliveries
Distribution of equipment, furniture and material (incl. Transport, boarding, textbooks, canteens and school meals)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fraud in public tendering • Collusion among suppliers • Siphoning of school supplies • Purchase of unnecessary equipment • Bypass of allocation criteria • Manipulating data • Ghost deliveries
Writing of textbooks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fraud in the selection of authors (favouritism, bribes, gifts) • Bypass of copyright law • Students forced to buy materials copyrighted by instructor
Teacher appointment, management, payment and training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fraud in the appointment and deployment of teachers (favouritism, bribes, gifts) • Discrimination (political, social, ethnic) • Falsification of credentials/ use of fake diplomas • Bypass of criteria • Pay delay, sometimes with unauthorised reductions
Teacher/school staff behaviour (professional misconduct)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ghost teachers • Absenteeism • Illegal fees (for school entrance, exams, assessment, private tutoring, etc.) • Favouritism/nepotism/acceptance of gifts • Discrimination (political, social, ethnic) • Private tutoring (including use of schools for private purpose)

⁵ A more extensive list of governance risks in Guidance Note: Education Sector Risk Assessment (ADB, 2010), reflects these corruption risk areas within other sector governance concerns.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sexual harassment or exploitation • Bribes or favours during inspector visits
Information systems	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Manipulating data to misrepresent • Selecting/suppressing information • Irregularity in producing and publishing information • Payment for information that should be provided free
Examinations and diplomas, access to universities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Selling exam information • Examination fraud (impersonation, cheating, favouritism, gifts) • Bribes (for high marks, grades, selection to specialized programmes, diplomas, admission to universities) • Diploma mills and false credentials • Fraudulent research, plagiarism
Institution accreditation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fraud in the accreditation process (favouritism, bribes, gifts)

Source: Hallack, Poisson (2007)⁶

1.2.3 Special issues for the study in the education sector

Formal vs non-formal⁷

The MDGs have focussed attention on formal schooling, normally in the public sector, whilst much education is offered by non-formal providers, especially for pre-school and out-of school children. The review has found no documented analysis of specific corruption risks or anti-corruption measures outside the formal schooling system and academic tertiary education. The administrative and governance contexts of these sub-sectors vary between countries: in many cases they are outside the purview of the national government, subject to limited oversight and, in most cases, they have been marginalized in development initiatives since the MDGs, which have focused on formal schooling.

Similarly the review found no documented analysis of the risks of corruption, or anti-corruption measures, in private schools. In view of the expansion of private provision in many countries, the risk in relationships where public subsidy is directed at private providers, and the increasing ideological support for privatisation in education development discourse, private provision merits more attention.

Decentralisation

The education sector has witnessed substantial initiatives, often driven by development partners, to decentralise management responsibilities, decision-making and financial administration to sub-national and institutional levels. Much of the literature of good-governance in education, and that of more explicit anti-corruption approaches, is within the context of decentralisation in general and introduction of block or capitation grants to schools. Such grants provide financing-a fixed lump sum or an amount proportional to student numbers, respectively-to be used as they decide often in keeping with a participatory school plan.

The World Bank, for example, has strongly promoted this modality, driven by a wider governance agenda for community accountability and participation but with expectations of

⁶ Hallack, J. Poisson, M. (2007) Corrupt schools, corrupt universities: What can be done? International Institute for Educational Planning. IIEP UNESCO.

⁷ Informal education may be offered with flexible hours, with a tailored/flexible curriculum in various setting and cater for particular need groups of children or adults.

reduced leakage (and improved performance in other risk areas) because of local oversight and accountability systems. In that sense, educational decentralisation and school-based management is perhaps the commonest approach to reducing corruption (amongst its other governance aims) in the allocation and utilisation of educational finance, and teacher behaviour. However, it is no panacea: parent and communities groups can be captured by corrupting forces or may lack capacity to exercise an effective oversight function.

Politicised corruption

As a major public service, education is properly a focus of political concern and influence. However, political allegiances can corrupt transactions, for example as a requirement in appointments or promotions, or to distort sanctions for corrupt behaviour. Such interference is widely reported in Bangladesh for example with its highly politicised bureaucracy.⁸

1.3 Corruption in the development discourse

The goals of universal education, the EFA initiative and the MDGs have increased the prioritisation, including funds, directed to education by development partners. Harmonisation and partnership initiatives arising for the Paris Declaration have increased the external imperatives to demonstrate proper use of funds and management of facilities and personnel. Partners have become more willing to recognise and discuss corruption openly and develop approaches to tackling it.

2 Methodology

2.1 Scope

The document review considers methodologies and anti-corruption initiatives within the education sector, taken to include primary⁹, secondary and post-secondary education in the formal and informal, public and private sectors. It is recognised that most of the available material is likely to pertain to the formal public sector as this has been the focus of development within the MDGs.

Although the emphasis is on the MDGs, and therefore mostly on primary education, the review encompasses methods and approaches used at secondary and tertiary level.

The review does not consider initiatives that have sought to improve governance at macro or national level, such as improved procurement laws or national anti-corruption agencies, which normally result from separate legislation or regulation without sector-specific focus. The review does consider national level initiatives that have taken specific steps to address corruption in education, including sector-specific responses to overarching corruption legislation for example.

The review does not seek to explore the special circumstances of post-conflict and fragile states in which the focus is on developing the organisational and institutional capacity to deliver education.

⁸ See for example *Developing a Risk-Reduction Strategy, on Financial Management and Governance PEDP2*, 2003. Wood, Hye, Shrivastava

⁹ Early childhood education is not within the scope of the review.

There is no time period for the review although little material dating from before 2000 was identified in the documentation, which indicates how the area of study and discussion has grown since that date.

2.2 Sources

A collection of documentation was collected and catalogued taking advantage of several “consolidating” websites. For reference these are listed in Annex 1. These, and follow-up of primary references in key publications, have provided around one hundred documents that include academic papers, agency strategies, methods and practices, and experiences reported from specific projects or countries.

2.2.1 Limitation

The literature specifically addressing anti-corruption initiatives in the education sector (as opposed to analysing the corruption risks) is thin. Whilst there are canonical case studies, and these are repeatedly cited, there remain too few documented examples of methods or tools from which to generalise.

There is of course a recognised difficulty in finding quantitative information about corruption and its impact, and the same must apply to anti-corruption measures. However, this apparent shortage of evidence concerning methods and tools in the education sector suggests the need for more research and analyses of anti-corruption initiatives.

Independent initiatives

The document search found few reports of national initiatives by governments or Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) other than those that have been reported and disseminated by the international agencies. Small, technical anti-corruption measures, such as changing the recruitment procedures for teachers, would be of particular interest to this study but documentation to the necessary level of detail is not widely available.

Context

The description of anti-corruption approaches and tools in the available literature too often lacks analysis of the national educational context within which they happen. Differences in the level of decentralisation, arrangements for teacher management and resource provision provide very different opportunities, incentives for corruption. Parallel or preparatory initiatives that have contributed to the anti-corruption work need to be identified. Without them it is difficult to analyse the enabling and constraining factors that would inform further research or replication of the initiatives.¹⁰

Evaluations and impact assessment

The vast majority of approaches and tools that have been used have not been evaluated. This has led to simplistic attributions from approaches to the perceived results in some of the literature or simply the absence of analysis of impact of a given intervention.

Whilst this is a limitation for this study, it is also an important finding to take into further work.

¹⁰ The widely reported gains following the PETS in Uganda have been reviewed to show capacity building and regulatory changes that contributed to the reported gains.

3 Overview of documents

3.1 Types of documents

The documents gathered fall into four main categories:

- (i) reports and studies from multilateral and bilateral agencies, UN agencies, foundations, funds and NGOs,
- (ii) academic and research papers,
- (iii) Power-Point presentations from a range of agencies,
- (iv) manuals and guidelines from agencies and civil society organisations.

A bibliography is at Annex 2.

3.2 Classification

The documents were categorised using two dimensions:

Dimension 1: categories of anti-corruption approaches

Different categorisation systems of approaches and tools are used by different agencies, mostly articulated around the concepts of integrity, transparency, capacity, participation and accountability. For the purpose of this study we have taken the classification used in a Literature Review commissioned by Norad¹¹, which sought to synthesise and rationalise the range of analytical tools in the literature into four main categories. They are:

- (i) Rule of law (control and sanction),
- (ii) Public administration and systems (corruption prevention)
- (iii) Transparency and accountability (duty bearers and rights holders, non state actors, information, awareness),
- (iv) Capacity development¹² (individual, organisational and institutional capacity building).

Types of interventions were defined according to the description of approaches in the documentation. The descriptors below therefore span the tools and approaches found in the literature and is a heuristic list arising from the review. It is presented here organised according to the above broad categories.

Rule of law

- Policy
- Legislation
- Codes of conduct

Public administration and systems

- Whistle blower / complaint procedures
- Innovations addressing teacher absenteeism

¹¹ Norad (Study 2/2008) Anti-corruption approaches: A literature review. Norad: Oslo.

¹² They use the term capacity-building but in keeping with recent practice we have opted to talk of capacity-development.

- Systems' improvement - finances and accounts
- Systems' improvement - independence and externality
- Systems' improvement – technologies
- Systems' improvement - open procedures

Transparency and accountability

- PETS, service delivery and other surveys
- Information – use of the media and information technology
- Information – systems
- Participatory monitoring and social accountability
- Partnerships and alliances
- Anti-corruption education (in education or about the education sector)
- Advocacy and awareness raising campaign
- Women's involvement

Capacity development

- Institutional reforms
- Organisational development
- Training

Some documented interventions combine action in several of these areas.

Dimension 2: Education sector area

A list of education action areas was mapped based on Table 1, but amended to reflect the specificities of some of the documented anti-corruption initiatives.

- Education finance (school level upwards)
- Procurement (textbooks, infrastructure...)
- Teacher certification, recruitment and deployment
- Institution accreditation
- Information systems
- Allocation of specific allowances
- School grants
- School management (general)
- School personnel behaviour
- Education aid
- Examinations, diplomas, access to university

Again many interventions and approaches, especially those driven by general good governance concerns, cover more than one of these areas.

The categorisation is shown schematically in Table 2, (some details omitted for clarity).

Table 2: categorisation framework

Education area	Anti-corruption interventions							
	Rule of law			Public admin and systems			Transparency and accountability	Capacity development
	Policy	Legislation	Codes of conduct	Whistle blower complaints procedures	Innovations for teacher absenteeism	Systems improvements	etc	etc
Education finance (school level upwards)								
Procurement (textbooks, infrastructure...)								
Teacher certification, recruitment and deployment								
Institution accreditation								
Information systems								
Allocation of specific allowances								
School grants								
School management (general)								
School personnel behaviour								
Education aid								
Examinations, diplomas, access to university								

Documents and findings were categorised accordingly.

4 Findings

4.1 Rule of law/integrity

Documented initiatives in this category cover procurement (of facilities and teaching and learning materials) and staff conditions of service.

Methods and tools described include teachers’ codes of conduct and recruitment legislation.

4.1.1 Legislation

An adequate legislative framework is a necessary condition for tackling corruption. Corruption has usually been addressed as a cross-cutting issue as it is, for example, in the United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC): anti-corruption legislation is generally not sector specific, although it may make specific provision. For instance in Vietnam, the 2005 anti-corruption law specifically mandates transparency in enrolment and examinations and public disclosure of public funds used in educational institutions¹³. The impact of this law has not been evaluated.

¹³ UNDP (2008) Preventing Corruption in the Education Sector: International Experiences with Civil Society Involvement. UNDP Policy Note. UNDP Vietnam.

There is no evidence in the literature of evaluation of anti-corruption legislation and its impact on education. However, the introduction or renewal of anti-corruption legislation is often taken as indicative of a government's willingness to address corruption and of a certain level of public discourse and pressure on the topic. Development partners have often encouraged and facilitated such legislation.

Legislation may establish anti-corruption institutions with powers to investigate corrupt practices. Respondents have reported the logical progression, in which general legislation is followed by sector-specific responses, including for the education sector, policy papers. In Sierra Leone the Anti-Corruption Commission produced an analogous document assessed risk in the education sector and proposed mitigation measures.¹⁴

In Nigeria the anti-corruption body maintains an office in the line ministries, including education, with established rights to be present in working meetings and have sight of documents.

Issues for studies

Where there is AC legislation has it been mediated and specifically operationalised within the education sector?

Has the education sector proved particular problematic to introduce and implement new legislation for any reason.

4.1.2 Sanctions

The aspects of criminal sanctions and disciplinary measures to deter corrupt practices in education reported in the literature include:

- Independent complaints systems
- Investigators with authority and access to relevant information
- Criminal sanctions according to the nature and level of malpractice
- Disciplinary measures (non-judicial)
- The publication of lists showing firms or individuals guilty of corrupt practices (e.g. blacklists for procurement contracts)
- Increased powers of oversight of schools:

The literature emphasises the general lack of sanction for non-compliance with regulations, even in relatively severe cases for which criminal or disciplinary measures would seem appropriate.

Anti-corruption laws tend to be administered by the anti-corruption agencies where they exist and there is very little connection with line ministries. Transgressions are not classified as corruption for the education sector which normally operates under some form of the Education Act.

Penalties in the education sector following identified corruption are usually less severe than those in the anti-corruption laws.

¹⁴ Anti-Corruption Commission (2009) From the abyss back to the Athens of West Africa: A report on systems review of Ministry of Education. Ministry of Education: Sierra Leone

Issues for studies

What are the sanctions for corrupt practices? Have they have changed and have been used?

A specific question might be whether staff have been dismissed for corrupt practices and have the charges been on anti-corruption or more general misdemeanours under the Education Act?

To what extent is the anti-corruption agency monitoring corruption in the Education sector.

4.1.3 Codes of Conduct

The literature shows how codes of conduct of education personnel (including head teachers, inspectors, education authority staff, teachers and ancillary staff) contribute to improving professional behaviour and performance¹⁵. IIEP has been recently working on a toolkit for teachers' codes of conduct¹⁶. Development agencies and NGOs working on school management issues and on school-based violence, including violence against girls in schools, have also been advocating for the review or development of codes of conducts. In countries where malpractice and misconduct from the teaching force were increasingly reported in the media (for instance in the Gambia), teacher unions have been instrumental in the development of such codes.

Recent examples of development of codes of conduct with strong inputs from teacher unions and significant support from agencies and particularly NGOs include the Gambia and Sierra Leone. Fact sheets on the development process can be found in a recent publication by UNICEF WCARO, Plan WARO, Save the Children Sweden and ActionAid¹⁷, with a focus on how these initiatives can contribute to curbing violence in schools and sexual exploitation of children. The same publication also highlights how school-based codes of conducts, developed with the participation of children, teachers and community members (e.g. Cote d'Ivoire through the *Rewrite the Future Programme* of Save the Children¹⁸) address teacher absenteeism specifically, although they seem not to address issues of sexual harassment or "sex for grades". Success factors identified by these initiatives include mainly the strong involvement of teacher unions (through a bottom-up process in the case of the Gambia) and the real collaboration between MoEs and unions. Remaining challenges pertain to the enforcement of the codes and the establishment of bodies responsible for administering sanctions. There are however countries where specific mechanisms or bodies have been established to ensure enforcement of the codes, Hong Kong and Canada are two examples¹⁹.

¹⁵ UNESCO, Ethics in Education, Role of Teachers' codes Canada & South Asia

¹⁶ <http://teachercodes.iiep.unesco.org/>

¹⁷ UNICEF, ActionAid, Plan WARO, Save the Children (2010) Addressing violence in schools. Selected initiatives from West and Central Africa. Too Often in Silence Series.
http://www.unicef.org/wcaro/VAC_Report_Directory.pdf

¹⁸ UNICEF, ActionAid, Plan WARO, Save the Children (2010) Addressing violence in schools. Selected initiatives from West and Central Africa. Too Often in Silence Series.
http://www.unicef.org/wcaro/VAC_Report_Directory.pdf

¹⁹ UNESCO, Ethics in Education, Role of Teachers' codes Canada & South Asia

The dissemination of the codes and the appropriation of its content and implications by education staff are critical. All the above mentioned initiatives have emphasised the need for consultation, validation and information dissemination at national, regional, local and school levels, including children, teachers, local education authorities and parents.

Results

There is reported impact of Codes of Conduct on teacher absenteeism, but there is no data on how codes may be curbing sexual harassment and abuse by education personnel.

The impact of codes may be affected by their lack of dissemination, the difficulty of understanding them, lack of children and community knowledge of complaints procedures in case of non compliance, and the general lack of enforcement mechanisms²⁰.

Issues for country studies

Where codes of conduct are in place:

- How were they developed?
- What aspects of behaviour do they cover?
- What are the enforcement mechanisms?
- How have enforcement mechanisms been used?
- Ghost teachers and teacher absenteeism can be tackled by involving the communities. To what extent are communities part of development of codes of conduct?
- How are the codes of conduct linked to formal disciplinary processes?
- What is the impact of SCORE Cards where communities rank schools performance?

4.2 Public administration and systems reforms

Documented initiatives in this category cover systems improvement (better financing and accounting systems, increased use of independent and external bodies, use of software and technology to prevent corruption), information systems, community participation and oversight of school finance and management, policy development and women's participation.

Although initiatives in this category focus mainly on the education system in general, specific education areas addressed include education aid, education finance, school grants, procurement, teacher certification, recruitment and deployment, examinations and entrance to university and schools.

4.2.1 Better financial systems

Financial management

Strengthening financial systems has been one of the anti-corruption methods used by donors and government to combat corruption in the education sector and improve financial planning and management overall. DPs have supported Public Financial Management

²⁰ Antonowicz, L (2010) Too Often in Silence: A report on school-based violence in West and Central Africa. UNICEF, Plan West Africa, Save the Children Sweden West Africa and ActionAid.
http://www.unicef.org/wcaro/documents_publications_4271.html

(PFM) and Public Expenditure Management (PEM) to establish sound budget systems and ease account generation and consolidation of expenditures. Financial capacity is central in considering budget-support and similar financial modalities and Sector Wide Approaches (SWAps).

Medium-Term Expenditure Frameworks (MTBF) are “multi-year public expenditure exercises that are used to set out the future budget requirements for existing services and to assess the resource implications of future policy change²¹”. They have been introduced in the past decade as a mean to strengthen and rationalise budget processes. MTEF are rolling programmes based on a 3 to 5 years planning and budgeting framework, with annual fixed budgets. They improve predictability of funds, efficiency and accountability as implications of policy decisions must be costed. Lastly MTEF can give priority to budget expenditures that are pro-poor.

In Bangladesh, a Medium-Term Budgetary Framework (the most basic type of MTEF) is being piloted with seven ministries, including the MoE, with support from DFID, the World Bank and the IMF to address some of the identified fiduciary risks. This has enabled Ministries to ensure consistency of allocations with fiscal and policy objectives and to strengthen some of their financial capacities. In Bangladesh for instance, this led to improved speed in generating accounts and to the publication of monthly fiscal reports by the government²².

UNESCO Asia and Pacific Regional Bureau for Education also commissioned a series of in-depth studies on education financial planning in Asia (Mongolia, Nepal, the Republic of Korea, Thailand and Viet Nam), focusing on MTEF²³. These publications do not necessarily tackle anti-corruption per se but provide useful information on MTEF as they apply to education, implementation challenges, and clarity over allocation rule per type of education inputs.

Elsewhere the literature mentions how external expert ratings of budget performance are also being tested at the sector level, including education, to track budget credibility and institutional performance²⁴.

Whilst such macro-level methods will help budget transparency and may reduce the opportunities for education funds to be misused and diverted at the national level, it is in the management of their disbursement, reconciliation of expenditures and oversight of spending at the lower levels where there remain opportunities for both mismanagement and corruption. The most critical element here is improved electronic systems and use of the banking system, rather than cash, to make payments, for teachers salaries or school grants²⁵. PFM initiatives, including that cited in Bangladesh, work towards national systems

²¹ Pearson, M. (2002) Medium Term Expenditure Frameworks. An introduction, DFID. HSRC,

²² World Bank (2006) Program document for a proposed Second Programmatic Education Sector Development Support Credit o The people’s republic of Bangladesh. Human Development Sector, South Asia Region.

²³ <http://www.unescobkk.org/education/epr/epr-areas-of-work/education-planning-and-financing-portal/mtef-news/mtef-news-details/article/education-financial-planning-in-asia/>

²⁵ Jamaica, which has the banking infrastructure for paying teachers, persists in paying salaries by cheque distributed by hand because the oversight (typically by the school head) reduces the risk of paying teachers who have retired. An example where lack of timely and accurate employment information clearly increases risks. The

with shared records etc. Important steps at the technical level include integrating financial systems for reconciling payments made, based on standardised coding and increased use of electronic systems that allow financial data to be shared and inspected.

It is acknowledged that such practices may not specifically address corrupt practices identified at national level but contribute to the overall good governance agenda at government and Ministry levels.

However there is an apparent tension between introducing electronic financial management and devolving financial function down to institutional level, where skills and infrastructure may not be available.

Results

The search found no evaluations of direct impact of these financial management processes on the reduction of corruption, or of the specific type of corruption in education that might be addressed. However overall, the literature refers to increased financial capacity of government and line Ministries and to better systems creating an enabling environment for good governance. Where budgetary information has been generated in shorter cycle, there have been potentially more opportunities for external oversight. This is perhaps due to the absence of baseline information, and to the multiple objectives of such interventions in terms of better governance.

Issues for country studies

What is the level of introduction of accounting systems, at sub-national offices and agencies?

Have robust financial management mechanisms been introduced with a specific corruption reduction goal? If so what were the nature, the size and the location of the risks?

For the introduction of new financial management mechanisms:

- Who is involved?
- What are the drivers at government level?
- What administrative structure needs to be in place to enable such mechanisms to have an impact?

School grants disbursement

School grants have become increasingly common in the past two decades, driven by a portfolio agenda for improved local responsiveness, decentralisation and the explicit AC aim for funds to be subject to oversight of beneficiaries and main stakeholders (pupils and parents).

The literature presents a range of parameters to be taken into account when devising school grants disbursement systems, in particular around the allocation formulae and the possible disbursement channels. AC approaches within them have included:

Use of a third party for disbursement.

In Sierra Leone, two routes were compared for grant disbursement from central to school level, through Education Secretaries and the District Education Offices (2001-2002) and

effectiveness of this countermeasure is not known.

through the use of a third party, namely KPMG, in 2002-2003. The second method resulted in almost no leakage compared to the first, with 98.6 percent of the funds transferred to KPMG reaching schools in contrast to only 45 percent of the funds when disbursed centrally²⁶. This system has however ceased to exist. With the Local Government Act of 2004 and the devolved function of primary education to the local councils, grants are now disbursed from central government to the local council, and from the council to school bank accounts.

Textbook grants transfer to schools.

In Kenya, textbook grants were transferred directly to school bank accounts for purchasing textbook locally. According to a follow-up audit, very little leakage was discovered²⁷.

(Centralised textbook procurement and distribution is a recognised corruption risk in many countries and this transfer of the responsibility and funds to schools is a rare example of a method that might address that risk.)

School bank accounts

Most countries introducing block or capitation grants have requested schools to open bank accounts in order to avoid full disbursement of the grant in cash. In most instances there are three signatories to the account: the head teacher, the SMC Chair and a treasurer or a local education officer.

Returns and liquidations

Grants tend to be disbursed at different periods across the school year, usually per term. There are financial processes to be followed by school to justify their spending of the funds before being entitled to the disbursement of the second or third tranches of the grants. This is the case in Sierra Leone for instance where the grants for primary education are disbursed every term by the local council to school bank accounts. Schools have to account for all their expenses and provide receipts to the council. Failing to do so would result in the non-disbursement the following term.

Other methods.

The literature shows other approaches to ensure proper disbursement and utilisation of school-grants. They include:

- Systems to improve validity and timeliness of information about schools within national EMIS to ensure grants (especially formulae-driven grants) match schools' needs;
- Active attempts to ensure public awareness of grants and community oversight of school finances

These are discussed later in the context of information, transparency and participatory oversight.

Results

The literature indicates that positive results in terms of reduced leakage due to a given intervention in financial management flows may not mean the problem is eradicated but,

²⁶ Lewis, M., Petterson, J. (2009) Governance in Education: Raising Performance, 22 December 2009.

²⁷ Lewis, M., Petterson, J. (2009) Governance in Education: Raising Performance, 22 December 2009.

rather, it may be transferred, with leakages happening at another level when systems have curbed them in other places.

Examples documented in the literature include:

- Sierra Leone when school grants were disbursed via a third party (KPMG), which ensured the grants reached schools but had no control over possible leakages at the school level itself;
- In Cambodia, the formula-based allocation method and the program budget structure in place around grants for schools (“Priority Action Programme 2.1 funds”) resulted in funds mostly reaching school. However the 2005 Public Education Tracking Survey raised concerns that the tighter control and monitoring procedures around the grants had shifted corruption over to other budget lines (the budget line in particular that covers work related travel, equipment and accommodation for education officials)²⁸.

Another issue raised in the documentation is that public accounting procedures (record keeping and supporting documentation) can conceal financial mismanagement or corrupt practices when neat accounts “on paper” do not bear resemblance with the reality of funds usage²⁹.

Issues for country studies

Where there have been grants to schools:

- How are grants disbursed?
- How are schools being held to account for the grants
- Do approaches anticipate the changes of the introduction of a new financial or disbursement system onto others? How is this done?
- What is the role of school level governance (school committees or parents associations) in approving expenditure and accounting and how open is such school-level financial oversight?
- Evaluation of good practices should look at results in the area targeted by AC, but also widely to ensure no transfers have taken place?
- Data collection systems to complement financial management / accounting practices to corroborate what is on paper.

4.2.2 Better systems—*independence and externality*

Education in general

At the initiative of governments, with some pressure from DPs’ governance agendas, countries have taken steps in setting up and strengthening independent audit bodies. The literature alludes to the work undertaken by these but lacks detail on its impact on corruption deterrence, beyond the investigation of cases that led to actions against corrupt officials and to dismissals of Ministers or corrupted civil servants. The most commonly cited issues refer to the financial independence of these audit bodies, their non-reliance to government for administrative decisions, their level of authority to investigate cases and contracts, and their

²⁸ World Bank Group (2005) Cambodia - Public Expenditure Tracking Survey (PETS) in Primary Education. World Bank Group.

²⁹ Hallack, J. Poisson, M. (2007) Corrupt schools, corrupt universities: What can be done? International Institute for Educational Planning. IIEP UNESCO.

reporting lines (to Parliament and the judiciary in particular). National institutional arrangements for public audit across sectors are clearly overburdened to provide adequate audit oversight of education institutions, a situation that is aggravated as more responsibility is being delegated to institutions and sub-national administrative units. There is no literature on designs to take (national) audit and oversight functions into systems that are decentralising education: at school level the reliance is usually on the community oversight.

Beyond audit bodies, other mechanisms can be set to scrutinise public finances and increase transparency and accountability. This is the case for instance of the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) in Nepal. The PAC is “one of the select committees of the present Legislature-Constituent Assembly. Its main function is to examine the Public Accounts and the Report of the Auditor General to reduce misuse and abuse of public funds. It is empowered to direct concerned departments to explain financial irregularities, and also to pursue the clearance of arrears, that might have been specified in the Report of the Auditor General.”³⁰ Following a probe by the PAC of the parliament on the minister of education, and with support from donors, the minister resigned from his function over corruption charges in early 2010. This occurred in a context of increased public awareness of corruption and how it affects service delivery as a result of NGO and media pressure. It was also fostered by the fact that the PAC holds open deliberations which receive good media coverage³¹.

Issues for country studies

- The existence of audit bodies, their status, role and level of authority is to be investigated in the country studies. Examples of investigations by such bodies in the education sector are to be analysed.
- Whether audit comments are followed though and lead to sanctions, in any cases.
- Role of parents Education Boards to scrutinize the accounts and track expenditure.
- How are discrepancies reported

School grants

Independent entities have also been used to assess compliance and monitor disbursement of scholarships and school grants. The literature refers to the example of the Central Independent Monitoring Unit (CIMU), set up to monitor school grants and investigate complaints in Indonesia³². CIMU, which was established at the recommendation of DPs, independently reviews the school and district grants that were introduced as part of the major decentralisation initiative. By design, the CIMU was headed by an international consultant deemed more able to resist the pressures to which the CIMU might be subjected.

The CIMU exposed and followed through a number of cases of misuse and diversion of funds; it bought publicity to these cases and was the centre of some controversy.

³⁰ Asian Development Bank (2009) NEP: Governance Risk Assessment. Report prepared for the Nepal Country Partnership Strategy (2010-2012).

³¹ Asian Development Bank (2009) NEP: Governance Risk Assessment. Report prepared for the Nepal Country Partnership Strategy (2010-2012).

³² Baines, S. (2005) Towards more transparent financial management: scholarships and grants programmes in Indonesia. UNESCO IIEP.

Issues for country studies

Are there independent bodies with responsibility for AC oversight and action for the education sector?

Role of parents associations and School Boards

How are they constituted and their independence maintained?

Examination, diplomas and entrance to university

Although tertiary education is not a specific target of the MDGs, the development of the tertiary system and its ability to “produce” graduates is critical for the education sector in general, and the achievement of the MDGs in particular. Universities and other tertiary education institutes such as teacher training colleges have a key role to play in both access and quality of education. Without teachers in the classroom countries that have committed to free and compulsory primary education cannot hold their promise about access for all. Similarly, teachers who have not been properly trained cannot deliver an education of quality. Educational prospects may also play a role in family decision to support the education of girls and boys from primary onwards, and is critical in transition from primary to junior secondary. As a result the review extended its coverage to include tertiary education.

The literature mentions how the creation of external bodies to handle and supervise university admissions and entry examinations, such as the State Student Admissions Committee appointed by the Government of Azerbaijan³³ or the National Assessment and Examination Centre in Georgia³⁴, has had an impact of reducing corruption in university admissions³⁵.

Corruption at university entrance has been described in many ex-Communist states, indeed at any of the critical points where students move from one institution to another, with life-critical implications, there is a very high risk, especially where the relevant examinations and tests are conducted internally.

Issues for country studies

- Identify the existence, status and remit of examination or student commissions in country, and articulate their role
- Schools associations and parents Boards
- Identify strengths and weaknesses in these

Teacher certification

There are examples of independent bodies in charge of dealing with teachers' examination and appointments to overcome political patronage or nepotism in recruitment.

In Bangladesh for instance, the Non-Government Teacher's Registration and Certification Authority (NTRCA), has the remit since 2005 to conduct teachers' registration examinations

³³ Chapman, D. (2002) Corruption and the Education Sector. Sectoral Perspectives on Corruption. USAID. November 2002.

³⁴ Meier, B., Griffin, M. (eds.) (2005) Stealing the Future: Corruption in the Classroom: Ten real world experiences. Transparency International: Berlin.

³⁵ Chapman, D. (2002) Corruption and the Education Sector. Sectoral Perspectives on Corruption. USAID. November 2002.

for the selection of competent teachers for non-government junior high schools, secondary schools, colleges, madrasahs, technical schools and vocational institutions in a bid to ensure School Management Committees and College Governors Bodies could not appoint teachers without the requested skills.

In parallel the high risk area of primary teacher recruitment in Bangladesh has seen measures to reduce corruption by decreasing the interview marks awarded (so increasing the ratio accorded to the examinations)³⁶.

Issues for country studies

In critical points for recruitment and promotion is there any opportunity for external oversight of procedure?

School level

There is some evidence in the literature that devolution of power to parents and communities to run schools has reduced corruption. In El Salvador for instance a pilot project established that close parental control of schools had an impact on detecting and preventing corrupt behaviours³⁷. However, there are a range of factors to be considered when entirely devolving school management to parents, related to community willingness, readiness and capacity to undertake such a task. .

Issues for country studies

How are parents involved in the oversight of schools and do they have opportunities to act against corrupt practices?

In this what is the role of different parents' associations

4.2.3 Better IT for administration

The literature mentions how software and the use of IT can reduce corruption, in particular in the area of teacher registration and payment, student records, examinations and access to university.

Teacher deployment and payment

The literature provides example of how reliable EMIS and TMIS help the fight against corruption. Better information systems can reduce opportunities for corruption in teachers' payment and appointments. Examples include the information systems in Colombia³⁸ and payroll management tools in Zambia³⁹. Payroll clean up through random physical verification in schools was also used in Uganda⁴⁰. Although Uganda demonstrates a reduction in the number of ghost teachers, the literature cannot attribute it solely to the payroll clean up and teachers' census. The involvement of parents or Board which can verify which teacher is there and detect ghost teachers has also contributed.

³⁶ Bangladesh Ministry of Primary and Mass Education: Governance Report 2008

³⁷ UNDP (2008) Preventing Corruption in the Education Sector: International Experiences with Civil Society Involvement. UNDP Policy Note. UNDP Vietnam.

³⁸ Hallack, J. Poisson, M. (2007) Corrupt schools, corrupt universities: What can be done? International Institute for Educational Planning. IIEP UNESCO.

³⁹ U4 (2006) Corruption in the Education Sector. U4 Issue 4:2006.

⁴⁰ Lewis, M., Pettersson, J. (2009) Governance in Education: Raising Performance, 22 December 2009.

Another example from Gambia highlights how a detailed TMIS system, recording a range of skills and competences of teachers can provide information to support teacher assignment to schools according to their needs and provide the basis to challenge decisions based on rent-seeking, favouritism and nepotism⁴¹.

However there is no impact evaluation of these promising initiatives and the documents referring to them are providing scarce information, the reason why this report cannot elaborate on these examples.

Higher Education

IT has been used to tackle recognised corruption risks in higher education:

- Software to fight plagiarism have been developed and are being widely used in academic institutions in the North⁴².
- IT, admission processes can be automated hence limiting the opportunity for manual manipulation⁴³, not least when governments pay directly fees to universities for some of the students they are sponsoring.

Issues for country studies

- Is EMIS or TMIS used? Does it allow teachers and or third parties to make reality checks?
- Are there such IT systems in place being used to validate the administrative and financial processes that are at risk?

4.3 Transparency and accountability

Documented initiatives transparency and accountability in the education sector include: advocacy campaigns; awareness raising and AC education; the use of media in information dissemination; PETS, service delivery and other surveys; community oversight; children's monitoring; innovative approaches to reduce teacher absenteeism; and more open procedures.

The main education areas to which these approaches are applied are education finance, school grants, school management, school personnel behaviour, and procurement.

Local and appropriate tools, such as financial reporting on school notice boards can inform local oversight.

4.3.1 Advocacy and awareness-raising

The literature considers few stand alone 'anti-corruption in education' advocacy campaigns (Mali, Peru). Campaigning is usually an accompanying measure to other AC approaches, to increase buy in and to mobilise public "eyes and ears" for the initiative.

Lessons can be learned from the 2006 advocacy campaign in Peru, the objective of which was to make AC an essential component of educational reform⁴⁴. The campaign, which was

⁴¹ Chapman, D. (2002) Corruption and the Education Sector. Sectoral Perspectives on Corruption. USAID. November 2002.

⁴² Eckstein, MA. (2003) Combating academic fraud: Towards a culture of integrity. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

⁴³ Advanced training workshop on: Resource leakage and corruption in the education sector in Kenya. Capacity building for KESSP investment programme managers (2006). *Ethics and corruption in education*. UNESCO IIEP: Paris.

⁴⁴ U4 (2008) Corruption-free education: Lessons from a state and civil society joint initiative in Peru. U4 Brief,

jointly supported by Proética, Transparency International's chapter in Peru, and the Office of the Ombudsman aimed to expose areas prone to corruption in the education sector by analysing complaints of corruption at regional level. The campaign led to an increased amount of complaints and increased awareness of teachers, parents, children and local communities of corruption issues in the sector. This resulted into: (i) some of the cases being referred to the competent authorities and dealt with, (ii) the government's commitment to set up a commission to develop a probity policy for the education sector and cross-sectoral multi-stakeholders anti-corruption forums, and into (ii) the review of regulations pertaining to the investigation of teachers involved in acts of corruption. Among the identified factors that contributed to the success of the campaign, they note: (i) the enabling political environment (new education legislation passed two years before the campaign, on-going decentralisation), (ii) the window of opportunities provided by the implementation of this legislative change, (iii) the readiness of the public already engaged in discussions in education, and (iv) a strong partnership between civil society and a public institution. The main limitation of the campaign was that it lacked direct links with change processes in the education sector, and this impeded attempts to capitalise the campaign's success into transformative actions.

In Mali, the advocacy campaign "Eradicate corruption in education", led by the Association of Journalists against Corruption with the support of USAID (2002-2004), worked with national and school stakeholders, from the MoE to teacher unions to PTAs to raise awareness on the drastic effects of corruption on the education system. The campaign resulted in the establishment of a more transparent student evaluation system, including exams, and in less opacity in the scholarship process and award criteria⁴⁵.

Measuring the impact of advocacy and awareness-raising campaigns is a recognised challenge and the context and enabling environment should not be underestimated when trying to identify contribution or attribution of campaigns to tangible results and changes. Campaigning organisations systematically tend to put a positive light on their results to generate additional support.

Issues for country studies

Elements to consider include:

- Enabling and hindering environment of the campaign (political, social, economic, cultural context)
- Partnership: modality, strengths and weaknesses
- Linkages between campaign outputs and transformative actions

4.3.2 Anti-corruption education

Most AC awareness and education activities outlined in the literature focus on anti-corruption generally rather than on specific sectors. However many of the AC education activities are implemented in the education sector, be it through specific modules, or embedded in subjects such as moral education, citizenship education and others. This results in corruption in the education sector being a particularly useful entry point to discuss corruption

March 2008, No. 6

⁴⁵ USAID (2004) Fighting Corruption in Mali's Education System. Online article Africastories news article. http://africastories.usaid.gov/search_details.cfm?storyID=277&countryID=14§orID=0&yearID=4

in general. It may allow students to reflect upon experiences of corruption in their environment and it offers a unique opportunity for discussing corrupt practices in the education sector and how it affects students' education rights. The partnership between GTZ and the Anti-Corruption Commission in Sierra Leone is one recent example of such an approach⁴⁶. From 2005 to 2008, GTZ worked with the Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC) of Sierra Leone to curb the negative political and socio-economic impacts of corruption, which are cited as one of the factors of the conflict. The project combined awareness raising through radio and TV programmes and educational material for young people with supporting teacher aids (cartoons, posters etc). Six secondary schools "integrity clubs" were also piloted, with students taking an active role in raising awareness on corruption among their fellow students and the wider education community⁴⁷.

Results of such interventions are not analysed in depth in the literature. Although the argument that AC education leads to greater self-discipline and awareness of the rights and duties of citizens⁴⁸, including children and young people, is well articulated, studies lack evidence that specific AC education initiatives have resulted in behaviour and attitude change or led to a reduction in corruption in education..

Anti-corruption education provides a sound basis, in a human rights-based approach, for rights holders to claim their education rights and demand accountability and transparency from the government and other education stakeholders. When anti-corruption education may be presented as "moral education", with the emphasis on the individual and his or her own behaviour, such interventions may not have been as relevant or effective, not least in contexts where corruption is endemic and embedded in the power structures.

Such initiative may be based in the national curriculum or managed as extra-curricular additions; which have more risks of sustainability.

Issues for country studies

Where awareness campaigns and AC education initiatives complement AC interventions in the education sector, they should be reported and analysed to assess their value and learn lessons on how best to use them. Their fit into the school curriculum should be accorded.

4.3.3 More open and transparent systems or procedures

Procurement

The literature captures some of the key steps towards open and transparent procedures in procurement. A well documented case study is the procurement of textbooks in Argentina⁴⁹. A range of combined and simultaneous strategies were used to combat the allegations of corruption in the textbook tendering process: (i) transparency over the selection process of the National Advisory Committee members, with published profiles of experts and a communication line opened for publishers to comment on the proposed experts and identify

⁴⁶ GTZ UNCAC Project (2008) Anti-Corruption in education: Supporting the Anti-corruption Commission in Sierra Leone. GTZ

⁴⁷ <https://www.gtz.de/en/weltweit/afrika/senegal/15258.htm>

⁴⁸ See the work of the Hong Kong's Independent Commission Against Corruption (ICAC) in that area.

⁴⁹ Meier, B., Griffin, M. (eds.) (2005) *Stealing the Future: Corruption in the Classroom: Ten real world experiences*. Transparency International: Berlin.

possible conflicts of interest; (ii) open discussion on procurement criteria and bidding documents with publishers, (iii) integrity pact between publishers and the Ministry of Education re the procurement process, concretised in the form of a signed declaration by all Parties. Each strategy led to specific results: (i) exclusion of unsuitable experts from the National Advisory Committee, (ii) refined procurement criteria to accommodate publishers' feedback, (iii) signature of the integrity pact by 48 publishers.

Comments on the integrity pact highlighted the lack of sanctions, but the positive effect that the new procedures have had on the process and on the quality of the products purchased.

However textbook procurement remains a high cost and high risk activity.

Issues for country studies

- What steps have been taken to introduce better procurement systems?
- What is done to reduce the risks, especially around textbook supply?

4.3.4 Participatory monitoring and social accountability

The literature reveals a spectrum of participatory monitoring and social accountability initiatives with various degrees and modalities of participation. The stated objectives of these methods may explicitly seek to address corruption or, more often, are seen as part of the governance agenda around institutions with aims for improved oversight and accountability to community stakeholders, properly organised and supported to provide it.

Role of SMCs

In line with decentralisation processes, the decentralisation of funds from central government to schools has been increasing in the past twenty years, especially in developing countries. This led to the establishment of School Management Committees (or school boards, or boards of governors in secondary schools), with responsibility for oversight of school planning, school budgeting and school finances. SMCs typically have a membership prescribed by law, of about 6 to 10 members, including the head teacher, an SMC chair and a treasurer. The membership may include representatives from community organisations, from religious groups, from the local education authorities, and from the local council/assembly. In most cases SMC membership will include at least one woman. However children membership is far from being widespread.

The results of SMC involvement in school monitoring vary across countries and regions. While in some countries there are reports of increased oversight and better usage of school funds, in others SMC chairmen and head teachers may have dominated committees and given little space for other members to oversee finances and raise their concerns⁵⁰. This may be particularly the case in SMCs where the only literate members are the head teacher and the chair, and where people have limited understanding of accountancy and finances⁵¹.

The literature provides a range of examples of increased transparency as a result of parental involvement through SMCs. For instance in Bangladesh, the reformulation of the role and the composition of the School Management Committees, increasing parental participation

⁵⁰ Lugaz, C., De Grauwe, A. (2010) *Schooling and Decentralisation, Patterns and Policy Implications in Francophone West Africa*. IIEP/UNESCO. Plan WARO.

⁵¹ Antonowicz, L., Lesné, F., Stassen, S., Wood, J. 2010, *Africa Education Watch: Good Governance Lessons for Primary Education*. Transparency International.

and the participation of women in particular, led to a reduction of the proportion of students asked to pay bribes to benefit from a government stipend scheme to support poor children, to which they were entitled⁵². In Indonesia, parents' involvement in school management has also reduced opportunity for corruption around school grants⁵³.

Women's participation in public life and politics as a mean to reduce corruption has been debated in the past decade without reaching clear conclusions although there is some indication that women are less susceptible to bribes⁵⁴.⁵⁵

There is no evidence pertaining to the education sector specifically, but women's participation is described in some documentation as a possible tool to fight corruption in this sector⁵⁶.

Issues for country studies

A potential area of investigation could be whether there are correlations in corruption survey at school level between female head teachers or female chair of SMCs and reduced perception of corruption in comparison to male-led schools.

Budget tracking and monitoring

One of the distinctive features of budget-tracking interventions is the involvement of civil society organisations: budget tracking has been promoted by several CSOs including the Commonwealth Education Fund⁵⁷. However the literature highlights the importance of an enabling environment for budget tracking by NGOs and civil society organisations to get recognition and support when undertaking this type of work⁵⁸.

A good example is provided by the Commonwealth Education Funds (CEF) project, funded by DFID between 2002 and 2008 and jointly managed by ActionAid, Oxfam and Save the Children, engaged in local community participation in monitoring education budgets and expenditures at local and national level. The project was undertaken in Bangladesh, Cameroon, Gambia, Ghana, India, Kenya, Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, Nigeria, Pakistan, Sierra Leone, Sri Lanka, Pakistan, Tanzania, Zambia, Uganda and Zimbabwe. CEF through various partnerships at national and local level with NGOs and CSOs piloted a range of tools and approaches and learned many lessons. Tools and manuals have been fine-tuned to enable genuine participation from parents and procedures have been developed for the Independent Board Monitors (such as working in groups to avoid bribes⁵⁹). Impact on good

⁵² World Bank (2006) Program document for a proposed Second Programmatic Education Sector Development Support Credit o The people's republic of Bangladesh. Human Development Sector, South Asia Region.

⁵³ Chapman, D. (2002) Corruption and the Education Sector. Sectoral Perspectives on Corruption. USAID. November 2002.

⁵⁴ Azfar, O., Knack, S., Lee, Y., Swamy, A (1999) Gender and Corruption. Working paper #232: IRIS Center.

⁵⁵ There is a discussion of the issue, including references at

<http://www.u4.no/helpdesk/helpdesk/queries/query98.cfm>

⁵⁶ Chene, M. (2009) Gender, Corruption and Education. U4 Expert Answer. U4 and Transparency International.

⁵⁷ See for examples: <http://www.commonwealtheducationfund.org/budget.html>

⁵⁸ U4 (2009) Confronting Corruption in Education: Advancing accountable practices through budget monitoring. U4 Brief. May 2009. No 7.

⁵⁹ Anyuru, MA. (2006) Best practices in budget and anti-corruption work: experiences of the Apac anti-corruption coalition (TAAC), CCF Acenlwo Children and Family programme, and Uganda Adult Education Network (UGAADEN). Commonwealth Education Fund: Uganda.

governance and better quality education has been reported, alongside the recovery of some misappropriated funds⁶⁰. However the impact of such initiatives is said to be reduced due to the lack of follow-up of those reported cases of corruption.

Score cards

There is record of the use of community score-cards or report cards in a range of countries, Ukraine, Armenia⁶¹, Ghana⁶², Tanzania⁶³, Sierra Leone⁶⁴, and Bangladesh (re textbooks distribution)⁶⁵. Report cards are seen as flexible and are considered to help build local awareness of service delivery issues and perhaps of mismanagement and corruption. They are used by CSOs working with communities to provide the perspective of the users/beneficiaries.

Community score-cards are a tool used to structure the way that responsibility for “tracking” is delegated to beneficiaries and may be undertaken over a longer period: however, there is a warning in the documentation that a necessary pre-condition is that the beneficiaries care enough to do the work required, and are not constrained by fear of reprisal should there score cards reveal bad practice and mismanagement.⁶⁶ The arrangements by which score cards are analysed and actioned are therefore critical to their effectiveness. Much experience is based on pilots in which external agencies lead this role, rather than it being institutionalised.

Issues for country studies

Are there examples of tracking initiatives that have also included strategies to ensure case follow-up and enforcement of legislation?

Are there initiatives for local oversight of service and/or finance?

Children’s monitoring

Although many NGOs have engaged in participatory community oversight of school finances and education budget tracking, fewer have sought children’s participation in such processes. Child participation in school management has been encouraged as a contribution to good governance. A well documented case-study in Uganda⁶⁷ demonstrates the role that students

⁶⁰ Hart, J. (2008) Education budget work: civil society action against corruption. Commonwealth Education Fund. Presentation at the 13th International Anti-Corruption Conference, Athens, Greece, 30 October – 2 November 2008.

⁶¹ World Bank (2005) Social Accountability and Participatory Monitoring Approaches in Armenia. Experiences and Opportunities. A reader. World Bank Armenia.

⁶² Northern Ghana Network for Development (2004) Community Scorecards. Module 1: Facilitating the Community Scorecard.

⁶³ Twaweza (2008) Program Components. Tanzania.

⁶⁴ The National Accountability Group (2006) Participatory service delivery assessment of the activities of local councils in the mental health and sanitation, agriculture and educational sectors in Sierra Leone: A citizen report card on the 19 local councils.

⁶⁵ Ochse, K. (2004) Preventing corruption in the Education sector: A practical guide. GTZ

⁶⁶ Banerjee, A., Duflo, E. (2006) *Addressing Absence*. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*. Vol. 20, Issue 1, pp. 117-132.

⁶⁷ Anyuru, MA. (2006) Best practices in budget and anti-corruption work: experiences of the Apac anti-corruption coalition (TAAC), CCF Acenlwo Children and Family programme, and Uganda Adult Education Network (UGAADEN). Commonwealth Education Fund: Uganda.

can play in monitoring school grants and contributing to school management. Children's monitoring was perceived as positive for reporting teachers' absence and inappropriate behaviours. Identified cases of corrupt head teachers and of school staff impregnating girls were reported to the authorities.

For such interventions to be successful there needs to be a strong political will at local level and a readiness from communities to listen to children's voices. Key challenges pertain to law enforcement and the follow-up of cases by authorities (be they educational or judiciary), but also to the possible manipulation of children and their exposure to potentially dangerous situations when reports identify malpractice.

Issues for country studies

Are there attempts to empower children, and to provide ways that their voice and knowledge can be mobilised against corruption?

4.3.5 Information and the use of media and information technology

The literature underlines the importance of engaging with the media in anti-corruption work. Most projects undertaken in the last decade included a media component with strategic partnerships for information dissemination, training on investigative journalism and reporting etc.

The case of Uganda is analysed at length, with regards to the role played by information dissemination in the PETS and the reduction of leakages around school grants⁶⁸. National and local newspapers published information about the size of the grants that were to be paid to school and this was associated with a reduction in losses (through corruption and mismanagement).

While some argued that public access to information in Uganda was strongly correlated with the reduction in capture of school funds⁶⁹, others have established that despite the key role played by public access to information, positive results in terms of corruption reduction would not have been achieved if other drivers had not been in place at the time of the intervention, in particular the restructuring of the grant and the introduction of Universal Primary Education⁷⁰ and associated capacity development activities undertaken.

With the emergence of new media and the Internet, opportunities for information dissemination and public scrutiny of public expenditure have increased. Examples of publicly accessible procurement systems to enable public scrutiny are found in the literature but the impact of such practices is yet to be fully articulated⁷¹.

Hart, J. (2008) Education budget work: civil society action against corruption. Commonwealth Education Fund. Presentation at the 13th International Anti-Corruption Conference, Athens, Greece, 30 October – 2 November 2008.

⁶⁸ Hubbard, P. (2007) Putting the power of transparency in context: Information's role in reducing corruption in Uganda's education sector. Center for Global Development Working Paper Number 136

⁶⁹ Reinikka, R.; Svensson, J. (2004). The power of information: evidence from a newspaper campaign to reduce capture. Policy Research Working Paper No. 3239, 2004. Washington, DC: World Bank.

⁷⁰ Hubbard, P. (2007) Putting the power of transparency in context: Information's role in reducing corruption in Uganda's education sector. Center for Global Development Working Paper Number 136

⁷¹ IIEP (2007) Corrupt schools, corrupt universities: what can be done?

It is important that media coverage is not limited to the exposure of corruption but sustained relationships with the media are developed to create a constant flow of information on corruption issues that contributes to accurate public knowledge, reduces public tolerance of corrupt practices in the education sector, and leads to action or behavioural change.

Issues for country studies

Assess how freely and completely the press reports on corruption and acts to increase public awareness around corruption in education.

4.3.6 Initiatives to curb teacher absenteeism

Teacher absenteeism is acknowledged as a major management concern for education in many countries. Where teachers absent themselves without legitimate reason they divert public resources to their own purposes to the detriment of the education of their pupils.

Beyond participatory monitoring interventions which usually cover the monitoring of teachers' presence in schools, CSOs have piloted a range of initiatives designed to curb absenteeism. The initiatives focus on the role of direct incentives for teachers. Banerjee and Duflo⁷² explore further the role of incentives by comparing approaches and note that better attendance results are obtained through systems mechanically and systematically implemented rather than systems involving headmasters who may, for a variety of reasons, manipulate teacher attendance records. Their conclusions are based on two initiatives. The first one required teachers to take a picture of themselves in front of the classroom at the beginning of every day of the week with a digital camera with date and time functions. Checks enabled to establish when teachers had not been in schools, resulting in salary loss for days not worked. The second one entrusted head teachers to monitor teachers' presence and to offer a bicycle to teachers with a good attendance record. Monitoring of both experiments took place with control schools. The first initiative showed a positive difference in teacher attendance between schools using cameras and the others. The second initiative did not show a significant difference, which the authors explain by the fact that "when human judgment is involved in a system where rules are often bent, incentives may easily be perverted".

Issues for country studies

What are countries doing to ensure attendance of teachers?

What is the evidence at the school level?

4.3.7 Surveys

The types of surveys encountered in anti-corruption work include Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys (PETS), Quantitative Service Delivery Surveys (QSDS), and other types of diagnostic surveys or social audits⁷³. Although such surveys are not anti-corruption interventions *per se*, their results can be used to assess the potential impact of specific interventions (e.g. a change in disbursement of funds, or a procedure to disburse funds), and to raise awareness and disseminate quantitative evidence on corruption in a given sector in

⁷² Banerjee, A., Duflo, E. (2006) *Addressing Absence*. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*. Vol. 20, Issue 1, pp. 117-132.

⁷³ Ochse, K. (2004) Preventing corruption in the Education sector: A practical guide. GTZ

a given country⁷⁴. They also provide a shared starting point for analysing risks and points of potential action.

There is not yet rigorous comparative data on the impact of PETS. Some of the surveys are too recent to have been evaluated.

The literature reviews at length two PETS case studies: Uganda and Tanzania⁷⁵. The Uganda PETS in education has been much quoted as identifying the level of leakage in the distribution of school grant funds and stimulating action, most notably the pro-active information about grant amounts discussed above.

The Tanzania PETS is reported to have been less immediately successful and demonstrates lessons about the need for common understanding and agreements about methodologies, especially where DPs are the main drivers of the study. In the Tanzania case, identified concerns from the PETS about the overly complex financial structures and lack of information, but did not find consensus and action. The Government was critical of the methodology (which is described by others as “robust”) and no response to the final study was made.

There is not yet rigorous comparative data on the impact of PETS. Some of the surveys are too recent to have been evaluated. However, there is increasing consensus that PETS may be useful only in certain circumstances, where there can be consensus to act on results. The early rush of enthusiasm has been tempered and it is increasingly recognised that the novelty of PETS is not an innovative tool *per se* but the application of proven methods to service providers and governments where we have previously relied on administrative data.⁷⁶ PETS can thus be seen as a way to make up for shortcoming in the administrative/financial data.

Other commentators note that⁷⁷:

- PETS do not tend to provide a process or strategy by which the technical recommendations that are provided can be implemented.
- They do not necessarily trigger a public debate. Beyond the Ugandan experience in which there was political will for education and strong development partnership, there is little evidence of PETS capturing the public imagination or leading to concerted pressure for reform.
- Essentially, a PETS does not “do” anything. It is merely a survey, and it is only useful if its findings are acted upon. It is therefore important that a PETS is seen as only one part of a larger strategy.
- Although this might seem obvious, it is striking how little attention is paid to the need for (and possible difficulty of) follow-up action in policy discussions leading to decisions to conduct a PETS.

Issues for country studies

Has there been a PETS or survey with intention to identify leakage or risks?

What happened to the results?

⁷⁴ Reinikka, R., Smith, N. (2004) Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys in Education. IIEP/UNESCO.

⁷⁵ U4 (2007) Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys: Lessons from Tanzania. U4 Brief. November 2007. No 14.

⁷⁶ IIEP Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys in Education

⁷⁷ U4 2008, Following the money do Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys matter?

4.4 Capacity development

Documented initiatives in the literature on anti-corruption approaches focusing on capacity development cover institutional, organisational and individual capacity using technical assistance and training as the two main implementation strategies.

Initiatives commented upon in the literature tend to be components of wider education programmes and interventions. This is for instance the case in Honduras, where GTZ *Program to Support the Quality of Basic Education in the Framework of the EFA Fast Track Initiative* provided Technical Assistance to the Transparency Department of the Ministry of Education, and training of teachers' unions, PTAs and civil society organisations on corruption issues in the education sector⁷⁸. Similarly, the Commonwealth Education Fund project described above was active in building the capacity of civil society organisations, parents and children in monitoring and tracking budgets⁷⁹. This work reported impact on the national coalition's ability to discuss education budgets with Ministries of Education, and in best cases, Ministries of Finance.

Parliamentarians are also targeted by training on education budgeting, of which anti-corruption may be a sub-component. Training initiatives focusing on Parliaments have been reported in Kenya⁸⁰ and Tanzania among other places, building the capacity of Parliament Education Committees to scrutinise budgets and ensure they are in line with education policies.

But it is within the context of decentralisation and increasing responsibility and accountability of head teachers and SMCs that most training and capacity strengthening programmes have been framed to address these actors.

The role of head teachers is critical in school management, yet in many countries, especially in sub-Saharan Africa, head teachers tend to be teachers promoted after a number of years in service, and through processes that may be subject to patronage. Their terms and conditions and career management rarely reflect the increased responsibilities that are being delegated to them. Head teachers do not normally receive any management training before entering their new function. Building their capacities in school management and finance has been recognised as a priority in a number of countries, with a focus on their accountability roles in decentralisation initiatives. However these are new skills and evidence, for example in TI's Africa Education Watch survey, suggests a wide gap.

Issues for country studies

What capacity development initiatives have contributed to anti-corruption efforts in the education sector?

What have been the different capacity development methodologies used (target groups, implementation strategies, activities, sustainability elements etc)?

⁷⁸ Teggemann, S. (2010) Anti-Corruption in Sectors: Good Practices and Lessons Learned from Country Experiences. Presentation at the Conference of the Arab Anti-Corruption and Integrity Network "National Anti-Corruption Strategies and the Roles of National Stakeholders" Sana'a, Republic of Yemen 26-27 July 2010. GTZ.

⁷⁹ Perry, V. (2008) Civil Society engagement in education budgets: A report documenting Commonwealth Education Fund experiences. Commonwealth Education Fund.

⁸⁰ U4 (2006) Corruption in the Education Sector. U4 Issue 4:2006.

4.5 Development aid to education

Multilateral and bilateral agencies have prioritised the corruption agenda over past ten years driven by concerns for wastage of development aid, the distortions caused and increasing criticisms from their own constituencies. The thrust of EFA and the MDGs for education, and of the Harmonisation agenda provided a context and international agreements to increase and share accountability for aid and its results. In extreme, and high profile case, such as the high-level corruption in Kenya, agencies halted disbursement of funds to the concerned Government.⁸¹ Action against corrupt suppliers by donors is ongoing and procedures to reduce risks under constant development.⁸²

Agencies act by exerting their agendas in programme development to include anti-corruption (or more often “governance”) initiatives in programme design, by introducing national anti-corruption programmes and by working to reduce the risks of mismanagement of the concerned funds.

So, for example, Norad has three main approaches to tackle educational financing and corruption:

- (i) anti-corruption clauses in development cooperation agreements;
- (ii) support and participation in PER/PETS;
- (iii) financial reviews⁸³

Issues for country studies

Have aid agreements explicitly included AC measures and of what type?

5 Conclusions

5.1 Gaps in the reportin

Most of the AC approaches and tools address transparency and accountability and public administration and system reforms.

There are few examples of initiatives tackling the rule of law or capacity building to combat corruption in the education sector. This might be explained by the fact that AC legislation often addresses the macro level rather than sectors individually, and that AC issues are mainstreamed in capacity building activities rather than being the main focus of specific capacity initiatives.

The focus of interventions has been on education finance, school grants and school management in general. Surprisingly the literature does not present many tools for known risk areas for corrupt practices, such as teacher accreditation, appointment, deployment and payment, or procurement of infrastructure. Most importantly, interventions are reported

⁸¹ See for example: <http://www.nation.co.ke/News/-/1056/820998/-/item/0/-/109gea5z/-/index.html>

⁸² See for recent example: <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/finance/newsbysector/mediatechnologyandtelecoms/media/7683139/Macmillan-admits-to-bribery-over-World-Bank-Sudan-aid-deal.html>

⁸³ Norad Educational Financing and Corruption, Norad 2006 (PPT doc)

without precise information on the magnitude/level of risk of the education area or transaction it addresses, and on the reasons why these are so prone to corruption in comparison with others. Where there are impact measures they are often over aggregated and provide little help to identifying the impact of interventions on inputs or outputs.⁸⁴

Although this review has focussed on anti-corruption interventions, it appears that the majority of interventions described as anti-corruption initiatives are, in fact, about wider governance aims, such as integrity, transparency, participation, accountability and capacity but without explicitly making the link to areas of corruption. Is this simply a problem of overlapping categories, or of recognising these important elements of good governance as part of the toolkit for anti-corruption? Or is the discourse of governance being used to avoid discussing “corruption” directly?

An area which is not explored by the literature is how anti-corruption interventions of different types and in different education areas combine to have a greater impact, in what combination and at what level is likely to result in the most significant improvement.

As some examples have shown, anti-corruption initiatives may lead to the transfer of corruption from the targeted area to another area.

5.2 Context matters

The drivers and conditions for change are frequently overlooked in the literature, although it has been established that corruption is linked to power dynamics between groups, behaviours of elites and individuals and the political nexus. Drivers and pre-conditions for change should therefore be investigated within the context in which AC initiatives take place. Contextual information might include:

- National, historic and political context re corruption
- Education system (level of decentralisation, level of government involved in school funding etc)
- Governance system:
 - Legislative and regulatory framework, including assessment of functional court systems and enforcement mechanisms
 - Norms and customs
 - Financial flows
- Level of press freedom and journalist ethics, role of the media
- Analysis of each risk and the power dynamics, values and cultural practices that are embedded in individuals’ and groups’ attitudes towards risks areas and corruption.
- Political will

These contexts are so important to understanding and to attempts to replicate success stories. One approach would be to work on the conditions that create an enabling environment for AC work in a particular area of the education system.

⁸⁴ UNDP, Users Guide to Measuring Corruption

Annex 1. Internet sources

Information sources – Anti-corruption

The following websites have provided initial data and wide-ranging related literature on anti-corruption in education. Several of the websites below have cross-linkages as well as links to unique URLs for academic papers in journals. Several collected documents are sourced via bibliographies of these pages or their resources.

Name	URL	Comments
UNDP	http://www.undp.org/governance/focus_anti-corruption.shtml	Links to overview / top-level UNDP anti-corruption publications and newsletter, Anti-Corruption Guidance Note and Asia-Pacific HDR 2008
UNDP Anti-corruption portal	www.anti-corruption.org	Portal with U4, UNDP and UNESCO resources on education and corruption including country-specific data.
IIEP UNESCO	http://www.iiep.unesco.org/information-services/publications/ethics-and-corruption.html	Wide-ranging resources, especially on teacher codes of conduct and academic fraud (e.g. examinations, plagiarism).
IIEP ETICO database	http://databases.unesco.org/etico/etico_eng.htm	Resources on ethics and corruption in education. Links to TI's CORIS web portal. World Bank, TI and academic papers included.
World Bank – Governance and Anticorruption	www.worldbank.org/wbi/governance	Empirical diagnostic surveys and resources focusing on state level interventions – judicial reform, public sector governance. Few resources by sector inc education.
World Bank – Education	http://go.worldbank.org/GMDMICVFFQ	Information on school-based management, finance and expenditures in education.
IMF	http://www.imf.org/external/research/index.aspx	IMF research searchable page with various papers on good governance and anti-corruption, including linked to education.
OECD	http://www.oecd.org/topic/0,3373,en_2649_37447_1_1_1_1_37447,00.html	Focus on bribery and governance; a few resources connecting corruption with education sector.
OECD Anti-Corruption Network	http://www.oecd.org/document/58/0,3343,en_2649_37447_41803642_1_1_1_1,00.html	Links to regional pages of general anti-corruption data including some on education sector.
USAID	http://www.usaid.gov/our_work/democracy_and_governance/technical_areas/anti-corruption/	Including USAID's anti-corruption strategy and description of programs.
Organisation for Security and Cooperation in	http://www.osce.org/	Includes Best Practices in combating corruption.

Europe (OSCE)		
OSI / Soros Foundation Education Support Programme	http://www.espsare.org/display/TAAinGE/Documents http://www.espsare.org/display/TAAinGE/Links.+Anti+corruption+in+education+websites	Work with IIEP between 2003-06. Produced 'Anticorruption, Transparency and Accountability Resource Pack' – an overview of OSI supported anti-corruption initiatives in education
U4 Anti-Corruption Resource centre	http://www.u4.no/	Wide-ranging major collection of resources including 'expert answers' on anti-corruption and education.
Governance and Social Development Resource Centre (GSDRC)	http://www.gsdrc.org/go/gateway-guides/anti-corruption	Gateway to general, thematic and regional resources across the web, including links to NGO, UN agency and donor web pages.
Global Integrity	http://report.globalintegrity.org/	Global Integrity report is an assessment of national anti-corruption systems across tens of countries. Overview of national issues gives indication of issues but not education sector specific.
Transparency International	http://www.transparency.org/global_priorities/other_thematic_issues/education	Education theme page with several anti-corruption in education reports, many school and community level
Freedom House – Countries at the Crossroads	http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=139&edition=8	Survey and data on governance, including anticorruption and transparency, in 70 countries.
Overseas Development Institute	http://www.odl.org.uk/resources/	Working papers and opinion papers on anticorruption in education, particularly in humanitarian and post-war contexts.
ELDIS	http://www.eldis.org/go/topics	Searchable database with U4, TI, IIEP, NGO, donor and academic reports and articles
Regional Anti-Corruption Initiative (South east Europe)	http://www.rai-see.org/home.html	Small library of regional anticorruption resources in general
Anticorruption Student Network in south east Europe	http://see-corruption.net/	Information on student initiatives to fight corruption in higher education in the region.
iKnow Politics	http://www.iknowpolitics.org/homepage	Information on women and corruption
Information portal on corruption in Africa	http://www.ipocafrika.org/	Conference reports, charters and Acts from Southern Africa related to corruption. Focus on legislation.

Annex 2. Bibliography

Advanced training workshop on: Resource leakage and corruption in the education sector in Kenya. Capacity building for KESSP investment programme managers (2006). Ethics and corruption in education. UNESCO IIEP: Paris.

Alatasa, L. Cameron, A. Chaudhric, N. Erkalb and L. Gangadharanb in Gender and Corruption: Insights from an Experimental Analysis.

ANPPCAN Chapter, Acen Lworo Project, Kigulu Development Group (2006) National dissemination report: UPE monitoring report.

Anti-Corruption Commission (2009) From the abyss back to the Athens of West Africa: A report on systems review of Ministry of Education. Ministry of Education: Sierra Leone.

Antonowicz, L (2010) Too Often in Silence: A report on school-based violence in West and Central Africa. UNICEF, Plan West Africa, Save the Children Sweden West Africa and ActionAid. http://www.unicef.org/wcaro/documents_publications_4271.html

Antonowicz, L., Lesné, F., Stassen S., Wood, J. (2010) Africa Education Watch. Good Governance Lessons for Primary Education. Transparency International. Berlin.

Anyuru, MA. (2006) Best practices in budget and anti-corruption work: experiences of the Apac anti-corruption coalition (TAAC), CCF Acenlworo Children and Family programme, and Uganda Adult Education Network (UGAADEN). Commonwealth Education Fund: Uganda.

Arunatilake, N., de Silva, R. (2004) Overview of education budgeting and resource allocation processes in Sri Lanka. Institute of Policy Studies: Sri Lanka.

Asian Development Bank (2009) NEP: Governance Risk Assessment. Report prepared for the Nepal Country Partnership Strategy (2010-2012).

Azfar, O., Knack, S., Lee, Y., Swamy, A (1999) Gender and Corruption. Working paper #232: IRIS Center.

Baines, S. (2005) Controlling corruption: lessons from the School Improvement Grants Program in Indonesia

Baines, S. (2005) Towards more transparent financial management: scholarships and grants programmes in Indonesia. UNESCO IIEP

Banerjee, A., Duflo, E. (2006) *Addressing Absence*. Journal of Economic Perspectives. Vol. 20, Issue 1, pp. 117-132.

Bangladesh Ministry of Primary and Mass Education: Governance Report 2008

Barrett, L. (2004) Corruption and Anti-corruption measures in education: The CIS and the

Western Balkans. A report for the Education Support Program, Open Society Institute.

Budiene, V., Poisson, M., Hallak, J. (2004) Corruption, Transparency and Accountability in education: Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. Report of joint OSI/IIEP mission. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

Carrillo, S., Fall, M. (2007) Country-level governance diagnostics: Strengthening local capacities for greater government effectiveness. Global Governance. The World Bank Institute. October 2007.

Catalyst, H. (2007) Follow the money: A resource book for trainers on public expenditure tracking in Tanzania.

Chapman, D. (2002) Corruption and the Education Sector. Sectoral Perspectives on Corruption. USAID. November 2002.

Chene, M. (2009) Gender, Corruption and Education. U4 Expert Answer. U4 and Transparency International.

Civil Society Coalition for Quality Basic Education (2005) A Report on the spot check exercise for the 2004/5 financial year: Have the resources tickled down to schools?

Claasen, M. (2008) Making the budget work for Education: Experiences, achievements and lessons from civil society budget work. The Commonwealth Education Fund.

Commonwealth Education Fund (2009) A Budget Guide for Civil Society Organisations working in Education. The Commonwealth Education Fund.

De Grauwe, A., Diakkate, C. (2005) Does decentralisation lead to school improvement? Findings and lessons from research in West-Africa. *Journal of Education and International Development*, 1(1).

Dimitrova, NP. (2000) Introduction of Anticorruption Education in Bulgarian Secondary schools

Doig, A., Watt, D., Williams, R. (2006) *Hands-on or hands-off? Anti-corruption agencies in action, donor expectations, and a good enough reality.* Public Administration and Development. Vol. 26, pp. 163-172.

Dollar, D., Fisman, R., Gatti, R. (1999) Are Women Really the “Fairer” Sex? Corruption and Women in Government. Policy Research Report On Gender And Development. Working Paper Series, No. 4 October 1999. The World Bank Development Research Group/ Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network

Dyer, K. (2003) A simple guide to working with finances and education. Oxfam and TEN/MET.

Eberlai, w., Fuhrmann, B. (2004) Fighting poverty and corruption: Integrating the fight

against corruption into the PRS Process – analysis and recommendations for development cooperation. GTZ

Eckstein, MA. (2003) *Combating academic fraud: Towards a culture of integrity*. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

Elimu Yetu Coalition (2002) *A Tool for tracking budgetary allocations, disbursement and utilization for basic education in Kenya*. Nairobi.

Elimu Yetu Coalition (2004) *Monitoring of the Free Primary Education and establishing the unit cost of primary education in Kenya*. Nairobi.

Ephraim, N., Millie, N., Robert, J. (2005) *Basic education budget tracking: Facilitators Guide*. Uganda Adult Education Network

Goetz, AM. (2005) *Political cleaners: how women are the new anti-corruption force. Does the evidence wash?* Institute of Development Studies: Brighton.

Goetz, AM., Jenkins, R. (2001) *Gender-sensitive local auditing: initiatives from India to build accountability to women*.

GTZ (2009) *Fighting corruption in and through education: experience of German Technical Cooperation*. GTZ.

GTZ UNCAC Project (2008) *Anti-Corruption in education: Supporting the Anti-corruption Commission in Sierra Leone*. GTZ

Guidance Note: Education Sector Risk Assessment (ADB, 2010)

Gupta, S., Davoodi, H., Tiongson, E. (2000) *Corruption and the provision of health care and education services*. IMF Working Paper WP/00/116

Hallack, J. Poisson, M. (2007) *Corrupt schools, corrupt universities: What can be done?* International Institute for Educational Planning. IIEP UNESCO.

Hart, J. (2008) *Education budget work: civil society action against corruption*. Commonwealth Education Fund. Presentation at the 13th International Anti-Corruption Conference, Athens, Greece, 30 October – 2 November 2008.

Heyneman, S. (2004) *Education and corruption*. International Journal of Educational Development, 24 pp. 637-648

Heyneman, S. (ed.) (2009) *Buying your way into heaven: education and corruption in international perspective*. Global Perspectives on Higher Education. Vol. 15. Sense Publishers: The Netherlands.

Hubbard, P. (2007) *Putting the power of transparency in context: Information's role in reducing corruption in Uganda's education sector*. Center for Global Development Working

Paper Number 136

Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (2004) The education budget in Pakistan. The Commonwealth Education Fund.

Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (2005) A Guide to participatory budget analysis for primary education.

Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (2005) Tracking of the Education budget: Manual. In collaboration with The Commonwealth Education Fund.

Karim, S., Santizo Rodall, CA., Cabero Mendoza, E. (2004) Transparency in education: Report card in Bangladesh; Quality Schools Programme in Mexico. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

Keen, E. (2000) Fighting corruption through education. COLPI Papers 1. Open Society Institute: Hungary

Kiiza, J. (2006) Nature and extent of corruption in Universal Primary Education (UPE) in Uganda: A research report. Makerere University: Uganda.

Levacic, R., Downes, P. (2004) Formula funding of schools, decentralization and corruption: a comparative analysis. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

Lewis, M., Pettersson, J. (2009) Governance in Education: Raising Performance, 22 December 2009.

Lolichen, PJ. (2006) *Children as informed participants in governance*. International NGO Journal. Vol. 1 (2), pp. 21-29.

Lugaz, C., De Grauwe, A. (2010) Schooling and Decentralisation, Patterns and Policy Implications in Francophone West Africa. IIEP/UNESCO. Plan WARO.

Meier, B., Griffin, M. (eds.) (2005) Stealing the Future: Corruption in the Classroom: Ten real world experiences. Transparency International: Berlin.

Melikidze, V., (2003) Role of the formal decision making in emerging of the 'new corruption' in a school education in transitional societies (case of Georgia)

Michael, B. (2004) *What do African donor-sponsored Anti-corruption programmes teach us about international development in Africa?* Social Policy and Administration. Vol. 38, No. 4, pp. 320-345.

Mullochaev, MA. (date unknown) The state and ways of achievement of transparency in education system of Tajikistan.

National Assembly Select Committee on Education and Training (2005) Report on Schools Survey. Republic of The Gambia.



National Seminar on Anti-corruption issues in education (Baku, Azerbaijan: 21-23 February 2006). Ethics and corruption in education. Open Society Institute, The Center for Innovations in Education, UNESCO IIEP.

Norad (Study 2/2008) Anti-corruption approaches: A literature review. Norad: Oslo.

Northern Ghana Network for Development (2004) Community Scorecards. Module 1: Facilitating the Community Scorecard.

Ochse, K. (2004) Preventing corruption in the Education sector: A practical guide. GTZ

Pamoja Trust (2006) Civil Society Capacity Development on primary education budget tracking: Facilitators Guide. Pamoja: Tanzania.

Pearson, M. (2002) Medium Term Expenditure Budget Frameworks. An introduction, DFID. HSRC,

Perry, V. (2008) Civil Society engagement in education budgets: A report documenting Commonwealth Education Fund experiences. Commonwealth Education Fund.

Pliksnys, A., Kopnicka, S., Hrynevych, L., Palicarsky, C. (2009) Transparency in education in Eastern Europe. Ethics and corruption in education. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

Poisson, M. (2009) Guidelines for the design and effective use of teacher codes of conduct. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

Pro-Poor Advocacy Group (2004) Expenditure analysis on the nature and magnitude of resource allocation in the Education sector (2000-2004). The Commonwealth Education Fund: The Gambia.

Ramkumar, V. (2008) Our money, or responsibility: A citizens' guide to monitoring government expenditures. The International Budget Project.

Reinikka, R. Svensson, J. (2003) Survey Techniques to Measure and Explain Corruption. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 3071, June 2003

Reinikka, R. Svensson, J. (2003) The Power Of Information: Evidence From A Newspaper Campaign To Reduce Capture. December, 2003

Reinikka, R., Smith, N. (2004) Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys in Education. IIEP/UNESCO.

Reinikka, R., Svensson, J. (2003) Survey techniques to measure and explain corruption. World Bank Policy Research Paper 3071.

Reinikka, R., Svensson, J. (2004) Fighting corruption to improve schooling: Evidence from a newspaper campaign in Uganda. World Bank.



Reinikka, R., Svensson, J. (2005) Improving schooling by combating corruption: evidence from a newspaper campaign in Uganda.

Robinson, L. (2004) Community Scorecards: Module 1 – Facilitating the Community Scorecard. The Northern Ghana Network for Development.

Seats, EL., Vardaman, SH. (2009) Lessons learned fighting corruption in MCC threshold countries: The USAID experience. USAID: Washington DC.

Stecher, B., Kirby, SN. (eds.) (2004) Organizational improvement and accountability: Lessons for education from other sectors. RAND corporation.

Sundet, G. (2008) Following the money: do Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys matter? U4 Issue 2008:8.

Swamy, S. Knack, Y. Lee and O. Azfar, Gender and Corruption, World Bank, 2000

Tanzi, V. (1998) Corruption around the world: Causes, consequences, scope and cures. IMF Staff Papers, Vol. 45, No. 4.

Teggemann, S. (2010) Anti-Corruption in sectors: good practices and lessons learned from country experiences. Conference of the Arab Anti-Corruption and Integrity Network, Sana'a, Yemen. PowerPoint presentation. GTZ.

The National Accountability Group (2006) Participatory service delivery assessment of the activities of local councils in the mental health and sanitation, agriculture and educational sectors in Sierra Leone: A citizen report card on the 19 local councils.

Topuzyan, A. (date unknown) Steps to prevent corruption in the education system in Armenia.

Transparency International (2207) Corruption in the Education Sector. TI Working Paper # 04/2007.

Transparency International Kenya (2006) Integrity Study. Teachers Service Commission. Nairobi. Kenya.

Twaweza (2008) Program Components. Tanzania.

U4 (2006) Corruption in the Education Sector. U4 Issue 4:2006.

U4 (2007) Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys: Lessons from Tanzania. U4 Brief. November 2007. No 14.

U4 (2008) Corruption-free education: Lessons from a state and civil society joint initiative in Peru. U4 Brief, March 2008, No. 6

U4 (2008) Teachers and taxis: corruption in the education sector in Honduras. U4 Brief. May

2008: No 16.

U4 (2008) The power of data: enhancing transparency in the education sector in Sierra Leone. U4 Brief. August 2008, No 22.

U4 (2009) Confronting Corruption in Education: Advancing accountable practices through budget monitoring. U4 Brief. May 2009. No 7.

UNDP (2008) A User's Guide to Measuring Corruption. UNDP: Oslo

UNDP (2008) Preventing Corruption in the Education Sector: International Experiences with Civil Society Involvement. UNDP Policy Note. UNDP Vietnam.

UNDP (2008) Tackling Corruption, Transforming Lives. Accelerating Human Development in Asia and the Pacific.

UNDP (2010) Fighting corruption in post-conflict and recovery situations: learning from the past. UNDP: New York

UNESCO (2005) Decentralisation in Education: national policies and practices. Education Policies and Strategies. UNESCO: Paris

UNESCO (2007) Educational Governance at local level. Division for the Promotion of Basic Education, UNESCO: Paris

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (2004) The Global Programme against corruption: UN Anti-corruption Toolkit. 3rd edition. UNODC: Vienna.

USAID (2009) Anti-corruption Assessment Handbook. Final Report. February 28, 2009. MSI. Coffey International. USAID.

Valk, M., Cunnings, S., van Dam, H. (eds) (2004) Gender, citizenship and governance: A global source book. KIT (Royal Tropical Institute), The Netherlands and Oxfam GB.

van Nuland, S., Khandelwal, BP. (2006) Ethics in education: the role of teacher codes Canada and South Asia. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

Winthrop, R., Graff, C. (2010) Beyond Madrasas: Assessing the links between education and militancy in Pakistan. Center for Universal Education Working Paper 2.

Wood, Hye, Shrivastava Developing a Risk-Reduction Strategy for Financial Management and Governance in PEDP2, 2003. <http://www.efc.co.uk/projects/documents/bangladesh-financial-management-and-governance.pdf>

Workshop: Enhancing transparency and accountability in the education sector in Sierra Leone. Ethics and corruption in education. 2008. UNESCO IIEP: Paris

World Bank (2005) Social Accountability and Participatory Monitoring Approaches in



Armenia. Experiences and Opportunities. A reader. World Bank Armenia.

World Bank (2006) Program document for a proposed Second Programmatic Education Sector Development Support Credit o The people's republic of Bangladesh. Human Development Sector, South Asia Region.

World Bank (2008) Implementation completion and results report on a credit in the amount of 65.60.0 million to the People's Republic of Bangladesh for an Education Sector Development Support Grant. Human Development Sector, South Asia Region.

World Bank Group (2005) Cambodia - Public Expenditure Tracking Survey (PETS) in Primary Education. World Bank Group.

Zillur Rahman, H., Shakhaway Ali, K. (2005) Quest for quality primary education: Where are the entry points? PPRC Policy Brief: Dhaka.

Annex 3. Draft TORs for the country studies

Background

Corruption hinders efforts to achieve the MDGs by reducing access to services and diverting resources away from investments in infrastructure, institutions and social services. Success in meeting the MDGs will therefore largely depend on the 'quality' of governance and the level of effectiveness, efficiency and equity in resource generation, allocation and management.

As highlighted by UNESCO in its Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2009, good governance matters for education. This implies not just transparency and accountability, but also a commitment to equal opportunity for all citizens. Failure to tackle corruption has particular damaging consequences for the poor. When resources do not reach schools, or when schools levy unauthorised fees, it is the poor who are least able to pay. In the absence of good governance, parents and communities face education provision that is unresponsive to their needs and ineffective in raising learning achievements. It leaves communities and regions with children sitting in classrooms lacking basic teaching materials, and supervised by untrained and demotivated teachers. In some cases, bad governance also means that financial resources allocated to schools do not arrive; the teacher quality goes down even if the teacher-student ratio increases, resources are spent ineffectively because of lack of mechanism to monitor and assess the impact; most of all weak decentralised strategy and accountability structure ultimately hinder the progress.

A literature review conducted internationally reveals that anti-corruption (AC) initiatives in the education sector are not well documented or reported upon. Opportunities for sharing learning on best practice across countries and agencies are scarce. Moreover, the literature review establishes the need to increase the understanding of the enabling environment for AC work in education, and to more systematically evaluate AC interventions to gauge their results on corruption reduction, their value added for the education sector in general, and their sustainability.

Purpose and scope

The field research is to look at methods and tools that have been used and describe them in detail, with their contexts, enabling and constraining factors and, to the extent possible assess their success and impact on corruption reduction.

Investigation questions

Core questions:

What are the contextual parameters of corrupt practices and AC initiatives?

What AC interventions have been initiated?

- What were the drivers?
- What specific corruption risks have they addressed?
- What has been the approach of the AC intervention?
- Through what implementation partnership was the intervention conducted?

- How have activities tackled the diverse range of factors of the identified corrupt practice or risk?
- What have been the results of the AC intervention? Supported by what evidence?
- What have been the enabling and hindering factors of the AC intervention's results? How have constraints and obstacles been overcome during intervention implementation?
- What sustainability mechanisms were built into the AC intervention? Have these been effective?
- What lessons can be drawn from the AC intervention?
- What elements of replicability could be singled out from the intervention?

Issues to be explored in field work

Legislation

Where there is AC legislation has it been mediated and specifically operationalised within the education sector?

Has the education sector proved particularly problematic to adopt and implement new legislation for any reason?

How consultative has been the process leading to AC legislation?

What are the enforcement mechanisms in place? Is there evidence of their effectiveness?

Identify what are the sanctions for corrupt practices, whether they have changed and if they have been used.

Specific evidence might be of whether staff have been dismissed for corrupt practices.

Codes of Conduct

Where codes of conduct for education staff and civil servants are in place:

- How were they developed (political will, consultation process, leadership etc)?
- What aspects of behaviour do they cover?
- What are the enforcement mechanisms?
- How have enforcement mechanisms been used?

Better financial systems

Financial management

What is the level of introduction of accounting systems, at sub-national offices and agencies?

Have robust financial management mechanisms been introduced with a specific corruption reduction goal? If so what were the nature, the size and the location of the risks?

For the introduction of new financial management mechanisms:

- Who is involved?
- What are the drivers at government level?
- What administrative structure needs to be in place to enable such mechanisms to have an impact?

School grants disbursement

Where there have been grants to schools:

- How are grants disbursed?
- How are schools being held to account for the grants?
- How are central and district levels accountable to schools re grant disbursement?
- Do approaches anticipate the changes of the introduction of a new financial or disbursement system onto others? How is this done?
- Evaluation of good practices should look at results in the area targeted by AC, but also widely to ensure no transfers have taken place?
- Data collection systems to complement financial management / accounting practices to corroborate what is on paper.

Better systems— independence and externality

- The existence of audit bodies, their status, role and level of authority is to be investigated in the country studies. Examples of investigations by such bodies in the education sector are to be analysed.
- Whether audit comments are followed through and lead to sanctions, in any cases.

Examination, diplomas and entrance to university

- Identify the existence, status and remit of examination or student commissions in country, and articulate their role
- Identify strengths and weaknesses in these

Teacher certification, deployment and salaries

Is there any opportunity for external oversight of procedure in critical points for recruitment and promotion?

What mechanisms are in place to ensure teachers receive their full salary?

School level

How are parents involved in the oversight of schools?

Do parents have opportunities to act against corrupt practices?

Better IT for administration

Are there systems in place? If so are they being used to validate the administrative and financial processes that are at risk?

Is EMIS and TMIS being disseminated in a way that third parties may be able to use it and make reality checks?

Transparency and accountability

Advocacy and awareness-raising

Elements to consider include:

- Enabling and hindering environment of the campaign (political, social, economic, cultural context)

- Partnership: modality, strengths and weaknesses
- Linkages between campaign outputs and transformative actions

Anti-corruption education

This is not a priority area for investigation. However where awareness campaigns and AC education initiatives complement AC interventions in the education sector, they should be reported and analysed to articulate their value added and learn lessons on how best to use them.

More open and transparent systems or procedures

Procurement

What steps have been taken to introduce better procurement systems?

What is done to reduce the risks, especially around textbook supply?

Participatory monitoring and social accountability

Role of SMCs

A potential area of investigation could be whether there are correlations in corruption survey at school level between female head teachers or female chair of SMCs and reduced perception of corruption in comparison to male-led schools.

Budget tracking and monitoring

Score cards

Examples of initiatives that have also included strategies to ensure case follow-up and enforcement of legislation?

Are there initiatives for local oversight of service and/or finance?

Children's monitoring

Are there attempts to empower children, and to provide ways that their voice and knowledge can be mobilised against corruption?

Information and the use of media and information technology

Assess how feely and completely the press reports on corruption and acts to increase public awareness around corruption in education.

Initiatives to curb teacher absenteeism

What are countries doing to ensure attendance of teachers?

What is the evidence at the school level?

Surveys

Has there been a PETS or survey with intention to identify leakage?

What happened to the results?

Capacity development

What initiatives have contributed to anti-corruption efforts in the education sector?



What have been the different methodologies used (target groups, implementation strategies, activities, sustainability elements etc)?