



## LEARNING FROM EXPERIENCE (part 2)

### Recommendations of other Development Organizations (RNSF 2016b)



Project reference:  
EuropeAid/135649/DH/SER/MULTI

Funded by the European Union

Project implemented by:



In collaboration with





# Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

## Research, Network and Support Facility

The **Research, Network and Support Facility** is a European Union-funded project to improve knowledge on ways to enhance the livelihoods of people in the Informal Economy and to increase the social inclusion of vulnerable groups. It is implemented by A.R.S. Progetti S.P.A. in a consortium with Lattanzio Advisory S.p.a. and AGRER S.A. N.V.

July 2016



## This series

This is Volume 4.2 in a series of 9, produced by the Research, Network and Support Facility, a project funded by the European Commission and implemented by a consortium led by A.R.S. Progetti.

- Volume 1      Reference Guide to the Outputs of a Research on the Informal Economy (RNSF 2018d)
- Volume 2      Defining the Informal Economy (RNSF 2017a)
- Volume 3      Policies on the Informal Economy: A Global Review (RNSF 2018a)
- Volume 4.1    Learning from Experience: Good Practices and Lessons Learnt from 33 projects funded by the EU Programme Investing in People launched in 2009 (RNSF 2016a)
- Volume 4.2    Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations (RNSF 2016b)
- Volume 4.3    Learning from Experience: Good Practices and Lessons Learnt from 15 projects funded by the EU (RNSF 2017c)
- Volume 4.4    Learning from Experience: Good Practices and Lessons Learnt from 15 projects funded by the EU Programme Investing in People launched in 2014 (RNSF 2018b)
- Volume 5      Extending Coverage. Social Protection and the Informal Economy. Experiences and Ideas from Researchers and Practitioners (RNSF 2017b)
- Volume 6      Organizar a los trabajadores de la economía informal: estrategias de fortalecimiento y acción colectiva (RNSF 2018c)

All documents are available on <https://europa.eu/capacity4dev/rnsf-mit>

## Authors

The RNSF team was directed by **Daniele Fanciullacci**, chief executive of ARS Progetti S.P.A., and coordinated by **Serena Bove**, project manager. It included the following experts:

- **Mei Zegers**, team leader, January 2015 – July 2016
- **Paolo Carlini**, team leader since July 2016
- **Jacques Charmes**, research expert
- **Alessio Lupi**, project officer
- **Pierre Berman**, communication assistant.

The present document was realised by **Mei Zegers**.

## Disclaimer

The current document is presented by ARS Progetti. It does not necessarily reflect the views and opinions of the European Commission.

## Contents

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>8</b>
Background .....	8
Methodology .....	9
Research question 1: Enabling environment .....	10
Research question 2: Decent work and enterprise growth .....	11
Research question 3: Direct actions in communities .....	11
Research question 4: Approaches to enhance livelihoods, equity and inclusion .....	13
 <b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	 <b>16</b>
 <b>METHODOLOGY.....</b>	 <b>18</b>
 <b>RESEARCH QUESTION 1: ENABLING ENVIRONMENT .....</b>	 <b>22</b>
1.1. Global and regional strategies for livelihoods with attention to social inclusion.....	22
1.2. Advocacy methods on IE legal and policy framework development.....	25
1.3. Supportive legal frameworks development, adoption and implementation .....	27
1.4. Identification of relevant policy frameworks and development of appropriate actions .....	30
1.5. Key elements in policy frameworks identification .....	34
1.6. Improvement of impact of policy frameworks .....	36
1.7. Institution and capacity strengthening on IE .....	38
1.8. Organising informal economy groups .....	47
1.9. Value chains and adding value to value chain components .....	51
1.10. Improving linkages between formal and informal economy .....	58
1.11. Coordination and sustainability planning .....	60
 <b>RESEARCH QUESTION 2: DECENT WORK AND ENTERPRISE GROWTH .....</b>	 <b>72</b>
2.1. Promotion and implementation of decent work .....	72
2.2. Formalising work in IE .....	75
2.3. OSH implementation in IE .....	80
2.4. Environment and sustainable management and the informal economy .....	83
 <b>RESEARCH QUESTION 3: DIRECT ACTIONS IN COMMUNITIES .....</b>	 <b>88</b>
3.1. Social behaviour change communications .....	89
3.2. Entrepreneurship: Capacity strengthening on economic activities .....	92
3.3. Information technology and enhancing of livelihoods of people dependent on the IE.....	106
3.4. Leadership, life skills, empowerment training, literacy/numeracy .....	108
3.5. Microfinance.....	111

3.6.	Vocational education/skills training .....	121
3.7.	Labour market analysis to determine types of education/training provided .....	132

#### **RESEARCH QUESTION 4: APPROACHES TO ENHANCE LIVELIHOODS, EQUITY AND INCLUSION..... 137**

4.1.	Social dialogue and IE .....	139
4.2.	Social inclusion promotion (awareness raising on social inclusion in IE).....	144
4.3.	Social protection .....	148
4.4.	Improving food security through enhancing livelihoods of people dependent on IE .....	154
4.5.	Strengthening IE with attention to gender issues.....	156
4.6.	Strengthening IE with attention to youth and children .....	172
4.7.	Strengthening IE with attention to people affected by HIV .....	175
4.8.	Strengthening IE with attention to people with disabilities .....	178
4.9.	Strengthening IE with attention to the elderly .....	180
4.10.	Strengthening IE with attention to migrants, refugees, trafficked persons .....	181
4.11.	Strengthening IE with attention to general or other specific vulnerable groups .....	188

#### **ANNEXOVERVIEW OF CRITERIA FOR SELECTION OF GOOD PRACTICE, LESSONS AND SUMMARY OF RESEARCH MATRIX..... 190**

#### **REFERENCES..... 193**

## Acronyms

ACF International	Action Against Hunger International
Cap4Dev	Capacity for Development
CGIAR	Consortium of International Agricultural Research Centers
CIG	Common Interest Groups
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DEW	Digital Early Warning
DFID	Department for International Development
E-FACE	Ethiopians Fighting Against Child Exploitative Labor
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
IE	Informal Economy
IESF	Informal Economy Support Facility
IFPRI	International Food Policy Research Institute
IFRC	International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
IOM	International Organization for Migration
IT	Information Technologies
ITP	International Training Programme
IZA	Institute for the Study of Labor
LIFT	Livelihood and Food Security Trust Fund
NRC	Norwegian Refugee Council
OPHI	Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
RNSF	Research, Network and Support Facility
SEWA	Self Employed Women's Association

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

SIDA	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
SIYB	Start and Improve Your Business
SWE	Small Water Enterprises
TAMKIN	Municipal Capacity Building and Service Delivery Program (translation of Arabic name)
TVET	Technical vocational education and training
TVET-R	Technical vocational education and training reform
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WFP	World Food Programme
WIEGO	Women in Informal Employment Globalizing and Organising



## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

People dependent on the informal economy (IE) often work in situations that are characterised as low-paid with poor job security and low compliance in terms of core labour rights and all other aspects of the Decent Work Agenda.<sup>1</sup>One of the principal factors that define livelihoods in developing countries is the high proportion of people whose livelihoods depend on the informal economy (IE). The Research, Network and Support Facility (RNSF) has already published the first volume in a series of to identify means to strengthen the support, access to decent work and long-term poverty reduction for people dependent on the IE. RNSF 2016a analysed European Commission financed projects. The core of the current report (RNSF 2017a) covers principal recommendations based on an analysis of projects and documents financed and implemented by other agencies.<sup>2</sup>The analysed documents all include a strong focus on field development experiences with people dependent on the IE. Note that RNSF 2017a is primarily a reference document that allows readers to look up recommendations to consider when implementing specific types of approaches in programming on social inclusion and the IE.

The current report is a contribution to the development of the corpus of research under the European Commission-funded Research, Network and Support Facility (RNSF).The report summarises good practices and lessons learned extracted from an analysis of 202 documents including 171 mid-term, final, and impact evaluations as well larger meta evaluations of multiple projects. Projects from Africa, Asia, Latin America and Eastern Europe were reviewed. Funding and implementing agencies of the analysed projects included the ILO, World Bank, USAID, DFID, WFP, UNIDO and FAO.

The good practices and lessons learned with their corresponding recommendations are organised to provide a broad set of inputs in line with the approved RNSF Research Matrix. The RNSF Research Matrix was presented in the RNSF Inception Report<sup>3</sup> and has recently been streamlined based on actual experience of the analysis of existing information.

RNSF 2017a is part of the initial phase of the RNSF design and methodology. A next volume will focus in greater detail on European Commission priority areas. For 2015 the European Commission has requested a focus on social protection and vocational education and skills training. Other priority areas are expected to be added in 2017. These analyses—and additional volumes—will culminate in a final synthesis document that focuses on the most important findings at the end of the RNSF implementation period at the end of 2018.

## Background

The European Commission funded thematic programme "Investing in People" pursues a broad approach to development and poverty reduction, with the general aim of improving human and social development levels in partner countries including in the informal economy.<sup>4</sup>The RNSF was launched

---

<sup>1</sup>Extracted from Terms of Reference EuropeAid/135649/DH/SER/MULTI

<sup>2</sup> See Table 2 below

<sup>3</sup>Research Network and Support Facility : «Support to enhance livelihoods for people dependent on the informal economy and improve social inclusion of marginalised and vulnerable persons», Inception Report Month 1-3

<sup>4</sup>Extracted from Terms of Reference EuropeAid/135649/DH/SER/MULTI

to contribute to strengthening the related thematic programming on livelihoods enhancement, equity and inclusion of people dependent on the informal economy. More specifically, the Research, Network and Support Facility (RNSF) is being implemented as part of the European Commission programme, “Support to enhance livelihoods for people dependent on informal economy and improve social inclusion of marginalised and vulnerable persons”-EuropeAid/135649/DH/SER/MULTI.

The RNSF has two complementary purposes:

- Develop a corpus of research on innovative approaches to livelihood enhancement, equity and inclusion of people dependent on the informal economy, including through analysis and evidence based information from literature, the projects selected through a call for proposals<sup>5</sup>, as well as other relevant projects and initiatives.
- Make use of the outputs of the research and provide support to projects selected through the European Commission call for proposals 135181 in order to provide them with a support facility.

RNSF 2017a contributes to fulfilling these two purposes in a substantial way.

It is important to note that not all of the information identified could be called “innovative” but has, nevertheless been included in the analysis. This is mainly because, as the conclusions from the evaluations show, many quite obvious concepts in project implementation are still not being sufficiently implemented. Examples include the importance of supporting the organising of people dependent on the IE to advocate for their own rights. As a consequence, where the documentation clearly re-emphasises the importance of implementing such concepts, they have been reiterated in the recommendations contained in RNSF 2017a.

## Methodology

The term “people dependent on the informal economy”<sup>6</sup> was used broadly in the search for information for RNSF 2017a. Using an ILO definition of Informal Economy, the search encompassed evaluations and analyses that used terms such as “livelihoods”, “income generating activities”, and of course, “informal economy”.<sup>7</sup> Note that within the framework of the RNSF the informal economy thus refers to all economic activities of workers and economic units that are—in law or in practice—not covered or insufficiently covered by formal arrangements. The law is not applied or not enforced or the law discourages compliance, because it is inappropriate, burdensome, or imposes excessive costs.

Data sources: Evaluations and other information on 202 selected projects, case studies, and situation analyses, international literature review documents, international agencies’ reviews of strategies, and research reports.

Data analysis methods: Establishment of criteria for selection of good practices and lessons learned; thematic and comparative analysis of effectiveness of strategies and extent to which strategies were

---

<sup>5</sup> Specifically: Call for proposals EC 135181

<sup>6</sup> That is the people who are the subject of the RNSF

<sup>7</sup> ILO (2007): “Gender, Employment and the Informal Economy”. Available from: <http://goo.gl/sqItjp>.

Website accessed on 30.3.2015

implemented and useful. The team uses the qualitative data analysis software Atlas.ti<sup>8</sup> to ensure a well-organised and consistent analysis of the available information. The team that conducted the current analysis was composed of Mei Zegers, RNSF Team Leader, and Vittorio Giorgetti, Research Assistant.

Some common threads can be discerned from the analysis and resulting recommendations. While the subject areas may be different, the recommended solutions may be the same. The most important commonalities that were identified are summarised below under each of the four main RNSF research questions.<sup>9</sup>

Below is a summary of recommendations based on RNSF analysis of documents covered in RNSF 2017a.

### Research question 1: Enabling environment

#### Principal research question details

What are the key ways to successfully support the enabling environment at national and sub-national level for enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion? This includes legal and policy framework development, institution and capacity strengthening as well as coordination.

#### Summary of recommendations

- 1) Promote inter-country exchange on supporting decent work and poverty reduction with people dependent on the informal economy (IE). Place particular emphasis on exchange between countries in the same region and consider national context and priorities. Establish and/or support inter-country networks to facilitate exchange.
- 2) Use a two-pronged approach in projects of all sizes on the IE: 1) strengthen the enabling environment with government and non-state actors with regard to the IE 2) engage in community level actions on the IE with the full participation of relevant local actors.
- 3) Engage in advocacy using very high quality data to identify gaps and strengthen holistic legal and policy frameworks approaches on the IE. Include people dependent on the IE in advocacy.
- 4) Support national and sub-national development, implementation and enforcement of relevant legal and policy frameworks on decent work and poverty reduction for people dependent on the IE.
- 5) Provide support for excellent coordination, institutional and capacity strengthening with actors across IE related subjects at national and all sub-national levels (including to communities).

---

<sup>8</sup> See Atlas.ti.com for details.

<sup>9</sup> Please note that a fifth research question pertains to the functioning of the RNSF project itself and is not included in the current analysis.

Include focus on detailed and clearly formulated strategies for planning and prioritising actions on the IE at all levels.

- 6) Promote linkages between private and public sector with people dependent on the IE. Include support for value chain development analysis in critical areas of benefit to the IE.

## Research question 2: Decent work and enterprise growth

### Principal research question details

What key elements were proven to contribute to successful formalisation of growth oriented informal economy enterprises and that help ensure informal economy decent work conditions?

### Summary of recommendations

- 1) Support clear, transparent and inclusive formalisation processes with individual and groups of people in the IE. Ensure tailor made formalisation strategies that are in line with the local realities.
- 2) Promote and smooth access to relevant services that support people dependent on the IE. Include dissemination of information on available services to service providers and people dependent on the IE. Support the development of results-based management tracking and quality of access to services.
- 3) Based monitoring to measure extent of use of services.
- 4) Support strengthening of Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) provisions for people dependent on the IE and ensure their awareness of such provisions. Include making of business case for OSH in the IE with national to community level stakeholders.
- 5) Ensure that analysis of environmental sustainability is included as a cross cutting consideration in the design of all projects and/or programmes on the IE. Promote green jobs in the IE and ensure good articulation of such jobs in value chains.

## Research question 3: Direct actions in communities

### Principal research question details

What are the key proven direct actions at local level that contribute to the successful enhancement of livelihoods and working conditions for those working in informal economy enterprises with special attention to social inclusion?

### General finding

Note that holistic approaches to projects tend to have better results. A criterion for the level of holistic approaches used in the project, including establishing linkages with various stakeholders, should be included in monitoring programming.

### Summary of recommendations

- 1) Conduct assessment to identify the most likely successful community level mechanisms to support people dependent on the IE in a specific context. Avoid provision of standard support packages across all settings. Review the need for comparatively higher focus on different means of support such as training, mentoring, mobile technologies and/or micro-finance (or other actions) in accordance with situation. Design support accordingly.
- 2) Determine need for relative emphasis of content when carrying out activities on leadership/group management, life skills, rights awareness, versus enterprise development and operations. Within enterprise development content, analyse relative need for focus of support on business feasibility, production, marketing, finance and human resources management. Prioritise enterprise support in accordance with identified needs.
- 3) Support social behaviour change communications (SBCC) on the rights of people dependent on the IE to decent work conditions and environmental sustainability of IE work with all stakeholders. Incorporate innovative means, including digital technologies, to raise awareness and carry out project actions. Ensure that sufficient time and resources are allocated for this purpose.
- 4) Ensure clear and detailed operational targets on IE that are set with the participation of stakeholders over a realistic implementation time period. Ensure that implementers have the necessary capacities to provide needed support to reach the targets in the local context, including on mobile technologies.
- 5) Ensure good fit between the needs of people dependent on the IE in a specific context and available micro finance services. Promote training on financial education among stakeholders including implementing agencies and IE community members. Provide follow-up mentoring and support to ensure community members are able to use available micro finance services following financial education.
- 6) Provide a life cycle approach to design of financial services. Promote savings and not only credit activities. Ensure adapted and clear loan repayment mechanisms.
- 7) Ensure vocational education and skills training corresponds to labour market needs in accordance with thorough analysis. Include private and public sector in the analysis.
- 8) Engage in mapping of available training services and carry out assessment of fit between applicants' wishes, labour market needs and available training services. Include analysis of apprenticeship/mentoring possibilities with formal and informal enterprises. Provide support for job placement and/or launching of self-employment prior to completion of training.

## Research question 4: Approaches to enhance livelihoods, equity and inclusion

### Principal research question details

What (innovative) approaches do national and international entities use to enhance livelihoods, equity and inclusion of people dependent on the informal economy? What are the new strategies adopted by people relying on informal economy activities themselves?

### Summary of recommendations

- 1) Promote and facilitate social dialogue and participation between key stakeholders in the design, planning and dissemination of results on IE related programming. Facilitate formation of associations and other groups of people dependent on the IE. Ensure that well-functioning networks of key stakeholders are created at national, local and community level to strengthen the socio-economic position of people dependent on the IE. Support programming to facilitate awareness raising of people dependent on the IE about their democratic rights in elections and organising. Give marginalised persons a voice in governance and investment decision on issues related to socio-economic development. Design and implement long term methods to continuously share progress, good practices and lessons learned on IE issues using mass media, digital social media, and traditional means.
- 2) Ensure that the design and implementation of social protection programming specifically includes attention to people dependent on the IE. This should include the design of relevant types of social protection, including access to micro-insurance support specifically oriented to people dependent on the IE. Verify alignment of IE related project activities with available government social protection services. Ensure the input of people from the IE into design and implementation processes of social protection programming and adjust content in line with their evolving needs. Take into consideration that needs of people dependent on the IE may change during their life cycle and that their socio-economic context may also change. As a result, ensure flexibility in social protection programming. Adjust available social protection services over time and for different categories of people dependent on the IE using good practices and lessons learned from experienced IE support groups. Provide support to facilitate access of people dependent on the IE to relevant social protection services while ensuring that service providers have the needed capacities.
- 3) Include attention to food security issues—such as nutrition education and access to quality food—in programming with people dependent on the IE who have special food security vulnerabilities.
- 4) Address power imbalances that perpetuate the dependence of vulnerable groups on IE employment. Ensure that planning not only focuses on inclusion of adequate quotas of women/men and other groups in project activities but also pays attention to righting imbalances regarding access to resources to develop economic activities and a voice in decision making. This may include training and mentoring on social and economic empowerment of women as well as people from various vulnerable groups. Include men in awareness raising on women's roles and rights in the IE.

- 5) Carry out gender analysis and/or other analysis of other vulnerable groups dependent on the IE with regard to their roles and responsibilities in the household and the community and other relevant issues. Include analysis of differences in access to and control over resources and decision-making, factors that constrain or facilitate equal participation of women and men in community development processes and the different capacities, needs and priorities of women and men. Draw on the existing knowledge and capacities of women, men, boys and girls. Make use of existing tools on gender analysis (see body of the report). Use the acquired information to design and implement programming to support vulnerable groups who are dependent on the IE.
- 6) Ensure that gender issues are well articulated in programme design and implementation taking the different needs of women and men dependent on the IE into account. Where other groups such as youth, people with disabilities, living with or affected by HIV, the elderly, refugees and others are included in IE programming, ensure that their needs are equally considered. Take into account that the needs of these different groups within a single project may differ from each other. Encourage cross-linkages between projects on the IE and other development initiatives oriented to such vulnerable groups.
- 7) Consider the logistics ability of women and girls, youth, people with disabilities, living with HIV, refugees and the elderly to access support training and other activities organised with people dependent on the IE. Adapt training materials and other means of support so that various groups can access, understand and fully use them in their work in the informal economy and/or for formalising their activities. Support the development of labour saving devices to lighten household and IE related workload of vulnerable groups.
- 8) Use holistic approaches to address the needs of youth dependent on the IE to reach their full potential through provision of support for access and development of their:
  - General education
  - Technical work as well as behavioural skills such as team work and time management
  - Self-reliance
  - Knowledge of their rights and responsibilities
- 9) In the case of actions to eliminate hazardous child labour, aside from provision of SBCC, ensure that programming emphasis is placed on:
  - Development of sustainable decent work options for household members
  - Links to and capacity strengthening of available government/non state actors to provide economic empowerment support to families of child labourers.
  - Supportive legal and policy frameworks
  - Provision of access to available social protection services
- 10) Support economic empowerment of refugees as well as the communities in which they are situated whenever relevant. Study the contexts in both sending and receiving locations to ensure that appropriate economic empowerment programming is developed. Provide re-entry livelihoods support if and when refugees can return home. Support economic empowerment as well as

activities against trafficking and exploitation in post-disaster situations. Pay special attention to address the risks of children who are vulnerable in disasters and refugee situations to trafficking and other worst forms of child labour.



## INTRODUCTION

People dependent on the informal economy (IE) often work in situations that are characterised as low-paid with poor job security and low compliance in terms of core labour rights and all other aspects of the Decent Work Agenda.<sup>10</sup> One of the principal factors that define livelihoods in developing countries is the high proportion of people whose livelihoods depend on the informal economy. The Research, Network and Support Facility (RNSF) has already published the first volume in a series of to identify a range of subject areas to strengthen the support, access to decent work and long-term poverty reduction for people dependent on the IE. RNSF 2016a analysed European Commission financed projects. The core of the current report (RNSF 2017a) covers principal recommendations based on an analysis of projects and documents financed and implemented by other agencies.<sup>11</sup> The analysed documents all include a strong focus on field development experiences with people dependent on the IE. Note that RNSF 2017a is primarily a reference document that allows readers to look up recommendations to consider when implementing specific types of approaches in programming on social inclusion and the IE.

The current report is thus the second contribution to the development of the corpus of research under the European Commission-funded Research, Network and Support Facility (RNSF). The report summarises recommendations based on good practices, lessons learned and conclusions extracted from an analysis of 202 documents. The documents include 171 mid-term, final, and impact evaluations as well as larger meta evaluations of multiple projects. Projects from Africa, Asia, Latin America and Eastern Europe were reviewed. Funding and implementing agencies of the analysed projects included the ILO, World Bank, USAID, DFID, WFP, UNIDO and FAO.

The good practices and lessons learned with their corresponding recommendations are organised to provide a broad set of inputs in line with the approved RNSF Research Matrix. The RNSF Research Matrix was presented in the RNSF Inception Report<sup>12</sup> and has recently been streamlined based on actual experience of the analysis of existing information.

RNSF 2017a is part of the initial phase of the RNSF design and methodology. A next volume will focus in greater detail on European Commission priority areas. For 2015 the European Commission has requested a focus on social protection and vocational education and skills training. Other priority areas are expected to be added in 2017. These analyses—and additional volumes—will culminate in a final synthesis document that focuses on the most important findings at the end of the RNSF implementation period at the end of 2018.

For individuals who have not read RNSF 2016a, we present a brief background to explain the purpose of the current document.

The European Commission funded thematic programme "Investing in People" pursues a broad approach to development and poverty reduction, with the general aim of improving human and social development levels in partner countries including in the informal economy.<sup>13</sup> The RNSF was launched

---

<sup>10</sup> Extracted from Terms of Reference EuropeAid/135649/DH/SER/MULTI

<sup>11</sup> See Table 2 below

<sup>12</sup> Research Network and Support Facility : «Support to enhance livelihoods for people dependent on informal economy and improve social inclusion of marginalised and vulnerable persons», Inception Report Month 1-3.

<sup>13</sup> Extracted from Terms of Reference EuropeAid/135649/DH/SER/MULTI

to contribute to strengthening the related thematic programming on livelihoods enhancement, equity and inclusion of people dependent on the informal economy. More specifically, the Research, Network and Support Facility (RNSF) is being implemented as part of the European Commission programme, “Support to enhance livelihoods for people dependent on informal economy and improve social inclusion of marginalised and vulnerable persons”-EuropeAid/135649/DH/SER/MULTI.

The RNSF has two complementary purposes:

- Develop a corpus of research on innovative approaches to livelihood enhancement, equity and inclusion of people dependent on the informal economy, including through analysis and evidence based information from literature, the projects selected through a call for proposals<sup>14</sup>, as well as other relevant projects and initiatives.
- Make use of the outputs of the research and provide support to projects selected through the European Commission call for proposals 135181 in order to provide them with a support facility.

RNSF 2017a contributes to fulfilling these two purposes in a substantial way.

It is important to note that not all of the information identified could be called “innovative” but has, nevertheless been included in the analysis. This is mainly because, as the conclusions from the evaluations show, many quite obvious concepts in project implementation are still not being sufficiently implemented. Examples include the importance of supporting the organising of people dependent on the IE to advocate for their own rights. As a consequence, where the documentation clearly re-emphasises the importance of implementing such concepts, they have been reiterated in the recommendations contained in RNSF 2017a.

Due to the large amount of data and findings and the need to synthesise the findings, the body of the report provides recommendations for implementing support for people dependent on the IE. The recommendations are organised into categories that are in line with the RNSF Research Matrix.

Sections 1 and 2 cover the introduction and methodology. Section 3 is structured in accordance with the RNSF Research matrix and focuses on providing recommendations/guidelines to consider when providing support to people dependent on the IE in specific subject areas. (See the Table of Contents and the Recommendations for the list). The findings of RNSF 2017a will be disseminated in report format in different media sites. They will also be provided using an index based format on the Capacity for Development(Cap4Dev) website in the Informal Economy Support Facility (IESF) group.<sup>15</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup> Specifically: Call for proposals EC 135181

<sup>15</sup> See website, <http://capacity4dev.ec.europa.eu/iesf/minisite/welcome>

## METHODOLOGY

The term “people dependent on the informal economy”<sup>16</sup> was used broadly in the search for information for RNSF 2017a. Using an ILO definition of Informal Economy, the search encompassed evaluations and analyses that used terms such as “livelihoods”, “income generating activities”, and of course, “informal economy”.<sup>17</sup> Note that within the framework of the RNSF the informal economy thus refers to alleconomicactivities of workersandeconomicunitsthatare—in law or in practice—not coveredorinsufficientlycoveredbyformalarrangements. The law is not applied or not enforced or the law discourages compliance, because it is inappropriate, burdensome, orimposes excessive costs.

### Data sources

Evaluations and other information on selected projects, case studies, and situation analyses, international literature review documents, international agencies’ reviews of strategies, and research reports.

### Data analysis methods

Establishment of criteria for selection of good practices and lessons learned; thematic and comparative analysis of effectiveness of strategies and extent to which strategies were implemented and useful.

Please refer to RNSF 2016a and Recommendations for details on the methodology for the identification good practices and lessons learned. In summary, however, we repeat a few of the main points here.

The RNSF selected 7 criteria for the identification of a good practice. The good practice should include as many as possible of the criteria. Good practices should thus be:

- Effective and successful
- Innovative and creative
- Environmentally, economically and socially sustainable
- Gender sensitive
- Technically feasible
- Inherently participatory
- Replicable and adaptable.

---

<sup>16</sup> That is the people who are the subject of the RNSF

<sup>17</sup> ILO (2007): “Gender, Employment and the Informal Economy”. Available from: <http://goo.gl/sqltjp>.

Website accessed on 30.3.2015

In reality, however, it is rare to find that all these criteria are met in a single good practice. For the purpose of our research we thus identify good practices that meet as many as possible of these criteria.

With respect to the identification of lessons learned, several selection criteria were determined. The lesson learned must be a description of what was learned from past experience(s) that can be used to inform new planning of strategies and actions. From this perspective a lesson should thus contribute to the improvement of knowledge for better decision-making and, consequently, contribute to improved program or project performance, outcome, or impact. The lesson learned can be positive or negative. They can be negative in terms of identifying (an) element(s) that should not be repeated in future planning. They can also include the identification of specific positive experiences which need to be taken into account when engaging in planning.

RNSF 2017a is structured in accordance with the Research Matrix that has been developed to structure the RNSF research. The team uses the qualitative data analysis software Atlas.ti<sup>18</sup> to ensure a well-organised and consistent analysis of the available information.

The team that conducted the current analysis was composed of Mei Zegers, RNSF consultant, and Vittorio Giorgetti, Research Assistant. To ensure that the team could easily quote the documents, it was decided to use only documentation that is available in the public domain, that is, on the Internet. Thus the team identified evaluation reports and other documents that might have relevance for the purpose of the research. Many more documents were reviewed than were actually used in the analysis but they were rejected because they were not sufficiently relevant to the subject. Rejected documents are not cited in the reference list but total more than 50 documents.

Tables 1, 2 and 3 provide an overview of the types of documents, donor and/or implementing agencies and countries represented in the analysis.

**Table 1. Type of analysed document by frequency**

Type of document	Frequency
Final evaluation	79
Midterm or interim evaluation	28
Impact evaluation	18
Thematic evaluation	11
Meta-analysis evaluation <sup>19</sup>	30
Final project/program report	5
General background document on issues in our research matrix	23
Review of multiple projects and/or actions	5
Other	3
Total	202

---

<sup>18</sup> See Atlas.ti com for details.

<sup>19</sup> A meta-analysis evaluation is an evaluation of multiple projects

**Table 2. Number of documents reviewed by types of institutions**

Institution	Frequency
ILO	53
USAID	20
World Bank	13
Welthungerhilfe	10
UNIDO	10
Research Network and Support Facility	8
FAO	6
OXFAM	6
DFID	5
DANIDA	4
SIDA	3
Social Impact Inc.	3
IFPRI	3
UNDP	2
UNHCR	2
ACF International	2
IZA	2
UNICEF	2
EVAL Partners	2
Other institutions <sup>20</sup>	4
Journals, publishing houses <sup>21</sup>	12
<b>Total number of different institutions</b>	<b>61<sup>22</sup></b>

**Table 3. Regional areas represented in documents consulted**

Region	Number of documents
Eastern and Southern Africa	67
South Asia	33
East Asia and the Pacific	31
Latin America and Caribbean	20
Middle East and North Africa	19
West and Central Africa	19

### Notes to consider when reviewing the recommendations

As already specified in the introduction, RNSF 2017apivots around four main research questions. Several sub-topics were includedundereach research question.The Team Leader and the Research

20 World Vision, National Bureau of Economic Research, Norwegian Refugee Council, CGIAR, Save the Children, US Department of Labor, Development Training Service, Spanish Red Cross, Global Village Energy Partnership, Acumen, ARS Progetti, CARE Australia, European Union, Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Grameen Foundation, University of Irvine, International union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Research, IOM, Knowledge Transer Africa, LIFT, OPHI, United Nations University World Institute for Development Economics Research, IFRC, MIT, Practical Action, CIAT, AEASA, Norwegian University of Life Sciences, IIED, Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Microfinance Opportunities, DEW, Overseas Development Institute, WFP, WIEGO, OECD, CARE Bangladesh, UNAIDS, African Development Bank, IDB, EES.

21 The Journal of Development Studies (2), American Economic Journal, Elsevier (3), Springer, Journal of Social Aspect of HIV, American Economic Review, Development Policy Review, Routledge, New Agriculturist

22 Not counting journals/publishing houses

Assistant drew on 202 documents released by International institutions, development agencies and NGOs to identify relevant recommendations.

Each sub-topic of the Research Matrix that is unfolded from page 21 onwards includes:

- Indicators and data analysis methods that were used to extract the good practices and the lessons learned.
- Recommendations, based on the findings laid out in the documents that were reviewed.. Each recommendation is supported with evidence samples and relevant references.

The recommendations are frequently based directly on the evaluation reports and other documents that were reviewed. This is to ensure that they are rooted in the actual findings of the evaluators in the field and are not based on personal opinion of the RNSF experts. Nevertheless, the experts only included recommendations that they agreed with based on the provided evidence and experience from previous field work.

In some cases, the resulting recommendations based on Good Practices and Lessons Learned overlap. Consequently, some recommendations are grouped together and the respective evidence source numbering may not be sequential.

Some common threads can be discerned in the recommendations. While the subject areas may be different, the recommended solutions may be the same. Slightly different perspectives have also resulted in separate though related recommendations under the same specific Research Matrix heading. The most important commonalities that were identified are summarised in text boxes under each of the four main research questions.

## RESEARCH QUESTION 1: ENABLING ENVIRONMENT

**Principal research question details:** What are the key ways to successfully support the enabling environment at national and sub-national level for enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion? This includes legal and policy framework development, institution and capacity strengthening as well as coordination.

### Summary of recommendations on enabling environment strengthening

1. Promote inter-country exchange on supporting decent work and poverty reduction with people dependent on the informal economy (IE). Place particular emphasis on exchange between countries in the same region and consider national context and priorities. Establish and/or support inter-country networks to facilitate exchange.
2. Use a two pronged approach in projects of all sizes on the IE: 1) strengthen the enabling environment with government and non-state actors with regard to the IE 2) engage in community level actions on the IE with the full participation of relevant local actors.
3. Engage in advocacy using very high quality data to identify gaps and strengthen holistic legal and policy frameworks approaches on the IE. Include people dependent on the IE in advocacy.
4. Support national and sub-national development, implementation and enforcement of relevant legal and policy frameworks on decent work and poverty reduction for people dependent on the IE.
5. Provide support for excellent coordination, institutional and capacity strengthening with actors across IE related subjects at national and all sub-national levels (including to communities). Include focus on detailed and clearly formulated strategies for planning and prioritising actions on the IE at all levels.
6. Promote linkages between private and public sector with people dependent on the IE. Include support for value chain development analysis in critical areas of benefit to the IE.

### 1.1. Global and regional strategies for livelihoods with attention to social inclusion

**Indicators:** a) Key global and regional economic and social strategies for enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion identified.

b) Effectiveness of global and regional strategies for implementation at country level assessed.

**Data analysis:** Establishment of criteria for selection of strategies. Thematic and comparative analysis of effectiveness of global and regional strategies of extent to which strategies have been implemented and useful.

- 1) *Promote and facilitate South-South exchange* on experience with programming on the IE among target countries as a means toward further capacity development. Use national examples at world and/or regional level to promote approaches to women's entrepreneurship and gender). This should include the creation, support and sharing of national experiences on growing women's entrepreneurship and gender equality with special attention to those who are dependent on the IE.

Based on evidence, the evaluation suggested “further promotion of South-South exchange among the target countries as a means toward further capacity development.”	Jersild, Amy, 2014, Good Governance through Labour Administration and Labour Inspection – Final Evaluation, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: China, Costa Rica, Indonesia, Lebanon, Namibia, South Africa, Ukraine, Vietnam.
The evaluation found that the program has raised awareness among regional actors of the importance of promoting women's entrepreneurship and gender equality using national experience. A bottom-up approach was a major strength of the programme. It was responsive to national priorities and focus on national partners.	Mauer, Ralf, 2013, Decent work results and effectiveness of ILO technical cooperation: a meta-analysis of project evaluations, 2011–2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva. Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Phase III, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

### 2) For a good analysis and well-founded conclusions of the synthesis results of complex regional projects on the IE:

- *Recognise that an understanding of the context*, that is the culture and socio-economic situation of *each* of the included countries is necessary.
- *Develop criteria for the selection of countries* so that they can be grouped and managed in a coherent way. Selecting countries in a single region is one way to accomplish this. Another is to select countries that face similar issues or stages with regard to development of their programming on addressing issues of people dependent on the informal economy. Countries within one region may vary substantially which needs to be kept in mind when selecting countries.
- *Select countries with common characteristics* when the purpose is to identify global and regional economic and/or social strategies on the IE. This facilitates learning as opposed to selecting countries with a great variety of contexts. Too much variety leads to implementation confusion, inefficiency and lack of a coherent drawing of lessons and identification of good practices. Where there is too much variety, there are too many confounding factors to understand impact which makes it difficult to draw overall conclusions about how to strengthen the position of people dependent on the IE.

The evaluation found that results in complex regional projects are highly context specific and understanding of the context, culture, socio-economic situation, are key elements of analysis.	Bugnion de Moreta, Christian; Pedraza Isaza, DanielHongman ; Lam Ba Nguyen, Zhang; Owusu; Sandra, Christian Bugnion de Moreta (Lead Evaluator), Daniel Pedraza Isaza, Hongman Zhang, Lam Ba Nguyen, Sandra Owusu, 2012, SCORE - Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
Project evaluation findings conclusions and recommendations: “An additional consideration in the choice of countries at the start of programming may be a combination of countries that would effectively facilitate identified learning objectives and form a basis or rationale for desired outcomes. A regional approach might effectively accomplish this, or a selection of countries based on identified common characteristics. These	Jersild, Amy, 2014, Good Governance through Labour Administration and Labour Inspection – Final Evaluation, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: China, Costa Rica, Indonesia, Lebanon, Namibia, South



## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

might include countries facing similar issues with regard to furthering dialogue with social partners or countries at varying stages in the development of their labour inspection systems or training programs.”	Africa, Ukraine, Vietnam. Zegers, Mei, 2015, External Independent Interim Evaluation of Country Level Engagement and Assistance to Reduce (CLEAR) Child Labor Project, Midterm or interim evaluation, US Department of Labor, Washington DC, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Paraguay, Philippines, Suriname, Uganda.
The evaluation found that there were some criteria for country selection included in process documents but these did not include criteria to group countries by type. This resulted in a mix of countries from different regions with highly varying contexts, needs, population size and past experience that made it very difficult to identify global good practices and lessons learned.	Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries.

- 3) *Support the carrying out of regional studies* on informality and rural employment. Ensure that such studies analyse the regional and national socio-economic and political context to facilitate the implementation of labour norms.

<p>The evaluation identified a need for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Studies and policy advice on informality and rural employment across the Northern Africa region.</li> <li>More information about application of labour norms and their operationalisation</li> <li>Ensuring as far as possible that all materials are available in Arabic</li> </ul>	Guzman, Francisco L. et al, 2014, Independent evaluation of ILO Decent Work Country Programme Strategies and Activities in North Africa: 2010-2013, Thematic evaluation, ILO. Geneva, Covered countries: Algeria, Egypt, Eritrea, Libya, Morocco, South Sudan, Sudan and Tunisia.
--	---

- 4) Develop clear strategies to establish national and international networks on the IE and formalising. Strategies should include methodologies for keeping donors close to national stakeholders even after the end of a project through follow up missions and other type of contacts.

The evaluation noted that in SIDA's International Training Programme (ITP), apart from the networking that took place during the training programme itself, the networks that were formed were only done so on an ad-hoc basis. A clear strategy and purpose for the networking had not emerged. The opportunity to strengthen national networking through an active support from the SIDA representation at the Swedish Embassies in the participating countries was missed as did the opportunity to have a more frequent presence in the participating countries through follow-up missions. One of the main benefits of networking is access to information, through for example, improving the research and information management skills of the participants, e.g. by improving Internet based research skills.	Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.
---	---

## 1.2. Advocacy methods on IE legal and policy framework development

**Indicators:** Effective advocacy methods on IE legal and policy framework development identified with primary focus on national level.

**Data analysis:** Identification of advocacy methods in project countries. Identification of criteria for determining effectiveness. Thematic analysis of advocacy methods effectiveness using a systems analysis approach (how advocacy has contributed to improving the enabling environment).

- 1) *Develop Media and Advocacy Strategy at the outset* of program implementation (design phase) in projects on the IE. The plan should specify the type of messages, advocacy campaigns and strategies to be used for the main messages to be mainstreamed and effectively implemented.

The evaluation found that media and advocacy strategies should be developed at the outset of program implementation (design phase). It should specify the type of messages, advocacy campaigns and strategies to be used in order for the main messages to be mainstreamed.

Hanife Kurt; Nashashibi, Rana, 2013, Gender equality and women's empowerment in Palestine - Final Joint Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

- 2) *Take the complex nature of advocacy as related to IE issues into account:*

- Note that associations or other IE groups are their *own best advocates* with facilitation from the media or other supporters. Support the organising and mobilising of people dependent on the IE to advocate for social protection measures and development of related legal frameworks.
- *Stress awareness of their rights among vulnerable groups* and empower them to advocate with government and other entities.
- Ensure that the target of the advocacy, often government duty bearers, are *well versed on issues such as necessary reforms regarding the IE to be enacted, funding constraints, and priorities*. If this is ignored then advocacy will not be effective.

Danida's BUSAC project was mostly focused on the demand side of advocacy. Unfortunately, the lack of duty bearers' knowledge on advocacy (necessary reforms to be enacted, funding constraints, priorities etc.) has hindered the overall achievement of project results.

Oxford Policy Management, 2014, Evaluation of the Business Sector Advocacy Fund Ghana, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen.

The evaluation found that as awareness levels increased among the disadvantaged groups their demands (advocacy) for increased budget allocations at the local level.

Poudyal, Lokendra; Upadhyay, Balkrishna; Karki, Laxmi, 2013, Final Report on the Mid – Term Evaluation of Livelihood Recovery for Peace (LRP/UNDP) Project, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, Kathmandu.

Analysis indicates that organising women in the informal economy is effective with respect to the experience of waste pickers in India. Municipal governments in India have constitutional responsibility for waste management. They are supposed to provide medical insurance for waste pickers and earmark of spaces across the city for scrap sorting. SEWA was able to combine its knowledge of the law with the numerical strength and tenacity of the organisation, and familiar trade union tools of protest with less familiar 'cultural appropriations'. It has also mobilised as part of a waste pickers' network for the inclusion of waste pickers in social protection measures offered by the 2008 Unorganised Sector Workers' Social Security Bill.

Kabeer, Naila; Milwars, Kirsty and Sdarshan, Ratna, 2013, Organising women workers in the informal economy; General background document on issues in our research matrix, SEIWA, Routledge, London.

### 3) Develop actions aimed at strengthening advocacy with *deep consideration* of:

- *Necessary number of involved stakeholders* finding a good balance between efficiency and effectiveness
- *Scope* of the advocacy action
- Preferred and *most effective timing*

Take into account that *single issue advocacy actions involving relatively few stakeholders, and with limited budgetary implications*, tend to be the ones that are mostly likely to achieve their objective within the stipulated timeframe. Successive advocacy on new issues can build on the success of previous advocacy efforts.

The evaluation shows that single issue advocacy actions involving relatively few stakeholders, and with limited budgetary implications, tend to be the ones that are mostly likely to achieve their objective within the stipulated timeframe. The topic of these advocacy actions typically relate to weak enforcement of existing legislation, inadequate delivery of public service, or simple sensitization of the public about a particular issue.

Secondly, district level projects involving sub-sector or product-based associations tend to have a relatively high success rate. On the contrary, whether new legislation at central level is required, every project has a tendency to be more complicated and time consuming. The time allocated by BUSAC for the dialogue and post-dialogue parts of the advocacy process is often too short for national level policy issues.

Finally, timing is crucial, especially where advocacy has budgetary implications. Agreeing an advocated change before the passing of the relevant budget and well before elections or a predicted change of duty bearers is of course a critical success factor.

Oxford Policy Management, 2014, Evaluation of the Business Sector Advocacy Fund Ghana, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen.

### 4) Improve advocacy on child labourers(who often work in the informal economy) by *using quality data* to advocate for economic empowerment of affected households through government programming.

The evaluation determined that, based on the evaluation of the project in Ethiopia and evaluations of similar projects in other countries, when families are economically empowered, they will not need to put their children into exploitative child labour. To accomplish economic empowerment, the project worked to improve the livelihoods of children and families involved in child labour among other actions. This included attention to increasing the productivity of adults, improved occupational safety and health, as well as increased access to micro-finance. E-FACE also included vocational training for older children to economically empower them.

E-FACE—which stands for Ethiopians Fighting against Child Exploitation—is a multi-organizational effort to reduce the number of children involved in child labour and trafficking in Ethiopia, specifically in its weaving industry. Over nearly three weeks in Ethiopia, the evaluation team visited the three areas of Ethiopia the project was operational in: Gamo Gofa Zone, Wolaita Zone, and the capital Addis Ababa.

One of the main challenges originally facing the project was to coordinate with the government but the limited awareness on the issue at hand on the part of the government officials at local level interfered with this., Government officials and also the public were not yet entirely aware of the full extent to which child exploitation was occurring. As a result, child traffickers and informal businesses

Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.

employing child labour were able to operate informally. Government was not aware of their existence and unable to intervene in their affairs. To work on this, the project made advocacy and awareness-raising among their primary focuses. Government officials, police, labour inspectors, and social workers were invited to trainings where they were further educated on the realities of child labour and child trafficking in their areas, and were advised on actions that they could take to help reduce them. Their awareness that poverty is the cause of child labour increased. The government officials, now more aware that such a serious problem existed, actually already had many of the tools to begin taking action on these challenges. These included local government specialists to provide support and monitoring on livelihoods and related subjects. Officials emphasized their desire to continue to regulate and monitor the situation long after the project had ended. During the evaluation all of the government officials spoke about their commitment to eradicating exploitative child labour and have put by-laws in place in every project location to regulate it. The by-laws cover areas beyond the areas in which the project was active thus vastly increasing the impact of the project.

5) Advocate with local government and use a *holistic approach when addressing issues surrounding child labourers*. Advocacy for holistic approaches should include promotion of a combination of attention to development of:

- Effective legal and policy frameworks at national and local levels (place important emphasis on development of local by-laws)
- Access to a wide range of locally available poverty reduction programmes
- Economic empowerment actions for affected households.
- Access to quality education including vocational education and skills training as applicable
- Strengthening of government capacities on implementing actions on child labour at all levels
- Well organised and implemented local referral systems.

A holistic approach and strong emphasis on working with local government to address exploitive child labour and associated child trafficking are useful to increase impact and the potential for sustainability.

Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.

### 1.3. Supportive legal frameworks development, adoption and implementation

**Indicators:** a) Legal frameworks pertinent to enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion identified in selected project countries.

b) Key elements in legal frameworks contributing to enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion identified in selected project countries.

c) Extent to which projects have found legal frameworks in countries to have a supportive impact on their beneficiaries. Reasons for extent to which frameworks have had positive and/or negative impact identified.

d) Extent to which enforcement challenges of legal frameworks exist.

**Data analysis methods:** Identification of methods for the development of pertinent legal frameworks and pertinent experiences with adoption and implementation with respect to IE.

- 1) Use a two-pronged approach to address the employment needs of people dependent on the informal economy. *Simultaneously focus on direct actions at local level and fostering an enabling environment.*
- 2) At enabling environment level—i.e. local and/or national—*focus on development of supportive legal and policy frameworks related to the IE.* Ensure advocacy for enabling environment stakeholders to develop and revise IE relevant laws and regulations as needed.
- 3) *Locally adapt (appropriate) approaches* to support (self) employment needs of people dependent on the informal economy in accordance with context at community level. (see other recommendations in report for details).
- 4) Facilitate *capacity strengthening of institutions to develop and revise relevant laws and regulations.*

<p>The analysis determined that the design of the programme focused on implementation of decent work practices at downstream level forgetting that such practices cannot become sustainable if not being supported by the required enabling environment procedures, institutional framework and human resources for implementation. The lack of institutional building and measures to make the social partners become implementers resulted in low commitment, which added to the low involvement. The lesson learned is that for sustainability reasons project designs should emphasize more on capacity building of future implementers than on the very implementation.</p> <p>The analysis indicated that creating a conducive environment often takes the form of developing legislation and providing capacity building to governmental institutions. As a strategy for creating employment, it works indirectly, leading to results in the longer term. However, in combination with other approaches, such as Local Economy Development (LED), more immediate visible effects may be produced. A combination of indirect and direct approaches works particularly well for specific target groups.</p> <p>The analysis included review of interventions aimed at women's employability. This indicated that a target group approach preferably combines different strategies, ranging from indirect approaches (such as creating a conducive environment) to concrete measures (such as leadership training and cash programmes).</p> <p>In many development projects, there is a tendency to focus on target groups in a direct way, rather than on structural issues related to the enabling environment. The review observed similar tendencies with regard to the way ILO projects on employment promotion are tackling gender, with an overall bias towards direct interventions for women (training, awareness raising), which are often not sufficient to bring about change.</p> <p>It is essential to complement these types of strategies with those oriented towards creating an enabling environment for women at work.</p>	<p>ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013 , Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The analysis found that combining institutional capacity building with a demonstration programme was a critical factor in the success of the programme.</p>	<p>Mauer, Ralf, 2013, Decent work results and effectiveness of ILO technical cooperation: a meta-analysis of project evaluations, 2011–2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO,</p>

	Geneva.
Analysis of approaches used in 13 of 17 implementing partners projects. Projects based their planned actions on past experience and the need to focus on ensuring a supportive environment for the sustainability of their local actions in communities.	RNSF: Needs analysis of 17 Implementing Partner Projects of RNSF

- 5) *Support appropriate and relevant reform of the tax system* to accommodate formalisation of IE work. Take into consideration that appropriate reforms may lead to an overall increase in the number of registered firms and possible corresponding increases in employment. Take into consideration that formal enterprises are more productive and profitable when compared with informal ones.

<p>One study carried out by Fajnzylber and Montes-Rojas (2011) examined the effects of tax reform in Brazil, which were found to reduce the tax burden on small firms by about 8%. According to this study, more firms registered for tax and formalised so as to benefit from the reform. Both the existing and newly created firms that opted to operate in the formal sector had higher revenues and profits, and employed more workers. This was found to lead to an overall employment increase of 12%.</p> <p>2) In another study, Fajnzylber, et.al. (2009) examined micro enterprise survey data from the 1990s in Mexico and found that registering for and paying tax significantly improved firm profitability.</p> <p>3) Kenyon and Kapaz (2005) used data from the World Bank's Investment Climate Survey in Brazil to show that firms that avoid paying tax by not registering are less productive and less likely to access financial markets than other firms.</p>	<p>White, Simon &amp; Fortune, Peter, 2015, Business Environment Reform and Poverty, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Evaluation on projects and reforms concerning labour law, tax system, administration and business registration rules, Covered countries: Mexico, Sri Lanka, Uganda, Vietnam, Brazil, Bolivia, Algeria, Indonesia, Zambia, Bangladesh, Ghana, Tanzania, India.</p> <p>Fajnzylber &amp; Montes-Rojas, 2009, Does Formality Improve Micro-Firm Performance? Quasi-Experimental Evidence from the Brazilian SIMPLES Programme, Thematic evaluation, IZA, Bonn.</p> <p>Fajnzylber, P., W. Maloney and G. Montes Rojas, 2009, Releasing constraints to growth or pushing on a string? Policies and performance of Mexican micro-firms, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Journal of Development Studies.</p> <p>Kenyon, T. &amp; E. Kapaz, 2005, The Informality Trap, Thematic evaluation, World Bank Viewpoint Series, Note 301, World Bank, New York.</p>
--	---

- 6) Review available contextual World Bank Business Environment Snapshots<sup>23</sup> and ILO Enabling Environment for Sustainable Enterprises (ESEE)<sup>24</sup> to understand the enabling environment for business in project countries. Note that laws and regulations for formal businesses also have an impact on informal economy operators and workers.

The analysis determined that creating a conducive environment often takes the form of developing legislation and providing capacity building to governmental institutions. As a strategy for creating employment, it works indirectly, leading to	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-
---	---

23 The World Bank (2016), World Bank Business Environment Snapshots. Available from <http://rru.worldbank.org/besnapshots/> Website accessed May 15, 2016.

24 Sustainable Enterprise Programme - ILO (2014) Enabling Environment for Sustainable Enterprises. Available from the ILO Sustainable Enterprise Programme. ILO, Geneva.

results in the longer term.

2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

7) When developing legal frameworks related to the IE, *take potential implementation and enforcement challenges in the context into account*. Design approaches to facilitate implementation and address enforcement challenges. (Projects can contribute to this process)(1.3.2/3) *Provide support for the enforcement of legal frameworks* in project countries including:

- Steps to reduce corruption
- Strengthening government coordination
- Strengthening capacities of enforcement agencies/staff
- Streamlining government bureaucracy
- Strengthening the quality of regulations
- Increasing public – private dialogue

The evaluation found that there is a need to pay special attention to the challenges in the context in which a sector is operating as these also influence whether labour laws can be fully implemented and enforced.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

8) Promote the development of codes of conduct among business associations/cooperative members in IE sectors. Train labour inspectors and other monitoring agents to verify the implementation of codes of conduct, if existent in the association/cooperative.

The evaluation identified an example of government commitment in the integration of the E-FACE supported weavers' code of conduct into local government routine labour inspections. To help ensure the implementation of the code of conduct and more general labour laws, the project provided training to 523 labour inspectors. The evaluator visited and discussed the code of conduct with ministry officials who expressed appreciation for the labour inspectors training.

Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.

## 1.4. Identification of relevant policy frameworks and development of appropriate actions

**Indicators:** Policy frameworks pertinent to enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion identified in selected project countries.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of pertinent policy frameworks on IE. Identification of positive and/or negative impact and related reasons.



- 1) Carry out analytical assessments of the enabling environment to link enterprise development to a broader discussion of decent work and employment at the national policy level. Ensure that these assessments cover the decent work challenges linked to enterprises.

The evaluation determined that a move towards more analytical assessments of the enabling environment is a substantive way of linking enterprise development to a broader discussion of decent work and employment at the national policy level, provided that these assessments cover the decent work challenges linked to enterprises.

Henry, Carla; Dearden, Philip N., 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

- 2) Study past and current public policies in diverse areas which impact on employment creation including for people dependent on the informal economy. Include analysis in the areas of fiscal, enterprise development, education, social protection, reasons for unemployment, poverty reduction areas.

The evaluation concluded that it is required to conduct detailed exploration of past and current public policies in very diverse areas (education, fiscal, enterprise development, social protection, poverty reduction, etc.)  
A correct diagnosis of the causes of unemployment among young people (mismatch between labour supply and demand, sluggish labour demand, low job search intensity or wage reservation mechanisms) is of the essence for the design and targeting of effective interventions.

Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

- 3) Promote identification of opportunities for longer term and more systematic change as opposed to high focus on shorter term and pragmatic approaches to enterprise development. Ensure that focus on offering overly simplified solutions to complex problems is avoided.

The evaluation found that ILO country offices tend to respond to shorter term and pragmatic approaches to enterprise development, which governments demand and donors fund, tending to overlook opportunities for longer term and more systematic change, in the hope of offering simple solutions to complex problems.

Henry, Carla; Dearden, Philip N., 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

- 4) Note that drawing upon developed countries' existing models as an inspiration for new labour market policies in developing countries is not optimal. Rather, follow a precise strategy to:

- Make existing models clear to stakeholders but explain that it is usually not relevant to copy them.
- Request participating countries to reflect on their challenges and explain how their own systems and models work
- Determine if any of the developed country models have relevant components that might be relevant to transfer or adapt.
- Design a programme of new concepts, changes or adjustments
- Pilot the changes, evaluate and, where relevant, scale up and replicate.



<p>In its ITP programme, SIDA relied on the Swedish model as an inspiration and demonstration of highly advanced active labour market policy in practice. However, for a wide range of reasons, the model was not directly applicable for the majority of participating countries. Recognising the limitations, SIDA has set out a 5 points strategy to be drawn upon for future projects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 1. Explain the Swedish model but recognise that it is not relevant in most cases to copy it;</li> <li>▪ 2. Request participating countries to reflect over their challenges and explain how their own systems and models work;</li> <li>▪ 3. Develop a process where participating countries identify what parts or elements of the Swedish model or approach might be relevant to transfer or adapt;</li> <li>▪ 4. Design a programme of changes or adjustments;</li> <li>▪ 5. Pilot the changes evaluate and where relevant scale up and replicate.</li> </ul>	<p>Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.</p>
--	--

- 5) Design programmes, policies in such a way that integrated components are coherent with sufficient focus on prioritisation of key areas of importance. Analyse and determine how to deal with the inter-dependencies between components when designing and determining priorities.

<p>The evaluation concluded and recommended that it is advisable to invite designers of technical cooperation interventions to frame integrated programme objectives favouring more coherent design with greater attention to dependencies and prioritisation. This also applies to national level planning and policies.</p>	<p>Mauer, Ralf, 2013, Decent work results and effectiveness of ILO technical cooperation: a meta-analysis of project evaluations, 2011–2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	---

- 6) Be aware that the existence of an employment strategy is a necessary, but not sufficient condition to bring focus and coherence to labour market policies and programmes. Ensure that contextual impediments are addressed and opportunities are integrated into actions.

<p>The evaluation found that the existence of an employment strategy is a necessary, but not sufficient condition to bring focus and coherence to labour market policies and programmes.</p>	<p>Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
--	--

- 7) Note that there has not yet been any definitive conclusion on whether special targeting of vulnerable groups for employment promotion is more effective than a generic employment policy.

<p>The analysis concluded that whether special targeting for defined vulnerable groups is a more effective policy than a generic employment policy is still subject to debate.</p>	<p>ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
--	--

- 8) Facilitate development of a supportive policy and institutional environment for women's self-help group linkages with micro-finance and other agencies. Empower women's groups to demand quality service delivery.

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

<p>The evaluation determined that support for the establishment of women's self-help groups with linkages to bank finance and within a supportive policy and institutional environment can lead to enhanced confidence and capacity of women both collectively and individually. The evidence from Andhra Pradesh suggests that collective empowerment can support greater accountability for service delivery that, in turn, can positively affect the livelihoods of the poor.</p>	<p>Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2015, Project Performance Assessment Report India Ten Million Women and Counting: An Assessment of World Bank Support for Rural Livelihood Development in Andhra Pradesh, India, Final evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC, Projects: Andhra Pradesh District Poverty Initiatives Project; Andhra Pradesh Rural Poverty Reduction Project.</p>
--	--

- 9) When developing policies, strengthen implementing stakeholders' capacities in subjects such as information systems and administrative/organisational processes of institutions.

<p>The evaluation found that development efforts should emphasise institutional strengthening in countries before proceeding with policy preparation. Considerable institutional bottlenecks affected the implementation of project activities and eventually restricted the achievement of more outcomes. Building strong national institutions is important. The report recommends paying more attention to two critical factors for the success of future policy development: information systems and administrative/organisational processes. Given the duration of policy development, however, the RNSF team believes that efforts to develop policies need to be undertaken simultaneously with policy development.</p>	<p>Pacheco Jiménez, José Francisco, 2013, Improving social protection and promoting employment, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic "improving social protection and promoting employment in Burkina Faso, Cambodia and Honduras".</p>
--	---

- 10) To promote effective governance of labour migration and related skills development invest in:

- Establishment of solid knowledge base to support appropriate policy making
- Institutional capacity building responding to the specific requirements of the target groups
- Development of demonstration programmes.

<p>The analysis indicated the importance of a very comprehensive approach which combined inter alia the necessary investment to create a solid knowledge-base to support appropriate policy-making and extensive capacity building responding to the specific requirements of the target groups and final users.</p>	<p>Aiolfi, Luca, 2013, Effective Governance of Labour Migration and its Skills Dimensions, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic "effective Governance of Labour Migration and its Skills Dimensions in Moldova and Ukraine".</p>
<p>The evaluation identified the need for strategies that combine institutional capacity strengthening with demonstration programmes directed at the creation of more and better opportunities for youth would seem to be more effective in responding to the needs of disadvantaged youth. This is because labour market institutions often require support to deliver innovative targeting of and provision for the disadvantaged youth cohort.</p>	<p>Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>

- 11) Ensure participation of youth in the development of policies of concern to them such as youth employment policies. (This is also in line with UNICEF Convention on the Rights of the Child).

<p>Based on findings, the evaluation recommended the enhancement of participation of young people in the formulation of youth employment policies.</p>	<p>Jiménez, José Francisco, 2014, ILO-Sida Partnership 2012-2013: National Employment Policies (NEP) and Youth</p>
--	--

	<p>Employment (YE), Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Botswana, Comoros, Lesotho, Liberia, Malawi, Mozambique, Cambodia, Sri Lanka, El Salvador, Kyrgyzstan Yemen. El Salvador, Indonesia, Jordan Zambia</p> <p>UNICEF, 2015, Fact Sheet: the Right to Participation. New York: UNICEF. United Nations (2009), Convention on the Rights of the Child. CRC/C/GC/12 1 July 2009. Committee on the Rights of the Child Fifty-first Session, Geneva, 25 May; 12 June 2009.</p>
--	--

- 12) Ensure that policies on youth employment are sufficiently wide in scope so as to address the broad array of issues that impact youth employment. Ensure that programming targets those who are most at risk of labour market exclusion.

<p>Based on findings, the evaluation recommended that policies aimed at improving youth employment prospects should be wide in scope, while programmes need to be targeted to those who are most at risk of labour market exclusion.</p>	<p>Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
--	--

## 1.5. Key elements in policy frameworks identification

**Indicators:** Key elements in policy frameworks contributing to enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion identified in selected project countries.

**Data analysis methods:** Establishment of criteria to select key elements of policy frameworks that contribute to enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion. Application of criteria to determine good practices and lessons learned.

- 1) For successful policy reforms, combine analysis, consultation, public-private initiatives and coalition building.

<p>The evaluation determined that a combination of analysis, consultation, public-private initiatives and coalition building can result in policy reforms.</p>	<p>Easterling, Tom; Foster, Brian; Delia Casco, Rita, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the USAID/Nicaragua Employment and Enterprise (E&amp;E) Activity, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
--	--

- 2) Promote interaction of projects with local government, and facilitate government creation of an enabling environment with regard to development of policies, regulations, subsidies, tax incentives, registration procedures for business set ups, and access to micro finance.

The analysis of evaluations indicates that Start and Improve Your Business (SIYB) projects tend to have a higher chance of success when they interact closely with local government, and where government manages to create an overall enabling environment in terms of policies, regulations, subsidies, tax incentives, registration procedures for business set ups, access to micro finance, etc. Note: SIYB projects use specific course materials and learning methodologies that the ILO has developed over the course of 3 decades.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013 , Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
---	--

- 3) Ensure that project intervention logic and indicators for support to policy/legal frameworks on the IE are clear and not too open-ended. Do not, however, make indicators that measure actual government adoption of the legal/policy frameworks as projects are generally too short to allow for bureaucracies to move in tandem with project implementation periods and formalise them. Rather, include indicators that measure effective advocacy and progress towards adoption.

The analysis determined that quite a few projects featuring a policy support strategy (particularly projects focusing on informal economy workers) seemed to struggle to come up with tangible or verifiable results as a consequence of intervention logics that were too open ended.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013 , Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation noted that it is rare for to see a law initiated with the support of a project actually adopted during the same project implementation period. Projects are generally too short to allow for bureaucracies to move in tandem with project implementation periods and formalise the laws.	Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

- 4) Follow 6 basic rules to improve international training programmes (ITPs) related to labour market policies:

- Link future international training programmes to national and international efforts (both training and projects);
- Obtain or make a mapping of current and planned labour market training (national and international) initiatives at country and regional level to inform the training programme design and selection of participants;
- Underpin, where possible, the relevant national/international initiatives;
- Ensure that projects are linked to on-going and planned reforms;
- Consider if the capacity development budgets of on-going reform initiatives could be used to co-finance aspects of the ITP such as the projects;
- Create opportunities to link future ITPs better to decent work and the human rights approach.

<p>The evaluation sets 6 strategic rules to improve development project related to labour market policies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 1) Link future international training programmes (ITPs) to national and international efforts (both training and projects);</li> <li>▪ 2) Obtain or make a mapping of current and planned labour market training (national and international) initiatives at country and regional level to inform the training programme design and selection of participants;</li> </ul>	Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.
---	---

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 3) Underpin, where possible, the relevant national/international initiatives;</li> <li>▪ 4) Ensure that projects are linked to ongoing and planned reforms;</li> <li>▪ 5) Consider if the capacity development budgets of ongoing reform initiatives could be used to co-finance aspects of the ITP such as the projects;</li> <li>▪ 6) Create opportunities to link future ITPs better to decent work and the human rights approach.</li> </ul>	
---	--

- 5) When working in specific enterprise development areas engage in actions such as enacting inclusive reform for Small Water Enterprises (SWE), in order to make them more reliable and compliant with Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) and provide a fair price system for SWE and their customers.

<p>The evaluation is focused on Small Water Enterprises (SWE). In many cities of Africa, Asia and South America, more than half of the population obtain their water services from suppliers other than the official water supply utility. SWEs are private enterprises, usually operated by small scale entrepreneurs (with a maximum of 50, and usually fewer employees) which earn money from the sale of water.</p> <p>SWEs typically provide water services alternative to, or supplementary to, those provided by water utilities. They usually supply water to places that are unserved or inadequately served by the utility or at times when the utility is not able to provide those services.</p> <p>In most cities, the situation is changing and there are new opportunities for developing more vigorous and economically efficient SWE systems. Sectoral reforms are providing more opportunities for small, as well as large, private enterprises. Governments are more inclined to recognise the strengths of SWEs. Utilities are being encouraged to work with, rather than against, SWEs.</p> <p>Provided these lessons can be learnt, one can expect a number of benefits particularly for low-income neighbourhoods:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Greater customer convenience, as SWEs become more reliable and accountable.</li> <li>▪ Lower prices, as supplies from SWEs increase.</li> <li>▪ Reduced burden from water-related diseases, as hygiene improves.</li> <li>▪ The utility can also expect to benefit from:</li> <li>▪ Less water lost, as SWEs invest in better equipment (and less illegal connections);</li> </ul> <p>Higher utility revenues, as SWEs become legitimate and reliable paying customers.</p>	<p>Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries.</p>
--	---

## 1.6. Improvement of impact of policy frameworks

**Indicators:** Extent to which projects have found policy frameworks in countries to have a supportive impact on their beneficiaries. Reasons for extent to which frameworks have had positive and/or negative impact identified.

**Data analysis methods:** Systems analysis approach to determine contextual elements influencing effectiveness.

- 1) Ensure that project/programmes are well aligned with countries' development priorities as opposed to those of the donors. Advocate to ensure that national policy-makers are in full support of the relevant social protection initiatives.

For policy support interventions on social protection to be effective, they require the full support of national policy-makers, and they need to be in line with the development priorities of a country	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
--	---

### 2) Promote institutionalisation of specific youth employment policy activities to ensure impact.

The evaluation noted that institutionalization of youth employment policy activities is crucial for sustainable impact.	Okumura, Yuka, 2013, Improving decent work opportunities for youth through knowledge and action (Work4Youth), Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Cambodia, Nepal, Samoa, Viet Nam - Armenia, Kyrgyzstan, FYR Macedonia, Republic of Moldova, Russian Federation, Ukraine - Brazil, Colombia, El Salvador, Jamaica, Peru - Egypt, Jordan, Occupied Palestinian Territories, Tunisia, Benin, Liberia, Madagascar, Malawi, Togo, Uganda, United Republic of Tanzania, Zambia.
---	--

### 3) Advocate to increase expenditures on research/data collection to inform investments that will affect strengthening of rural enterprise management in subjects such as transport, storage facilities, marketing of farm and non-farm products/services, distribution of seeds, etc.

In an analysis of government expenditure and agricultural data (drawn from IMF, World Bank and FAO databases) for 43 developing countries (Asia, Africa, Latin America) from 1980 to 1998, Fan et al (2003) found that government agricultural expenditure contributed strongly to agricultural growth. The provision of public goods in the form of roads, irrigation and education all had positive and statistically significant effects. Disaggregating total agricultural expenditure into research and non-research expenditure components, revealed that although both their coefficients are positive, the coefficient for agricultural research is larger in magnitude and more significant, and suggesting that productivity-enhancing expenditures, such as agricultural research investment, have larger output-promoting effects than other forms of public spending on agriculture.	Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries. 1) Fan, S. & Rao, N., 2003, Public spending in developing countries: trends, determination, and impact, Meta-analysis of evaluations, EPTD Discussion Paper, International Food Policy Research Institute, Washington DC.
Using a survey of 3,500 farmers operating in rice and potato value chains in India, Bangladesh and China, Reardon et al (2012) have confirmed that the state was instrumental in fostering private-sector involvement through investments in research and development, the distribution of seeds, infrastructure, cold storage facilities and electricity grids. The removal of restrictions on medium- and large-scale millers allowed foreign direct investment in processing and retailing, leading towards greater economies of scale and market consolidation.	Reardon, T., 2012, The Quiet Revolution in Staple Food Value Chains in Asia: Enter the Dragon, the Elephant, and the Tiger, Meta-analysis of evaluations, International Food Policy Research Institute, Manila, Covered countries: East Asian countries.
Lastly, in a study of farm panel survey data on 1,233 farm households in 22 districts of Kenya between 1997-2010, Chamberlin and Jayne (2013) argue that cell-phones and new technologies lower transaction costs by improving traders' ability to cultivate more spatially-diffuse networks and make use of faster price-discovery and negotiation times. Their findings suggest that investments in telecommunications rather than road infrastructure could be more efficient for lowering the costs of trade in remote areas.	Chamberlin, J. & Jayne, T.S., 2012, Unpacking the Meaning of 'Market Access': Evidence from Rural Kenya, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Volume 41, January 2013, Pages 245-264, Elsevier World Development, Amsterdam.

## 1.7. Institution and capacity strengthening on IE

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on institutions and capacity strengthening on IE identified.

b) Challenges on institutions and capacity strengthening on IE identified and possible means to overcome identified and analysed.

**Data analysis methods:** Identification of on institutions and capacity strengthening methods/tools implemented. Systems analysis to identify the key institutional actors, their roles and means of coordination. Identification of GP and LL on institutions and capacity strengthening.

- 1) Ensure projects include focus on capacity strengthening of institutional partners and dissemination of project learning as specifically related to the IE:
  - Include focus on capacity strengthening of government institutions including local authorities.
  - Promote training of trainers in government institutions so that they can continue to train others in their respective offices.

The evaluation concluded, based on findings, that sharing and learning as well as capacity building of partners should be an integral part of project implementation.	Mingoen, Hariette, 2012, Social Protection and Gender in Cambodia Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation determined that building the capacity of government agencies within the scope of their mandate and within the context of the convergence program while advocating for continued prioritization for funding bodes better for sustainability as compared to supporting NGOs in the same role, as was done in Masbate and Northern Samar.	Jersild, Amy; Lazo, Lucita , 2013, Towards a child-labour-free Philippines: Building on past gains and addressing challenges – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
Findings indicated that, in Lebanon, seconding a consultant to the MoL had enhanced not only coordination but also time management.	Grunewald, Matthias, 2013, Small Farmer Livelihoods and Income Enhancement in Baghlan Province, Afghanistan – GCP /AFG/053/GER, Final evaluation, FAO, Rome, Project: FAO Rehabilitation of the Sugar Industry in Baghlan, Afghanistan.
The evaluation found that the relevant project has undoubtedly strengthened Government staff's capabilities in many technical, organizational and managerial fields. Next to Provincial Department (DAIL) staff's participation in Sector Working Group meetings, Interagency meetings and Project's field and training activities, 10 DAIL staff members were recently trained in "Training of Trainers" courses, preparing them for the work as trainers in agricultural marketing. The evaluation concludes that they have already participated in the training of 600 farmers from 30 cooperatives. The evaluator was told by Project staff that farmers increasingly show confidence in the technical support of DAIL extension agents.	Rum Ali, Mohamad; Young, Andrew, 2013, Independent Evaluation: Realizing minimum living standards for disadvantaged communities through peace building and village based economic development (Indonesia), Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
The evaluation determined that Training of trainers from the project was an efficient use of resources	Samaranayake, Mallika R.; Velupillai, Krishna, 2011, Mid- term Evaluation of Outcome 7: "Socio-economic recovery in the North and East" under the UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) 2008-2012 (Sri Lanka), Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, New York.
Awareness and capacity building of community and local government officers and political authorities will be useful from a long term point of view. Government departments can add real value to the projects where those departments have capacity and willingness, and negative impact where they	Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation,



## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

don't.	Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.
A GP linked Lesson Learned from a WFP thematic evaluation concluded: for governments to be better equipped to support the livelihood needs of their own citizens it will need to invest more in developing its capacity building policies and capabilities. This needs to be better articulated and put into practice.	Harvey, Paul; Burton, Cynthia; Wilkinson, Laura, 2009, Strategic Evaluation of the Effectiveness of WFP Livelihood Recovery Interventions, Thematic evaluation, A Report from the Office of Evaluation, WFP, Brussels, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Colombia, Lesotho, Nepal, Uganda.

### 2) Ensure that projects include systematic approaches to clearly *identify the desired capacity strengthening outputs and outcomes on the IE.*

- Assess the capacities and performance of cooperating partners at different levels.
- Develop standard tools for capacity assessment of local partners based on past experience in the local context.

The evaluation concluded that though the project involved significant efforts to build capacity and strengthen systems, there was not a systematic approach to identify outcomes of capacity building interventions. Systematic approaches are needed to identify the desired outcomes of capacity building interventions.	Jersild, Amy, 2014, Good Governance through Labour Administration and Labour Inspection – Final Evaluation, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: China, Costa Rica, Indonesia, Lebanon, Namibia, South Africa, Ukraine, Vietnam.
The evaluation identified the need for clear indicators of progress on integration of constituents' capacity building.	Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Tripathi, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluators indicated that WFP should do more to review its partnership arrangements and assess the capacities and performance of cooperating partners.	Harvey, Paul; Burton, Cynthia; Wilkinson, Laura, 2009, Strategic Evaluation of the Effectiveness of WFP Livelihood Recovery Interventions, Thematic evaluation, A Report from the Office of Evaluation, WFP, Brussels, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Colombia, Lesotho, Nepal, Uganda.
Develop standard tools for capacity assessment of local partners, RC and government, based on models already available within the RC Movement and beyond. Use these tools in the design phase to determine the implementation model, and provide additional technical and financial support where the willingness exists but capacity is limited.	Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation, Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.

### 3) Promote the *establishment of close working relations* with institutional stakeholders who work on IE issues and related social inclusion at all levels. Strengthen them and provide them with tools and products to enable quality implementation. Specifically ensure advocacy and technical support for local level governance of project actions.



## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

The evaluation found that close working relations with constituents, the strengthening of national institutions, and the integration of ILO tools and products into national institutions have contributed to positioning decent work concepts among constituents and communities.	1) Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Trikha, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation determined that decentralization of the implementation among the local government and other organizations has reinforced their commitment and technical capabilities in the future work on the project's goals.	Do, Evaluan, 2013, Gobernanza de la migración laboral y su vínculo con el desarrollo en Mali, Mauritania y Senegal – Evaluación final, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic: "Governance of labour migration and its links to Development in Mali, Mauritania and Senegal".
The evaluation found that district level government agencies in Afghanistan are crucial to the implementation of the project. The decentralized offices are in fact much closer to the farming community and can act faster to respond to regular or urgent needs. It avoids lengthy procedures and miscommunication since at the district level the officers are capable to quickly observe and assess the needs of vulnerable farming community and consequently can provide rapid adequate support.	Denecke, Harry W., 2013, Support to household food security and livelihood of vulnerable and food insecure farming families - GCP /AFG/061/LUX (Afghanistan), Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.

### 4) Ensure that there is *great clarity of roles and responsibilities* of project partners and other the stakeholders affecting project implementation on IE programming and related social inclusion:

- Promote mapping of relevant institutional stakeholders and their roles, gaps and opportunities with regard to project outputs and outcomes.
- Ensure that training is based on partners' collective needs and priorities.

The Partnership between the three implementing organisations is strategic in ensuring effective execution of the interventions with each organisation taking responsibilities relating to their areas of expertise.	Munene, Charles, 2013, Improvement of livelihoods for vulnerable in urban and peri-urban areas of Galkayo – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva
The evaluation noted that it was important that the project identified precisely the governorate needs, and the ability to respond to needs.	Newkirk, James, 2013, Edible oil value chain enhancement in Ethiopia Final Evaluation of the Joint Programme, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation found that all training is based on USAID priorities and partners' collective capacity development priorities. The courses were helpful in raising partners' awareness and developing their capacity. However, the evaluation concluded that the partners had higher capacity levels than they actually had. Because of this, partners' capacities were pushed to the limit and they became slow in to implement project activities.	Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.
The evaluation noted the underpinning of the project by comprehensive knowledge on the operations of complex organisations (public administration in general, ministries and department in charge of labour and employment and Public Employment Services).	Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
Individual technical cooperation interventions should be more attentive to the risks and opportunities within the relevant institutional environment, including	Mauer, Ralf, 2013, Decent work results and effectiveness of ILO technical cooperation: a

weaknesses in national institutional capacities, for greater sustainability.

meta-analysis of project evaluations, 2011–2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

- 5) Focus on *including a range of government offices, including ministries, bureaus, universities and municipalities* to implement actions on the IE and social inclusion as this contributes to effectiveness.

The evaluation evidence demonstrates the effectiveness of a cluster approach to project implementation on value chain enhancement, with specific reference here to the value of involvement of the Ministries, Bureaus, Universities and Municipalities.

Newkirk, James, 2013, Edible oil value chain enhancement in Ethiopia Final Evaluation of the Joint Programme, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

- 6) Ensure that the *selection of an appropriate structure (within government)* is carefully identified as there needs to be sufficient buy-in from the structure to attain real policy change. Determine that there is a real interest of the agency in participating in the project. The choice may not always be the most immediately obvious line ministry or office within a government entity. Ensure that projects plan continued advocacy, follow up and diplomacy to mediate any internal conflicts and/or competition within such offices.

The evaluation found that a lesson learned for achieving policy change and buy-in to create an enabling environment for women's entrepreneurship development is linked to the choice of structure to house the project. The choice of structure for housing women's entrepreneurship development has a major influence on success, greater than might be expected. The project was flexible and found different solutions that appeared best in the varying circumstances. Despite these efforts, it was not always possible to predict the ideal structure nor to easily solve any eventual challenges. Internal conflict and competition between individuals and agencies/departments can severely affect implementation. A great deal of advocacy, follow up and diplomacy was needed to mediate such situations.

Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

- 7) In capacity strengthening planning on IE issues in fragile states include focus on:

- Sensitivity to historical animosities
- Civil society supporting efforts to influence positive change.
- Build confidence combined with longer term structural reform based on careful analysis of the drivers of conflict
- Integrate democracy, human rights and governance principles and practices into development approaches.

A review of many programs on ending extreme poverty in fragile states indicates among the good practices, the need to focus on building confidence in institutions – which requires capacity development and sensitivity to historical animosities and marginalisation – as well as building resilience in areas of chronic vulnerability. In countries lacking a credible governmental partner, work must continue to focus on civil society supporting their efforts to influence positive change. The key is rapid action to rebuild confidence combined with longer term structural reform based on careful analysis of the drivers of conflict. It is also

USAID, 2014, Ending extreme poverty in fragile contexts, Review of multiple projects and/or actions, Getting to Zero: A USAID discussion series, USAID, Washington DC.

essential to integrate democracy, human rights and governance principles and practices into our development approaches.

- 8) When developing capacities to provide support to people dependent on the IE, *use a broad range of organisation development approaches* beyond only providing training. These may include organisation analysis to determine strengths and gaps and providing direct technical support to build on strengths and address gaps.

The evaluation determined that a good practice was the development of a broad organisation development approach to working with project partners including governments. Direct contacts with the partners relied on a system of identifying strengths and gaps followed up with support to build on strengths and address gaps.	Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva. Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.
Findings indicated that capacity strengthening was provided in the form of training, guidance during meetings, and direct technical support while developing strategies and plans. This methodological system of combining different approaches to strengthen capacities was very effective as they complemented and reinforced each other.	Zegers, Mei, 2014, Responding effectively to the HIV/AIDS epidemic in the world of work: Country programmes – Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Burundi, Cameroon, Chad, Ivory Coast, Democratic Republic of Congo, Ghana, Kenya, Madagascar, Morocco, Mozambique, Namibia, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, South Africa, Zambia, China, Indonesia, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Brazil, Guatemala, Jamaica, Ukraine, Tajikistan.
The evaluation noted that most implementing partners called for a holistic approach to their own capacity development, following a schedule and objectives aligned with their organizations, including coaching. The evaluation further determined that training courses hinged on addressing and guiding on issues of governance, administration, finance, and programming for overall capacity development. These issues, however, require more than knowledge acquired in a training workshop. Partners may need closer, hands-on support. Therefore, training must be intentionally linked to coaching and mentoring support in each organisation.	Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.

- 9) Ensure that *early institutional and community level consultations* are conducted prior to commencement of activities on IE issues. (While this is often recommended it is often ignored or insufficiently carried out).

The evaluation noted that early consultations prior to commencement of interventions at both institutional and community levels is important.	Munene, Charles, 2013, Improvement of livelihoods for vulnerable in urban and peri-urban areas of Galkayo – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva. Observations of RNSF expert Mei Zegers from numerous project evaluations conducted over the course of over 20 years.
---	--

- 10) Capacity strengthening results should be *measured immediately post training/technical support* on IE issues. It should, however, also be conducted at later intervals to determine the actual impact

and usefulness of learning. Conduct such impact assessments 3 – 6 months after intervention and again at later stages as relevant.

- 11) Impact assessments of IE related programming should *determine what can be applied, what cannot be applied and why* to improve future capacity strengthening efforts. Ensure that impact assessment findings are actively applied and not only remain in an impact assessment report.

The evaluation found that 3 surveys used in Vietnam and Indonesia is a useful tool, which aimed to identify the relevance, the training held for participants and certain outcomes achieved. The evaluation recommends that such tracking be done systematically for all training immediately following training, but also to identify outcomes 3 to 6 months after training. Such tracking will enable more productive monitoring of activities implemented and progress made toward CPOs and the organizational outcome, as well as understanding of what is working effectively and what might be changed. The evaluation recommends inclusion of other questions that attempt to measure application of new learning and skills.

Jersild, Amy, 2014, Good Governance through Labour Administration and Labour Inspection – Final Evaluation, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: China, Costa Rica, Indonesia, Lebanon, Namibia, South Africa, Ukraine, Vietnam.

- 12) *Promote use of methodologies such as the Service Quality Check for Supporting Female and Male Operated Small Enterprises (FAMOS) or USAID's Organizational Capacity Assessment Tool* for organisation needs analysis and progress monitoring. The FAMOS Check is an organizational development tool that enables organizations that provide services to small enterprises to carry out a gender self-check to identify improvements in their operations, in particular in respect to the needs of women entrepreneurs.

The evaluation found that direct contacts with the partners relied on an informal system of identifying strengths and gaps followed up with support to build on strengths and address gaps. Methodologies such as the Service Quality Check for Supporting Female and Male Operated Small Enterprises (FAMOS) check were implemented with sensitivity to organisation issues beyond only women's entrepreneurship development or gender. Note that many small enterprises are not formal and/or employ informal workers. Other forms of research on strengths, gaps and opportunities likewise contributed to a comprehensive approach

Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

The evaluation determined that the use of the Organizational Capacity Assessment Tool was beneficial but only part of the methods that should be used. It also summarised the elements identified for a capacitated organisation, notably;

- Vision: The sense of focus and the change the organization wants to bring about in society
- Culture: An organization's norms and values, and how these help or hinder the organization
- Relationships: How well people in the organization and the partnership relate
- Strategy: How the organization intends to accomplish its mission
- Structure: How roles and responsibilities are shared within and among organizations
- Policies, systems, and procedures: How to bring about consistency in decision-making in the organization
- Skills: Whether the organizations have sufficient skill sets or ability to develop them
- Financial and material resources: The adequacy of things such as finances, equipment and office space

Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.

- 13) Encourage the *establishment of local level (municipal, district) committees* for citizens, the private sector and municipalities to engage in dialogue and collaborate on local economic development initiatives.

<p>The evaluation concluded that formation of local economic development committees at the individual municipality level is more effective than the cluster of municipalities found at the level of Local Economic Development Committee or Municipal Development Committee for creating space for citizens. The private sector and municipalities engage in dialogue and collaborate on local economic development initiatives. The main reason is that at cluster level there were not representatives of each municipality so their voices were not all heard. For the municipal committees, though they are responsible for the outcomes of local economic development plans municipal election turnover and other reasons caused substantial delays.</p> <p>Both Empowering Municipalities through Local Economic Development (EMLED) and Municipal Capacity Building and Service Delivery Program (TAMKIN) established Local Economic Development Committees as mechanisms for cooperation and collaboration among the municipality, citizens and the private sector. The Municipal Development Committees established by TAMKIN and the Local Economic Development Committees formed by EMLED provide a space and platform for community representatives and municipalities to engage in a dialogue on local economic development needs. This dialogue includes discussions on the needs of the community, prioritization, identification and selection of projects for implementation.</p>	<p>Social Impact, Inc. Corporate Office, 2011, Empowering Municipalities Through Local Economic Development (EMLED) &amp; Municipal Capacity Building And Service Delivery Program (TAMKIN) Program Evaluation (Lebanon), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
--	--

- 14) Ensure that projects are *sensitive to the level of investment of local government* that are needed to strengthen capacities of existing programmes and newly introduced programmes on the IE. Impact and sustainability may be negatively affected if this point is inadequately considered.

<p>The evaluation determined that the project had not been especially sensitive to different levels of investment required by local governments' existing programmes and newly introduced programmes in terms of their capacities to respond to similar future disasters.</p>	<p>Rodriguez-Ariza, Carlos, 2014, Typhoon Bopha Philippines: Application of Local Resource-based Employment Generation Approach (PHI/12/08/AUS) and Joint Response Based Employment Generations and Livelihood Recovery Interventions (PHI/13/03/AUS), Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	---

- 15) *Build on existing traditional structures* in communities wherever this is possible as it can contribute to appropriateness, motivation and interest of the community with regard to IE issues.

<p>The evaluation noted the use of traditional institutional systems, such as keres, (traditional group associations) in the development of community tourism and grain and seed banks was useful for gaining the motivation and interest of the community.</p>	<p>Tessema, Ato Tsegahun; Tadess, Beyen; Getahun, Zewditu; Buta, Ato Mengistu, 2008, Meket Livelihood Development Project MLDP (Ethiopia) phase II Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Save the Children UK, Addis Ababa.</p>
<p>The evaluation identified good practices for replication: the application of community-based participatory approaches based on existing social structures and linkages with local and regional service providers; promotion of self-organisation via counselling of self- help groups and cooperatives.</p>	<p>Wolterstorff, Paul, 2015, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Project Promote and Strengthen Enterprises and Market Systems in Drought-Prone ASAL Areas in Kenya, Midterm or interim evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.</p>

16) Ensure that monitoring and evaluation of coaching and mentoring on IE related issues is *result-based and well implemented*. Ensure that coaching and mentoring is well organised and ensure that mentors:

- Understand their roles
- Can determine needs of learners
- Are able to impart learning well.

The evaluation concluded that the project invested a great deal of time in coaching and mentoring. Though partners acknowledged the benefit of this effort, they observed that the coaching and mentoring was not well organised. There was no properly documented program for the mentoring activities. This includes a lack of organised monitoring of these activities.

Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.

17) *Promote capacity strengthening of ministries and other agencies* to specifically support women entrepreneurship (including of women dependent on the informal economy) and advocate to make such development a priority.

The evaluation determined that there is a necessity for continued advocacy and support to help ministries and agencies responsible for private sector development to make women's entrepreneurship development a priority will be needed.

Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

18) *Include labour inspectors, labour officers and law enforcement officials* in training and as actors on awareness raising of decent work conditions for people dependent on the IE.

The evaluation recommended of a strong focus on inclusion of labour inspectors, labour officers and law enforcement officials in training and as actors on awareness raising of decent work conditions.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environmentfor MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

19) *Use experienced stakeholders from previous projects* related to the IE to disseminate and replicate/scale up activities to new areas as opposed to implementing them only through provision of tools, guidelines, and training workshops at central level.

The evaluation found that it is useful to use existing project stakeholder entities to disseminate actions in various parts of the country. Replication is facilitated when individuals who were involved in pilot models are directly involved in replication in whole or in part.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environmentfor MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

20) *Raise awareness of stakeholders on basic capacity issues in organisational management* so that they can assess their own learning needs. For example, when determining institutional training needs, stakeholders need to have a basic understanding of organisation management methods



including on change management, knowledge management, stakeholders' involvement, new opportunity development and how they work in their organizations on IE issues.

<p>The evaluation found that project partners need more awareness on capacity issues in organizational management, including on change management, knowledge management, stakeholders' involvement, new opportunity development and how they work in their organizations. To be able to assess their own competencies in this area a basic awareness of these issues is needed. The evaluation also found that the Organizational Capacity Assessment Tool contains all the dimensions of a well-capacitated organization. It further determined that projects need to raise awareness on what these dimensions mean and how important they are to the organizations.</p>	<p>Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
---	---

21) Ensure that the use of tools and guidelines are *adequately disseminated* to project field offices for internal use and for capacity strengthening of local stakeholder partners on IE issues.

<p>There were no mechanisms on how the perceived benefits of the Organizational Capacity Assessment Tool would trickle down to the field offices.</p>	<p>Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
---	---

22) Ensure that projects provide *capacity strengthening of partners instead of micro-managing or taking over the roles and responsibilities of the partners* when providing support to people dependent on the IE. Ensure that partner roles and responsibilities during implementation is clear and agreed upon.

<p>The evaluation found that the project partners cited lack of clarity on roles and responsibilities, and micromanaging. They complained that the project sometimes took roles they felt they should be handling or gave these roles to consultants (e.g., for district-level training workshops and procurements).</p>	<p>Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
--	---

23) *Ensure that certification of trainers* trained through projects is implemented in a sufficiently timely manner to maintain their sense of motivation on providing support to people dependent on the IE.

<p>The evaluation found that quality and competency of the trainers is a key issue for the success of SCORE but also a challenge. There is some loss of motivation linked to the slowly implemented certification process for trainers.</p>	<p>Bugnion de Moreta, Christian; Pedraza Isaza, Daniel; Hongman ; Lam Ba Nguyen, Zhang; Owusu; Sandra, Christian Bugnion de Moreta (Lead Evaluator), Daniel Pedraza Isaza, Hongman Zhang, Lam Ba Nguyen, Sandra Owusu, 2012, SCORE - Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	---

## 1.8. Organising informal economy groups

**Indicators:** GP and LL on organising informal economy groups.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during institution and capacity strengthening and determine if/how these were overcome.

- 1) Promote the *organising of people dependent on the IE into business associations or cooperatives* to enable them to formalise and access possible government or other support. Include capacity strengthening focus on:
  - working together,
  - increase in sharing, exchanging and lending between community members of material goods, sharing of ideas and skills.

Organizing producers into business associations or cooperatives to help formalize the support that they may obtain from government is useful to increase economic empowerment.

The evaluation noted that a significant number in all groups agreed there was benefits to the community arising from increased working together, and an increase in sharing, exchanging and lending between community members. This related not just to material goods, but also to sharing of ideas and skills. Increased trust within the community had increased opportunities for borrowing and lending and the giving of credit. There have also been increased interactions between different members of the community, leading to new friendships and a strengthening of existing friendships. The community has also benefited from a decrease in the level of begging and a reduced feeling of dependence on others.

Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.  
Gourley, Deborah, 2012, Evaluation of NRC Food Security and Livelihoods Projects in Chipinge and Chiredzi Districts, Zimbabwe, 2011-12, Final evaluation, Norwegian Refugee Council, Oslo.

- 2) Note that it is necessary to strengthen the organisational capacities of cooperatives and informal enterprise groups as only forming such groups is not sufficient for them to be effective and self-sustaining.

According to the Evaluation, the numerous groups formed such as Village Development Committees, Water Users Associations and other Cooperatives are yet to be capacitated in terms of organisation management, marketing, conflict mitigation and comprehending the concept of development. During the field visits the Evaluation Team noticed seeds of conflict between the members, the dependency on the project to sustain most of the activities and the lack of coordination among these groups.  
If in the remaining period the project would invest more in capacity building of these organizations especially in economic development, marketing and organizational capacity, the potential is there and the local people seem to be quite willing to be engaged and are open for more possibilities.

Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.

- 3) *Be flexible in the determination of types of informal groups* that will be strengthened and/or established. Recognise that there may be different needs and do not promote a single approach throughout all projects/activities. Consider that there may be groups with strong forms of full partnership among the group members or simpler options such as cooperating on a single aspect such as marketing or transportation.



## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

The evaluation noted that a spectrum of group formation should be wide to range from strong forms of full partnership among the women into lighter options such as cooperating on a single aspect such as marketing or transportation, something that the project executed in its first phase. Including groups that are formed based on family businesses, as the evaluation showed, should not be seen as a drawback but as a way to adapt to the local practices. It is recommended that for any forthcoming phases, flexibility of group formation is continued and announced from the beginning among local partners and potential women beneficiaries.	Summers, Guy, 2013, Palestinian Women's Economic Empowerment Project – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Palestinian Women's Economic Empowerment Project, Occupied Palestinian Territory.
The evaluation determined that a pursuit of a single group model, such as women's self-help groups, to the exclusion of other approaches, limits the ability to learn from the user – about what works and why in different contexts – and to test alternatives in parallel rather than in sequence. Greater experimentation during the first phase, when the project was rolled out in the first six districts, could have laid the ground for more creative destruction, adaptation, and learning prior to scaling.	Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2015, Project Performance Assessment Report India Ten Million Women and Counting: An Assessment of World Bank Support for Rural Livelihood Development in Andhra Pradesh, India, Final evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC, Projects: Andhra Pradesh District Poverty Initiatives Project; Andhra Pradesh Rural Poverty Reduction Project.

- 4) *Integrate and study the results of cooperative approaches* in small enterprise development. Organising cooperatives as an alternative to small enterprise associations may be useful in the context of formalising the informal economy. The extent to which this is beneficial needs further analysis.

The analysis determined that the work to promote enterprise associations and cooperative enterprises was found to have great potential but is currently underdeveloped, in large part due to limited funds and, as yet, too few cases of cooperative approaches being integrated into small enterprise development technical cooperation.	Henry, Carla; Dearden, Philip N., 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation noted the inclusion of cooperatives of formerly informal economy transport providers but the extent to which this approach is beneficial to operators and workers was still not fully evident.	Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

- 5) *Promote inter-producer IE group learning* as opposed to only training from formal entities.

Producer Organization approach and the Farmer Field School (FFS) methodology have both been and still are instrumental in enhancing stakeholder interventions by reaching households through groups that facilitated joint learning directly from each other	i-TEC, 2011, Uganda Livelihoods And Enterprises For Agricultural Development (LEAD), Mid Term Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
--	--

- 6) Consider when starting groups—including for women and other people dependent on the informal economy—that a *focus on building trust between group members* is important. Use team building exercise methodologies to build trust. Even in communities where people may know each other there can be a need for such team building activities.

The evaluation concluded that the building of trust is crucial for the success of business groups. This was brought up time and again by women especially those who were concerned about partnering with other women whom they have not worked before.	Summers, Guy, 2013, Palestinian Women's Economic Empowerment Project – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Palestinian Women's Economic
--	--

	Empowerment Project, Occupied Palestinian Territory.
--	--

- 7) While organising IE workers into groups such as savings and credit cooperatives that can be beneficial to addressing decent work deficits, note that the heterogeneous nature of the informal economy may results in challenges. In project design, *consider differences between IE operators and workers and the eventual potential challenges to scaling up activities after project end*. Such consideration may take the form of good analysis of the functioning of types of IE activities and possible contextual challenges. Subsequently, envisage, test and measure results to learn lessons. Integrate lessons learned back into new programming.

Informal economy workers were supported through the joint action of trade unions and cooperatives. Among other things, the project envisaged organizing workers into groups, often in the form of savings and credit cooperatives (SACCOs). Through specific training activities on decent work, and support activities in the area of OSH, certain decent work deficits were addressed. At the same time, the project was challenged by the heterogeneous nature of the informal sector and the difficulty of scaling-up activities after the pilot phase.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
---	---

- 8) *Promote the creation of Common Interest Groups (CIGs)* as a first step towards the creation of cooperatives to enable efficient and effective economic and practical support.

FAO's project was implemented by in two districts: Qarabagh, Kabul Province, and Surkhrod, Nangarhar Province. The direct target beneficiaries numbered 6,515 farming families. These were grouped in Common Interest Groups, CIGs. At the end of the project 134 CIGs were present in Qarabagh, and 124 CIGs in Surkhrod. The CIGs collect the requests for agricultural inputs from their members, e.g. seed, fertilizer, poles for trellis, and so on. These goods are transported to the stores at the district and the Chiefs of the CIGs divide the goods over the members who sign for receiving the goods with their ID number. CIGs receive the goods at a discount of often 20%. The principle is that after the harvest the members of the CIGs pay their equivalent share into a bank account; this is registered in the name of the Chief of the CIG. The CIG is free to spend this money following community's purposes. For instance this may be used to build a water conservation dam, or buy a lorry to transport their agricultural produce, or to transport inputs to the CIG, or to purchase agricultural inputs for the next cropping season. From a technical perspective, FAO's Extension Officers have communicated to the CIGs and farmers crop-specific best cultural practices under the given circumstances and for the particular climate, land, water and soil conditions. This technical information will stay with the farming community and provides a long-term benefit for them and was a sustainable component of the project.	Denecke, Harry W., 2013, Support to household food security and livelihood of vulnerable and food insecure farming families - GCP /AFG/061/LUX (Afghanistan), Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.
--	--

- 9) *Consider promoting different types of group models depending on the context*, the needs and purpose of the groups instead of using the same model throughout. Test alternatives in parallel rather than in sequence.

The evaluation concluded that the pursuit of a single group model, such as women's self-help groups, to the exclusion of other approaches, limits the ability to learn from the user – about what works and why in different contexts – and to Greater experimentation during the first phase, when the project was rolled out in	Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2015, Project Performance Assessment Report India Ten Million Women and Counting: An
---	---

the first six districts, could have laid the ground for more creative destruction, adaptation, and learning prior to scaling.	Assessment of World Bank Support for Rural Livelihood Development in Andhra Pradesh, India, Final evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC, Projects: Andhra Pradesh District Poverty Initiatives Project; Andhra Pradesh Rural Poverty Reduction Project.
---	---

- 10) Foster *more participation of vulnerable groups' in informal groups* by adapting the criteria to obtain membership and to stay a member.

<p>The evaluation notes that women's participation in water users associations (WUAs) in Kenya was constantly undermined by several factors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The payment required by WUAs (in cash or in kind) for the access to associations and the use of water is often beyond the means of very poor women;</li> <li>▪ Membership is often restricted to registered landowners, who very often are men.</li> <li>▪ Staying in the associations' planning bodies requires time: women don't dispose necessary time to participate to all the activities.</li> <li>▪ Although women emerge as the main beneficiaries of improved water management in the community, their substantial contributions are largely hidden behind social norms regarding gender roles and relations.</li> </ul>	Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.
---	---

- 11) *Keep supporting groups even after a project ceases to operate.* Try to sustain technical support for their activities for (at least) another production period and/or better to guide their transformation process in cooperatives. Gradual phasing out of support is preferable to immediate end of technical support at project closure.

<p>The evaluation states that Common Interest Groups (CIGs) have properly worked in Afghanistan for the duration of the project, but raises concerns about their future sustainability. FAO, along with the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock, agreed on the transformation of CIGs in cooperatives. Unfortunately, a major obstacle is that formally only multi-purpose cooperatives are recognized by law. CIGs are concerned with a single crop. Many farmers and members of CIGs are hesitant to become members of cooperatives since the farming community has had mixed experience with cooperatives.</p> <p>After the project ceases to operate, for the CIGs willing to continue functioning in a sustainable manner, it is advisable for FAO's Extension Officers to continue rendering services to them for one more cropping season albeit less intensively. This could be an exit strategy for those CIGs who do not wish to become a cooperative. For CIGs who wish to transform into a cooperative, FAO's Extension Officers could guide this process and assist the CIGs in negotiating their future set-up as cooperative with local government officials.</p> <p>Obviously, these new organisations would require adequate legal and regulatory frameworks for producer organizations and simple registration processes, as well as technical support, facilitation and business development support to establish strong and sustainable organizations.</p>	Denecke, Harry W., 2013, Support to household food security and livelihood of vulnerable and food insecure farming families - GCP /AFG/061/LUX (Afghanistan), Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.
--	--

## 1.9. Value chains and adding value to value chain components

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on value chains and adding value to value chain components

b) Challenges on GP and LL on value chains and adding value to value chain components

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on value chain with special attention to the existing linkages between formal and informal economy.

- 1) *Conduct commodity/product-specific value chain studies* to determine recommendations for improving product quality, value added, potential market access for exports and identify high value commodities.

Twenty-three commodity-specific quality studies were prepared that evaluated value chains and provided recommendations for improving product quality, value added and market access for exports and high value commodities.	Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2013, Project Performance Assessment Report Tunisia Agricultural Support Services Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC.
---	---

- 2) *Keep within a feasible and realistic number of value chain and component analyses* in accordance with available human and other resources. Over-extending the number of studies and support may result in only a limited success along the value chain.
- 3) When designing projects with *women (and men) in home-based or other informal economy activities, include focus on the value chain*. Incomes and working conditions can be improved when consideration is made of the means to strengthen informal economy products in the value chain.

The evaluation found that the project's focus on the embellished product's value chain is an appropriate approach to engaging women in economic activity in the project area.	Management Systems International, 2012, Women's Economic Empowerment: Balochistan, Final Evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
The project activities directed at the strengthening and development of producer organizations through the approach of addressing gaps and bringing various actors along the value chain together has demonstrated immense potential for creating a sustainable environment toward reaching the program goal and objective.	i-TEC, 2011, Uganda Livelihoods And Enterprises For Agricultural Development (LEAD), Mid Term Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
Before MSME's intervention, most honey was sold in a raw, unprocessed state along the roadside in buckets. With the technical assistance of MSME, the communities now filter the honey and sell it at higher prices to buyers in Phnom Penh and the respective provinces including Siem Reap, Kampong Thom, Koh Kong, Preah Vihear and Steung Treng. MSME produced the "Honey Profiles/Book" that provided information to potential buyers about how much honey was available in different communities, when it was available, and who could be contacted.	Mendez England & Associates, 2012, Final Performance Evaluation of USAID's "Cambodia Micro, Small And Medium-Sized Enterprises II/Business Enabling Environment" Project, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

- 4) Conduct studies *on different possibilities within each potential value chain* but do not over-extend. That is, remain within what is feasible and reasonable with regard to available human and

other resources. Include focus on improving value chain component product quality, means to add value and market access at each level.

The evaluation noted that the project conducted 23 commodity-specific quality studies on value chains and their components and provided recommendations for improving product quality, value added and market access for exports.

Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2013, Project Performance Assessment Report Tunisia Agricultural Support Services Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC.

- 5) When supporting projects that include value chain enhancement, *consider the impact of the development of the value chain on a wider range of the community members as opposed to primarily on business owners.*

The evaluation found that both project components promoted public-private partnerships for local economic development. However, while some partnerships provided benefits to a wider range of the community (e.g., a milk collection centre), others are limited in scope and the benefits accrue mostly to the business owners (e.g., snack bars and restaurants for tourists directly benefit the restaurateurs only). The project staff defined public-private partnerships as any collaboration between municipalities and the private sector for the provision of (a) direct financial contribution; (b) in-kind contribution; (c) public incentives for private investment; and (d) public provision of services or technical support on projects run by the private sector. The private sector could be any business, including individual entrepreneurs, local or foreign companies, community-based organization (CBOs) or other for-profit entities.

Social Impact, Inc. Corporate Office, 2011, Empowering Municipalities Through Local Economic Development (EMLED) & Municipal Capacity Building And Service Delivery Program (TAMKIN) Program Evaluation (Lebanon), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

- 6) Conduct studies to determine whether, if any new value added/value chain components are developed, they *do not compete with existing traditional non-beneficiary local producers.*

The evaluation concluded that it is important to conduct studies to determine if any new value added/value chain components are added that they do not compete with existing traditional non-beneficiary local producers.

Lassine, Bamba, 2015, Good practices collection from Implementing Partners Part 1 AVSI (Civil Society / NGO) - 12 October 2015, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Research Network and Support Facility, Rome, Project: Projet integre d'appui a l'autonomisation des artisans de Côte d'Ivoire.

- 7) *Study various forms of public private partnerships for food processing facilities and extract good practices for possible replication.*

The establishment in both the Amhara and Oromia regions of joint processing facilities, was an exemplary demonstration of a public private partnership, and sets the stage for potentially significant developments in the sector

Newkirk, James, 2013, Edible oil value chain enhancement in Ethiopia Final Evaluation of the Joint Programme, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

- 8) *Introduce certification of decent work produced items* that are for example, “child labour free”, “forced labour free”, “produced in safe working conditions”, etc. Monitor certification program through public private partnerships. Such programs can go beyond fair trade certification as they can also be used within countries. Awareness raising around the certification program at national level can also be a means to raise general awareness of the need for decent work conditions.

Based on the evaluation of the Ethiopians Fighting Against Child Exploitative Labor (E-FACE) project an analysis was done of the Safe Threads program is an E-FACE collaboration with the government to create a Child-Safe label for products, in order to increase their connectivity with international textile markets. E-FACE found that simple weavers of textiles in Ethiopia would not be able to connect with designers supplying foreign buyers in Europe and America due to a reputation for dependence on exploitative child labour. Many textile companies and fashion designers did not want to source their materials from Ethiopia because buying from businesses employing child labour would hurt their reputation with consumers in the West.

In order to solve this conflict, E-FACE employed the program that we are identifying as a good practice: Safe Threads. In the program, domestic producers of textiles who are not using exploitative child labour can go to the government and, after proving that their means of production are Child-Safe, they can receive the Safe Threads certification. When these firms are certified as Child-Safe, international buyers should feel more comfortable buying from them, thus economically empowering the local weavers. Weavers continue to be monitored to ensure that they do not return to employing child labour. E-FACE had primarily created this initiative because part of the project's goals is to get domestic producers of textiles to end their dependence on exploitative child labour. If they do so in order to get this certification, then these goals were accomplished. This is a good practice because, instead of forcing the businesses to end their dependence on child labour, E-FACE is influencing them to choose to end the dependence themselves. Should these firms gain international market connections due to the Safe Threads program, it is safe to say that they will never return to using child labour again, as doing so would lose their certification, and thus their connections with foreign buyers. As far as the Informal Economy is concerned, this is also an effective formalization good practice because in receiving this certification from the government, businesses must become registered, and therefore formal.

This practice motivates businesses to formalize themselves, as it provides large benefits for doing so. As a result, similar practices can be recommended in other situations where improving decent work conditions and economic empowerment are prime goals.

Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.

- 9) *Support the development of the whole value chain of production and selling* to improve local conditions and support beneficiaries independent from development projects. Pay particular attention to those parts of the value chain involving people dependent on the IE and how these can be strengthened to improve their decent work and income conditions.

The evaluation found that the interventions in horticulture in Kosovo were based on a justified logic: it was focused on restoring the productive potential of agribusinesses by promoting value chains, in particular horticultural and related agribusinesses, through labour intensive growth for agribusinesses. In particular, the components were explicitly focused on supporting the whole chain from improving the quality of the products, to establishing of local collection centres and linking-up to large local buyers (e.g. supermarket chains). They appear to be appropriate to sustainably increase production levels. Generally, the evaluation found that beneficiaries in the value chain became

Orbicon A/S; GHK Consulting Limited; Pinto Consulting GmbH, 2011, Evaluation of the Danish Neighbourhood Programme with a focus on the Economic Development Portfolio, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Armenia, Kosovo, Serbia.



increasingly independent and built on the initial supported investments (e.g. green-houses, incubators, collection centres, etc.). Contracts were signed with local storage operators, food processors and supermarkets. Furthermore, the value-chain activities supported through the horticulture component resulted in a degree of import substitution and/or export. Some international firms demonstrated willingness to buy Kosovo farming products (fruits and vegetables) and the requirements of these firms in terms of the standard of the exported products are contributing to improving quality over time and other positive knock-on effects for the Kosovo horticultural value chains.

10) Pay attention to key debates of concern in value chain development on contract farming: *equity of participants and fairness in quality control of products*. Note that contract farming can be seen as a broad umbrella term of inclusive business models where smallholders/value chain producers are engaged and supported by larger firms to produce outputs.

The analysis concluded that contract farming is an important means to include people with limited resources and who live in live in rural areas in economic processes. However, the recent literature on contract farming with smallholders focuses on several key debates:

- 1) The degree of smallholder participation in contracting schemes.
- 2) The impact of participation on smallholders' incomes/welfare. (equity issues)
- 3) Crops exhibiting high variation in quality, that perish easily, that are hard to grow, or that command a higher price per kilo are more likely to be grown through contract farming. Standard crops that have uniform quality and are not perishable are usually traded in spot markets since the transaction costs are low.

Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries.

11) *Strengthen exchanges among enterprises from developed and developing countries* in order to accelerate knowhow transfer in both directions. Companies in developed countries may, for example, increase their understanding of other cultures and new markets.

Evaluation focuses on enterprises exchanges and knowhow transfer. The latter is often related to systems building, for example in creation of cold chain in the food industry and in general safety and hygiene in this sector, critical in developing country exports to industrial countries where food safety standards are generally very strict. Knowhow is also to a large extent related to market demands and quality issues in industrialised countries. In this respect, the Danish companies brought critical knowledge to local firms engaged in sub-contracting manufacturing in sectors such as information technology and food. The exchange of personnel between Denmark and the partner country was often a critical element, providing essential learning for the local company on how firms in the same business was organised in Denmark and the quality requirements on the Danish market. Financing such exchanges was an essential part of successful knowhow transfer and learning.

In general, collaboration between businesses from different cultures and markets means learning from both parties. It would therefore be wrong to see the knowhow transfer as a one-way street. It goes both ways: Danish companies interviewed express overall the learning they have made through the partnerships of understanding of cultures and of new markets. While technology transfers from the North often can be a valid concept, technology is today globalised in many sectors and transfer of knowhow goes both ways, besides the aspect of mutual cultural learning.

Evaluation Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Denmark, 2014, Evaluation of DANIDA Business to Business Programme 2006-2011, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Mali, Benin, China, Vietnam, Uganda, Bangladesh.

In Tanzania, Oxfam adopted the 'Lead-Firm' Model and partnered with Katani Ltd. to improve smallholder access to markets for sisal. Katani agreed to improve the production and processing capacity of the smallholders, and committed to purchase all quality sisal fibre. Both Oxfam and Katani funded training for smallholders, while Oxfam supplied them with loans to purchase processing equipment. As a result of the project, more buyers were attracted by the new supply of fibres, farmers and processors gained significant increased income, and the local sisal value chain greatly improved with sustainable connections to high-value markets.

It is important to add, however, that the Lead-Firm Model provides many advantages, but the selected private-sector actor can monopolise supply and enforce less beneficial conditions of trade. This risk can be avoided by securing more buyers and less exclusive contracts, and providing loans directly to smallholders through an independent agent.

Beck, G. & Davies, I., 2013, The Lead-Firm Model: Connecting smallholders to high-value markets in Tanzania, Final project/program report, Oxfam (online publication).

- 12) Note in planning and designing programming that *road construction and cash for work can both contribute to improved livelihoods for people dependent on the IE.* These initiatives contribute to effective demand for products while roads facilitate the work of traders. (Informal economy related programming often ignores this type of support).

The evaluation concluded that roads constructed by the Cash for Work programme have improved access to markets for beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries; shortened time spent getting to markets; improved inter-locality networking and enhanced social capital such as labour and market information sharing. Through its direct impact on the income of beneficiaries, the cash injected considerably increased the effective demand for major food crops and livestock (for asset building). This provided a good opportunity for traders to enter and/or expand their operations.

Tessema, Ato Tsegahun; Tadess, Beyen; Getahun, Zewditu; Buta, Ato Mengistu, 2008, Meket Livelihood Development Project MLDP (Ethiopia) phase II Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Save the Children UK, Addis Ababa.

- 13) Take into account that *interventions in parts of a particular value chain may negatively affect the level of employment in those parts of the value chain.* This may especially occur when more modern technical equipment is used to increase production.

According to the evaluation carried out in Eastern Europe\neighbourhood countries, production increases obtained through the acquisition of new and more modern technical equipment at small family farm sites does not lead to significant employment effects.

Thus, it is recommended that design and formulation of future economic development interventions should take more explicitly into account the potential trade-off between the wish to increase production through investing in more effective agricultural production within family farms on the one hand and the intention to generate large rural employment effects on the other hand. By focusing on the entire value chain it could be anticipated that employment will decrease in some part of the value chain due to introduction of more efficient production methods but at the same time lead to increase in other parts of the value chain e.g. in the processing industry.

Orbicon A/S; GHK Consulting Limited; Pinto Consulting GmbH, 2011, Evaluation of the Danish Neighbourhood Programme with a focus on the Economic Development Portfolio, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Armenia, Kosovo, Serbia.

- 14) Consider that in agriculture projects there may be *interest in and room for developing value-adding activities in food related projects.* Limiting value chain development to trading of raw products means opportunities are missed to increase incomes for vulnerable groups. Determine if farmer interest in food processing exists and then support development of processing of agricultural products. Include support for value chain analysis and development to accommodate these diversified products. Include training on economic managerial skills to run a business.



<p>The evaluation found that there is considerable enthusiasm in farming communities for developing micro and small enterprises in value addition. Farmers are eager to participate in value-adding activities for a profit, and they acknowledge the need for training in food processing and economic managerial skills to run a business.</p> <p>Analysis determined that some cooperative members realize that they have potential to aggregate 150-180 MT of soybeans per year. With this volume to sell or store, a cooperative can command a good price when it decides to sell. However, cooperatives would like to learn how to use value addition to go beyond commodity exchange. Transforming soybean into soy milk, soy meat, or cooking oil on a commercial scale requires technical expertise and managerial economic skills that farmers lack. Although farmers realize that their villages need suitable infrastructure such as buildings, water, power, and good roads, they would like to know the feasibility of linking with processors to take their soy, process it, and then distribute and sell the final product. Farmers in villages with infrastructure that can support a processing plant would like to carry out feasibility studies to explore the processing options to assess market demand.</p> <p>The evaluation concluded that work in the project on the value chain stopped at the commodity exchange level. The addition of agricultural processing to the marketing chain could provide an easy link to nutritious foods. As one Consortium staff stated, "No one can eat raw soybeans." Processing is a missed opportunity. A program can be developed for import substitution to processing, which of course it is not.</p>	<p>Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, <i>The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report</i>, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
--	--

- 15) Verify whether projects are *not over-extending themselves when working on different value chains and various interventions along the value chains*. As there are many needs for value chain development with respect to people dependent on the informal economy, it may be tempting to wish to address all of them but quality of actions must be the priority as opposed to their quantity. *Identify a mix of key value chains and gaps along these value chains that will maximize quantitative and qualitative impact*, provide effective lesson learning and build a larger degree of sustainability.

<p>The evaluation found that the Livelihoods and Enterprises for Agricultural Development (LEAD) was focusing on too many value chains and interventions along the value chains, some of which are already supported by other agencies.</p> <p>The evaluation thus recommended to identify a mix of fewer chains and key gaps along the value chain that will maximize quantitative and qualitative impact, provide effective lesson learning and build a larger degree of producer organizationsustainability.</p>	<p>i-TEC, 2011, <i>Uganda Livelihoods And Enterprises For Agricultural Development (LEAD), Mid Term Evaluation</i>, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
---	--

- 16) Facilitate focus on strengthening the functioning of the existing components of the value chain but also adding new components. That is, ensure that value chain development actions consider supporting the development of value such as on food processing even where this does not yet exist.

<p>The evaluation found that the value chain stops at the commodity exchange level which is too limited. The project needs to work on processing/value addition with its sub-partners. The addition of processing to the marketing chain could provide an easy link to nutritious foods. As one consortium staff stated, "No one can eat raw soybeans."</p>	<p>Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, <i>The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report</i>, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
---	--

17) When assessing a project proposal concerning value chain development, consider:

- How beneficial it can be for local workers both in terms of production and income
- If all the groups can be equally involved into the value chain (especially the most vulnerable ones)
- How developed the last part of the value chain is (marketing, transport facilities, supplies, consumers' customs etc.)

The evaluation underlines how the project in Kassala (Sudan) has identified and supported two value chains, namely sunflower and fishery.

1) With regard to sunflower value chains, fifty farmers were selected from 5 villages. The project provided seeds, and improved sorghum seeds as a staple food. Farmers benefitted from extension services from the Ministry of Agriculture seconded by an officer from the IFSP-Kassala team and were trained on the production of these crops. In order to foster market linkages, a visit of farmers' representatives was organised to Medani Oil processors and to the Agriculture Research Station in Wad Medani.

However, the situation is not clear in terms of income increase. The meetings with sunflower farmers in Kassala inspectorate have shown that the income they gained from sorghum is more than five times the income they got from sunflower.

They attributed that to associated problems in land preparation, sowing dates and sowing techniques. They are still willing to continue sunflower production based on its potential of stable markets (contracts with oil processor companies) and ready market compared to unstable market prices for sorghum.

The sunflower value chain is exclusively male dominated, and youth are systematically excluded.

Marketing is still the weakest link with this production. So far sunflower producers are linked to oil plants in Gezira state. All farmers interviewed by the Evaluation Team have only mentioned one company which organized their visit before production to convince farmers to grow sunflower on the basis of the ready market. The farmers' bargaining power is weak and they have to accept the offered price. They do not have alternative markets to reduce the risk of dependence on one company.

2) The fish value chain started with consultation meetings with fishermen, boat makers, fish processing plants, fish restaurants and representatives from local governments and NGOs. Accordingly 18 fishermen groups were formed involving more than 425 fishermen in addition to one women's cooperative in Khashm el-Girba where 40 women benefitted from training in fish processing and net making. The fishermen benefitted from boats and proved fishing gear while women in the value chain benefitted from food and fish processing tools.

Regarding most vulnerable groups' involvement, though women are involved in fish processing, they are not clearly linked to the value chain. It was also clear that involving women in net making is economically not viable mainly because it is a time consuming activity and also because the marketing process is not clearly defined and the women have to use their own network to sell their nets. With respect to youth, the skills- development training they received is not necessarily relevant to boat fixing or tractor repair apart from fixing flat tires.

As for marketing, fish is still traditional and localised. Expanding the market beyond the state requires sophisticated storage and transport facilities beyond the current capacity of the cooperatives or the project.

Overall, the Evaluation Team found that the project focus was mainly on community-based organizations and service providers, less on agro-processing micro and small enterprises. There has also been almost total lack of the participatory approach and the implementation process has remained top-down in planning, implementation and M&E. The beneficiaries were not consulted on the results and processes and the team has remained strongly focused on the targets of the project document.

Therefore, the designers of this project have not defined and combined value chainS in a clear, comprehensive, and consistent pathway of activities, outputs

Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.

and results to support this approach. No training of staff and partners on value chains and absence of training on community development approaches. No social simulation or awareness of youth preceded the selection of activities or areas of training.

## 1.10.Improving linkages between formal and informal economy

**Indicators:** a)GP and LL on how to improve linkages between formal and informal economy identified.

b) Challenges on improving linkages between formal and informal economy identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of types of linkages between formal an informal economy implemented in different settings (including through systems analysis). Identification and analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during strengthening of linkages between formal and informal economy and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Include the private sector as well as the* government when working with people dependent on the IE. This is particularly important where public sector financing is limited.

The evaluation determined that, while UNIDO operated through local public sector institutions, the potential role of the emerging private sector should be further emphasised as a contributor to income generation and peace building. This is vital in areas where public sector financing is limited.

UNIDO, 2014, Integration and progress through protection and empowerment of displaced groups in South Sudan, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

2) To enable an efficient agricultural environment, ensure that public and private sector coexist and cooperate strategically. Ensure that private sector implementation is aligned with government rules and incentives. Steps towards this goal should be phased and may be composed of:

- Initial short term state-led infrastructure investments
- Governmental interventions in seasonal finance and input supply systems
- Government withdrawal and private sector gradually taking over.

According to Dorward (2004), a three-phased approach is needed, and it is composed of: 1) state-led infrastructure investments; 2) governmental interventions in seasonal finance and input supply systems; 3) government withdrawal and private sector taking over. Spailman (2010) supports initial and short-term public engagement, since high start-up costs and risks in developing agricultural value chain justify state's intervention. The latter should be gradually taken over by private agents since they can adjust public inefficiencies and trigger new investments by relying on their own interests. Poulton and Macartney (2012) claim that private sector taking over should be aligned with public policy objectives through rules and incentives that can avoid ethical issues and adverse selection.

Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries.

- 3) *In designing programmes on the IE, pay attention to context, including country geographic, socio-cultural and economic differences.* Actions on establishing linkages may work well in one context but not another. Innovations on linkages between formal and informal entities should be vetted through pilot and stakeholder consultations to ensure their suitability for the local context. Options should then be tested in a new context before scaling up. This is necessary to make public/private investments into strengthening the enabling environment more successful in the whole country.

<p>The evaluation found that the impact of fertiliser subsidies programme in Zambia was not the same for the whole country. In wealthier areas, where the private sector was very active, these subsidies crowded out private initiative: commercial distributors waited to see how and where the government would have addressed its programme (changing every year) and then they acted consequently, in order to be more competitive.</p> <p>In the case of Thailand, the success of producing higher added value products was due to: new land tenure rules; credit by state-owned banks; establishment of semi-public agribusiness companies; facilitation of contract farming schemes.</p> <p>Other examples show which shortcomings public-private partnerships might face, e.g. low farmer acceptance of new products supported by challenge funds; creation of lucrative market through guarantee funds instead of expanding coverage to low potential areas etc</p>	<p>Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries.</p>
<p>The evaluation briefly revisited the elements of the Rwandan context that most likely affected the effectiveness of the Akazi Kanoze Youth Livelihoods Project. The analysis contributes to the quality of the analysis of the project results.</p>	<p>McLellan, Iain &amp; Bamwesigye, Jackson, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Akazi Kanoze Youth Livelihoods Project (Rwanda), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
<p>The evaluation noted that specific project design features (in this case its linkage program between the formal and informal economy) may work well in one context, but not in another. Innovations should be vetted through pilot and stakeholder consultations to ensure their suitability for the local context.</p> <p>Conducting a pilot for the formal/informal linkage program would have highlighted implementation challenges, which could then be addressed before scaling up.</p> <p>Due to its implementation challenges the component had to be revised at mid-term review to narrow its focus to a smaller number of rural commercial banks and to support them in developing business plans to help them form linkages as well as to rationalize the type of trainings, group selection criteria etc. This was costly and inefficient.</p> <p>Creating linkages between formal and informal institutions was an innovative idea, inspired by a similar program in India. The evaluation stated, however, that according to the project this was included as an "afterthought" without testing its suitability for the local context through a pilot or through stakeholder consultations.</p>	<p>Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2014, Project Performance, Assessment Report Ghana Rural Financial Services Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC.</p>

- 4) *Engage the private sector in program delivery of entrepreneurship development activities* as it can enhance effectiveness. Linkages between learners and the private sector are established and content is rendered appropriate to the existing business context.

<p>The meta analysis determined that involving the private sector in program delivery (entrepreneurship development) can enhance the effectiveness.</p>	<p>Cho, Yoonyoung; Honorati, Maddalena, 2013, Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries: A Meta Regression Analysis, Meta-analysis of evaluations, World Bank Human Development Network Social protection and Labor Unit, Washington DC.</p>
---	--

- 5) When designing projects or individual actions on the IE, *consider supporting combining informal and formalisation aspects of economic activities*. Doing this would depend on the needs and context of the community members. Combining would entail maintaining the informal and accessible character in terms of cottage industry, family labour, low technology, and local manufacturing. At the same time provide support for including important formal sector characteristics such as technical/national standards, business registration, and access to finance. Formalisation does not have to be an “either or” option but can include support for maintaining informal aspects if these are appropriate to the needs of the community members.

The evaluation noted that the informal sector predominates in terms of employment and opportunities within East African economies – as it does across most of Sub-Saharan Africa. It holds this prominent position because it is accessible in terms of capital and education and provides the only real off-farm livelihood opportunity for most of the regions rural and peri-urban residents. The downside of the informal economy is that product quality is unreliable (there are no standards), it cannot access finance, it is overlooked by governments in terms of procurement of goods/services and it cannot really be regulated and supported. Which ensure that growth prospects and minimal. What the programme has done is develop a hybrid incorporating the useful elements of both the formal and informal sector into their approach to supporting businesses. The approach retains the informal and accessible character of the informal sector in terms of cottage industry, family labour, low technology, local manufacturing, etc. but at the same time includes important formal sector characteristics such as technical/national standards, business registration, access to finance, etc. While the businesses remain accessible and true to their socio-economic context, they do offer considerably more scope for growth and stability.

Aitken, Robert, 2013, Developing Energy Enterprises Project in East Africa, Final evaluation, The Global Village Energy Partnership DEEP EA, Nairobi, evaluation on the topic “Developing Energy Enterprises in Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda.

- 6) Avoid focusing only on *creating work opportunities inside the informal economy and also include focus on working with the formal private sector* to create formal employment of trained beneficiaries.

The analysis indicated that, while many of LabourNet’s trainings for women build their capacity for participation in the informal labour force, engaging with Corporate Social Responsibility programs and private sector companies who are interested in involving women in skilled positions in the formal sector, can help identify the latent labour demand that exists for women in the formal sector.

ACUMEN - Cartier Charitable Foundation, International Center for Research on Women, 2015, Women And Social Enterprises: How Gender Integration Can Boost Entrepreneurial Solutions to Poverty, General background document on issues in our research matrix, ACUMEN, New York.

## 1.11.Coordination and sustainability planning

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on coordination and sustainability planning identified.

b) Challenges on coordination and sustainability planning identified.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of implemented and successful methods of coordination and sustainability planning in selected projects, with special attention to the relations built-up among private NGOs, international institutions and public authorities (both at local and national level).

- 1) In identifying projects for funding, *take as criteria evidence of efforts to build on local resources and knowledge, partnering with established associations and collaborating with government agencies.*

The evaluation found that the project approach built on local resources and knowledge, partnering with established associations and collaborating with city government agencies.	Price, Jonathan, 2013, Community-Based Emergency Employment (Cash-for-Work) and Reconstruction Project (Philippines) – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
--	---

- 2) Ensure that project design includes *attention to coordination, continuity and complementarity with other initiatives in the implementing area.* During the project inception period this should be further strengthened with a mapping exercise to identify other local initiatives, complementarity, their possible roles in coordinating with the project.
- 3) *Develop well-defined and well-equipped facilities/institutions* aimed at upholding new entrepreneurs and liaising project beneficiaries with public authorities. Successful experiences should be institutionalised both at regional and national level so as to guarantee full sustainability and continuity with good results.
- 4) *Consider seconding experts to relevant government offices* for a period of time to strengthen their institutional capacities on IE issues.

The evaluation concluded that conducting a stakeholder analysis and determining roles of partners is essential to ensure good coordination. Recognize the distinct objectives and modus operandi of humanitarian organizations (short- term) and business entities (long-term), and respect their different mandates, roles and approaches.	UNHCR, 2011, Promoting Livelihoods and Self-reliance Operational Guidance on Refugee Protection and Solutions in Urban Areas, General background document on issues in our research matrix, UNHCR, Geneva.
The analysis indicated that continuity and complementary with other initiatives had a clear positive effect at the policy and technical level.	Aiolfi, Luca, 2013, Effective Governance of Labour Migration and its Skills Dimensions, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic "effective Governance of Labour Migration and its Skills Dimensions in Moldova and Ukraine".
The evaluation found that there were good efforts in most interventions to involve local institutions and other stakeholders. This improved accuracy in planning and made the implementation more efficient.	Munene, Charles, 2013, Improvement of livelihoods for vulnerable in urban and peri-urban areas of Galkayo – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation determined that the importance of coordination, collaboration and convergence of development efforts is a good practice that should not be ignored.	Jersild, Amy; Lazo, Lucita, 2013, Towards a child-labour-free Philippines: Building on past gains and addressing challenges – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation noted that in one of the countries, Jordan, joint planning meetings are being organized to improve coordination. In the same project but in Lebanon, a specialist was assigned to the Ministry of Labour to assist with coordination and implementation time management. This reiterates the importance of regular meetings to ensure coordination, complementarity and continuity post-project.	Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Trikha, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.



## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

The evaluation stated that coordination with local and provincial stakeholders helped to avoid duplication and contributes to effective information sharing (transparency).	Van Noord, H; Asmoro, P., 2013, Green Livelihood Access for Central Kalimantan's Inclusive Environmental Response to Climate Change- GLACIER (Indonesia), Final Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The analysis noted that the weakest link seems to be between projects on skills development and their effects on labour rights, unless additional strategies were incorporated in the project design to include, for example, social partners and/or ministries of labour (inspection).	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
Evaluation Findings indicated that, in Lebanon, seconding a consultant to the Ministry of Labour had enhanced not only coordination but also time management.	Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Trikha, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation indicated the Enterprise Development Units (EDUs), located in each of the governorates, were the conduit through which the project activities were implemented. The EDUs included tasks to coordinate with and strengthen the role of government offices on the project subjects. Special attention was given to building the capacities of EDU host institutions for the purpose of increasing sustainability.	UNIDO, Iraqi Programme, 2010, Enterprise Development and Investment Promotion Project, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

- 5) Work with governments to strengthen *coordination between relevant ministries at national and/or subnational level (as appropriate)* on the subject of the IE. Ensure that relevant government entities are involved from the project design and initiation phase. This may be accomplished through advocacy for the establishment of permanent coordinating committees and capacity strengthening of responsible persons/groups.

The evaluation concluded that coordination among different ministries remains the most difficult area to be tackled – especially so during a labour market crisis – with coordination among line ministries fragmented and with too few initiatives taken in concert.	Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
Projects should aim to work closely with regional and national government structures, especially in project design and initiation phases.	Wicander, S; Coad, L., 2015, Learning our Lessons A Review of Alternative Livelihood Projects in Central Africa: Review of multiple projects and/or actions, International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources, Gland, Switzerland.
The evaluation concluded that a stronger alliance/partnership with the public sector is highly desirable to ensure sustainability and longer-term development of suitable models.	Cambronero, Sergio; Midling, Michael; Molina, Francisco, 2012, Mid-term Evaluation- USAID Improving Access to Employment Program in El Salvador, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
The evaluation of two projects concluded that it is necessary to invest in more coordination with other stakeholders.	Ferrari, Florence, 2015, Search For Common Ground (SFCG): Land Programming in Rwanda Final evaluation «Umurage w'Ejo, the Legacy for Tomorrow project: Land and Livelihood in Rwanda», and Midterm evaluation « Strengthen citizen participation around sensitive issues in order to prevent

	conflict in the Great Lakes Region» , Midterm or interim evaluation, and Final evaluation, European Union & Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Brussels and The Hague, Projects: 1) Umurage w'Ejo, the Legacy for Tomorrow project: Land and Livelihood in Rwanda ; 2) Strengthen citizen participation around sensitive issues in order to prevent conflict in the Great Lakes Region, Rwanda.
The evaluation found that project management had limited interaction with central and local governments at all levels which means that project interventions will not be sustainable. Leaving district, field, and grantee staff to determine the nature of the Local Government interaction is a manifestation of inconsistent implementation and management approaches. Integration of project activities in the Local Government planning processes was notably weak in all districts visited; this led to duplication of efforts. The key lesson is that Local Governments are critical to future sustainability of project interventions.	i-TEC, 2011, Uganda Livelihoods And Enterprises For Agricultural Development (LEAD), Mid Term Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
The evaluation concluded that more value should be placed on the strengthening of the organizational structures on vertical and horizontal levels within the network to ensure the active participation and the closer ownership of associated members.	Zerhusen, Dirk, 2014, Sustainable Poverty Reduction and Food Security through Climate Change-Adapted Potato Production in Zerafshan Valley (Tajikistan), Final project/Program report, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.

6) To improve groundwork for effective coordination *ensure that all stakeholder partners are brought together at project inception* so that:

- The objectives of the project are understood by all
- The direction of the project is clear
- There is agreement on indicators
- Activities are coherent and aligned.

Although these are commonly known steps to ensure good coordination, they are frequently only partially implemented. More attention needs to be paid to these aspects.

The evaluation determined that in a project with multiple implementing partners, it is critical to bring partners together, preferably at the beginning of the project, to ensure that the objectives of the project are understood by all, to discuss the direction of the project, agree on indicators and ensure that activities are coherent and aligned.	Mingoen, Harlette, 2012, Social Protection and Gender in Cambodia Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
---	--

7) Ensure that projects *design an explicit exit strategy which is further elaborated during project inception period*. The exit strategy should identify the major risks to sustaining the project outcome and impact as well as sequencing of the measures to be taken. (1.8.2/10) Thus, include in project design clear post project transition strategy to government (or other implementers). Such a transition strategy goes beyond the usual short statements on sustainability in project documents and should include a summary of:



## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

- The underlying theory of change that is targeted for sustainability post project
- Expected roles and responsibilities for service delivery
- Expected types of training to be provided to acquire the needed capacities for transition (1.8.1/3).

The evaluation identified the need to develop an explicit Exit Strategy in the form of a written document that identifies the major risks to sustaining the project outcome and impact and sequences the measures to be taken until the end of 2015.	Schoen, Christian; Mousaco, Vino, 2013, Business opportunities and support services (BOSS) - Midterm Evaluation (Timor Leste), Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
All the projects assessed in the evaluation showed weakness in monitoring and shortcomings for their replication. At the project level the design of the project, particularly in later programme cycles is often results-orientated but the format and organisation of the programme does not seem to allow a rigorous follow up and monitoring that could help in adjusting the approach or bringing in extra resources or launching follow up projects to ensure a cumulative effect. Project reports rarely report on or use the indicators or monitoring tools that are available as part of their design. The prospects or opportunities for replication and scaling up (e.g. by linking to wider longer term efforts) are not considered during design or implementation. There are some initiatives where the potential for replication was identified through "project stories" and although useful this has not been sufficiently promoted or led to scaling up of activities.	Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.
The evaluation noted that in the early phases of rural development projects that support large-scale community as a means to leverage more equitable service delivery, including finance, there is a need to think long-term about the transition strategy for the chosen implementing agency. In the case of Andhra Pradesh, the implementing agency support became an essential pillar of the built system, undertaking roles and responsibilities for service delivery that overlapped with the line ministries. Without an effective transition strategy that integrates the philosophy, training and acquired skills into the broader administration, there is a risk that gains made under the project will be lost and efforts to reach the poorest of the poor may not be sustained.	Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2015, Project Performance Assessment Report India Ten Million Women and Counting: An Assessment of World Bank Support for Rural Livelihood Development in Andhra Pradesh, India, Final evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC, Projects: Andhra Pradesh District Poverty Initiatives Project; Andhra Pradesh Rural Poverty Reduction Project.

- 8) *Ensure that coordination is not limited to information sharing* about progress on activities. Coordination meetings should also cover real work to create synergies and develop legal/policy and planning frameworks as relevant.

The evaluation noted that the project's attempts at coordination were limited to information sharing. The RNSF Team leader has noted this problem in the evaluation of many projects in different subject areas over the course of almost 20 years.	Poudyal, Lokendra; Upadhyay, Balkrishna; Karki, Laxmi, 2013, Final Report on the Mid – Term Evaluation of Livelihood Recovery for Peace (LRP/UNDP) Project, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, Kathmandu.
--	---

- 9) *Identify and take into account the different priorities* of concerned parties in coordination of action with respect to the informal economy. Promote and provide technical support on discussions to attain consensus on steps to strengthen support for and people dependent on the IE.

The evaluation found that the project attempted coordination among interrelated projects and institutions. Plans related to DDC, DADO, WCO and DLSO are developed through DLCC. The DLCC meetings are organized regularly. Besides	Poudyal, Lokendra; Upadhyay, Balkrishna; Karki, Laxmi, 2013, Final Report on the Mid – Term Evaluation of Livelihood Recovery
--	---

these meetings, the project has also been organizing other issue based stakeholder meetings, orientations and workshops. MoU is signed with MEDEP, while the CGs are linked with the WCF established under the LGCDP. Despite these efforts, ensuring complementarity by making the process obligatory among all parties concerned has become difficult due to the variation in priorities.

for Peace (LRP/UNDP) Project, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, Kathmandu.

10) Ensure that projects are *linked to reform initiatives* and take other concrete steps to ensure that positive changes on the IE are more useful and sustainable. Efforts towards sustainability should be specific and well integrated into project activities, e.g.:

- Take actions to support reform legal and policy frameworks
- Support research to inform development of appropriate legal and policy frameworks. Include establishment of systems for continuous use of labour market information to adjust national strategies.
- Establish post-project systems for self-financing of activities.

The evaluation covers a selection of projects and actions initially promoted through SIDA's International Training Program (ITP) that show good prospects for sustainability:

- Kenya: Youth Entrepreneurship training where the ITP has contributed to a new employment bill which has good prospects of being sustained if implemented:
- Mozambique: tackling youth employment challenges where the ITP supported research paper contributed to the National Youth Employment Policy.
- Vietnam: Labour market information where the new data and information sources will continue to provide better information on the labour market and allow adjustment in national strategies.
- Tanzania: Establishment of incubation centres where the centre intends to apply a levy to ensure continued funding of the incubation activities
- South Africa: Career guidance for cooperatives where systems, brochures and materials were used to provide systematic career guidance to small businesses

Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.

11) Include *focus in project design on dissemination of results* and use existing project stakeholder entities to channel actions in various parts of the country.

Greater public awareness and dissemination of results in order to enhance the outreach of the services strengthened by the projects, and to leverage resources.

1) Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Tripathi, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

Use existing project stakeholder entities to channel actions in various parts of the country

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

### 12) *Begin embedding project activities into community structures from the earliest project phase.*

This should be clearly indicated in project design (and, when assessing proposals) points reduced in cases where this is not apparent in the proposal).

<p>The evaluation noted that community-based projects must work quickly towards fully embedding activities into the community structure in order to strengthen sustainability.</p> <p>The project underestimated the importance of a grassroots organisation at village level in form of Small Villages Groups (SVG's) as members to the association.</p>	<p>Wicander, S;Coad, L., 2015, Learning our Lessons A Review of Alternative Livelihood Projects in Central Africa: Review of multiple projects and/or actions, International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources, Gland, Switzerland.</p> <p>Zerhusen, Dirk, 2014, Sustainable Poverty Reduction and Food Security through Climate Change-Adapted Potato Production in Zerafshan Valley (Tajikistan), Final project/Program report, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.</p>
---	---

### 13) *Ensure coordination across project components is well organised when designing projects.* Given the diversity of actions in projects on the IE, this is particularly important. (entrepreneurship development, micro finance, literacy/numeracy, leadership training, support for marketing, value chain research and development, formalising, etc. (Project proposals should indicate how coordination will be organised, including with government and non-state actors. Internal coordination across project components should also be described).

<p>The evaluation noted that the project had a lack of internal coordination across project components.</p>	<p>Poudyal, Lokendra; Upadhyay, Balkrishna; Karki, Laxmi, 2013, Final Report on the Mid – Term Evaluation of Livelihood Recovery for Peace (LRP/UNDP) Project, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, Kathmandu.</p>
---	--

### 14) *Ensure that sufficient time is allocated to coordination,* particularly where entities have not worked together before.

<p>The evaluation noted that cooperation between partners who did not work together before required more time for harmonization of processes.</p>	<p>Wolterstorff, Paul, 2015, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Project Promote and Strengthen Enterprises and Market Systems in Drought-Prone ASAL Areas in Kenya, Midterm or interim evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.</p>
---	---

### 15) *Increase attention to coordination and responsibilities of each organisation within a project.* This should not be limited to short descriptions of the roles of project partners but also (during inception phase) include more detail of how coordination will be done in practice. The mapping of other relevant institutional stakeholders and their roles, gaps and opportunities should be carried out.

<p>Analysis of progress of the 17 RNSF IP indicates that coordination and responsibilities of each organisation within a project needs clearer attention. While proposals describe the roles of project partners, it is not always evident how these are really implemented in practice. The mapping of other relevant institutional stakeholders and their roles, gaps and opportunities is recommended.</p>	<p>RNSF analysis of 17 RNSF implementing partners of projects funded by the European Commission</p>
---	---

- 16) *Increase coordination among implementing agencies in an area where they may be working with the same target groups* to avoid duplication of training or other activities with the same target stakeholder groups.

The evaluation noted that more attention should be paid to coordination with other NGOs to avoid duplication of trainings (or other project activities) with the same target stakeholder groups. The evaluation concluded that this could be achieved by resurrecting a lapsed NGO coordinating group, or by including information on forthcoming trainings in bulleting / documents shared with other NGOs and training providers	Gourley, Deborah, 2012, Evaluation of NRC Food Security and Livelihoods Projects in Chipinge and Chiredzi Districts, Zimbabwe, 2011-12, Final evaluation, Norwegian Refugee Council, Oslo.
--	--

- 17) *Include indicators and monitoring tools that are clearly and directly aimed at ensuring replication and scaling-up of implemented projects.* Implement rigorous monitoring and adjust approaches during implementation as findings from monitoring indicate. A systems approach where what is learned is fed back into the project to improve it is recommended. Note: projects too often monitor but do not use collected information to improve project implementation during the project.

The evaluation identified the need to develop an explicit Exit Strategy in the form of a written document that identifies the major risks to sustaining the project outcome and impact and sequences the measures to be taken until the end of 2015.	Schoen, Christian; Mousaco, Vito, 2013, Business opportunities and support services (BOSS) - Midterm Evaluation (Timor Leste), Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
All the projects assessed in the evaluation showed weakness in monitoring and shortcomings for their replication. At the project level the design of the project, particularly in later programme cycles is often results-orientated but the format and organisation of the programme does not seem to allow a rigorous follow up and monitoring that could help in adjusting the approach or bringing in extra resources or launching follow up projects to ensure a cumulative effect. Project reports rarely report on or use the indicators or monitoring tools that are available as part of their design. The prospects or opportunities for replication and scaling up (e.g. by linking to wider longer term efforts) are not considered during design or implementation. There are some initiatives where the potential for replication was identified through "project stories" and although useful this has not been sufficiently promoted or led to scaling up of activities.	Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.

- 18) For projects supporting people dependent on the IE, 4 essential issues to increase sustainability should be included:

- *Institutional capacity strengthening*
- *Establishment of links with microfinance institutions*
- *Promotion of public-private partnerships.*
- *Strengthening of the management capacities of IE groups.*

According to the evaluation, the prospects for sustaining and scaling up the IFSP-Kassala project are low for 4 main reasons. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There is no adequate institutional capacity and finance in place to</li> </ul>	Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP
---	--

<p>ensure its continuation. The entrepreneurship capacity is weak within all the groups targeted. Youth, women and some farmers were trained in certain skills, and they were provided with tool kits and necessary equipment. However, a policy to support and maintain these activities and promoting them is still lacking. Most beneficiaries are heavily dependent on the project and they do not seem prepared enough to expand or manage these initiatives at least in part by themselves.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The project is not linking these groups to existing microfinance institutions, and hence their financial sustainability beyond the project period is highly questionable. Although most groups were provided with basic training in business management and marketing, the training comprised only three representatives from each group and their performance has not been assessed. The follow-up system of the project is not able to track down whether or not the knowledge and skills acquired from the training are disseminated to the other members. The field visits showed that members beyond the three executives lack knowledge and information about management and marketing.</li> <li>▪ Despite the efforts made to establish cooperatives and Village Development Committees, these structures are still fragile, with weak management capacities and several of them are not legally registered. Evidence for regular meetings with the members is not found. The organisations are weak to empower the value chains, to maintain the profits in the chains and to provide sustainable services in favour of farmers, women, youth, and the value chains in general. The project has not sufficiently stimulated and supported micro- and small agro-processing enterprises.</li> <li>▪ There is a need to make the public sector more effective and to reinforce Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) in favour of Village Committees' development and sustainability. The Project Technical Committee needs to be widened to include representatives of local NGOs and to strengthen its coordination function with the aim of leading to more autonomy for the local organizations</li> </ul>	<p>/SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.</p>
---	--

- 19) Include the *development of very good communications and training materials* with a wide range of stakeholders (including enabling environment) that stakeholders have well accepted for sustainability in project design. Special focus should be placed on the inclusion of IE workers in awareness raising and training for sustainability including replication and scaling up. Consider using trained workers as peer educators after project completion.

<p>The evaluation noted the importance of the development of very good communications and training materials that are well accepted by stakeholders for sustainability. Special focus on the inclusion of workers in awareness raising and training in Kenya is likewise important for sustainability. Workers can act as peer educators assisting in replicating and scaling up awareness.</p>	<p>Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	--

- 20) *Study the contextual factors that may influence effectiveness and sustainability of value chain partnerships between companies* from developed and developing countries. Take such identified factors into account when designing future programming on such partnerships.

<p>The evaluation found that several contextual factors can have a positive correlation with the likelihood of a sustained PPP(partnership) beyond the project.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Size: larger Danish companies have shown to be more able to sustain the partnership than smaller ones.</li> <li>▪ Age: more established Danish partners were slightly more able to sustain partnerships than younger companies, whereas there is a rather clear correlation between the age of the local partner and sustainability – the</li> </ul>	<p>Evaluation Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Denmark, 2014, Evaluation of DANIDA Business to Business Programme 2006-2011, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Mali, Benin, China, Vietnam, Uganda, Bangladesh.</p>
---	--

<p>more established the company, the better sustainability.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>International experience: both Danish and local partners with considerable international experience have better sustainability, and the same goes for the financially robust companies, though none of them are strong factors.</li> <li>Business motive: market extension projects are more sustainable as are buy/sell and JV type of partnerships. Sector wise, the ICT sector is the one that has the least chance of sustainability.</li> </ul>	
---	--

### 21) Support the *establishment of linkages of IE operators to markets to sustain programme activities* and organisations even after the end of development project/programme.

<p>The evaluation discusses two aspects of sustainability of the relevant project: sustainability of the programme activities of Hand in Hand East Africa (HiHEA) as an organization.</p> <p>Programme activities: All programme activities were anchored in training. This was linked with activities on savings and venturing into enterprises as a group. It was assessed that sustainability is assured where groups have attained the culture of savings and have gone through the cycle of building trust and benefiting from their savings. However, without market linkages, sustainability of the enterprises and groups stands on loose sand as experienced where CIGs that were not linked to market collapsed within a period of 2-3 years after the project exited from assisting them. If enterprises do not thrive for lack of market linkages or due to lack of information to increase production and quality, automatically sustainability of not only the enterprise but also of the jobs cannot be assured. Most of the groups met reported that project assistance in accessing markets for their products was strongly needed, as training in marketing alone was not enough.</p>	<p>Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet &amp; Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.</p>
---	---

### 22) Include in project design the *implementation of a fundraising strategy for social enterprises* at an early stage so as to give to new businesses better chances to survive. Facilitate the identification of foundations that may be supportive to poverty reducing social enterprises in particular.

<p>The evaluation noted that, because of lack of early stage funding, some ideas terminate before they even take off. The report provides several examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Greenway, an Indian company prototyping thermoelectric generators that converts waste heat to electricity, noted that "commercial funding is not provided for undertaking market research and testing prototypes for such social ventures, as such projects carry huge commercial risk. So it is through foundations and other organisational funding and grants that the project can be executed and progress".</li> <li>My Tree, a company exploring the use of internet technologies to promote tree planting and forest stewardship in a number of African countries, summarised the challenge well when they noted that "continually seeking external funding at such an early stage of our project would consume most of the time and energy available, so that actual development of the core business would proceed very slowly. This increases the risk of losing team members to alternative activities, and of encountering competition in our concept type."</li> </ul> <p>SIDA's IAP (Innovation Against Poverty) Programme was, however, extremely supportive. IAP directed its funds to new product development and early stage market testing rather than only implementation. IAP Programme has given to new businesses credibility when approaching other funders, investors and partners.</p>	<p>SIDA, 2013, From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).</p>
---	---



### 23) Dedicate resources and efforts to *long-term planning for capacity strengthening and support individual career planning* of government and other implementing partners.

The evaluation indicates that it is necessary to be cautious about raising too much optimism regarding the long-term impact of capacity building efforts undertaken by FAO's project. Capacity building entails far more than formal and informal training. It should preferably deal with human resource management issues in the broadest sense, including transparent planning of individual career development. This kind of support would have required far more comprehensive and longer duration capacity building commitments. Being a relative short duration project, this type of service could have never been offered. Capacity building requires sustained and dedicated resources, which are best pooled on a programmatic basis and supported by different agencies and donors.

Bulteimer Bernd, Bakhtani Naserullah, 2013, *Initiating Participatory Forestry in Support to Sustainable Livelihoods in Afghanistan - GCP /AFG/052/GER*, Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.

### 24) Ensure that cooperatives members have:

- Clearly understood cooperative advantages and purposes
- Have adequate capacities to plan, manage and coordinate
- Do joint buying, selling and other cooperative activities together
- Reinvest savings into the cooperative activities
- Are fully functional at project end.

The evaluation found that the 30 cooperatives formed in Afghanistan are not fully functional for several reasons:

- Ordinary cooperative members do not work together in areas like planning, organisation, coordination and control. Members do not use the cooperatives to jointly buy agricultural inputs or sell agricultural products. Cooperatives also do not provide financial services to their members, neither in accessing loans (from institutions) nor in using cooperative capital for on-lending to members. The capital of cooperatives remains in bank accounts, it is not used for investments benefiting the cooperative as a whole. Thus, these cooperatives exist only in the books of the Agricultural Cooperative Department (ACD). There is no difference between an ordinary farmer and an agricultural cooperative member. Both grow and sell their products outside the cooperative individually.
- The monthly meetings planned to discuss the major issues, to resolve them and improve systemic planning and management of cooperatives were less effectively carried than expected.
- It is questionable whether cooperative boards manage and administer cooperatives in a transparent, efficient and effective way in the interests of their members, whether they lobby for their fellow members and are considered by members as their representatives fighting for ordinary members' interests.
- The awareness and knowledge of cooperative members about purpose and functions of cooperatives is low and so is their interest and participation in cooperative affairs.
- The communication between the cooperative board and ordinary members is weak and there is no request for accountability and transparency from ordinary members' side. Village elders, 'Malek, Khan and Qomandan' still dominate the cooperatives' boards strongly.

Grunewald, Matthias, 2013, *Small Farmer Livelihoods and Income Enhancement in Baghlan Province, Afghanistan – GCP /AFG/053/GER*, Final evaluation, FAO, Rome, Project: FAO Rehabilitation of the Sugar Industry in Baghlan, Afghanistan.

### 25) Ensure sufficient time for:

- Mobilisation to ensure commitment of stakeholders including government.
- Institution and capacity strengthening
- Analysis of past experience in similar projects in the local context
- Analysis of local markets
- Analysis of existing IE operator management capacity strengthening needs and good production practices
- Development of information feedback mechanisms to improve implementation of development actions
- Focus on establishing mechanisms to strengthen coordination among stakeholders throughout all project phases.

The evaluation asserts that, as FAO's project had a delayed start, and began without operational guidelines for complex components like institution building, monitoring systems to track output and outcome level targets, analysis of lessons from previous projects, staff exposure, market studies for different products, identifying existing good production practices, record keeping at family level, activity calendars and feedback mechanism etc., and defining inter-departmental commitments for convergence of resources.

The initial phase of community mobilisation and staff capacity building was rushed to make up for lost time due to delayed start. Formation of groups, selecting vulnerable families for special assistance and disbursing funds all started simultaneously. This shortened the time required for changing community mind set from grant based projects to participating in governance; for leaders to sharpen their facilitation skills and faith in democratic functioning, for beneficiary families to make informed choices of agro-enterprises before opting for micro-finance etc.

Khot, Seemantinee, 2014, Mid-term evaluation of food security through enhanced agricultural production, diversified sources of income, value addition and marketing in Bangladesh (Mymensingh/Sherpur), Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.



## RESEARCH QUESTION 2: DECENT WORK AND ENTERPRISE GROWTH

**Principal research question details:** What key elements were proven to contribute to successful formalisation of growth oriented informal economy enterprises and that help ensure informal economy decent work conditions?

### **Summary of recommendations on enabling environment strengthening**

1. Support clear, transparent and inclusive formalisation processes with individual and groups of people in the IE. Ensure tailor made formalisation strategies that are in line with the local realities.
2. Promote and smooth access to relevant services that support people dependent on the IE. Include dissemination of information on available services to service providers and people dependent on the IE. Support the development of results-
3. based monitoring to measure extent of use of services.
4. Support strengthening of Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) provisions for people dependent on the IE and ensure their awareness of such provisions. Include making of business case for OSH in the IE with national to community level stakeholders.
5. Ensure that analysis of environmental sustainability is included as a cross cutting consideration in the design of all projects and/or programmes on the IE. Promote green jobs in the IE and ensure good articulation of such jobs in value chains.

**Please note that there are cross linkages between research question 2 and the other research questions.**

### 2.1. Promotion and implementation of decent work

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on promotion of decent work in IE identified.

b) Challenges on promotion of decent work in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

c) GP and LL on implementation of International Labour Standards and national labour laws in IE identified.

d) Challenges on implementation of International Labour Standards IE and national labour laws identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on promotion and implementation of decent work; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability; Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of decent work in the IE and determine if/how these were overcome.

- 1) *Promote and participate in the development of country decent work strategies with regard to people dependent on the IE* and ensure that they are not too theoretical.

The evaluation determined that having a decent work strategy is important to position the ILO's mandate within national contexts, and to clearly articulate the needs and expectations of constituent partners.	Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Trikha, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation found that the decent work concept was partly assessed as a far too theoretical approach.	Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy on occupational safety and health - ILO 2013

- 2) Stress awareness raising of the *importance of labour market information systems and social dialogue* in projects/programmes with people dependent on the IE.

<p>The evaluation indicated that participants from all countries found SIDA's ITP Programme highly useful for individual development. This led to new approaches in their work. Through the use of interviews and surveys, the evaluation found that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Participants gained an increased understanding of the importance of well-developed labour market information systems.</li> <li>Participants gained an increased understanding of the importance of active labour market measures.</li> <li>Participants gained an increased understanding of the importance of coordination and cooperation between different stakeholders within the country to achieve common goals. This is in particular noticeable when it comes to social dialogue.</li> </ul>	Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.
---	---

- 3) *Design a database through which it will be possible to monitor and assess the quality of employment created in a given project/programme.*

- 4) Ensure that efforts on employment creation in the IE include *focus on the creation of quality jobs and not poor or temporary jobs*. Ensure and monitor whether employment created with the support of projects meets specific requirements, e.g.:

- Employment is in line with the aim of the worker to work full or part-time, seasonal or ad-hoc demand
- Work corresponds to decent work conditions.

The evaluation determined that jobs were created in some of the established youth-led businesses, but it remains to be ascertained to what extent the jobs created are full-time jobs, part-time jobs, seasonal jobs or even jobs on 'ad-hoc demand'. It is recommended to add this dimension (disaggregate jobs created) in the project database to strengthen performance monitoring. One important aspect of the inclusive and sustainable development agenda is to create decent work opportunities which can be assessed through analysis of data base information provided the distinction between types of jobs created.	UNIDO, 2015, Productive work for youth in Armenia – supporting young entrepreneurs, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
The analysis found that several evaluation reports provided examples of projects, especially in the informal sector, which led to poor and temporary jobs, or where there was no attention to or monitoring of the quality of the jobs.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-

	2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
--	--

- 5) Note that projects that *rely on existing public structures and allocated funding* for implementation of labour policies, have a better chance to be easily replicated and sustainable in the future.
- 6) *Involve project community members* directly to implement active labour policies.

<p>Evaluation concludes that there were a number of projects, which are clearly in line with the overall national policy, and which are embedded in existing (public) structures which increases the possibilities of long-term funding and replication. A good example of this is the business incubators currently being established on three of the 27 existing training institutions of the state training organisation VETA in Tanzania. The project has secured internal funding of more than 100, 000 USD, and has a good chance to become sustainable and be replicated to other training institutions in this system. Another example is the project in South Africa which contributed to rolling out a career guidance service for small businesses in support of national policies.</p> <p>In some cases the projects have gone beyond knowledge of active labour policies and involved the participants in applying active labour policies. Successful hands-on projects addressing a specific labour market measure have a potential to positively influence the employment situation if they are picked up and replicated. An example of this is the training in Kenya through the NGO "Youth in Action" (CP4) of 30 unemployed young persons in technical skills (making of fuel bricks from solid waste) and on how to open their own business. The training took place in 2012; 85% of the participants opened up their own business, and a majority of these businesses still exist today. Since this particular project also falls under "green economy" a replication in Kenya and other countries could be of high interest.</p> <p>Last but not least, the evaluation found that a number of projects have led to active labour policies that were developed and approved. Projects, which were developed in the form of strategies, have on some occasions had an impact on new legislation and bills. The clearest example comes from Kenya, where Mr Caleb Okolo from the Ministry of Labour through his participation in the International Training Programme managed to influence the New Employment Bill, which was approved by the Parliament last week of June 2015. The contribution of Mr Okolo concerned possibilities for tax exemption and wage support to employers when hiring new staff from certain vulnerable groups. Evaluation found that 30 Kenyan unemployed young persons were trained by the NGO "Youth in Action" in 2012 on how to make fuel bricks from solid waste and how to open his own business. Three years after, 85% of participants opened up their businesses and still exist.</p>	<p>Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.</p>
---	--

- 7) *Integrate training on labour rights* in the provision of TVET with youth.

<p>The analysis identified examples with positive effects on labour rights where youth receive skills training but are also sensitized to labour rights, or where priority access is given to specific training opportunities for youth in the age group 15–18 years. Projects building entrepreneurship and skills development, such as the Emergency Start and Improve Your Business (E-SIYB) (CPR/04/02/UKM), have established ways of incorporating labour rights, especially regarding OSH. The Livelihood Recovery in Sichuan Project in China (CPR/08/03/UKM)<sup>47</sup> integrated OSH together with labour and social security issues in vocational training activities, and through interaction with the workers' federation.</p>	<p>ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	--

## 2.2. Formalising work in IE

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on formalising in IE identified.

b) Challenges to formalisation identified.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on formalising the IE; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during formalising in the IE and determine if/how these were overcome (expected benefits of formalising: improved access to decent work conditions, social protection, government support programming).

1) *Carry out research to collect systematic evidence of “what works”* in the transition from the informal to the formal economy. Evidence of good practices are limited though common approaches are:

- Strengthening labour rights through protective legal and policy frameworks and their implementation
- Strengthening labour inspection,
- Increasing partnerships with ministries of health and agriculture to enable greater access to supportive programs.

The analysis noted that, over the years, the ILO has developed a set of decent work strategies for the informal economy, increasingly approached within an integrated policy framework. One strategy was to increase the cost of being informal, for example, by improving labour inspection, but also through partnerships with, for example, ministries of health and agriculture. Apart from applying sanctions, other “approaches that are educational, persuasive, transparent and participatory are particularly successful in reaching the informal economy”. Improving labour rights can be an expected key issue when working on transitions to formality, but systematic evidence on what works in this area is scarce.

ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

2) *Foster formalisation in both the regulatory framework and the quality and availability of public services* while avoiding drastic enforcement of strict anti-informality legal frameworks. Note that where formalisation is purely based on enforcement without developing supportive regulatory frameworks, it will likely lead to unemployment and low growth.

In a cross-country macro-level analysis of informality in Latin America, Loayza (2010) found that informality has a statistically and economically significant impact on growth and an equally significant positive impact on the incidence of poverty across countries. The impact of formalisation can, however, be extremely ambiguous, depending on the way in which countries achieved informality. Countries where informality is kept at bay by drastic enforcement will fare worse than countries where informality is low because of light regulations and appropriate public services. If formalisation is purely based on enforcement, it will likely lead to unemployment and low growth. However, where it is based on improvements in both the regulatory framework and the quality and availability of public services, it is associated with more efficient use of resources and higher growth.

- 1) White, Simon & Fortune, Peter, 2015, Business Environment Reform and Poverty, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Evaluation on projects and reforms concerning labour law, tax system, administration and business registration rules, Covered countries: Mexico, Sri Lanka, Uganda, Vietnam, Brazil, Bolivia, Algeria, Indonesia, Zambia, Bangladesh, Ghana, Tanzania, India.
- 2) Loayza, N.V., L. Serven and N. Sugawara 2010 “Informality in Latin America and the Caribbean”, World Bank, Washington DC

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

- 3) *Encourage formalisation of IE operators*, since it can lead to higher profits, better access to improved equipment, reduced taxes and less corruption. For workers it may lead to improved access to decent work conditions through enforcement of labour laws and policies and access to social protection.
- 4) Be aware that *group formation of IE operators and workers into registered associations, cooperatives and other groups can also be a means to formalise the informal economy*. Note that it is a misconception that formalising the informal economy entails only the registering of individual IE operations.

<p>Boly (2015) surveyed 2,500 firms in Vietnam to investigate the process of firm formalisation. His results show that becoming formal leads to an increase in profits, value added and revenue, in total amount or per employee. Formalisation was also found to be beneficial for firms, irrespective of their size. While the benefits of formalisation were found to materialise in the short term, they also persisted over time. The benefits of formalisation run through better access to improved equipment, a larger customer base, advertising, and business association membership.</p>	<p>White, Simon &amp; Fortune, Peter, 2015, <i>Business Environment Reform and Poverty, Meta-analysis of evaluations</i>, DFID, London, Evaluation on projects and reforms concerning labour law, tax system, administration and business registration rules, Covered countries: Mexico, Sri Lanka, Uganda, Vietnam, Brazil, Bolivia, Algeria, Indonesia, Zambia, Bangladesh, Ghana, Tanzania, India.</p> <p>Boly, A. 2015: "On the benefits of formalization, panel evidence from Vietnam", UN WIDER Paper 2015/038.</p>
<p>McCulloch (2010) used data from the Indonesian Rural Investment Climate Survey of non-farm household enterprises, conducted in six districts in 2006. Comparing between informal and formal firms (i.e., those with at least one local business license) he found that licensing does provide advantages in terms of reduced tax and corruption payments.</p>	<p>Mc Culloch, 2009, <i>Rural investment climate in Indonesia</i>"; <i>Rural Investment Climate in Indonesia, General background document on issues in our research matrix</i>, Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore.</p>

- 5) *Introduce and facilitate the development of agricultural cooperatives* to pull local farmers out of informality and share market benefits with broader communities.

<p>The enacted agricultural cooperative law (2008) of Afghanistan was properly functioning for cooperatives' members who produce agricultural commodities. The cooperatives organise training for their members who apply what they were trained in (they practise collective marketing, i.e. buying inputs and selling outputs jointly). Members work together in areas like planning, organisation, coordination and control. Value-addition is gained through product sorting, grading, packaging and storing. Cooperatives provide: financial services in accessing loans (from institutions) and using members' savings/capital for investments benefiting the cooperative as a whole or on-lending to cooperative members; boards management and administration in a transparent, efficient and effective way in the interests of their members.</p>	<p>Grunewald, Matthias, 2013, <i>Small Farmer Livelihoods and Income Enhancement in Baghlan Province, Afghanistan – GCP /AFG/053/GER, Final evaluation</i>, FAO, Rome, Project: FAO Rehabilitation of the Sugar Industry in Baghlan, Afghanistan.</p>
--	---

- 6) Consider *establishment of a brand with guaranteed quality and marketing of the brand* to expand the potential of promoting the associated products.

<p>The evaluation identified the creation of the brand "Atayeb Falasteen" as a good practice. Such a brand, albeit only used by Souk el Tayeb during the course of the partnership with the project. The branding is an effective step in promoting the produce of local Palestinian women and at same time enhancing women's knowledge of the importance of branding and adhering to the inherent required quality. Note: Verify details of what this entailed, not available in the evaluation</p>	<p>Summers, Guy, 2013, <i>Palestinian Women's Economic Empowerment Project – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary</i>, ILO, Geneva, Palestinian Women's Economic Empowerment Project, Occupied Palestinian Territory.</p>
--	---

summary.

- 7) When facilitating the establishment of new businesses, *identify possibilities for down-stream and up-stream job creation* for people dependent on the IE. Integrate consideration of such possibilities during business support mechanisms for new businesses.

The evaluation highlights how new business partnerships do not only create direct jobs, but often also indirect jobs down-stream (through supplies of raw material, components, services etc.) and up-stream (retail, distribution etc.). In addition to such indirect employment, temporary jobs can also be a significant source of income for example in agro-businesses with varying demands for labour over the year.

Let's take a look to these real examples:

- A cotton processing company in Northern Uganda, which claim an outreach to about 35,000 farmers in the Gulu district, providing these farmers with an outlet for farm products such as cotton, in addition to temporary employment of several hundred persons in the cotton processing firm.
- Several B2B collaborations in agriculture that export different products to Denmark (dried fruits, vegetables, coffee, tea, etc.) and get the produce from contracted out-growers. These may vary from a handful to several hundred in each case.
- A cold chain project in Uganda providing a missing link in the value chain with impact on farmers and food distributors in Uganda as well as in neighbouring countries, in addition to temporary employment in the local firm.
- A B2B project in Bolivia involved in creating new export markets for llama wool. The company might potentially have significant spin-off effects in terms of jobs and better earnings for llama keepers in the country.
- The B2B has supported several joint ventures in Bangladesh that deliver improved trawls, and also whole trawlers, to domestic fishing companies. While employment aboard these trawlers cannot be directly attributed to the B2B, the programme has at least contributed to significant indirect employment, possibly in the range of 1,000-2,000 jobs.
- In South Africa a Danish innovative company have invested heavily in setting up a JV with a local company for the production of insulation material for houses made of waste newspapers. Besides the skilled jobs that will be established in the factories approximately 200 people will be needed to collect newspaper for the production.

It is clear that if temporary jobs and indirectly created jobs would be added to the estimate of total jobs created, the cost per job would be substantially reduced.

Evaluation Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Denmark, 2014, Evaluation of DANIDA Business to Business Programme 2006-2011, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Mali, Benin, China, Vietnam, Uganda, Bangladesh.

- 8) Consider that many evaluations have found that a *significant determinant of whether workers can access social protection is based on whether they are in the formal or informal economy*.

The evaluation found that in a number of countries, including Brazil, China, Jordan, Lesotho, Mongolia, Rwanda, South Africa and Thailand, measures to extend social protection coverage through non-contributory and contributory systems have enhanced social protection coverage for large groups of the population, including workers in SMEs. For SME workers in many countries, the most significant determinant for access to social security provisions remains whether they are employed in the formal or the informal economy.

ILO, 2015, Small and medium-sized enterprises and decent and productive employment creation Report IV, ILO-104th Session 2015, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.



- 9) Note that *business development projects can be more or less beneficial to the creation of formal employment of people dependent on the IE depending on the type of enterprise and the level of technology to be used.* Where modern technology is introduced it may reduce employment among IE workers.

<p>According to the evaluation, the employment factor depends to a large extent on the type of enterprises the programme supports.</p> <p>Thus, some partnerships which are doing financially well have meagre employment effects. For example, a partnership between a large Danish company with global presence in medical equipment in partnership with a distributor of medical supplies in Uganda is doing well financially, but the project has created one local job.</p> <p>Employment might also suffer due to the B2B Programme even if the partnership is functioning well. The collaboration between two manufacturers of signs in Uganda had an indirect impact on the latter by reducing its labour force from about 80 prior to the collaboration to currently 40, mainly due to productivity increase and reduction of unnecessary labour, on the advice by the Danish partner.</p> <p>As the evaluation team underlines, the Danida Neighbourhood Programme interventions have focused on production increases through acquisition of new and more modern technical equipment at the farm sites. This, combined with the fact that the vast majority of the farms in the neighbourhood countries are small in size and with little tradition of employing people from outside the family unit, is generating relatively few new jobs in the short to medium term.</p>	<p>Evaluation Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Denmark, 2014, Evaluation of DANIDA Business to Business Programme 2006-2011, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Mali, Benin, China, Vietnam, Uganda, Bangladesh.</p>
--	--

- 10) *Design tailor-made strategies for formalisation that are in line with the local context.* Take into account all the possible hurdles, implications and reactions of the system. Note that at least one study found that providing information and reimbursing the cost of registration did not induce more firms to register than those who were not provided with reimbursements.

<p>A noteworthy experiment was conducted in Sri Lanka, with the goal of generating data to test whether the exclusion or the exit view of informality better reflects reality. The experiment worked with a sample of informal firms with 1 to 14 paid employees: it reduced the information costs and increased the monetary benefits of formalizing for a random subset of the sample. In order to run, the experiment, four treatment groups were shaped. The first treatment group was given information about the costs and benefits of, and procedures for, registering their firm with the Divisional Secretariat (DS) – the relevant registration for tax purposes. Additionally, they were reimbursed for the (modest) direct cost of registration if they registered. The second, third, and fourth treatment groups were provided the same information and also offered a payment to register. Surprisingly, the experiment found that providing information and reimbursing the cost of registration did not induce firms to register. There are several reasons and implications behind a result as such:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 1) An important share of the firms not registering after receiving the largest incentive report that issues related to land tenancy prevented them from doing so. These firms operated with informal leases or agreements, and hence were unable to provide authorities with the required proof of ownership of the land on which the firm operated.</li> <li>▪ 2) Firms which formalized are found to have higher profits, although this impact seems largely due to increased advertising and use of receipt books, but no increases in receipt of government contracts, use of bank accounts or loans, or participation in government programs.</li> <li>▪ 3) Data do suggest that given the current tax code, the additional tax collections would not be large among this sample of firms. This, combined with the fact that the spill overs to growth are modest,</li> </ul>	<p>De Mel, Suresh; McKenzie, David; Woodruff, Christopher, 2012, The demand for, and consequences of formalization among informal firms in Sri Lanka, Impact evaluation, IZA, Bonn, Field experiment in Sri Lanka about formalisation and its consequences.</p>
--	---



suggests that near-term gains to the government of increased formality are limited. Finally, despite the pervasive interest of governments around the world in trying to increase the size of their formal sector, the experiment results overall suggest little in the way of pent-up demand to become formal among existing firms.	
--	--

- 11) Ensure that beneficiaries participating in IE project activities—including improved market linkages—are supported to obtain the required trading permits / licences to avoid being conflict with laws and regulations.

The evaluation determined that projects need to ensure that beneficiaries participating in support to develop Income Generating Activities (IGAs), market linkages and other projects involving vendor activities need to be supported to obtain the required trading permits / licences to avoid the project putting them into conflict with the law.	Gourley, Deborah, 2012, Evaluation of NRC Food Security and Livelihoods Projects in Chipinge and Chiredzi Districts, Zimbabwe, 2011-12, Final evaluation, Norwegian Refugee Council, Oslo.
--	--

- 12) Take into consideration basic steps to improve conditions of water vendors and similar IE workers with respect to their essential service:

- Recognize their role and view them as an integral part of the water supply system as it may
- help in the design and implementation of more comprehensive policies that better serve the poor end-users;
- Build trust and accountability
- Address existing constraints on informal water markets such as high prices relative to piped water;
- Changing counter-productive laws against water vending;
- Remove constraints on water supply;
- Reduce water tariffs for water vendors and reducing costs constraints;
- Form of vendor and consumer associations and improving the relationship between vendors, consumers and water utilities providers.

<p>The evaluation suggests a list of rules on how to improve the vendor services:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 1) Recognize the role played by water vendors;</li> <li>▪ 2) Seeing water vendors as an integral part of the water supply system may help in the design and implementation of more comprehensive policies that better serve the poor end-users;</li> <li>▪ 3) Recognising water vendors as official partners in the water system can also build trust and accountability;</li> <li>▪ 4) Addressing existing constraints on informal water markets such as high prices relative to piped water;</li> <li>▪ 5) Changing counter-productive laws against water vending;</li> <li>▪ 6) Removing constraints on water supply;</li> <li>▪ 7) Reducing water tariffs for water vendors and reducing costs constraints;</li> <li>▪ 8) Formation of vendor and consumer associations and improving the relationship between vendors, consumers and water utilities providers.</li> </ul>	Wanjala, Mathews Chirasha, 2011, Water vendors associations in informal settlements, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DEW Point Enquiry No.A0415, DEW, Northampton, Collection of studies concerning water supply in informal settlements in urban areas and water vendors associations, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya, Sudan, Ghana, Uganda.
--	---

## 2.3. OSH implementation in IE

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on OSH in IE identified.

b) Challenges on OSH in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on training OSH tools and other OSH relevant initiatives. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of OSH in the IE and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Advocate for the ratification of OSH-related conventions* in project countries.

The comparatively low number of ratifications of OSH-related Conventions is a critical issue, and an increase in the rate would be desirable.	Guzman, Francisco L.; Lissner, Lothar; Zayzon, Réka, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy on occupational safety and health: Workers and enterprises benefit from improved safety and health conditions at work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
---	---

2) *Increase focus on creating collaborative synergies* at regional and national levels between agencies that include focus on practical approaches to OSH in IE. Promote pro-active and action-oriented approaches to activities to strengthen OSH in the IE.

3) *Work towards good integration and creation of synergies between offices on OSH within agencies* to strengthen efforts to improve OSH in the IE.

<p>Experts are of the view that WHO activities concerning occupational health and diseases (asbestos, silica, and occupational cancers) are comparatively more proactive and practical than those of the ILO. Other institutions such as the World Bank (the International Finance Corporation – IFC – project BETTER WORK, EHS guidelines<sup>51</sup>) were also viewed as more active on the ground. While the ILO has played a supportive and complementary role in some of the global efforts (for instance, in WHO's Plan of Action on Workers' Health and Better Work), it is clear that the ILO's strategy on occupational health and diseases needs to be more action oriented, and collaboration with other institutions needs to be strengthened at regional and national levels.</p> <p>The quality and relevance of the products provided by SafeWork was not doubted. Still there were a number of interview responses stating that ILO had lost a significant amount of ground in OSH-related global issues. The reasons the interviewees gave included the activity of other similarly oriented international organisations, the minimal agreements between many constituents which prohibit the ILO playing a more advanced role in OSH, a lack of collaboration between ILO and other global organisations, and missed opportunities to promote OSH to donor organisations. Consequently, the formerly undisputed position of ILO as a global leader in OSH-related issues, and OSH standard setting, is likely to become increasingly vulnerable.</p> <p>Evaluation findings suggest that collaboration with internal partners such as Better Work, HIV/AIDS and the World of Work Branch (ILO/AIDS), Green Jobs, Better</p>	Guzman, Francisco L.; Lissner, Lothar; Zayzon, Réka, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy on occupational safety and health: Workers and enterprises benefit from improved safety and health conditions at work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
---	---

Factories and the Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises (SCORE) programmes was not always optimal.	
---	--

- 4) *Promote the implementation of suitable technologies and awareness raising on improving occupational safety and health in informal economy jobs.*
- 5) *When promoting implementation of OSH approaches in the IE, mention any relevant associated business benefits such as improved product quality and quantity as a result of OSH technologies.*

<p>The efforts of businesses operating in the informal economy to improve occupational safety and health issues are effective at improving decent work conditions for adults and for older children (older than 14 years). Efforts to improve hygiene in the workplace and use appropriate technologies appear to have increased the quality of products.</p> <p>E-FACE provided support for the implementation of improved working conditions that affected older children who are allowed to work under decent conditions as well as adults.</p> <p>Business owners who were interviewed pointed out that the improved conditions also contributed to better production quality. As one business owner pointed out, "The textiles were not clean because of the dust, but now our products are neater and that attracts customers." Youth participating in weaving associations likewise indicated that the improved working conditions, including better looms, contributed to an improvement in product quality.</p> <p>Weavers in three groups, one of which was the youth group, reported similar points regarding changes in the quantity. They commented that, "Now we are saving our energy and it is easier to make more in less time. It is also more comfortable so we can reduce our hours to make the same quantity." All three groups reported that they did not make more overall but rather that they were able to reduce their working hours. One weaver noted that, "We worked every night at home but now only in daytime in our group work place"</p>	<p>Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien &amp; Associates International, Washington DC.</p>
--	---

### 6) Support strengthening of the OSH:

- Knowledge base
- Advocacy and social behaviour change communications
- Management of approaches
- Monitoring of inspections in the informal economy and related value chain partners.

<p>There are significant limitations in national-level data collection, monitoring systems, workplace-level awareness (particularly in under-served sectors such as agriculture, small businesses and the informal economy), and quality and reporting on inspections.</p> <p>The usefulness of the ILO Encyclopaedia of Occupational Health &amp; Safety was considered 'somewhat satisfactory'</p> <p>Reliable data on occupational accidents and diseases are a necessary precondition for impact assessment and prioritisation of OSH activities. Improvement of data collection was part of the Plan of Action, but practically no progress was achieved. The ILO has made considerable efforts to overcome these serious deficits and data gaps by making estimates of the data.</p>	<p>Guzman, Francisco L.; Lissner, Lothar; Zayzon, Réka, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy on occupational safety and health: Workers and enterprises benefit from improved safety and health conditions at work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
--	--

- 7) Promote the *development of Codes of Practice* providing detailed guidance for IE groups/associations/cooperatives on occupational safety and health. As most groups/associations/cooperatives consist of similar types of IE operators it should be feasible to develop such Codes of Practice that are well adapted per sector.

SafeWork has published a number of codes of practice, some in cooperation with other units, which provide detailed guidance on safety and health. In the period of the evaluation, two codes of practice were published, i.e. Safety and Health in Agriculture (2011, together with SECTOR) and the Code of Practice on Safety and Health in the Use of Machinery (2012, SafeWork alone).

Guzman, Francisco L.; Lissner, Lothar; Zayzon, Réka, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy on occupational safety and health: Workers and enterprises benefit from improved safety and health conditions at work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

- 8) *Promote the use of OSH guidelines and tools* for OSH in the IE such as the tools on Work Improvement in Neighbourhood Development (WIND), Work Improvement in Small Construction Sites (WISCON), Work Improvement for Safe Home (for domestic workers (WISH), Work Improvement in Small Enterprises (WISE +). See among others: [http://www.ilo.org/safework/industries-sectors/WCMS\\_219580/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/safework/industries-sectors/WCMS_219580/lang--en/index.htm)
- 9) *Consult the ILO Computer Information Systems Documents (CISDOC)* database for further details bearing in mind the need to search for tools and materials that are appropriate to developing county informal economy settings. <http://www.ilo.org/safework/info/lang--en/index.htm> and <http://www.ilo.org/safework/info/lang--en/index.htm>

ILO 2001 OSH guidelines are well known, often used and perceived as very relevant at the country level.  
Some ILO programmes were specifically mentioned – the WIND training tool (agriculture), the BETTER WORK Programme and the WISE training tool for SMEs  
An effective approach is mainly based on practical tools that can be easily adapted to the needs of the targeted recipients.  
The ILO SafeWork's programme also develops practical and easy to use training materials and methods that provide adequate OSH capacities. They help users identify key priorities, elaborate coherent and relevant strategies, establish effective and efficient practices, and implement national OSH programmes.  
Training tools, such as SOLVE, are aimed at management, supervisors, workers and their representatives, government officials, and all those concerned with workers' safety and health.  
Computer Information Systems Documents (CISDOC) services include a lack of practical tools with the materials being too technical for wider reference, and knowledge products being too European or American in focus which affect their applicability in low-resource and weak institutional settings.

Guzman, Francisco L.; Lissner, Lothar; Zayzon, Réka, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy on occupational safety and health: Workers and enterprises benefit from improved safety and health conditions at work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

- 10) *Promote use of OSH risk assessments* of IE types work to help define improved approaches to improve OSH conditions.

1) Risk assessment techniques are important tools that facilitate the evaluation of risks, the establishment of priorities and the setting of standards at plant level.  
2) Methods included risk assessments of conditions in home-based weaving.  
Critical points identified were very unventilated, dusty and dark rooms, very unhealthy physical working positions, and excessive working hours.

Guzman, Francisco L.; Lissner, Lothar; Zayzon, Réka, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy on occupational safety and health: Workers and enterprises benefit from improved safety and health conditions at work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

	Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.
--	--

- 11) *Develop a recognisable local icon* to help during awareness raising campaigns on occupational safety and health (OSH).

The creation of a local "icon" to identify the awareness raising campaign on OSH (Chico Catracho) was signalled-out by several parties as a major success to convey preventative messages on OSH to the general public	Hsu, Lee-Nah, 2013, Improving safety and health at work through a Decent Work agenda, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Honduras, Malawi, Republic of Moldova, Ukraine, Zambia.
--	---

## 2.4. Environment and sustainable management and the informal economy

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on environment and sustainable management in IE identified.

b) Challenges on environment and sustainable management in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on environment and sustainable management issues; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability; Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of environment and sustainable management issues and determine if/how these were overcome.

- 1) *Include a broad range of national/local partners, including ministries, professional organisations, associations to build wider understanding and commitment to green jobs in the IE.*

The evaluation noted that the project's strategy of engaging with non-traditional partners, for example ministries and professional organisations related to the environment or to specific sectors, was an appropriate way to bring together local resource persons to help build the wider understanding and commitment to green jobs. It helped widen the dialogue around green jobs, facilitated new partnerships, and also broadened the audience for "decent work awareness" more generally. The greening of enterprises is more effectively fostered when the larger community in which it resides is taken into account, and ideally with the participation of local government, to make the greening of the enterprise more impactful and relevant, as well as sustainable at the broader level.	Mitchel, Lucy; Takahashi, Taeko T., 2012, Green Jobs in Asia – Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Indonesia, Nepal, Philippines, Sri Lanka.
---	--

- 2) *Promote the implementation of research on green jobs* in the IE with the engagement of local organisations as it strengthens their commitment to sustainable development.

The evaluation found that intensive research in the area of green jobs, and the engagement of the main local organisations that work on this topic, have strengthened the commitment of the local partners in the use of green jobs as an alternative for sustainable development and poverty reduction.	Do, Evaluan, 2013, Gobernanza de la migración laboral y su vínculo con el desarrollo en Mali, Mauritania y Senegal – Evaluación final. (Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva,
--	--

	Evaluation Summary on the topic: “Governance of labour migration and its links to Development in Mali, Mauritania and Senegal”).
--	---

- 3) When assessing and monitoring IE projects with environmental and sustainable development components, note whether the project is participatory and community-based with respect to planning, implementation and monitoring as it helps build awareness.

The evaluation determined that participatory, community-based, approaches of the project in planning, implementation and monitoring are contributing to essential building of awareness related to forest degradation, broad-based community engagement in rehabilitation interventions and capturing local needs and priorities.	Van Noord, H; Asmoro, P., 2013, Green Livelihood Access for Central Kalimantan's Inclusive Environmental Response to Climate Change- GLACIER (Indonesia), Final Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
---	--

- 4) Take into account that activities with regard to *environmental protection can succeed in developing value chains and creating jobs*. Review and consider the case study of the Ugandan “Eco-Fuel Africa” company.

<p>The evaluation illustrates an example from Uganda of a commercially viable business that creates value for poor people at many points.</p> <p>Eco-fuel Africa is a Ugandan company started by African entrepreneur and TED Fellow Sanga Moses. Eco-fuel Africa produces and distributes ‘green charcoal’; a cooking fuel made from agricultural bio-waste that is up to 20% cheaper than charcoal, emits less smoke, can be burnt in traditional cooking stoves and does not contribute to deforestation.</p> <p>The company leases low-cost, locally made kilns to farmers in Uganda and teaches them to convert their agricultural waste into char. Eco-fuel Africa then buys most of this char from farmers; some is retained by farmers and used as organic fertilisers (biochar). Biochar is considered to be an effective fertiliser that not only increases yields but also may contribute to carbon sequestration.</p> <p>At its local processing facilities, Eco-fuel Africa compresses the biochar bought from farmers into green charcoal briquettes. The briquettes are then distributed through retail kiosks, which Eco-fuel helps to establish. These retail kiosks are owned and run by female entrepreneurs, who would often not have any alternative source of income. Eco-fuel Africa provides the building for them to use as well as advice and support on how to run their business. The women kiosk owners are able to sell the green charcoal for a profit. Over time many of the women add to the products and services that are sold at their retail kiosks.</p> <p>Eco-fuel Africa is looking to scale its operations through a franchising model, where franchisees (rather than Eco-fuel Africa) buy char from farmers and produce green charcoal briquettes. This processing creates further value in the value chain and creates a scalable model that can expand into new markets. So far, four franchisees are in operation with plans for growth over the coming years.</p>	SIDA, 2013, From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).
--	--

- 5) Ensure that programming on livelihoods of people dependent on the *IE responds to current and future climate hazards includes a rigorous, detailed, and participatory analysis of livelihoods and vulnerability to climate change and disasters*. A comprehensive and rigorous analysis should start with identification and quantification of production data that includes staple, non-staple and non-food production; purchases; wild food collection; market and food processing situations and expenditure choices. It should include identification of the current hazards that affect the target population, including their characteristics, seasonality, frequency, severity, and variability. It also



involves assessment of the sensitivity and adaptive capacity of the target population to the identified hazards, to gain a better understanding of who is affected, by which hazards, how, to what degree and why they are affected. The analysis must be disaggregated by gender, wealth and/or IE dependent group. It should also consider any other significant aspects that may affect vulnerability within communities or households.

<p>The evaluation concluded that the necessary starting point for designing livelihoods programming that responds to current and future climate hazards is a rigorous, detailed, and participatory analysis of livelihoods and vulnerability to climate change and disasters. A comprehensive and rigorous analysis should start with identification and some degree of quantification of production data that includes staple, non-staple and non-food production; purchases; wild food collection; and expenditure choices. It should include identification of the current hazards that affect the target population, including their characteristics, seasonality, frequency, severity, and variability. It also involves assessment of the sensitivity and adaptive capacity of the target population to the identified hazards, to gain a better understanding of who is affected, by which hazards, how, to what degree and why they are affected. This analysis must be disaggregated by gender, wealth and/or livelihood group, and any other significant differences that may affect vulnerability within communities or households.</p>	<p>Dazé, Webb, Julie; Angie, 2010, <i>Livelihood security in a changing climate: Insights from a program evaluation in Timor Leste</i>, Impact evaluation, Evaluation covers analysis of evaluations of 4 projects in Timor Leste, CARE, Australia.</p>
--	---

- 6) Ensure that *environment friendly practices are incorporated* as a cross cutting theme on all possible interventions particularly with respect to people dependent on the IE and infrastructure related interventions. Sustainable environment issues should not be considered as a separate pillar under TRP.

<p>The evaluation recommended that environment friendly practices should be incorporated as a cross cutting theme on all possible interventions particularly in livelihood and infrastructure related interventions and should not be considered as a separate pillar under TRP. In terms of long term sustainability, environment concerns should be built into project interventions in close collaboration with the environment cluster. Collaboration with local government institutions will be useful in future interventions.</p>	<p>Samaranayake, Mallika R.; Velupillai, Krishna, 2011, <i>Mid-term Evaluation of Outcome 7: "Socio-economic recovery in the North and East" under the UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) 2008-2012 (Sri Lanka)</i>, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, New York.</p>
--	--

- 7) Promote the linking of sustainable (environmental) development approaches into projects focusing on issues such as irrigation and value chain components.

<p>The evaluation noted the importance of establishing linkages with environmental issues in value chain and irrigation system development.</p>	<p>Caldeyro, Martin; Khafagy, Mohamed, 2013, <i>Pro-poor horticulture value chains in Upper Egypt Final Joint Evaluation</i>, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	--

- 8) *Promote the development of a range of strategies* to support people dependent on the IE in locations where climate hazards are to affect livelihoods. Support households in managing risks. As well as supporting diversification within agriculture, support creation of opportunities outside agriculture, such as handicraft production and sale or work as tradespeople. Strategies for livelihood diversification must be planned based on sound analysis, capturing the full range of hazards people are exposed to, how these hazards interact with each other, and how they affect existing and planned livelihood activities.



The evaluation indicated that, in contrast with the poorest households, who are heavily reliant on maize production and therefore strongly vulnerable to climate hazards, comparatively better-off households in Liquica District are able to employ a greater range of different livelihood strategies. Diversity and expandability of these alternative livelihood options mean that households can adjust relative contributions to meet food and income needs when a particular component of their livelihoods is affected by a stress or shock. Because wealthier households have a wider range of less climate-sensitive alternatives available to them, they are less vulnerable to climate hazards.

One way to reduce vulnerability of poor households is to support them in managing risks by assisting them to diversify their livelihood strategies. As well as supporting diversification within agriculture, it may also involve creation of opportunities for diversification to income sources outside agriculture, such as handicraft production and sale or work as tradespeople. Strategies for livelihood diversification must be planned based on the sound analysis recommended above, capturing the full range of hazards people are exposed to, how these hazards interact with each other, and how they affect existing and planned livelihood activities.

Dazé, Webb, Julie; Angie, 2010, Livelihood security in a changing climate: Insights from a program evaluation in Timor Leste, Impact evaluation, Evaluation covers analysis of evaluations of 4 projects in Timor Leste, CARE, Australia.

- 9) Ensure that project designs *well articulate the differences and connections between green jobs, green enterprises and green economies*.<sup>25</sup>

The connections between green jobs with green business or greener enterprises, and indeed greener economies, should be better articulated in future project designs.

Mitchel, Lucy; Takahashi, Taeko T., 2012, Green Jobs in Asia – Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Indonesia, Nepal, Philippines, Sri Lanka.

- 10) Ensure when designing a project linking environmental conservation to improved economic development that *all the activities are thoroughly planned including their inter-linkages*. Include a level of flexibility in the program design, however, to enable adjustments during implementation in line with realities.

The evaluation noted that linking environmental conservation to improved economic development is a sound concept, but also that this means effectively managing a significantly complex set of activities.

Sullivan, Frank; Apiyo, Regina; Mtoka, Samuel; Musila, F., 2014, Performance Evaluation of the Scaling Up Conservation And Livelihoods Efforts in Northern Tanzania Project, Final evaluation, USAID - Development Training Services, Inc., Washington DC.

- 11) Ensure that the *inter-relationship between social and environmental impacts of an IE project is adequately considered* during implementation and assessment of a project. This particularly includes analysis of the relationship of the local socio-economic and cultural context and how this in turn affects the environmental impact of a project.

<sup>25</sup> “A Green Economy can be thought of as an alternative vision for growth and development; one that can generate growth and improvements in people’s lives in ways consistent with sustainable development. A Green Economy promotes a triple bottom line: sustaining and advancing economic, environmental and social well-being.” World Resources Institute. Q&A: What is a "Green Economy?". Available from <http://www.wri.org/blog/2011/04/qa-what-green-economy-0> (Website accessed 15 March, 2016)

The evaluation found that the FAO's project in Kassala was weak in design and implementation while many of the project's investments concerned environmental and social impacts. The issue of how mechanization and irrigation schemes are affecting soil fertility, biodiversity and desertification are not addressed. Equally, the impact of keeping livestock around water points on natural pastures is not assessed. The potential conflict over water resources between settled and nomadic groups has not been catered for through pre-emptive measures, particularly in the absence of governing bodies organizing use and supervising management of these resources. Moreover, since most of the land is under control of local sheikhs and tribal leaders, the success of agricultural production activities may generate new conflicts over access to land and land management. A study of land tenure is necessary to reduce social conflicts.

Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.

- 12) Encourage projects to recognise the *different levels of initial knowledge of stakeholders on green jobs* and develop approaches accordingly.

The analysis determined that in building understanding about green jobs in national and regional development requires on-going effort, working at different levels, to respond to the different baseline knowledge levels.

Mitchel, Lucy; Takahashi, Taeko T., 2012, Green Jobs in Asia – Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Indonesia, Nepal, Philippines, Sri Lanka.

- 13) When assessing project proposals on the environment and sustainable development, ensure that *project components actively promote showing local people that there are alternate livelihoods of people dependent on the IE that do not cause environmental degradation.*

Although the incomes of local people could increase through improving rubber and fishery production, this does not ensure that deforestation will reduce. Therefore, component three does not directly address any of the existing deforestation drivers nor has any direct benefit for emission reduction. However, this component could show local people that there are alternatives to improve livelihoods that do not cause deforestation.

Van Noord, H; Asmoro, P., 2013, Green Livelihood Access for Central Kalimantan's Inclusive Environmental Response to Climate Change- GLACIER (Indonesia), Final Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

- 14) Ensure that projects *include attention to environmental issues in awareness SBCC* wherever this is applicable. Monitor and feed back into planning the effectiveness of the SBCC on environmental issues.

The evaluation concluded that, at the end of the project, strong linkages between conservation and economic development were still undeveloped in most villagers' minds.

Sullivan, Frank; Apiyo, Regina; Mtoka, Samuel; Musila, F., 2014, Performance Evaluation of the Scaling Up Conservation And Livelihoods Efforts in Northern Tanzania Project, Final evaluation, USAID - Development Training Services, Inc., Washington DC.

## RESEARCH QUESTION 3: DIRECT ACTIONS IN COMMUNITIES

**Principal research question details:** What are the key proven direct actions at local level that contribute to the successful enhancement of livelihoods and working conditions for those working in informal economy enterprises with special attention to social inclusion?

**General finding:**

Note that holistic approaches to projects tend to have better results. A criteria for the level of holistic approaches used in the project, including establishing linkages with various stakeholders, should be included in monitoring programming.

**Summary of recommendations on enabling environment strengthening**

1. Conduct assessment to identify the most likely successful community level mechanisms to support people dependent on the IE in a specific context. Avoid provision of standard support packages across all settings. Review the need for comparatively higher focus on different means of support such as training, mentoring, mobile technologies and/or micro-finance (or other actions) in accordance with situation. Design support accordingly.
2. Determine need for relative emphasis of content when carrying out activities on leadership/group management, life skills, rights awareness, versus enterprise development and operations. Within enterprise development content, analyse relative need for focus of support on business feasibility, production, marketing, finance and human resources management. Prioritise enterprise support in accordance with identified needs.
3. Support social behaviour change communications (SBCC) on the rights of people dependent on the IE to decent work conditions and environmental sustainability of IE work with all stakeholders. Incorporate innovative means, including digital technologies, to raise awareness and carry out project actions. Ensure that sufficient time and resources are allocated for this purpose.
4. Ensure clear and detailed operational targets on IE that are set with the participation of stakeholders over a realistic implementation time period. Ensure that implementers have the necessary capacities to provide needed support to reach the targets in the local context, including on mobile technologies.
5. Ensure good fit between the needs of people dependent on the IE in a specific context and available micro finance services. Promote training on financial education among stakeholders including implementing agencies and IE community members. Provide follow-up mentoring and support to ensure community members are able to use available micro finance services following financial education.
6. Provide a life cycle approach to design of financial services. Promote savings and not only credit activities. Ensure adapted and clear loan repayment mechanisms.
7. Ensure vocational education and skills training corresponds to labour market needs in accordance with thorough analysis. Include private and public sector in the analysis.
8. Engage in mapping of available training services and carry out assessment of fit between applicants' wishes, labour market needs and available training services. Include analysis of apprenticeship/mentoring possibilities with formal and informal enterprises. Provide support for job placement and/or launching of self-employment prior to completion of training.

### 3.1. Social behaviour change communications

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on using SBCC in IE identified.

b) Challenges on using in SBCC in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on SBCC/Communications for Development (C4D). Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during SBCC and C4D development and implementation and determine if/how these were overcome.

- 1) *Develop a business case for the usefulness of the implementation of labour laws* in IE activities. A business case for IE operators would indicate that it can be useful to their business to implement labour laws with their workers.

Development of an effective business case for implementation of labour laws in the project sectors.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

- 2) Place high focus and *invest in the development of high quality, well-accepted communications and training* materials to raise awareness of the importance of implementing labour laws.

The evaluation determined that it is highly important to place strong focus and invest in the development of very good communications and training materials that are well accepted by stakeholders.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

- 3) Use innovative means to raise awareness of implementation of labour laws and right to access to decent work of IE workers. *Include approaches such as use of mobile phones and radio programming.*
- 4) *Include IE workers in awareness raising on improving their labour conditions* as this will help contribute to bringing about change. This includes for IE workers who are employed on a daily, part-time or occasional basis such as informal construction workers.

Special focus on the inclusion of workers in awareness raising and training in Kenya.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

- 5) Promote SBCC on the rights of domestic workers, including with workers organisations, to remind them of their obligations to the informal workers.

Sensitization campaigns on the rights of domestic workers are required, reminding trade unions of their obligation to these informal workers.

Murray, Una, 2014, Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers Swedish funding towards Outcome 5, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Paraguay, India, Zambia, Tanzania and The Philippines.

- 6) During project design, baseline analysis and implementation *be aware that IE workers (who work for IE operators) may be hesitant to participate in labour law compliance*. Determine as much as possible in advance what, if any reticence may exist, why it exists and how this could be addressed to increase their access to decent work conditions.

At the time of the evaluation, attitude change could be discerned but behaviour change in terms of actual compliance with labour laws such as through the provision of labour contracts was still lagging. The main reasons for the slow uptake of labour contracts include the diversity of challenges that affect the sectors in both countries. In Kenya an unexpected finding explained part of the reason for the still limited labour contracts, i.e. workers in the matatu sector themselves were very hesitant to accept them. Workers tend to prefer the flexibility to move between employers as they wish and believe that they can earn more money daily under the existing systems than if they were given a monthly salary. Zambian contractors did indicate that they thought that their workers generally like to have contracts.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

- 7) Note that *simple and practical approaches during project implementation can also have an impact* on attitude and behaviour change. E.g, a project in Kenya established a savings culture among groups dependent on the IE using a simple piggy bank concept.

The evaluation notes that the project in Kenya has successfully promoted saving culture among the targeted groups with documented results. The piggy bank concept has enabled those who never saved in their lives or those who had no idea of saving to appreciate the power of saving. Individual testimonies from group members on how the savings enabled them to realize their rights during the period "Hand in Hand" NGO has worked with them and not before.

Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet & Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.

- 8) When implementing Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices (KAP) assessments in baseline and end line studies in IE projects, *ensure that they are designed in such a way that real change can be measured* over time.

Knowledge, attitudes and practices assessments need to be designed in such a way that they use a combination of different approaches for baseline and end-line. Methodologies need to be fine-tuned to measure change accurately under each of the categories.

Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

- 9) *Allocate sufficient time to illustrate and talk about socio-cultural issues*, even in trainings that are not assumed to address such topics. Addressing socio-cultural issues such as on equality and equity with regard to access to production and markets needs attention.

The evaluation found that the time allocated to awareness raising on different socio-cultural issues tended to be too short in the joint male-female Farmer Field School (FFS) sessions. In particular, presentations were too broad, while the farmer Trainers/Facilitators have just 'touched' on the issues and there has not been proper coverage. Socio-cultural issues were seen as an add-on rather than an integral part of livelihood management.

Schwensen, Carl & Laurence, Alida, 2011, Evaluation of the Farmer Field School Approach in the Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II, Bangladesh, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Project: Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II (ASPS II), Bangladesh.

10) When working to change attitudes towards local products/services, take into account the usefulness of *aspirational role models to change low-income customers' behaviour*. Stimulate production and supply, without losing sight of the need to improve the demand for products and services. Consider that products made by people dependent on the IE or working in newly formalised companies need clients. In many instances the producers/service providers are part of a population group that may also be potential clients. Lack of sufficient information about the usefulness of such products/services may interfere with purchasing them. Growing local markets among the poor who are close to the producers is useful and should be considered. Keep in mind services such as feminine hygiene products and sanitation.

According to the evaluation, people living at the base of the pyramid have a limited amount of money to spend and, especially, they have their own logic about what they want to spend it on and it's not always what companies expect. Target customers may not yet know the benefit of products or services that have not been available to them before. They may not understand what the problem is with, say, non-nutritious food or poor sanitation practices and therefore lack motivation to purchase products with these benefits. Or they may have information about benefits but simply don't see the appeal.

To create consumer demand for new products or services, project's grantees have had to develop an offer that is sufficiently compelling for people to part with their limited cash. This is in particular challenging when the benefits and value are not immediate but are realised over time, such as in the case of education or preventative healthcare.

Aspiration has emerged as another important success factor in poor markets. Like any consumer group, low-income customers want to be respected and admired by their peers. They want to have social status, own the latest or fashionable things, and be like their aspirational role models. The evaluation provides two outstanding examples of this typical behaviour:

1) In researching the market for menstrual products, the social enterprise Makit spent a number of months exploring the needs and wants of young women living in Kenyan slums and impoverished rural areas. The market is particularly brand-conscious with strong role models both in popular culture and also societally. Young women living in the slums aspire to be like the wealthier girls living in the city and when opinion leaders in schools and communities adopt a new product, the rest are quick to follow. The market for sanitation products is dominated by one brand, which is associated with rich, educated city women. It is seen as such a sign of status (even given the private consumption nature of the product) that some women would rather save up the extra money for this premium brand – using makeshift sanitary solutions in the meantime – instead of using a less prestigious brand on a regular basis. Makit have realised that aspirational factors are key to creating demand in this market, impacting everything from packaging to distribution channel. This realisation helps them to improve the interest in their product.<sup>26</sup>

2) Waste Ventures has also seen the effect of aspiration in the customer demand in another, very different sector – garbage collection services. The company was pleasantly surprised to find many low-income citizens were willing to pay for

SIDA, 2013, From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).

26 <http://www.inclusivebusinesshub.org/page/project-profile-makit-menstrual-cup-distribution>

Waste Ventures' waste management services. The reason is that customers saw doorstep garbage collection as a 'big city' service and this aspirational factor was cited as a strong driver in their purchasing decision.	
---	--

11) *Build local consumers trust* in order to orient their savings to fairer and healthier products. In particular, draw upon a precise strategy that could include:

- Demonstrations
- Word-of-mouth
- After-Sale services.

<p>The evaluation noted that people living on a few dollars a day are very careful about how they spend their money. Since they are so risk-averse, building their trust is critical for any inclusive business. Among the possible strategies to change consumers behaviour by relying on their trust, the evaluation shows the importance of demonstrations, namely showing that the product or service works. For instance, research by consulting firm Hystra9 found that the more visual and tangible those demonstrations are, the better. During its village demonstrations, solar energy company D.light threw its lanterns on the floor to show how durable they are.</p> <p>Another important marketing tool is the so-called "word-of-mouth". Base of pyramid consumers trust what their family, friends and respected community members say. Word-of-mouth is consistently shown to be the most influential factor in customers' purchasing decisions, with some research suggesting that anywhere from 50–92% of consumers make purchasing decisions based on what their relatives or neighbours say.</p> <p>Because positive word-of-mouth referrals depend on satisfied customers, the most effective marketing happens after the sale. For example, solar energy company ONergy found that customers perceived solar energy to be unreliable due to generally poor levels of after-sales service on solar equipment. When equipment was not used correctly, or broke down, customers were left with the impression that solar energy doesn't work. ONergy tackled this misperception by focusing on after-sales service as part of its offer: it recognised that by providing this reliability in their products, they will not only increase their own market share but also increase overall demand and grow the size of the solar energy market.</p>	<p>SIDA, 2013, <i>From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups</i>, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).</p>
---	--

## 3.2. Entrepreneurship: Capacity strengthening on economic activities

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on entrepreneurship strengthening in IE identified.

b) Challenges on entrepreneurship in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on capacity strengthening for starting, improving, growing economic activities. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of capacity strengthening on starting, improving, growing economic activities and determine if/how these were overcome.



1) *Conduct needs analysis to determine the service support needs of the IE members.* This should include, in addition to training on entrepreneurship and other related subjects, attention to the complete (holistic) personal situation of the community members. This would entail their social, psychological, economic, health, education situation. Rather than implementing actions to address all the identified needs, however, projects/programmes can identify and provide linkages to external available services.

<p>The RNSF Implementing Partner, AVSI, indicates that, in their experience a full package of services should take beneficiaries complete personal situation into account.</p> <p>Baselines that analyse the needs of should cover all of these aspects so that project planning is well informed and sustainability more probable.</p> <p>Link the provision of services with services available through local government for added sustainability.</p>	<p>Lassine, Bamba, 2015, Good practices collection from Implementing Partners Part 1 AVSI (Civil Society / NGO) - 12 October 2015, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Research Network and Support Facility, Rome, Project: Projet integre d'appui a l'autonomisation des artisans de Côte d'Ivoire.</p>
<p>The meta-analysis found that the impacts of combinations of interventions vary depending on the target groups and specific context. Overall, entrepreneurship programs have a positive and large impact for youth and on business knowledge and practice, but no immediate translation into business set-up and expansion or increased income.</p> <p>The meta analysis also concluded that package providing both training and financing seems to perform better in promoting labour market activities. However, training alone can be quite useful to improve business knowledge and practice, and financing alone does well in enhancing business performance by releasing credit constraints. This suggests that more customised interventions can enhance cost effectiveness depending on the outcomes of interest and the constraints. (note:labour market outcomes include employment, business creation, hours of work, earnings, and profits and business performance to supply side changes such as improved technical and non-cognitive skills, business knowledge and practice, attitudes, aspirations, and more active financial behaviour (borrowing, saving).</p>	<p>Cho, Yoonyoung; Honorati, Maddalena, 2013, Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries: A Meta Regression Analysis, Meta-analysis of evaluations, World Bank Human Development Network Social protection and Labor Unit, Washington DC.</p>

2) *Use integrated (holistic) models for skills development in IE combining:*

- Functional literacy
- Entrepreneurship-business management
- Environmental conservation
- Occupational safety and health
- Labour rights of workers
- Gender awareness and right issues
- Leadership training
- Include in basic management on issues such as:
  - Business feasibility determination
  - Book-keeping

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

- Separating business from personal expenses, calculating working capital needs (including owner(s) and worker(s) labour costs)
- Financial literacy on micro-credit and/or insurance schemes
- Marketing
- Production management including stock keeping and stock record keeping

3) *Share training model* for people dependent on the IE with relevant local training authorities for wider replication.

Develop an integrated model on skills development, which combines (a) functional literacy, (b) entrepreneurship, (c) environment conservation, (d) occupational safety and health, (e) rights as workers, and (f) gender mainstreaming. This model could be shared with the relevant training authorities for wider replication.	Guardian, Edgar, 2014, Livelihood Restoration, Protection and Sustainable Empowerment of Vulnerable Peasant Communities in Sindh Province - Joint Midterm Review. Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation noted that training including on book-keeping and business management were useful components added to skills training	Barca, Valentina; Riemenschneider, Nils, 2012, Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund – DELTA 1 Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Multi Donor Livelihood and Food Security Trust Fund (LIFT), Myanmar.
The evaluation indicated that practical, hands on training in running a simple business, including calculating how much to set aside to replace assets and calculating your own labour costs, was often cited as a critical factor in the success of projects, even amongst those who had been running successful businesses before the disaster.	Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation, Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.
The evaluation of a series of projects indicated that comprehensive programs that provide a combination of business management and leader-ship skills, financial literacy, micro-credit and/ or insurance schemes.	Social Protection & Labor The World Bank; Children & Youth, 2010, ACTIVE LABOR MARKET PROGRAMS FOR YOUTH, A Framework to Guide Youth Employment Interventions, General background document on issues in our research matrix, World Bank Employment Policy Primer November 2010, No. 16. World Bank, Washington DC.
The RNSF Implementing Partner, Aide au Développement Gembloux found that a basket of complementary and integrated services (provision of financial services, agricultural inputs, marketing support to vulnerable rural populations will improve faster their economic and social situation. This finding is the basis for the development of the OSIRIS project to provide a more comprehensive and integrated service combination.	Good practices collection from Implementing Partners Part 1: Aide au Développement Gembloux (Civil Society / NGO), 9 October 2015
The evaluation concluded that participants of the small business training and start-up program as well as graduates of the vocational and entrepreneurship programs should learn how to keep an organised budget log of their expenses, revenue, and profit. Graduates should be provided with the necessary materials to support this practice. Agencies should require graduates to provide them with monthly reporting of these figures, as well as information about how they have spent or saved any profit they have made. This practice will improve the IPs' ability to monitor their graduates' income generation and asset development. Projects delivering small business start-up and entrepreneurship training must provide more robust support for the development of feasible business plans. All graduates who receive start-up grants or who are awarded start-up kits to implement a small business should receive an on-going package of services and support from the IP including routine coaching, technical guidance, and	Holzaepfel, Erica A., 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of Livelihoods Programs for Refugees in Ethiopia, Final evaluation, Social Impact Inc., Washington, DC, projects: 1) International Rescue Committee (IRC) Livelihoods project; 2) Jesuit Refugee Services (JRS) Livelihoods project; 3) Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) Livelihoods project in Ethiopia.

assistance securing peer to peer mentoring	
The project beneficiaries were extremely highly valued the training on financial management of livelihoods wherever it was used. A significant majority of households visited during the fieldwork stated that this was crucial for the success of their livelihood project.	Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation, Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.
The evaluation indicated that the combination of improving general knowledge on how to improve agricultural productivity, how to make a business, how to improve nutrition and health, with the Village Saving and Loan concept is promising.	Meuer, Heike, 2015, Final Evaluation Report Enhancing food security and nutrition in and around Monrovia and Tubmanburg - "UPANI" in Liberia, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.

4) *Develop sets of good practices with clear operational targets to be met in IE associations/cooperatives/groups.* In many projects, the measurement of the quality of the functioning of associations/cooperatives/groups is insufficiently included in monitoring. Good practices and lessons learned should be used to inform improvements in functioning of the IE groups. Implement a systems approach with feedback loops to improve implementation of activities in the groups.

The evaluation noted that advanced skills were developed through formal training efforts for some 18 senior technical individuals in the cultural sector of the country the 'Start Your Cultural Business' training efforts has exposed over 300 individuals to the entrepreneurial opportunities around (cultural) heritage utilisation across the country.	Heritage Resource, Incorporated, 2013, Improved livelihoods of empowered Namibian rural communities through cultural tourism - Final Joint Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation determined that the project has made excellent initial interventions in introducing ILO's entrepreneurship tool "Know About Business".	Raoof Ali, Samia, 2013, Empowering Vulnerable Groups through Education, Employment and Training (EET) – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation found that the sectoral adjustment of business training concepts, such as SIYB for agribusiness and solar energy and in the future most probably for tourism, will allow to more effectively targeting selected sectors.	Schoen, Christian; Mousaco, Vito, 2013, Business opportunities and support services (BOSS) - Midterm Evaluation (Timor Leste), Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

5) Be aware in project design and sustainability planning that entrepreneurship promotion programmes usually require an *extended time horizon* before employment effects become apparent.

Entrepreneurship promotion programmes (such as Start and Improve your Business (SIYB)) usually require an extended time horizon before employment effects become apparent. Employment was created in only three of the 14 interventions under review within the lifespan of the project. In one case, the Chinese government scaled up the ILO intervention leading to the potential creation of more than 1 million jobs. This remark is in line with a recent World Bank review stating that business training should use a much longer time horizon for any sustainable effects to appear. In demand-side strategies, such as entrepreneurship promotion, the causal chain between the intervention input and the outcome in terms of employment is evidently longer and more prone to disturbing factors.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
In South Africa two of the women entrepreneurs interviewed for the evaluation actually reported having decreased their employees as a consequence of training. In both cases, the entrepreneur stated that the training had led the entrepreneur to the conclusion that she was not managing her human resources efficiently. As	Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho,

a result, they decided to downsize in order to eventually be in a better position to hire more staff at a later point in time. In one case two employees went on to establish their own micro-enterprises but, as they could no longer be counted as employees for the project trainee, the business was counted as having lost staff. An additional point made by some evaluation participants is that it takes time for businesses to grow and that the effects of training on a business needs to be measured over the course of a longer time period.

Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

6) Ensure that projects and activities to support IE operators and workers are:

- Clearly oriented to their specific needs and not too general
- Do not try to cover too many different aspects and consequently lose focus
- Ensure a wider demonstration effect of projects
- Managers/supervisors of trainees in micro finance institutions fully accept and support the training of their staff.

The evaluation found that most projects were relevant but, in some cases, their design was not realistic given the time frame, budget constraints and institutional context.

An example is the "Democratic workers' participation and employment standards in the role of poverty alleviation" project in Tanzania, where too many issues were being considered including social dialogue, wages, work relations and social services. Participating institutions and the individual participants persistently noted that the course was too general with insufficient tailoring. The demand of many of the highly-qualified participants for more specific, specialised content was not met.

The projects that were not well designed were often those that involved single organisations - often NGOs actively engaged in providing skills to youth and others in entrepreneurship. Many of these projects were potentially very relevant but the design often missed a wider demonstration effect or a solid embedding in the longer operations of the organisation itself.

Furthermore, participants pointed out that the programme format did not engage strongly enough with the managers in the parent institutions. In many cases the managers of the institutions from which the participants are selected did not have a full understanding of the objectives of the training programme and were not willing to commit their organisation to fully support the participants during the elaboration and implementation of the projects. A test of the credibility and realism of the stated support from the institutions was not made – it seems it was accepted at face value and on the basis that the participants would be released for the course and in some cases the airfares would be paid for. As a result, projects were developed that were not realistic as they required funding from the parent institution that was not available.

Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.

7) Consider all the possible constraints that might lead business pilots to fail to grow including:

- Business models that are not sufficiently commercial.
- Other external factors limit the commercial proposition and ability to scale commercially.
- Market demand turns out to be very limited.
- The business cannot access growth capital.

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

- Structural or capacity constraints to growing the business
- There is a lack of ambition or incentive to grow
- There are no, or very limited, economies of scale for the business.

<p>The evaluation suggests 7 broad reasons to explain why apparently successful pilot businesses failed to reach scale:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 1. The business models are not sufficiently commercial</li> <li>▪ 2. Other external factors limit the commercial proposition and ability to scale commercially</li> <li>▪ 3. Market demand turns out to be very limited</li> <li>▪ 4. The business cannot access growth capital</li> <li>▪ 5. There are structural or capacity constraints to growing the business;</li> <li>▪ 6. There is a lack of ambition or incentive to go to scale</li> <li>▪ 7. There are no, or very limited, economies of scale for the business model.</li> </ul>	<p>SIDA, 2013, From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).</p>
---	---

8) *Support capacity strengthening of informal economy operators in accordance with their needs* but verify if they have specific needs in the areas of:

- Collective decision making
- Investment in and implementation of business plans
- Record keeping
- Available financial services and knowledge on how to access and use them
- Value-adding/value chain processes
- Mechanisms to access (new) markets and buyers
- Risk management.

9) Include *special attention to women's capacity strengthening* including through village savings and loan groups.

<p>The evaluation determined that capacity building is needed to empower farmers to make collective decisions beyond commodity exchange to invest and implement business plans. Knowledge of business development and financial services, and programs for start-up of value-adding businesses is lacking. Women have more limited access to labour and cash to embrace these activities than men; they also have lower literacy levels. The newly created VSL system can promote collective entrepreneurial ventures.</p> <p>Capacity building is also needed to help farmers understand mechanisms to access new markets or buyers and the potential to leverage better negotiations when large volumes of produce are put on sale. Efficient governance in storage and marketing practices in the local associations (GAC level) is a precondition to develop strategic relationships with market actors who are perceived as unreachable or against farmers' interests.</p>	<p>Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
<p>One of the key elements of the "Hand in Hand" model is the training modules that all groups and group members undergo before they can become self-sustaining. The evaluation team assessed the training modules. It is recommended that the module be improved to include record keeping, risk management, consumer</p>	<p>Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet &amp; Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA</p>

protection and value chain process.	Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.
-------------------------------------	--

10) Note when designing community level projects on IE that a meta-analysis of entrepreneurship development programs *found projects oriented to youth and urban populations were more likely to have positive impacts*. If working in rural areas, project design will need to be especially well detailed with solid theory of change and include intensive technical support.

Program impacts estimated for youth and the urban population are more likely to be positive and significant than estimates for impact of projects for the general population.	Cho, Yoonyoung; Honorati, Maddalena, 2013, Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries: A Meta Regression Analysis, Meta-analysis of evaluations, World Bank Human Development Network Social protection and Labor Unit, Washington DC.
---	---

11) When organising a training course, *use a well-defined participatory strategy with clear and detailed criteria to identify and select beneficiaries*. Participation should not be limited to project design but be included in all actions.

The evaluation reports that the identification and selection process of the members of the Common Interest Groups in both districts was based on a participatory approach and a complete inventory of all farming families totalling almost 30 000. Thereafter, the farm size was the most important criteria and the major livelihood as this is the common interest that provides for the social fabric of the group and unites them enhancing the success of the CIG. In addition the location of the farms formed the basis of the CIG. As opportune, for instance irrigation from the same water course, or previous experience with interventions of rural development projects, could lead to the formation of a CIG.	Denecke, Harry W., 2013, Support to household food security and livelihood of vulnerable and food insecure farming families - GCP /AFG/061/LUX (Afghanistan), Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.
--	--

12) Ensure that *communications about available project services are well formulated and disseminated*. Communication should focus on raising the trust and confidence of youth or other community members who may have limited or discouraging prior experience of accessing loans or other services. Ensure that communications on available services include a gender perspective to ensure females also access the services.

The evaluation noted that information about the opportunity to access affordable loans and technical coaching and counselling need to be better formulated and disseminated. Communication should focus on raising trust and confidence youth entrepreneurs who may have limited or discouraging prior experience of accessing loans from Government. It is also recommended to review the information presented and communicated in the messages from a gender perspective.	UNIDO, 2015, Productive work for youth in Armenia – supporting young entrepreneurs, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
--	---



13) Consider a wide range of livelihoods opportunities for people dependent on the IE outside of standard types of IE activities. Examples may include establishment of sales agent networks for diverse products, latrine installation, mobile hairdressing services, etc.

The evaluation determined that the project promoted the concept of sanitation as an excellent business opportunity that has spread far beyond IDE-trained entrepreneurs through production innovation, which has in turn stimulated both supply and demand. Copycat enterprises adopted sales and marketing strategies that IDE-trained entrepreneurs are using, such as displays and sales agent networks (new latrine installations upwards of 40-50% are coming from latrine competitors other than those trained by IDE). Due to the project, a widespread and fully functioning sales agent network now exists in communes and villages in the areas mentioned above, which is generating wide-spread sales. Many latrine producers now employ commission-based sales agents who actively market latrines in their areas of influence.	Mendez England & Associates, 2012, Final Performance Evaluation of USAID's "Cambodia Micro, Small And Medium-Sized Enterprises li/Business Enabling Environment" Project, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
---	---

14) Develop inventory of various types of available training materials in different IE areas. Widely share the available types of materials or locations/agencies through which they can be accessed.

The evaluation noted that advanced skills were developed through formal training efforts for some 18 senior technical individuals in the cultural sector of the country the 'Start Your Cultural Business' training efforts has exposed over 300 individuals to the entrepreneurial opportunities around (cultural) heritage utilisation across the country.	Heritage Resource, Incorporated, 2013, Improved livelihoods of empowered Namibian rural communities through cultural tourism - Final Joint Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation determined that the project has made excellent initial interventions in introducing ILO's entrepreneurship tool "Know About Business".	Raoof Ali, Samia, 2013, Empowering Vulnerable Groups through Education, Employment and Training (EET) – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation found that the sectoral adjustment of business training concepts, such as SIYB for agribusiness and solar energy and in the future most probably for tourism, will allow to more effectively targeting selected sectors.	Schoen, Christian; Mousaco, Vito, 2013, Business opportunities and support services (BOSS) - Midterm Evaluation (Timor Leste), Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

15) Promote combination of theory and practice during training followed up with technical inputs and support including for marketing of products.

16) Be aware that *trainers need to have skills in consulting/mentoring* so that they can provide the type of technical support to IE operators and entrepreneurs that they prefer and/or need.

17) Be aware that some *informal economy operators are more interested in receiving consulting/advisory services* as opposed to attending training.

The evaluation noted that the ILO's approach to building capacity through combining theory and practice in the training room, followed by further technical inputs and support in the workplace is a good practice.	Greener Business Asia Project - FE - ILO 2013 Schoen, Christian; Mousaco, Vito, 2013, Business opportunities and support services (BOSS) - Midterm Evaluation (Timor Leste), Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
Some entrepreneurs prefer consulting support as opposed to training. Trainers not well versed in consulting need special guidelines on consulting.	Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.



## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

<p>The evaluation found that the project provided technical assistance in product development and marketing support to 40 female members of the Cooperativa de Servicios Múltiples Rafael María Fabre in San José de Cusmapa, Matriz. The cooperative members produce hand-made woven household products made from natural fibres including pine needles produced in the nearby forests. Its members have received technical assistance from Omar Aguilar, the consultant hired by the E&amp;E project to assist the artisans that make up the value chain of Grupo Raices. It was Omar who encouraged and assisted these women in designing products that have more demand that has allowed them to increase their monthly sales. E&amp;E has also helped them participate in local and regional fairs, including International Fair of Handcrafts in Guatemala City in 2011</p>	<p>USAID 2012, Nicaragua Enterprise and Employment (E&amp;E) Activity MTE.</p>
<p>The evaluation determined that the implement the Business Innovation Facility (BIF), which consist of a dynamic innovation system consisting of different players (business training and counselling, technology support, financial support) is effective.</p>	<p>Schoen, Christian; Mousaco, Vito, 2013, Business opportunities and support services (BOSS) - Midterm Evaluation (Timor Leste), Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The evaluation noted that peer-to-peer mentoring should entail facilitated sessions where successful program graduates provide graduates who may be struggling or looking for inspiration, with insight, examples, and recommendations for trouble-shooting from their own experience as small business owners.</p>	<p>Holzaepfel, Erica A., 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of Livelihoods Programs for Refugees in Ethiopia, Final evaluation, Social Impact Inc., Washington, DC, projects: 1) International Rescue Committee (IRC) Livelihoods project; 2) Jesuit Refugee Services (JRS) Livelihoods project; 3) Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) Livelihoods project in Ethiopia.</p>

18) Include in project design focus on *ensuring experience and equipment sharing* between community members following training.

<p>The evaluation concluded that training of beneficiaries was relatively low cost and beneficiaries, once trained, were reportedly sharing equipment and experience in their community. Training also resulted in the production of marketable goods.</p>	<p>Rum Ali, Mohamad; Young, Andrew, 2013, Independent Evaluation: Realizing minimum living standards for disadvantaged communities through peace building and village based economic development (Indonesia), Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.</p>
--	--

19) Ensure that project design includes *provision of support for the acquisition of new technical skills* to establish new enterprises start-ups or to expand existing enterprises while also providing market support and access to financial services are important tools to improve the incomes of people dependent on the IE.

<p>SIDA's evaluation team surveyed project's beneficiaries who were supported to start new enterprise and to expand their existing ones. Most of the groups met reported that project assistance in accessing markets for their products was strongly needed, as training in marketing alone was not enough. It was found that acquiring skills led to 90% business expansion, followed by institutional support (85%). Market support and access to financial services were other incentives for starting or expanding a business at 65% respectively. Differently, increased income has had the least potential (50%) on the business expansion.</p>	<p>Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet &amp; Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.</p>
--	---

20) *Improve support for home-based workers by including mobile sales agents* who can link the workers to markets and communicate market demands back to producers.

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

<p>The evaluation identified several good practices to improve marketing of products that home-based workers had made. This included the approach of using mobile women as sales agents and to facilitate quality improvement, to link women embellishers (WEs) to markets, and to communicate market demands back to WEs addresses real constraints that WEs in the region face when accessing markets.</p> <p>Specifically, the evaluation noted that the project established Female Sales Agents (FSAs) to act as a link between the market and Women Embellishment Groups (WEGs). FSAs deliver the finished products from the WEGs to the market. They also bring back order specifications from the market, thus updating the home bound artisans on the latest trends and demands in the market.</p>	<p>Management Systems International (MSI), 2012, Women's Economic Empowerment: Balochistan Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
--	---

21) Include staff with well *good expertise on market development in IE projects*. Inclusion of such persons can be a good investment and result in better understanding of local markets and foster of better measures to improve access of IE operators to markets.

<p>The evaluation noted that the project engaged a well-qualified Marketing Consultant, in addition to the FAO's Technical Support Service Team. The latter was fundamental to become more involved in the areas of marketing. It was argued that Project staff was monitoring the local markets with farmers to explore the potential for farmers' produce; that, together with cooperatives, the Project team investigated in different packaging options and marketing hurdles; that an analysis of the demand and supply situation of products, the price formation process, trading margins and cost calculations of processing and storage were completed; and that linkages/networks were developed for the purpose of marketing analysis.</p>	<p>Grunewald, Matthias, 2013, Small Farmer Livelihoods and Income Enhancement in Baghlan Province, Afghanistan – GCP /AFG/053/GER, Final evaluation, FAO, Rome, Project: FAO Rehabilitation of the Sugar Industry in Baghlan, Afghanistan.</p>
---	--

22) Include *mentoring programmes with experienced business owners* in entrepreneurship development programmes as this builds the business and financial skills of young entrepreneurs and farmers.

23) Consider *including older more experienced youth to mentor* younger and less experienced youth.

<p>The analysis showed that mentoring programmes with experienced business owners can build the business and financial skills of young entrepreneurs and farmers.</p> <p>The mentoring from experienced business owners or farmers can further develop the financial and management skills of young people to access the financing needed to start or grow a business.</p>	<p>IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.</p>
<p>The analysis indicates that some mentoring programmes successfully engage older youth who have significant experience to mentor those who are younger and less.</p>	<p>The MasterCard Foundation. 2014. 2013-2014 Youth Think Tank Report: Engaging Young People. Toronto, Canada: The MasterCard Foundation.</p>
<p>The analysis identified the opportunity to network with other new and established entrepreneurs as a good practice.</p>	<p>Social Protection &amp; Labor The World Bank; Children &amp; Youth, 2010, ACTIVE LABOR MARKET PROGRAMS FOR YOUTH, A Framework to Guide Youth Employment Interventions, General background document on issues in our research matrix, World Bank Employment Policy Primer November 2010, No. 16 World Bank, Washington DC.</p>

The evaluation concluded that it is important to ensure that entrepreneurship coaching is an explicit cross-cutting theme to help improve knowledge and skills of beneficiaries under the different project components.	Andersen, Henny; Hamdy Mostafa, Marwa, 2016, Independent mid-term evaluation EGYPT Human security through inclusive socio- economic development in Upper Egypt, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
---	---

24) Include *cross-cutting attention to business coaching and youth skills enhancement* in early project stages in all relevant components to maximize the benefits over the long term.

The evaluation noted that micro-business coaching and youth skills enhancement should be cross-cutting theme to be included at an earlier stage in all relevant components to maximize the benefits.	Andersen, Henny; Hamdy Mostafa, Marwa, 2016, Independent mid-term evaluation EGYPT Human security through inclusive socio- economic development in Upper Egypt, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
--	---

25) Ensure that the types of support provided are well *adapted to the context of the community members' needs and available market*. Take into account that capacity strengthening of IE operators may not be the main need of community members but rather that support may be needed to address issues such as market access, the quality of packaging and products, the price of raw materials and the low prices received for products sold. Ensure that the products being developed with community members correspond to the local market desires.

The evaluation noted that the beneficiaries' main obstacles were market access, the quality of packaging, the price of raw materials and the low prices received for products sold.	Rum Ali, Mohamad; Young, Andrew, 2013, Independent Evaluation: Realizing minimum living standards for disadvantaged communities through peace building and village based economic development (Indonesia), Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
The evaluation concluded that the provision of small livestock, home gardening kits, boats and nets, and support for other income-generating activities (IGAs) and the cash-for-work (CfW) programmes had mixed success. This was partially linked to inadequate targeting of beneficiaries, but also to procurement problems and systemic risks such as livestock disease. Small livestock and home gardening inputs and training were often provided to households with no access to land. In areas where this was happening, several households interviewed ended up selling their assets and others were pushed further away from their village to sea in order to provide an income for their households. Some income generating activities did not address a local demand, and were therefore of little success (e.g. high-cost snack training in one village). The quality of the products or service were not always as good as those also available on the market and as a result the income earned was often low.	Barca, Valentina; Riemenschneider, Nils, 2012, Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund – DELTA 1 Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Multi Donor Livelihood and Food Security Trust Fund (LIFT), Myanmar.

26) Note possible shortcomings of the “village entrepreneur” model. In this model an individual selected from within a community acts as a ‘touch point’ between a business and local customer to strengthen links between supply and demand in local markets. People who are dependent on the IE are often selected to participate in such models. This model can have shortcomings, however, stemming

from difficulties recruiting village entrepreneurs, low investments, and/or scarce local demand. While the model can be useful, it is important to bear in mind and try to address the possible shortcomings.

The evaluation comments on a model project grantees often use: the village entrepreneur. Also known as a rural or micro entrepreneur, a village entrepreneur (VE) is an individual selected from within a village who acts as a 'touch point' between a business and local customers. The company supplies the product or service equipment to the VE upfront and provides additional support to help the VE succeed, such as training and branded promotional materials. In turn, the VE sells the company's product or service, provides customer support, invests capital, earns commission, and takes risks.

However, while the model stands, in theory, SIDA's experience suggests it is not that simple. Two Innovations Against Poverty (IAP) grantees in the energy sector tested the village entrepreneur model: Sunny People in Kenya and Nuru Energy in India. Both had a business model that was based on village entrepreneurs purchasing charging systems that could be used to charge mobile phones or lights. The idea was that village entrepreneurs would buy these systems on credit and then provide charging services to customers in rural and remote locations. This would enable the entrepreneur to earn an income while at the same time providing mobile charging services to communities that were cut off from the electricity grid. The money the entrepreneur earned could be used to pay off the capital investment and after the initial repayment period, would provide a sustainable income source.

Both grantees had entered into early partnerships with Micro Finance Institutions (MFI) with the view that this would enable them to quickly establish a village entrepreneur network, but both ran into difficulties. *Sunny People* found it difficult to motivate its MFI partner to recruit and train village entrepreneurs and there was a weak capacity in sales and marketing within the MFI. Eventually, Sunny People hired its own staff to recruit, train and manage rural entrepreneurs and undertake marketing and sales. In some cases Sunny People even took on the role of financier, providing credit to rural entrepreneurs directly. This led to higher overheads, required more time investment than originally expected, and created a much heavier organisational structure as the company took on responsibility for almost the entire value chain.

*Nuru Energy's* model was also jeopardised early in implementation as MFIs in India were hit with a credit crisis around that time. Its initial MFI partner pulled out and the company struggled to find another suitable partner that could provide financing to VEs. Eventually an NGO partner took on the role of providing credit, financed through the corporate social responsibility (CSR) programme of a large corporate foundation. To quickly establish village entrepreneur networks, Nuru Energy explored a range of other partnerships including with mobile telecoms companies, consumer durable companies, women's savings cooperatives and NGOs. After a lengthy process of negotiations, trial and error, the company has since chosen to focus on rural women's cooperatives and self-help groups as a way to recruit and fund village entrepreneurs and support marketing efforts. This has taken significant time and effort.

In addition to the problems of finding suitable partners in their distribution model, both Sunny People and Nuru Energy faced lower-than-expected levels of consumer demand for charging services. It seemed that customers preferred to buy their own chargers outright, giving them the convenience of charging in their own home as well as added social status of owning their own system.

SIDA, 2013, *From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups*, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).

27) collection of data of costs on production, storage transportation, inputs to the IE activity to enhance IE operators' decision making skills. This applies to both agricultural as well as other rural and urban production.

<p>The evaluation determined that a lack of on-farm records about productivity, costs of inputs and produce, and transportation and storage costs pose a challenge to enhancing farmers' decision-making skills. Lack of records also makes it difficult for INVC to properly populate key data to estimate performance.</p> <p>The evaluation also noted that the project supported collective marketing options for farmers by giving them leverage in negotiating for their crops through providing them with market intelligence. The project supports farmers to store and sell grain at their convenience with a receipt that can be used as a collateral for short-term loans; auctions to sell; and an option whereby buyers and sellers trade during a live electronic auction</p>	<p>Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
<p>The article emphasises that knowledge needs of producers need to be made visible and responded to. A critical activity in this direction is tracking and monitoring the supply and demand of knowledge in commodities that flow into particular markets regularly. Informal agriculture markets are not just for agricultural commodities but they have also evolved into knowledge markets where the demand and supply of knowledge can be tracked back to production along the whole value chain, informed by feedback from the market.</p>	<p>Dhewa, Charles, 2016, Making knowledge needs visible through agricultural markets, General background document on issues in our research matrix, eMKambo, Knowledge Transfer Africa, Harare Zimbabwe. See also website of Knowledge Transfer Africa <a href="http://www.knowledgetransafrica.com/">www.knowledgetransafrica.com/</a></p>

28) Promote opportunities for women to *enhance their IE livelihoods using skills that they already have* but ensure that full analysis is conducted of the market and other barriers that exist to gaining adequate income from these activities. Develop effective approaches to overcome the identified barriers.

<p>The traditional skills of making embellished garments – a skill from which many women already earn income – presents an opportunity that builds on existing skills and practices. However, homebound women face a number of barriers to full participation opportunities in the embellished garment sector.</p>	<p>Management Systems International (MSI), 2012, Women's Economic Empowerment: Balochistan Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
--	---

29) Consider facilitating the *development of collective marketing* for producers.

- Ensure that to build successful collective marketing:
- Trust is built through transparency
- Access to stock keeping areas is facilitated if needed
- Governance of associations is strengthened.

<p>Facilitate collective marketing with specific actions. To improve collective marketing, it is essential to build trust among farmers through transparency; strengthen governance of farmers associations; encourage farmers to collectively aggregate at warehouse centres.</p>	<p>Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.</p>
--	---

30) Promote the *collection of information and meaningful data about local markets* through early-stage project studies. This facilitates the establishment of enterprises at the base of the economic pyramid/value chains.

As the evaluation states, organisations working at the base of pyramid need to learn about the market, the value chains they are entering and the customers they are selling to. There may be little market data available and companies have to find ways to gather insights about what poor people want, believe, and will trust. To really understand the problem, the entrepreneurs had to conduct first-hand studies, observation and consultations. This early-stage research is essential as it often lays the assumptions on which the inclusive business is then based. Getting it right at this stage – or at least, as right as possible – can save considerable time and money cost later. Malagasy company Elimentaire Sarl, for example, used its small grant for a combination of pre-feasibility studies, stakeholder needs assessments and pilots to assess consumer demand and the most suitable distribution channels for moringa-based fortified food products. Through this process, Elimentaire Sarl discovered information on pricing and regulation that challenged their original business model. Without this adequate early-stage research, the company may have invested significant resources into an unfeasible business model. The team is now exploring a different model that starts with integrating the moringa plant in community reforestation schemes first, as moringa is widely known as a nutrient-rich vegetable by the local population. This gives Elimentaire Sarl flexibility to develop new sales channels to Base of pyramid consumers and other consumer markets at a later stage, and secure supply through partnerships with the respective local communities.

SIDA, 2013, From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).

31) *Recognise that specific IE activities that a project supports may only form a part of that household's income.* Ensure that the time the project expects a household to spend on the IE activity is proportionate to other household income generating responsibilities.

The evaluation noted that poor households tend to have a range of small activities that form sources of income. Projects should recognise that the activity they support will usually form only one part of the household income – and should only command a proportionate amount of the household time. The evaluation concluded that, with regard to IGAs, an integrated approach that includes a range of activities in the field of livestock and agriculture within a household needs to be developed. Project engage in many “one-off activities” that, for the situation in question and people concerned, make sense and have a minor outcome.

- 1) Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation, Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.
- 2) Hoffman, Ilse, 2013, Evaluation of the project “Conflict sensitive transitional aid to stabilize sustainable livelihoods in Karamoja, Northeast Uganda”, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.

32) Review *contract farming*<sup>27</sup> as a potential approach for involving smallholders in agroindustry development, increasing employment and improving the inclusiveness of growth. Note that marginal smallholders may find better prospects as wage labourers on larger farms—including in processing of agricultural outputs—instead of participating in improved supply chains as independent producers. Consider, however, that in some cases there is evidence that contract farming can benefit better-equipped farmers, excluding the poorest ones. Depending on project objectives, this will need to be taken into account and addressed.

Contract farming can be defined as agricultural production carried out according to an agreement between a buyer and farmers, which establishes conditions for the production and marketing of a farm product or products. Typically, the farmer agrees to provide agreed quantities of a specific agricultural product (FAO

Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London,

<sup>27</sup> Contract farming can be defined as agricultural production carried out according to an agreement between a buyer and farmers, which establishes conditions for the production and marketing of a farm product or products. Typically, the farmer agrees to provide agreed quantities of a specific agricultural product (FAO).



<p>website).</p> <p>The evaluation claims that contract farming can reduce firms' transaction costs and risks and provide an efficient means of sharing incentives and risks in some sub-sectors. In many developing countries with weak judicial processes and law enforcement institutions this is likely to be limited to circumstances where side-selling is difficult (e.g. where the contracting buyer has a monopoly) or unattractive (e.g. where buyers coordinate to discourage side-selling). In terms of poverty reduction, contracting with smallholders can be beneficial: small farms are owned by the poor, often use local labour, and often spend income nearby. For firms, contract farming can offer a number of opportunities: increased reliability in supply quantity and quality; greater control over the production process and crop attributes, to meet standards and credence factors; reduced co-ordination costs, as a more regular and stable supply permits greater co-ordination with wider activities; greater flexibility in expanding or reducing production compared to full vertical integration (and economies of scale in procurement of inputs). On a broader note, and especially where access to land is highly politicised, it can overcome land constraints.</p> <p>Contract farming also offers numerous opportunities for farms: it can allow access to a reliable market; it can provide guaranteed and stable pricing structures; and most importantly, it can provide access to credit, inputs, production and marketing services (seed, fertiliser, training, extension, transport, and even land preparation). On a wider note, contract farming can open doors to new markets for a farm's produce, stimulate technology and skill transfer (particularly for higher-risk crops, which resource-poor farmers might typically avoid), and it can support farmers in meeting vital standards.</p> <p>In contrast, additional studies suggest that poorer smallholders are often excluded.</p>	<p>Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries.</p>
<p>Barrett (2008) found a strong association between asset holdings, especially of land, and geographic factors (such as market access and agro-ecological zone) with participation.</p>	<p>Barrett, C., 2008, "Smallholder market participation: Concepts and evidence from eastern and southern Africa" Food Policy 33 (2008).</p>
<p>Freguin-Gresh et al (2012) argue that although contract farming generally improves the agricultural production of participants, it often does not benefit the poorest. Results show that contract farming mostly involves the better resourced, who have previously benefitted from specific development paths and public support.</p>	<p>Freguin-Gresh, S. d'Haese, M. &amp; Anseeuw, W. (2012) Demythifying contract farming: Evidence from rural South Africa, <i>Agrekon: Agricultural Economics Research, Policy and Practice in Southern Africa</i>, 51:3.</p>
<p>Bellemare (2012) shows that those participating in contract farming in Madagascar had larger landholdings, greater assets, better education and were more likely to be a member of a producer organisation.</p>	<p>Bellemare, M. F., 2012, As you sow, so shall you reap: The welfare impacts of contract farming. <i>World Development</i>, 40(7), Science Direct.</p>
<p>Taking these finds one step further, Wiggins and Keates (2012) argue that marginal smallholders may find better prospects as wage labourers on larger farms instead of participating in improved supply chains as producers.</p>	<p>Wiggins, S. and Keates, S. (2012), Leaping and learning, linking smallholders to Markets in Africa; Draft Reprt, Overseas Development Institute.</p>

### 3.3. Information technology and enhancing of livelihoods of people dependent on the IE

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on using IT to enhance the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion in IE identified.

b) Challenges (if any) on using IT to enhance the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.



**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on how IT was used to enhance of livelihoods. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of IT to enhance livelihoods and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) Assess the *availability of the needed technical infrastructure* when designing projects that will use IT to enhance/affect livelihoods of people dependent on the IE. (While this appears a straight forward consideration, this is not always sufficiently considered.)

The evaluation found that there was no technical feasibility assessment of the project prior to inception. This would have been useful, especially for the technical aspect of the project. The project did not sufficiently consider the need for a good mobile network coverage that would have made the early warning system mechanism more effective. Increasing the network coverage is essential for optimum benefit of the digital technology by the poor and vulnerable fishermen.	Faizul, Kabir; Kabir, Golam, 2015, Digital Early Warning Systems to Save the Lives and Livelihoods of Communities of Bangladesh (DEWS), Final evaluation, Dhaka.
--	--

2) *Introduce mobile technology* when designing IE development projects. They can be very useful to shorten the distance between service providers and local populations.

The evaluation notes that the development of mobile money has revolutionised the market and a range of payment methods are now available that make products and services more accessible to the poor. Most Innovations Against Poverty (IAP) grantees currently use mobile money as a key part of their business model or are considering shifting to this approach. For example, Pamoja Cleantech is an IAP grantee that supplies electricity to houses in rural villages in Uganda. Pamoja plans to operate a pre-paid pricing model and their initial idea was to manually collect payments by sending someone to visit each customer's house. The problems with this approach are multiple: there is a security risk in manually collecting and transporting cash; it causes a delay in payment to the company that impacts on cash flow and can become a risk if there is high inflation; it creates an inconvenient delay for customers between payment and connection to the electricity services; and the approach adds to the company's administrative costs. They are now using a mobile solution instead. Done well, a payment system can become a strong competitive advantage. In the same way, through IAP support, solar power company D.light has developed an innovative payment system called Pay-GO, which integrates pay-as-you-go consumer-financing technology into its solar power system. The Pay-GO system eliminates the high initial purchase.	SIDA, 2013, From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).
The paper shows two case studies. The Women of Uganda Network, engaging with existing informal local communication networks, use information channels that are familiar to women – radio, extension officers, and word-of mouth. Mobile phones are given to women's groups to call extension officers or share information between groups, and a radio to listen to local agricultural radio shows. Second, M-Kilimo is a helpline for Kenyan farmers, developed by Kenya's largest call centre and business processing operator, KenCall, with support from the Rockefeller Foundation. Agricultural expertise and advice is given to farmers. Farmers can speak to a real person for agricultural expertise and advice. During its first 18 months of operation, M-Kilimo reached 25,000 farmers, and it was estimated that 43% of them were women.	Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.

3) Be aware in designing IE related projects that using mobile technology can be a good and realistic option for providing technical support to youth and others dependent on the IE. Note that the use of technology and mobile phones has the potential to reduce project costs, for example with regard to

micro-finance management. It may also reduce training and mentoring costs since no continuous direct personal physical interaction is required.

<p>The assessment noted that mobile ownership data of young people across the developing world indicates that they own or have access to mobiles at rates that are nearly equal to or greater than the rates for adults.</p> <p>The assessment further refers to other studies that found that use of technology and mobile phones for product delivery also has the potential to reduce costs. A Consultative Group to Assist the Poor study on branchless banking showed, for example, that using mobile technologies can be, on average, 19 per cent cheaper than branch-based banking. The evaluation notes the promotion of innovation of mobile banking to facilitate access and usage in rural areas that have limited availability of financial services. Innovation can be achieved in collaboration with the private sector, including FSPs and mobile network operators</p> <p>In Ecuador: Freedom from Hunger's partner cooperatives use smartphones, which field staff take with them during field visits to schools to collect savings directly from the youth.</p> <p>Kenya: YouthSave partner Postbank developed its SMATA (smata means "the smart one" in Swahili) savings account geared towards 12- to 18-year-olds. Like other Postbank customers, SMATA customers can use Postbank's mobile banking system, PataCash, to deposit and withdraw money from their account through M-PESA.</p> <p>Democratic Republic of the Congo: United Nations Capital Development Fund YouthStart's partner, FINCA DRC, uses school-based agents who use point-of-sale devices for account opening and transactions so that students do not have to leave school premises.</p>	<p>IFAD, 2015, <i>Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services</i>, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.</p> <p>Reference Zimmerman, J., J. Nowak, E. Carls, J. Arnold, and V. Rao. 2013. <i>Beyond the Buzz: The Allure and Challenge of Using Mobile Phones to Increase Youth Financial Inclusion</i>. Washington, D.C.: New America Foundation.</p> <p>McKay, Claudia and Pickens, Mark, 2010, <i>Branchless Banking 2010: Who's Served? At What Price? What's Next?</i>, General background document on issues in our research matrix, CGAP, The World Bank, Washington DC.</p>
--	--

4) Use *information technologies (IT)* to promote knowledge sharing (see also subject 3.2.2) in projects and to strengthen IE operators' activities.

<p>The evaluation noted the use of technologies to promote communications and knowledge sharing on project activities.</p>	<p>Zegers, Mei, 2012, <i>Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation</i>, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.</p>
--	---

### 3.4. Leadership, life skills, empowerment training, literacy/numeracy

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on leadership, life skills, empowerment training in IE identified.

b) Challenges (if any) on leadership, life skills, empowerment training in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on leadership, life skills, empowerment training. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Promote group formation in producer organisations.* Smallholders might benefit in terms of overall production, quality assurance, costs, marketing and sharing of information.<sup>28</sup> Nevertheless, attention is strongly needed in relation to producer organization typology and kind of produced commodities. Note that member-based organizations that only provide benefits to members are preferable to broader community-based organizations.

A World Bank (2013) study found that producer organisations can reduce transaction costs per farmer and address information and communication blockages although collective action will also incur internal transaction costs within the producer organizations. Smallholder integration into more demanding value chains may be more successful where producer organisations can facilitate training, aggregation and compliance with standards. Producer organizations can also: facilitate higher producer prices by supplying bulk quantities that have some quality assurance; adapt to market conditions more quickly by seeking alternative buyers; negotiate more effectively with prospective firms; and facilitate finance and technology by channelling outside actors to their members. In this respect, such organisations may play a dual role, acting as a bonding mechanism within communities, but also providing an important bridging function with outside actors (such as firms and development agencies). However, other empirical studies are more sceptical about producer organizations' utility. Huang and Reardon (2008) fulfilled a research in 8 countries and found that membership of producer organisations was correlated with participation in modern markets in only half of the countries. For the rest the correlation was not significant or was negative. They also agreed that the type of producer organization matters: member-based organization that only provide benefits to members is preferable to broader community-based organizations. The type of commodity is also significant. Barrett (2008) highlights how producer organizations have improved smallholder engagement with firms for cash crops, especially dairy and horticulture. On the contrary, there is limited evidence of successful producer organization intermediation for staple-food crops. Bernard (2010) concludes that poor small farmers are not well-represented in staple-food producer organisations as the costs of membership are prohibitive.

Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries. World Bank, 2013, Growing Africa. Unlocking the Potential of Agriculture, General background document on issues in our research matrix, World Bank, New York. Huang, J. & Reardon, T., 2008, Patterns in and determinants and effects of farmers' marketing strategies in developing countries. Regoverning Markets Small-scale producers in modern agrifood markets, Meta-analysis of evaluations, IIED, London. Barrett, C., 2008, Smallholder market participation: Concepts and evidence from Eastern and Southern Africa, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Food Policy 33, USAID, Washington DC. Bernard, T., D.J. Spielman, A. S. Taffesse, & E. Gabre-Madhin, 2010, Cooperatives for Staple Crop Marketing: Evidence from Ethiopia, Impact evaluation, Research Monographs, International Food Policy Research Institute, Washington DC.

2) *Ensure that associations, cooperatives, IE groups are provided with organisation management, and conflict mitigation capacity strengthening* in accordance with their needs. Ensure that community participation is well aligned based on a capacity needs analysis.

The evaluation team found that, regardless of the training on business development and marketing, the numerous groups formed such as Village Committees, Cooperatives and Water Associations are yet to be capacitated in terms of organization management, conflict mitigation and comprehending the concept of development altogether. During the field visits the evaluation noticed seeds of conflict between members, the absence of women's involvement in VDCs and their continued dependence on the project to sustain most of the activities. Unfortunately, the absence of a community development approach and strategy within the IFSP- Kassala, has affected the achievement of a positive outcome. Actually, during the implementation stage the project tended to be a service delivery project and hence neglected community participation and capacity building.

Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.

<sup>28</sup> Note that while agriculture as such is commonly not considered part of the IE, agriculture is a form of livelihoods work. The marketing aspects, stock keeping, food processing and other aspects are commonly directly or closely linked to the IE. As a consequence, it is important to keep agriculture GP and LL in mind when discussing the IE.

Some members of organizations did develop their basic leadership capacity through training in management, book keeping and benefited from visits to fish production areas for fishermen and to oil processing companies for sunflower farmers.

3) Note that *developing self-confidence and communication skills* should be an essential part of most women's economic empowerment actions.

The evaluators agree that the success of Farmer Field School (FFS) was evident. The evaluators met 10 graduates, they shared their newly acquired learning with details and were keen on showing how they have applied these on their farms and improved production. The FFS graduates have not only improved farming practices, but also their confidence levels and communication. It was highly recommended that the "Community Field Days" are regularly convened, so as to keep on clearing doubts and encouraging new grantees among fellow farmers.

Khot, Seemantinee, 2014, Mid-term evaluation of food security through enhanced agricultural production, diversified sources of income, value addition and marketing in Bangladesh (Mymensingh/Sherpur), Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.

4) Ensure *balance between soft skills and higher-qualified technical skills* in order to provide a more fruitful spectrum of opportunities to newly-trained workforce. Soft skills may include providing customer service, leadership, conflict resolution and good teamwork.

Through several questionnaires and interviews, the evaluation found that the employers greatly appreciated Akazi Kanoze graduates in relation to their "soft skills". The soft skills that graduates developed, such as customer service, leadership, conflict resolution and teamwork, were commended by employers in all sectors, and particularly in those involving contact with the public. Graduates were perceived as being distinguished from their peers by stronger communication and relationship skills by 86% of employers, and an equal percentage also viewed the Akazi Kanoze Work Readiness certificate as holding significant value when considering an applicant for a position at their place of business. Then, all interviewed employers had strong praise for the quality of the Akazi Kanoze graduates and their work ethics, remarking on their discipline and tendency to work hard. The participants themselves observed that they had gained confidence in themselves and had gained a variety of skills that would enable them to thrive in society. Employers also appreciated the technical skills of graduates of food preparation, security and construction (particularly when the employers had direct involvement and actively partnered in determining the content of the skills development), with the exception of technical capabilities in the areas of Information and Communication Technology and automobile repair that were not sufficiently developed to interest employers in the sector on the scale anticipated. Graduates with training in auto mechanics and electricity were considered to have good basic skills but lacked expertise. Similarly, an employer within the catering unit of a hotel noted that graduates had a minimum level of qualification but required considerable on-the-job training.

McLellan, Iain & Bamwesigye, Jackson, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Akazi Kanoze Youth Livelihoods Project (Rwanda), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

5) Take the *political balance and motivations already in existence in the local context into account* when supporting the identification of Village Based Organisations leaders. While communities should identify their own leaders, projects/programmes need to be aware and support selection criteria that will help avoid individuals from monopolising leadership positions for personal purposes only. Promote inclusion of women in leadership positions.

<p>Evaluation concludes that the selection of leaders has not taken into account the likelihood of political vested interests or interference. As a result self-nomination seems to have crept in some politically motivated individuals. Developing a local leadership cadre is a good idea but the selection process could were better thought through. Faith in democratic functioning, sensitivity, inclusiveness, knowledge and information about government schemes could were given more importance. Though, the component of capacity building of Village Based Organisations leaders needs to be planned more elaborately and comprehensively than it is.</p>	<p>Khot, Seemantinee, 2014, Mid-term evaluation of food security through enhanced agricultural production, diversified sources of income, value addition and marketing in Bangladesh (Mymensingh/Sherpur), Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.</p>
<p>Evaluation expressed concerns that if farmer organisations established from Farmer Field School could turn into exclusive clubs for the village elite, possibly leading to increased polarisation and exclusion of the poorest households and women. Limited absorption capacity in the Board and obligations of payment of regular membership fees are barriers for the poorest FFS members, including many women, to become members of the farmer organisations. It is thus recommended that current procedures and criteria for selection of participants for FFS and membership of farmer organisations be reconsidered, in view of the potential risk for exclusion of groups of women and men from participating in FFS/farmer organisation related activities.</p>	<p>Schwensen, Carl &amp; Laurence, Alida, 2011, Evaluation of the Farmer Field School Approach in the Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II, Bangladesh, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Project: Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II (ASPS II), Bangladesh.</p>

### 3.5. Microfinance

**Indicators:** a) Key GP and LL on micro finance in IE identified.

b) Challenges on micro finance in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on micro finance. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation on micro finance and determine if/how these were overcome.

*1) Take into account substantial insights that can affect microfinance provision success:*

- Provision of a broad range of micro finance products including package with diversified interest rates and loan periods
- Women's specific finance needs and habits at different life cycle moments and in accordance with their physical mobility opportunities (some are able to be more mobile than others)
- Identification of innovative ways of reaching borrowers, especially in remote, rural areas and/or where they have low education levels. E.g. example from Malawi where a biometric smart card is used that enables non-literate customers can open and manage a savings account using only their fingerprints for identification.

<p>In the design of loan packages to heterogeneous clients including women, innovative ways of meeting client's needs should be explored, such as by varying interests and loan periods Karlan and Zinman (2007) worked with a South African lender, using randomized interest rate offers to over 50,000 clients. The analysis found that offering different rates and loan conditions had a strong bearing on clients demand for credit. Changing the duration of the loan, affected the size of the loan requested. This would assist women who need a longer duration of loan, dependent on the gestation of the crop.</p>	<p>Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and</p>
--	---



	<p>Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.</p> <p>Karlan, D., &amp; Zinman, J., 2007, Credit Elasticities in Less-Developed Economies: Implications for Microfinance, Thematic Evaluation, American Economic Review, 98(3): 1040-68 AEAWeb.</p> <p>2 &amp; 4) Stuart, G., Ferguson, M. &amp; Cohen, M., 2011, Microfinance &amp; Gender: Some Findings from the Financial Diaries in Malawi, Final project/program report, Microfinance Opportunities, Washington.</p>
<p>Policymakers often prescribe that microfinance institutions increase interest rates to eliminate their reliance on subsidies. This strategy makes sense if the poor are rate insensitive: then micro-lenders increase profitability (or achieve sustainability) without reducing the poor's access to credit. The study tested the assumption of price inelastic demand using randomized trials conducted by a consumer lender in South Africa. The demand curves are downward sloping, and steeper for price increases relative to the lender's standard rates. We also find that loan size is far more responsive to changes in loan maturity than to changes in interest rates, which is consistent with binding liquidity constraints.</p> <p>Innovative ways of reaching clients are often needed, when clients are rural, remote and often have low education levels. Opportunity International's bank in Malawi (OIBM) has used creative ways to reach its clients. They offer a biometric smart card that enables illiterate customers to open and manage a savings account using only their fingerprints for identification. Then, they have developed a mobile banking van which visits villages on certain days of the week for men and women to use</p>	<p>Stuart, G., Ferguson, M. &amp; Cohen, M., 2011, Microfinance &amp; Gender: Some Findings from the Financial Diaries in Malawi, Final project/program report, Microfinance Opportunities, Washington.</p>
<p>Women's life cycle and their priorities and circumstances also need to be taken account of when targeting credit. In addition financial services should offer opportunities to save. Meinzen – Dick and Quisumbing (2012) argue that women should not be locked into micro-finance alone – but need to a 'ladder' of finance. Women also need access to more ways of making and receiving payments such as through mobile phones. This is particularly important for situations where women's mobility is restricted, and women rely on family and friends to access banks and markets. An internet search found no papers or impact studies regarding disaggregated use of mobile banking.</p>	<p>Alkire, S., Meinzen-Dick, R., Peterman, A., Quisumbing, A., Seymour, G., and Vaz, A., 2013, The Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OPHI Working Paper.58, OPHI (Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative), Oxford.</p>

2) Consider that *different and adapted types of micro finance services may need to be designed* in line with specific socio-cultural, political contexts. Verify the specific situation prior to planning new projects and avoid simple replication of methods used in other settings. Develop appropriate strategies for each situation in advance.

<p>The evaluation indicated that the project's "Zahra" micro finance product consisted of specialised operations, products, and distribution mechanisms are required to reach and retain certain target groups like women. In Afghanistan, adaptations of financial products are needed to comply with local culture and to gain acceptance by both male and female members of society.</p>	<p>Mucheru-Karuri, Margaret; Krebs, Johann; Siddiqi, Abdul Bari, 2015, Final Performance Evaluation: Agricultural Credit Enhancement (Ace) Program in Afghanistan, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
<p>The evaluation noted that widening financial intermediation by reaching new markets or sectors requires appropriate strategies or innovative products that address these markets. The project was expected to increase outreach to agriculture and the lagging rural regions but the design did not include any strategies for doing so either through innovative products or any region specific approaches that addressed the risks of serving/ developing these markets.</p>	<p>Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2014, Project Performance, Assessment Report Ghana Rural Financial Services Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC.</p>

3) When supporting the development of micro finance systems, *verify if introduction of any of the services will compete for the same market segment as existing service providers*. If this is the case, consider redesigning the project to take this into account.

It was found in the evaluation that informal community based organisations and the formal Rural and Community Banks both competed for the same market segment and were not in complementary roles was not taken into consideration.	Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2014, Project Performance, Assessment Report Ghana Rural Financial Services Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC.
The evaluation noted that credit programs not thrive in grant funded development environments but this was ignored in the project design.	Resseguie, Robert; Hendricks, Larry; Nizami, Zareef; Paaneez, Waheedullah, 2011, Mid-Term Evaluation of Rural Finance and Cooperative Development Program- RUFCOD (Afghanistan), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

4) Note that analysis shows that *linking NGOs together with banks or Micro Finance institutions is more likely to be associated with success* (as opposed to delivering programs solely through banks or Micro Finance institutions).

The meta analysis concluded that, compared to having multiple agencies involved in program delivery, the programs delivered solely through banks or Micro Finance Institutes which are less likely to be associated with program success. NGOs are associated, though weakly, with better performance. This finding suggests that programs could work better when delivered by providers that have strong connections with the beneficiaries and are familiar with local contexts.	Cho, Yoonyoung; Honorati, Maddalena, 2013, Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries: A Meta Regression Analysis, Meta-analysis of evaluations, World Bank Human Development Network Social protection and Labor Unit, Washington DC.
--	---

5) Ensure that there is always *sufficient training of implementing agencies and their staff* so that micro loans are well managed.

The evaluation indicated that evolving credit funds were less efficient than expected because of insufficient training and weak management of micro-loans.	Indonesia Urban Poverty Project FE - World Bank 2015
--	--

6) Ensure that projects *promote realistic expectations of the benefits of micro finance groups* and services to avoid discouragement of members. Ensure that members understand that it takes time for their activities to grow even if micro finance or other support is provided.

The evaluation found that, despite the overall positive functioning of the Village Savings and Loan Association (VSLA) groups, most members indicated that they felt disappointed that they were not been able to increase their incomes as much as they would have liked. One possible explanation for the disappointment is that the VSLA members had unrealistic expectations at the start of the project. It takes time to build well-functioning VSLAs, especially using mechanisms where no kick-starter funds are provided from the project to help the group grow quickly.	Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.
--	--

7) Note that analysis shows that *access to credit probably plays a greater role in improving business performance* than training. Training alone is, however, still strongly associated with business performance of youth and higher education individuals, especially in the studies where business training was provided for these entrepreneurs.



The meta analysis concluded that, access to credit probably plays a greater role in improving business performance than training. That being said, training alone is strongly associated with business performance of youth and higher education individuals, especially in the studies where business training was provided for these entrepreneurs.

Cho, Yoonyoung;Honorati, Maddalena, 2013, Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries: A Meta Regression Analysis, Meta-analysis of evaluations, World Bank Human Development Network Social protection and Labor Unit, Washington DC.

8) *Design easy credit facilities supporting entrepreneurs to start/expand their business.* Interest free loans can work better than grants, since they break the dependency of micro-finance institutions upon international donors, besides bringing accountability for beneficiaries themselves.

The evaluation concludes that the presence of a credit facility to support trained entrepreneurs to start/expand or diversify their business was a valuable tool to complement the technical assistance provided by UNIDO. The inclusion of a loan facility within the EDIP (Enterprise Development and Investment Promotion) served not only to finance the expansion of the existing client's businesses but helped ease the transition of EDIP clients from small businesses to mid-size enterprises beyond the life of the EDIP program. Beyond the EDIP program the establishment of the facility was the first in Iraq to partner a UN technical assistance program with an Iraqi lending institution. Then, UNIDO's decision to adopt an interest free loan as opposed to a grant to the implementing institution was a timely move towards breaking the dependency of micro-finance institutions upon international donors and also brings in accountability. Interest free loans are an interim solution between grants that are often provided during start up years and accessing financing on the international markets, which still remains difficult considering the high perceived risks associated with Iraq and the on-going credit shortage as a result of the international financial crisis.

UNIDO, 2015, Productive work for youth in Armenia – supporting young entrepreneurs, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

9) *Where a project is carried out in a fragile context, determine the usefulness of implementing a credit programmes.* Verify whether the locations are ready to receive the services and implementation is practical and feasible.

The evaluation determined that the design of the project has worked well with the exception of location. The primary emphasis was to bring development in behind a military surge – a clearing action. This environment was not conducive for a credit program that requires an extended time frame and staff mobility to reach sustainability. When designing and approving credit projects to be located in an insecure environment, careful consideration needs to be given to the range of implementation and monitoring activities that can realistically be undertaken in support of such programs. In addition, credit programs will not thrive in grant funded development environments. It was further noted that, although credit programs, can be established as successful systems to provide access to credit, they require support and subsidy for a longer period of time than in a normal development environment. Security is a key aspect of this success, so that as military progress moves from 'clear' to 'hold' and 'build' in these areas, and as grant funded programs are reduced, the climate for employing credit for business and livelihood development improves. Therefore, for these credit initiatives to prosper in this milieu, longer term commitments of funding and TA support are required.

Resseguie, Robert; Hendricks, Larry; Nizami, Zareef; Paaeez, Waheedullah, 2011, Mid-Term Evaluation of Rural Finance and Cooperative Development Program- RUFCOD (Afghanistan), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

10) *Support development of appropriate laws/regulations for inspection of the functioning of credit unions and similar micro finance institutions.*

<p>The evaluation indicated that, with operational regulations necessary for the credit network, such as legitimate supervision and inspection, the cooperative law/regulation is urgently needed to build an even more solid credit network. At some point in every credit union system, a specific law to manage the emerging system is needed.</p>	<p>Resseguie, Robert; Hendricks, Larry; Nizami, Zareef; Paaeez, Waheedullah, 2011, Mid-Term Evaluation of Rural Finance and Cooperative Development Program-RUFCOD (Afghanistan), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
---	--

### *11) Improve micro-finance access through multiple approaches:*

- Support openness for entry of new commercial players and investors into the micro finance sector
- Advocate for more enabling government policy and regulations
- Facilitate access to technological innovations related to Micro Finance for people dependent on the IE. This would include electronic banking such as SMS-based banking, electronic point of sale devices in retail outlets and ATM's.

<p>The evaluation stresses that access of poor people to financial services has become the focus of increasing political, business and development attention in Kenya over the last five years. Despite its modest direct impact reached so far, micro-finance continues to receive considerable attention from donors and more significantly and increasingly from the government. The micro-finance sector in the country is changing and new commercial players are entering the lower-income segment of the market, backed by new investments, increasing competition and bringing economies of scale, lower costs of funds and introducing new practices and products. Change has also been brought about by a more enabling government policy and regulations of the financial sector. Technological innovation has also been a major driver too, permitting the spread of electronic banking, such as SMS-based banking, electronic point of sale devices in retail outlets and ATM's across the country.</p> <p>In parallel to mainstream banks entering the low-income market segment, three of the more successful NGO Microfinance providers (KWFT, Faulu Kenya and SMEP) have transformed into regulated Deposit Taking Microfinance Institutions. Driven by the quest to mobilize deposits and grow in scale and professionalisation, to enable them to offer a fuller range of financial products. Investors have also discovered opportunities to earn a return in micro-finance. Six Deposit Taking Microfinance Institutions were established by such investors.</p>	<p>Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet &amp; Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.</p>
---	---

*12) Promote training on financial education of people dependent on the IE, including on accessing and using micro finance and other financial services to obtain the most economic benefits. Specifically this may include support the training of micro finance and other financial service providers to strengthen their capacities to provide effective services to people dependent on the IE. For example:*

- Customer care
- Treasury and credit management
- Internal control
- Check clearing.

<p>The evaluation noted that, when working with migrant workers and their families on, for instance, financial education directly supports migrant workers to better manage their finances when they are overseas. It also helps migrant communities to address the poverty that is such a large factor in why people migrate in the first place.</p>	<p>Mauer, Ralf, 2013, Decent work results and effectiveness of ILO technical cooperation: a meta-analysis of project evaluations, 2011–2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The evaluation found that strategic business plans were developed for 15 selected rural and community banks and three training manuals were developed. Ten rural and community banks reported putting their plans into action with a resultant increase in the number of micro-finance clients and size of micro-finance portfolios. All participating rural and community banks became operationally self-sufficient. Overall some 8,000 rural and community bank staff were provided training in customer care, treasury and credit management, anti-money laundering, internal controls and check clearing. Some 468 Micro-Finance Institutions received training, as compared to a target of 500, of which about 348 received training more than once. In addition, 17 good practice training manuals were developed that could be used by future generations of trainers.</p>	<p>Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2014, Project Performance, Assessment Report Ghana Rural Financial Services Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC.</p>

13) Strengthen knowledge and *capabilities of community members on various savings methods* and encourage them to save as a pre-condition for further support.

<p>The evaluation found that, to facilitate access to finance, the project introduced and promoted approaches such as merry-go-round, piggy banks, individual savings and enterprise incubation funds in the training modules. All groups are trained on saving methods and encouraged to start savings as a pre-condition for further support. Although some of the groups that were started before they were referred to the project were involved in saving, the survey conducted to evaluate the impact shows that 91% of the members of the groups had started saving. The survey also shows that in 2010 when the programme started, 75% of the savers were in small category, 17% in medium and 8% in large. By 2013 the majority of savers were in medium category (54%), while those in large category increased to 10% and those in small decreasing to 35 %.</p>	<p>Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet &amp; Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.</p>
---	---

14) *Combine financial education and life skills training* with financial services to increase impact of support to young people dependent on the IE.

<p>Several studies noted that inclusion of education such as financial education and life skills training combined with financial services for young people can have a positive impact, including improved savings.</p>	<p>IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.</p> <p>IPA. 2014. Evidence on Child and Youth Savings. New Haven, Connecticut: Innovations for Poverty Action (IPA).</p> <p>Jamison, J.C., D. Karlan, and J. Zinman. 2014. Financial Education and Access to Savings Accounts: Complements or Substitutes? Evidence from Ugandan Youth Clubs. NBER Working Paper Series, Working Paper 20135. Cambridge, Massachusetts: National Bureau of Economic Research.</p>
---	--

15) Consider the *development of special loan products for women* in line with their specific needs.

The evaluation noted the benefit of a locally adapted special women's loan product called Zahra that caters specifically to female farmers and agribusiness entrepreneurs.

Mucheru-Karuri, Margaret; Krebs, Johann; Siddiqi, Abdul Bari, 2015, Final Performance Evaluation: Agricultural Credit Enhancement (Ace) Program in Afghanistan, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

16) When supporting the development of credit programs, *develop core branches first in urban areas*, test and learn from them as they solidify their services. Use successful offices to support the development of more risky branches in rural/urban areas.

The evaluation noted that the growth of credit programs has generally followed a pattern that begins with core branches in urban areas and, as the operations solidify, moves out to more rural areas. This allows the credit program to establish successful offices that in turn can support the development of more risky branches in rural/urban areas.

Resseguie, Robert; Hendricks, Larry; Nizami, Zareef; Paaeez, Waheedullah, 2011, Mid-Term Evaluation of Rural Finance and Cooperative Development Program-RUFCOD (Afghanistan), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

17) Foster the use of *enterprise incubation funds* since it can efficiently target and support economic activities that need financial support.

According to the evaluation, the project's Enterprise Incubation Fund was an important tool for supporting emerging groups and group members to start and expand their enterprises. As set out by the Hand in Hand's website, the enterprise incubation fund provided poor people with loans and not grant, acting as a catalyst for enhancing group and individual saving that improve on financial access in the rural areas. The project ensured that the fund was only benefiting the poor who had no chance of accessing financial services from the formal or informal service players. Targeting is important because if it is wrongly targeted, then there are likelihoods that there will be market distortion in the sector and moreover, the intended target group will miss out. The evaluation recommends that, in order to promote further expansion of the enterprises being undertaken by the groups, the incubation fund supports small and medium enterprises with strong backward linkages to beneficiary economic activities.

Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet & Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.

18) Find innovative ways to *increase the potential of small loans*, such as encouraging borrowers to share what they receive for the development of local cooperatives. By doing so, borrowers may enhance and share their income with their community, narrowing the likelihood of large individual losses at the same time. Consider *options such as stocking rice or other commodities to form a form of saving safety net* for community members where this may be appropriate. That is, not all savings needs to be in the form of money, especially when working with the poorest.

Within the IFRC's project in Sichuan, the evaluation identified a creative practice of loan use through cooperative development. Some of the loan borrowers joined village cooperatives to develop their products and improve market power (even though their business - walnut trees and kiwi fruit trees - had not started to make profit because the trees had not borne fruit yet when the evaluation was written). The labour was shared among the members, so that a larger plantation could be achieved. The questionnaire survey and the farmer small group discussions both showed that the loan beneficiaries were very excited about the development of their cooperatives: all the cooperative members and the village leaders were quite confident about their promising future. It is recommended that such cooperative practices be encouraged among new loan borrowers in the future.

Zeng, Meng, 2013, Impact Evaluation of the Small Loan Component of IFRC/RCSC Livelihood Recovery Project In Sichuan, Impact evaluation, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, Geneva.

Rice banks were considered an extremely useful safety net for the poorest (the one observed was still functioning and widely used).

Barca, Valentina; Riemenschneider, Nils, 2012, Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund – DELTA 1 Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Multi Donor Livelihood and Food Security Trust Fund (LIFT), Myanmar

19) Provide *training follow-up services and analyse the training or technical support* on micro finance that beneficiaries need for success.

The evaluation covered training and small loans on earthquake-affected families in China, who were extremely poor and vulnerable, especially after being relocated and losing land. These families could not obtain loans from the bank because the bank did not consider charitable assistance in their financial operations. Therefore, the families would not have had start-up funds to do any business if it were not for the project's small loans. In some cases training follow-up and small loan beneficiary monitoring had not been conducted thoroughly. In general, to ensure income increase, constant monitoring of the beneficiary families needs to be done to identify their new development needs. Based on these needs, the project team needs to provide the beneficiary families with technical support accordingly. The evaluation data shows that the project team did monitor the families, but focused more on finding out the changes and improvements that the beneficiaries had made after the loans.

Zeng, Meng, 2013, Impact Evaluation of the Small Loan Component of IFRC/RCSC Livelihood Recovery Project In Sichuan, Impact evaluation, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, Geneva.

20) Ensure that the size of *individual loans in a micro finance project* are sufficient to actually make a difference with regard to investment possibilities for viable enterprises.

The evaluation noted that, in regard to the size of individual loans, beneficiaries felt that they were usually too small to invest in viable enterprises.

Samaranayake, Mallika R.; Velupillai, Krishna, 2011, Mid- term Evaluation of : "Socio-economic recovery in the North and East" under the UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) 2008-2012 (Sri Lanka), Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, New York.

21) Make long-term *repeated application for loans accessible to everyone* with reasonable pre-condition criteria. Giving the opportunity to re-apply for a loan only to those entrepreneurs who have showed high growth in a short time is not conducive to strengthening. New firms may actually need more time to develop and become eligible for new loan facilities.

The evaluation draws attention to the rules for lending to Armenian young entrepreneurs. In accordance with the regulations of the Government of Armenia, an individual youth entrepreneur can access a start-up loan only once, irrespective of the amount granted. This implies that certain segments of the youth entrepreneurs are likely to face difficulties to realize their growth potential. In fact, youth entrepreneurs showing potential for strong and comparatively quick growth will be supported to further develop their business plan to apply for an additional loan from another loan facility, the SME Development National Centre. Most youth entrepreneurs will show potential for moderate but stable growth which is not sufficient for approval of additional loans from the loan facility. The evaluation states it is highly recommended to look into the possibility of revising laws and regulations (possibly on a pilot basis) to allow all approved youth entrepreneurs to apply for loans in several steps.

UNIDO, 2015, Productive work for youth in Armenia – supporting young entrepreneurs, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

22) Encourage the *growth of a good savings balance after* accounts are opened as it is critical for business sustainability.

The analysis found that encouraging the growth of savings balances after accounts are opened is critical for sustainability. While account opening by youth is a significant hurdle in itself, encouraging young people to continue depositing into their account and grow their savings balance is just as challenging and important.

IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.

23) Provide guidelines *clearly defining the loan repayment mechanisms, setting the most suitable amount and length of loans* for different types and scale of businesses. Ensure that all stakeholders are well aware of the guidelines and how they apply to the different types of recipients.

The evaluation noted that, in some cases, loans were not sufficiently large and/or the loans were not adequate or needed longer repayment periods. The evaluation team noted that it might better if the loan mechanisms address the needs of different types of businesses while clearly identifying the loan conditions in line with actual needs.

Zeng, Meng, 2013, Impact Evaluation of the Small Loan Component of IFRC/RCSC Livelihood Recovery Project In Sichuan, Impact evaluation, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, Geneva.

24) In designing micro finance programming with youth, *take a life cycle approach* to develop approaches that are relevant and appropriate at different stages and transitions of a young person's life.

The analysis indicated that financial needs and uses of financial services evolve over a person's lifetime. A life cycle approach can help design projects that are relevant and appropriate at different stages and transitions of a young person's life. This includes designing financial products for different life stages (starting with savings for minors) and for different rural financial needs (farm and non-farm).

Kasprowicz, P., and E. Rhyne. 2012. Looking through the Demographic Window: Implications for Financial Inclusion. Washington, D.C.: Center for Financial Inclusion at Accion. In: IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.

25) *Invest in innovations and share the successes of youth* access to a variety of financial services while also building the capacity of financial service providers to design and deliver viable financial products for rural youth.

There is a clear need to invest in innovations and share the successes of youth access to a variety of financial services while also building the capacity of financial service providers to design and deliver viable financial products for rural youth.

IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.



26) Be aware in designing micro finance support with *young people that they often do save and/or borrow already*. Their sources of income might be small and irregular. When they save they often do so in unsafe places. They borrow, most often informally, to start a business but also to continue with their education. They want access to formal financial services that can better meet their growing needs.

1) The analysis indicates that young people do have access to money, though their sources of income might be small and irregular; they do save, often irregularly and in unsafe places; they do borrow, most often informally, to start a business or continue with their education; and they do want access to formal financial services that can better meet their growing needs. Market research studies and demonstration projects conducted over the past several years across different continents have demonstrated that youth do have the capacity to save (SEEP, 2013).	IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome. SEEP. 2013. Understanding Youth and Their Financial Needs. Washington, D.C.: SEEP.
Even in rural areas where young people have limited and irregular access to money, young people can save enough money over time to buy small assets, such as livestock.	Gash, M. 2014. The Impact of Integrated Financial Services for Young People in Mali. Davis, California, USA: Freedom from Hunger.

27) When designing programming for micro finance with *youth, promote the establishment and tapping into formal savings accounts prior to using other types of financial services*, especially loans. This savings-first approach builds young people's capacity and confidence in using formal financial services and serves as a basis for building assets for the future.

The analysis showed that prior experience indicated that young people need to tap into formal savings accounts prior to using other types of financial services, especially loans. This savings-first approach builds young people's capacity and confidence in using formal financial services and serves as a basis for building assets for the future.	Erulkar, A., J. Bruce, A. Dondo, J. Sebstad, J. Matheka, A. Khan, and A. Gathuku. 2006. Tap and Reposition (TRY): Providing Social Support, Savings, and Microcredit Opportunities for Young Women in Areas with High HIV Prevalence. Seeds Series. Nairobi: Population Council. Kilara, T., and A. Latortue, 2012. Emerging Perspectives on Youth Savings. Focus Note 82. Washington, D.C.: CGAP. Kilara, T., B. Magnoni, and E. Zimmerman. 2014. The Business Case for Youth Savings: A Framework. Focus Note 96 in: IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.
---	---

28) Note when designing programming that *assist migrant youth that it is useful to support them with access to adequate financial instruments*, such as affordable and cost-effective remittance products.



This can benefit the economic development of their communities of origin and lead to long-term productive capacities.

The analysis indicated that, for youth who migrate, having access to adequate financial instruments, such as affordable and cost-effective remittance products, can benefit the economic development of their communities of origin and lead to long-term productive capacities.

Global Migration Group, 2014, Migration and Youth – Challenges and Opportunities, Meta-analysis of evaluations, United Nations Children's Fund, online publication.

29) Be aware that there is emerging evidence that *youth have the capacity to repay loans and that youth loans are not riskier than adult loans*.

The analysis indicated that there is emerging evidence that youth have the capacity to repay loans and that youth loans are not riskier than adult loans. The authors noted that youth loans continue to be very limited. Despite some of the innovations and emerging evidence on the viability of youth loans, FSPs remain reluctant to offer youth loans at scale because youth are still perceived as being too risky. This creates a vicious cycle, where a lack of large demonstration projects prevents more extensive evaluations of effective mechanisms for offering credit to young people.

IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.

### 3.6. Vocational education/skills training

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on vocational/skills training in IE identified.

b) Challenges on Vocational/skills training in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

c) Appropriateness of types of vocational/skills training with regard to enhancing livelihoods analysed. (i.e., are the types of training in line with local needs)

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on vocational/skills training. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation on vocational/skills training and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) When planning a Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) programme, *conduct an internal review of Government priorities about labour market* and economic diversification. Labour market assessments are needed to identify viable economic sectors for private sector development, the human resource requirements within the market and the appropriate training packages. The objective is to align the TVET system more closely with the requirements and dynamics of the market, as well as to the needs of an economic diversification strategy.

The evaluation stated that UNIDO's VET Programme (MISP V) in Iraq was mainly addressed to promote economic diversification, emerged as core Government priority. To meet Government needs, the programme was focused on Small and Medium Enterprises (SME). SMEs smooth the transition from predominantly agricultural economies to more urban, industrial economies by providing for accessible value-adding processing activities. SMEs succeeded in creating employment. Generally, SMEs showed a higher level of business activity and income and were better positioned to take advantage of improvements to the overall economy. Growth in

Al Allaf, Riyadh; Gairdner, David; Mandelik, Florence, 2012, Promotion of micro industries for accelerated and sustainable livelihood recovery – Ninewa Governorate of Iraq (MISP-V), Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

business resulted in a creation of employment, with the large majority of positions being full time. Importantly, employment creation extended beyond immediate extended family networks and included recruitment from the general labour market. The majority of SME owners were also making their own investments in upgrading business facilities and infrastructure, with the effects of leveraging the MISIP V contribution, further expanding operations and improving sustainability.	
The evaluation found that skill training for the benefit of youth did not provide strong evidence for either an increase in income or for better job opportunities. Those who have started their business were appreciated by local people in terms of small repairs and tyre mending. However the low frequency of such demand is inadequate for significant or sustainable increase of income. In fact, the location of youth activities in villages, other than Khashm al-Girba, makes their presence a service to the community more than to the business holder due to the limited demand. The ratio between investing in one youth as compared to the expected outcome in terms of income generation is not economically feasible in opportunity cost terms.	Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.

2) In project design take into account that *not all youth have the inclination or aptitude to become self-employed*, so any type of training needs to be sensitive to youth preferences and capacities. Determine preference for self-employment or employment working for others when enrolling youth in programmes. Be aware that their preferences may also change over time.

The meta analysis indicated that there is consensus that not all youth have the inclination or aptitude to become self-employed, so any type of training needs to be sensitive to youth preferences and capacities	IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.
--	---

3) *Distinguish between home-based income and market-based employment objectives*. Expand the repertoire of courses and options for trainees in both.

The evaluation identified the need to distinguish between home-based income and market-based employment objectives, and expand the repertoire of courses and options for women in both.	Gairdner, David; Al-Allaf, Riyadh; Mandelik, Florence, 2013, Independent Evaluation, The Republic Of Iraq, Evaluation of Micro Enterprises for Reintegration of Internally Displaced Persons in Thi Qar Governorate, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
---	---

4) Explore a range of methods to *determine types of skill sets needed in the labour market*. Aside from labour force surveys this can include surveying companies and Corporate Social Responsibility programs to understand the skill-sets that are needed.

LabourNet carries out an assessment of the labour force demand by surveying companies and CSR programs to understand the skill- sets that they need.	ACUMEN - Cartier Charitable Foundation, International Center for Research on Women, 2015, Women And Social Enterprises: How Gender Integration Can Boost Entrepreneurial Solutions to Poverty, General background document on issues in our research matrix, ACUMEN, New York
--	---

5) Carefully review and *plan the implementation steps of a TVET programme and ensure that these are well organised* to avoid implementation delays. Note that any significant delays may result in loss of momentum and poor results.

<p>The evaluation note the problems of implementation delays in the Kosovo VET Programme. The teaching material was supposed to be ready for printing early enough to be available for the next academic year. Purchase of complementary teaching material was scheduled to be initiated once development of the new curriculum and learning material had been finalised. Unfortunately, the required material arrived very late, and most of the planned practical teacher training was dependent on the provision of teaching materials. The big challenge in relation to the components intervention logic is that each element is to some extent dependent on the timely delivery of other inputs to work properly. Thus, there is a significant risk, therefore, that delays in implementation of some activities would cause general delays and inefficiencies at the overall component level.</p>	<p>Orbicon A/S; GHK Consulting Limited; Pinto Consulting GmbH, 2011, Evaluation of the Danish Neighbourhood Programme with a focus on the Economic Development Portfolio, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Armenia, Kosovo, Serbia.</p>
--	---

6) Ensure the TVET and training is *sufficiently tailored to local contexts* and the needs of participants so that participants can implement what they learned easily in the local situation.

<p>The evaluation noted two persistent weaknesses: the TVET course was too general with insufficient tailoring and; the course contents was not easy to adapt to the local context. The programme was perceived as very broad and covered not only active labour market policies, but also prerequisites for an efficient active labour market policy, for example systems for labour market information and labour market forecasting and systems for a regular social dialogue. As a consequence many participants mentioned during interviews that they lacked a more in-depth study of their specific field.</p>	<p>Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.</p>
--	--

7) Include *emphasis on the establishment of linkages* between government training institutions, private training institutions and private sector operators in TVET projects.

<p>The evaluation found that the ILO has used its particular expertise to facilitate and support Private Public Partnerships. Technical vocational education and training reform (TVET-R) linkages were formed between Government and training institutions with Industry and assisted Industry Skills Councils to be established in the five industry sectors of leather and leather goods, transport equipment, agro-food processing, information technology, and tourism and hospitality.</p>	<p>Sustineo Pty Ltd (Ms Sue Allan and Ms Mary Mertin-Ryan, 2014, Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reform in Bangladesh (TVET-R) – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The evaluation indicated that the design phase did not develop an effective strategy for linking vocational training to either small business development opportunities or support for market entry. Some activities were identified in Project Inception Report results matrix. However, none of these were finally implemented, despite extensive discussion on some of them.</p> <p>The evaluation noted that the project had a highly effective vocational training intervention for vulnerable persons, successfully targeting women and youth. However, the project lacked the design or means to create livelihood opportunities or promote small business development.</p>	<p>Gairdner, David; Al-Allaf, Riadh; Mandelik, Florence, 2013, Independent Evaluation, The Republic Of Iraq, Evaluation of Micro Enterprises for Reintegration of Internally Displaced Persons in Thi Qar Governorate, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.</p>

8) Ensure that projects include implementation of *assistance with job referral in the project design*.

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

The evaluation noted that a roster for assisting trainees to find jobs or a job referral system has not been established as envisioned. Individual trainers have helped some of the students to find job placements but this has not been a formal part of the agreement with UNIDO.

UNIDO, 2015, Reintegration for Liberian Returnees through Skills Training and Job Creation, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

9) Ensure that all *TVET modules include clear learning objectives* and, if relevant, establish linkages to national qualifications networks.

The evaluation noted that the existing curricula are based on the national qualification framework for vocational training. To strengthen teaching and to optimise learning it is recommended to clearly identify and describe the learning objectives for each module.

Pringsulaka, Pamornrat, 2013, Enhancing Rural Access Project, Timor-Leste Independent Mid-Term Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

10) *Involve potential employers* in the project by asking them to review course content and mentor trainees.

The evaluation noted that, as a project engages with potential employers to see what jobs they might have to offer their graduates, they also ask them to look at the proposed course content, to mentor trainees, and to offer them internships when they graduate from the program.

Van de Velde, Martine, 2013, Skills Development and Employment Services for the Construction Sector in the Gaza Strip – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

11) *Study particularly successful TVET programmes* to identify their good practices for replication in new areas.

The vocational training of the Turquoise Mountain Institute has provided many young people, particularly those from poor socio-economic backgrounds, with some viable craft skills through which to make a living. Moreover, the vision with which the Turquoise Mountain initiative was founded has transformed a formerly derelict area of Kabul into a thriving community.

Lightfoot, Michael; Rose, Aimee; Wafeq, Mainsha; Kamal, Burhamuddin; Santos, Ronald, 2015, Final Performance Evaluation and Sustainability Assessment of the Building Livelihoods and Trade (BLT) Activity, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

12) Consider *including possible types of employment that are often not considered for TVET* such as sales service provider, security guard, IT sector, development of new products based on traditional crafts, and green jobs.

The evaluation noted that, in its first centre in Nairobi – it now has nine there – the project found that many hotels needed staff and security guards, and that the construction sector needs builders and electricians).

Evalpartners, 2015, Evaluations that make a difference, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Publication released by: EvalPartners; African Development Bank Group; IDB; EES, Covered countries: Sri Lanka, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Kenya, Mexico, Nepal, the Netherlands, Canada.

The evaluation recommend the training of women to join unconventional occupations like hospitality, ancient knots making, on line earning and new more marketable patterns in the hand woven cloth cottage industry.

Jafar, Salmar, 2013, Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

13) Provide *training with a specific session on doing job applications and strengthening of professional confidence*. Do not underestimate that lack of preparation and experience in applying for a job is one of the main challenges that prevent those in the unemployed workforce from finding an employment opportunity.

<p>According to the evaluation, Akazi Kanoze graduates were questioned in focus groups and telephone surveys regarding the value of the program in improving their ability to access economic opportunities. Increased technical and practical skills, strengthened professional confidence, greater preparation for the job seeking process, and an improved ability to create economic opportunities through entrepreneurial training were considered the main benefits of the Akazi Kanoze program. Among those surveyed by telephone, 96% either agreed (14%) or strongly agreed (82%) that Akazi Kanoze had increased their self-confidence in finding work.</p> <p>Graduates shared such remarks as “We are now prepared to apply [for jobs] and work,” “We learnt how to search for jobs,” and “I used to sit at home and wait to hear from friends about jobs, but now I have a CV and letters of recommendation.”</p>	<p>McLellan, Iain &amp; Bamwesigye, Jackson, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Akazi Kanoze Youth Livelihoods Project (Rwanda), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
--	---

14) Promote *use of locally available resources, building on already known techniques*, and training on non time-consuming skills. (This should not be to the exclusion of innovative products and services if there is a market for them).

<p>The evaluation noted particularly positive examples from the project: reference to locally available resources and already known techniques, the promotion of non time-consuming skills complementing traditional sources of income.</p>	<p>Wolterstorff, Paul, 2014, Final Evaluation of the Project Vocational Education and Training for Inclusive Growth of Tribal Communities in East Indian States of Jharkhand, West Bengal and Orissa, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.</p>
<p>The evaluation indicated that a concentration on already existing traditional occupations based on easily accessible resources in order to upgrade and upscale these occupations and concentration on “low hanging fruits” easily creating incremental income.</p>	<p>Wolterstorff, Paul, 2015, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Project Promote and Strengthen Enterprises and Market Systems in Drought-Prone ASAL Areas in Kenya, Midterm or interim evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.</p>
<p>The products were useful for own use and save the trainees money as a result but a linked lesson learned indicated that in some instances trainees found it difficult to procure inputs locally, found limited local market for their products and had difficulties competing with low priced Chinese products.</p>	<p>Barca, Valentina; Riemenschneider, Nils, 2012, Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund – DELTA 1 Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Multi Donor Livelihood and Food Security Trust Fund (LIFT), Myanmar.</p>

15) Include focus on *building relations with private sector* companies to ensure employment of younger less-educated workers post training.

16) In vocational training *include focus on a wide range of skills* including with the retail industry and other customer service areas.

17) Where resources allow, *provide the basic equipment necessary* to the trainees in the form of income generating ‘toolkits’ and provide support to access start-up capital.

18) *Engage in local procurement of tools and materials* for training in order to ensure greater project effectiveness in supporting the local economy.

The evaluation found that the program targeted a wide range of critical industry requirements. At the lower end of the scale, initiatives such as the Committed Youth component targeted younger, less-educated workers (who normally work in the informal economy) for work within the service industry—primarily retail and food services. The programme provides orientation, pre- selection, and training services for new workers. Having private sector companies offer employment to selected participants was crucial to the success of the model, attracting a relatively large number of youth job- seekers. Youth populations were trained to access and perform in jobs found across a broad spectrum of customer service environment	Cambronero, Sergio; Midling, Michael; Molina, Francisco, 2012, Mid-term Evaluation- USAID Improving Access to Employment Program in El Salvador, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
---	---

19) Ensure that training *includes both practical as well as theoretical aspects*. Projects on TVET should emphasise and directly include the establishment of effective connections between job training and job placements. This may specifically include supporting:

The establishment of direct interactions during training between potential employers and trainees/students

Job placement centres/services and raising the awareness of their staff of the existence of the TVET graduates.

The evaluation noted the need to make a direct, rapid and effective connection between job training/orientation and job placement.	Cambronero, Sergio; Midling, Michael; Molina, Francisco, 2012, Mid-term Evaluation- USAID Improving Access to Employment Program in El Salvador, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
In terms of achievements, the evaluation finds that the VET Component in Armenia is likely to achieve, and in some cases even surpass, the intended outputs. The available evidence suggests that the new colleges and VET courses, including the short-term vocational training for the unemployed, are resulting in better opportunities that lead to increased employment for the graduates. For example, discussions at the VET colleges visited suggest that ca. 70% of the graduates progress either to further education or employment in Vanadzor and ca. 50% in Hrazdan; this is reportedly a significantly higher rate than previous to the component interventions. This reduces the gaps seen as a result of closer connection and matching between demand (firms) and supply (trained students) leading to direct recruitment of graduates and involvement in course development (e.g. during the visit to one college, the graduation fashion show was being held). Local firms were participating in the evaluation panel, resulting in recruitment benefits for the firms in question as well as the graduating students. The creation of VET Councils and College Boards has resulted in new forms of public-private partnerships, including work placements and traineeships, at the local level.	Orbicon A/S; GHK Consulting Limited; Pinto Consulting GmbH, 2011, Evaluation of the Danish Neighbourhood Programme with a focus on the Economic Development Portfolio, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Armenia, Kosovo, Serbia
The evaluation determined that, when providing training, theoretical training also accompanied by hands on practical application was useful.	Hanafi, Hamouda B.; Pipe, Roger D., 2014, Final Performance Evaluation Of The Agriculture Program Of The Community Livelihoods Project (CLP), Final evaluation, USAID Washington, DC.
The evaluation noted that the trades and the companies that the evaluation team consulted would welcome an apprenticeship scheme with part-time attendance at a vocational training institute.	Lightfoot, Michael; Rose, Aimee; Wafeq, Mainsha; Kamal, Burhamuddin; Santos, Ronald, 2015, Final Performance Evaluation and Sustainability Assessment of the Building Livelihoods and Trade (BLT)



	Activity, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
The evaluation noted that the impact of the program was in part because of the six months of specific skills training provided in certain sectors or occupations in both the classroom and on the job.	Attanasio, Orazio; Kugler, Adriana; Meghi, Costas, 2011, Subsidizing Vocational Training for Disadvantaged Youth in Colombia: Evidence from a Randomized Trial, General background document on issues in our research matrix, American Economic Journal: Applied Economics 3 (July 2011): 188–220, American Economic Journal: Applied Economics, Nashville Tennessee.
	Attanasio, Orazio; Guarín, Arlen; Medina, Carlos; Meghir, Costas, 2015, Long Term Impacts of Vouchers for Vocational Training: Experimental Evidence For Colombia, Impact evaluation, National Bureau of Economic Research, Cambridge, MA, USA, impact evaluation on the project “Jovenes en Acción” (JeA), Colombia.
The evaluation noted that, though evidence of the relative importance of the classroom component vis a vis the work experience was lacking, they concluded that the combination of the two contributed to program success.	UNIDO, 2015, Reintegration for Liberian Returnees through Skills Training and Job Creation, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

20) Link trainees to a range of public and private sector experts who provide *expert training in innovative subjects not often considered for TVET programmes*.

The evaluation stated that the projects were able to make use of existing local and regional public and private sector expertise to deliver specialist training to grant beneficiaries. Examples include training on greenhouse techniques. This approach allowed delivering specific technical skills to some beneficiaries and increasing their knowledge and maximise their capacity to run their activities. The project linked-up beneficiaries to existing economic realities, including the private sector and increased efficiency by sourcing existing expertise from outside the project.	Mode, Matteo, 2014, Evaluation of ACF's Livelihood Projects in Abkhazia funded by UNHCR in 2011-2013, Final evaluation, ACF International, UNHCR, Geneva, Projects: 1) Vocational Training, Small Business start-up opportunities and promotion of Small-Holders' Association in Abkhazia, Samegrelo and Imereti - January-December 2011; 2) Support to livelihoods through agriculture and small business development - January-December 2012; 3) Improving self-reliance of vulnerable families through provision of IGA grants -January-December 2013 in Abkhazia (partially recognised as an independent state).
---	--

21) Promote and *provide support to obtain internship options for TVET graduates* so that they can acquire experience and come in contact with employers who may not always advertise jobs that are becoming available.

The evaluation noted that internships allowed both employers and workers to obtain information on each other. From the employers' side, the internships allow employers to acquire information on the quality of workers without having to commit with a written contract subject to the high dismissal costs in Colombia. From the workers' side, the internships provide information on jobs just becoming available that are not announced through formal channels, as well as information on what sort of skills are required for a job.	Attanasio, Orazio; Kugler, Adriana; Meghi, Costas, 2011, Subsidizing Vocational Training for Disadvantaged Youth in Colombia: Evidence from a Randomized Trial, General background document on issues in our research matrix, American Economic Journal: Applied Economics 3
--	--



	(July 2011): 188–220, American Economic Journal: Applied Economics, Nashville Tennessee.
--	--

22) *Include life skills and other training in TVET programming* as it is critical to help prepare graduates for jobs. The inclusion of life skills and other soft skills training will help ensure that they can build sufficient confidence to implement their technical skills.

One of the most striking findings of the evaluations included in the analysis was the critical role of life skills in preparing young people for jobs. Analysis findings suggest that life skills combined with technical skills help youth to build up sufficient confidence to feel as though they can use their technical skills.	Evalpartners, 2015, Evaluations that make a difference, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Publication released by: EvalPartners; African Development Bank Group; IDB; EES, Covered countries: Sri Lanka, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Kenya, Mexico, Nepal, the Netherlands, Canada
Program partners were able to experience first-hand the benefits of a training program that moves beyond occupational skills, focusing on the soft skills and customer service ethos that create the appropriate profile for the workforce requirements of the service sector.	Cambronero, Sergio; Midling, Michael; Molina, Francisco, 2012, Mid-term Evaluation- USAID Improving Access to Employment Program in El Salvador, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
The evaluation determined quality of the graduates is generally mixed – it is reported that, although some have excellent craft skills, many graduates lack job-ready skills, business awareness, English-language skills, and computer literacy. The current training is not fully meeting the needs of the Afghan craft industries, as many of the graduates are not job- or market-ready.	Lightfoot, Michael; Rose, Aimee; Wafeq, Mainsha; Kamal, Burhamuddin; Santos, Ronald, 2015, Final Performance Evaluation and Sustainability Assessment of the Building Livelihoods and Trade (BLT) Activity, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
The meta analysis concluded that vocational training has the best chance of program success, especially when it is complemented with either counselling or financing services.	Cho, Yoonyoung; Honorati, Maddalena, 2013, Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries: A Meta Regression Analysis, Meta-analysis of evaluations, World Bank Human Development Network Social protection and Labor Unit, Washington DC.

23) *Develop voucher programmes* for young and other interested persons to facilitate attendance in TVET programmes. A voucher program enables potential trainees to receive vouchers that they can use to cover (most) of the costs of training in a selected number of training sites.

The evaluation noted that the probability of working in the formal sector is increased by 4 percentage points as a result of the TVET voucher program. In a voucher program potential trainees receive vouchers that they can use to cover (most) of the costs of training in a selected number of training sites. Given the importance for growth of reducing the size of the informal sector and moving people into the formal one the lessons learnt from this program should be replicated.	Attanasio, Orazio; Guarín, Arlen; Medina, Carlos; Meghir, Costas, 2015, Long Term Impacts of Vouchers for Vocational Training: Experimental Evidence For Colombia, Impact evaluation, National Bureau of Economic Research, Cambridge, MA, USA, impact evaluation on the project “Jovenes en Acción” (JeA), Colombia
---	--

24) *Ensure that TVET activities are well monitored* through an information system that collects data on the post training situation including:

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

- Absorption rate of graduates into the job market
- Changes in students' attitudes and lives.

The evaluation noted that the project manager uses a management information system developed to collect data on course enrolments, on graduates per cohort, on the absorption rate of graduates into the job market, and on changes in students' attitudes and lives after the training. This project data blends with the data collected annually by the University of Minnesota team that comes to Kenya to survey stakeholders, including participants and employers. Their data is compiled into a longitudinal study to see how the training changes the trajectory of participants' livelihoods and lives. This impact evaluation is designed to emphasise learning in the monitoring, evaluation and learning on of the program to help learn during implementation and respond to the needs of targeted youth.	Evalpartners, 2015, Evaluations that make a difference, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Publication released by: EvalPartners; African Development Bank Group; IDB; EES, Covered countries: Sri Lanka, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Kenya, Mexico, Nepal, the Netherlands, Canada.
The analysis recommended that beneficiaries who have undergone skills training should be provided with continuous mentoring and backstopping. The project should assist in establishing sustainable enterprises and strong market linkages.	Guardian, Edgar, 2014, Livelihood Restoration, Protection and Sustainable Empowerment of Vulnerable Peasant Communities in Sindh Province - Joint Midterm Review Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation stressed the need to improve linkages between vocational trainings and labour market.	Hall, Samuel, 2014, Evaluating IOM's Return and Reintegration Activities for Returnees and Other Displaced Populations Afghanistan, Meta-analysis of evaluations, IOM, Geneva.

25) *Ensure that translation of all the material that is to be used during TVET Programmes and other capacity strengthening materials is ready prior to training. Misunderstandings and message distortion may arise if the facilitator is relied on to translate content (see also 4.4.5 on ensuring that training materials are directly accessible to participants and content does not need too much adaptation during training).*

The evaluation found that TVET in Kenyan villages was based on very useful material that, however, was written in English and most of the group members could not read it. The trainers then had to interpret it into Swahili and then local dialect. This was a long process of passing a message with high likelihoods that the message received by the final recipient was not the same as the original. Considering that the majority of trainers do not speak the language of the local community, these materials had to be translated into Kiswahili to reduce the risks of message distortion.	Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet & Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.
--	--

26) *Ensure that the quality of TVET provided is high and that quality monitoring is carried out.*

The evaluation concluded that more attention needs to be paid to quality aspects of education and training in particular when enrolling young boys and girls as residents (boarders) in polytechnic/TVET institutions. Much more monitoring and follow needs to be done.	Nycander, Lotta; Riechi, Andrew, 2013, Creating the enabling environment to establish models for child labour free areas in Kenya – Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
--	--

27) *Note that employment creation after TVET completion may not be evident in the short term. If employment creation is to be directly fostered in a TVET project, this should be directly incorporated*

into the project design. This could include, for example, support for creating self-employment or training oriented directly to supply labour for new to be created employment opportunities.

Skills development was applied as a method in 13 of the 44 interventions studied. In seven out of these 13 evaluations, employment creation was recorded. Whereas this may give the impression that skills development is an effective method for creating employment even in the short term, it should be noticed that only in one of these seven cases, skills development stood on its own as the main strategy, namely in the large Education and Skills Training for Youth Employment (EAST) project in Indonesia (INS/06/15/NET)<sup>24</sup> where 2,800 TVET trainees (formerly out-of-school youth) and 660 Start and Improve your Business (SIYB) trainees found a job or started a small business. In other cases where employment was created in the short term, skills training was used as an accompanying measure: for labour-intensive works – three cases in Ghana, Madagascar and South Africa (Limpopo Province); for active labour market policy – two cases on Kiribati island in the RAS/06/53/NET project and Senegal in the SEN/07/01/LUX project; and for the promotion of stakeholder dialogue – one case in South Africa in the SAF/10/02/MUL project. In the interventions where skills development did not result in employment creation immediately, it either stood on its own as a measure, or it was combined with entrepreneurship promotion, which tends to target individuals rather than macro- or meso-level institutions.

ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

28) When providing seed capital support following TVET, ensure that it is provided within 2 months post- graduation to avoid disillusion and fatigue among graduates.

Ensure that time lag between training/apprenticeship and seed capital support in maintained less than 2 months to avoid disillusionment and fatigue among graduates;

Karuga, Stanley; Zimbizi, George, 2013, Skills for Youth Employment and Rural Development in Western and Southern Africa Programme (Zimbabwe Component) – Midterm evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

29) In situations where projects or other entities provide support for self-employment by providing work spaces, *ensure that such spaces are sufficiently well located* to be suitable to attract clients. While this may seem evident, it is not always considered.

The evaluation found that allocation of workspaces does not automatically resolve production issues and guarantee income. Project staff remarked that the location provided for the hairdressers is not suitable to attract clients. Local government officials who were interviewed likewise noted that the same problem applied to many of the other TVET graduates who had received government support. Interestingly, the youth weavers and hairdressers groups were planning to split into smaller groups and establish separate businesses instead of working as a larger association. These youth felt that it would be more beneficial because they could better focus on establishing concrete clientele for each of their groups and share their income with fewer members. The hairdressers indicated that they planned to rent a shop nearer to their potential clients so that they would be able to grow their businesses more efficiently and increase their incomes simultaneously.

Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.

30) When designing projects, take into account that *people who never attained primary education may require supplementary assistance* to level off with higher-educated participants (who are at least able to read and write).

<p>According to the evaluation, requiring a minimum education level for youth program participants (such as completion of lower primary) improves the likelihood that youth will master the work readiness and technical training. Some trainers reported that training secondary and primary school leavers together improved the quality of learning across the board, particularly during group work. In USAID's project in Rwanda, while youth with low literacy levels were the primary target population in the original plan, the Education Development Centre of Akazi Kanoze found they required considerable supplementary assistance to match the performance of the more highly educated participants. "If being able to read and write is a minimum requirement, it makes a big difference. They have the capacity to understand and accept the concepts quickly and either continue in school or look for opportunities for work," one sub-grantee partner coordinator observed.</p>	<p>McLellan, Iain &amp; Bamwesigye, Jackson, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Akazi Kanoze Youth Livelihoods Project (Rwanda), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
--	---

31) The duration of *skills training should be of sufficient length* to ensure adequate learning of skills.

<p>The evaluation noted that trainees, trainers, vocational training institutes and project staff consistently mentioned that the skills training was too short. (Two of the analysed evaluations came to the same conclusion)</p>	<p>UNIDO, 2015, Reintegration for Liberian Returnees through Skills Training and Job Creation, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna. Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien &amp; Associates International, Washington DC.</p>
--	--

32) Ensure (and test) that *project beneficiaries are fully able to use their newly acquired skills* and working tools obtained through training. Monitor the beneficiaries even after the end of the project, supporting them in developing their new activities and, consequently, gain more from their work. Work with government and civil society representatives to enable this.

<p>The evaluation determined that the project increased the probability of farmers selling agricultural products in the markets, as well as improving the quantity and increasing the variety of crops sold. These changes, however, did not translate into higher revenues, income or wealth. The project was successful in increasing the likelihood for a household to gain revenues from selling agricultural crops. On average more than 91 per cent of the households in the intervention group had revenues from selling crops in the previous 12 months, compared with less than 84 per cent in the matched comparison group. However, it appears there are no differences when comparing the average total amount of revenues from the two groups. This might be due to the fact that project participants were selling their crop production at higher prices or higher quality compared with comparison households. This explanation is consistent with the fact that project participants did not report using different technological tools or set of skills compared with households in the comparison group. Training on planning, climate change adaptation and marketing combined with technical support and planting materials, were expected to increase access to technology and skills, which in turn should increase agricultural diversification and the quantity of crops produced.</p>	<p>Lombardini, Simone, 2015, Impact evaluation of the project 'Scaling up sustainable livelihoods in Mindanao', Impact evaluation, OXFAM, Oxford.</p>
---	---

33) Be aware that graduates of TVET may not immediately automatically find employment. Develop other means to support graduates through social protection methods if needed until employment can be accessed.

The evaluation noted that actual results achieved for income and employment were modest. The majority of sewing course graduates reported earning a small amount of income from informal work (estimate USD 25-50 a month). Discounting for sewing graduates, 12% of the survey cohort reported success in finding employment  
12 % found employment, of which only 7% were women in the market-oriented courses found work.  
21%of beneficiaries reported they had created businesses. However, “business” in this context referred to be self-employed, sometimes with a family members or partners, but with characteristics similar to casual labour. There was no instance where a small enterprise was created.  
Strategies need to consider the post-graduation support that addresses the specific obstacles to job market access faced by women.

Gairdner, David; Al-Allaf, Riadh; Mandelik, Florence, 2013, Independent Evaluation, The Republic Of Iraq, Evaluation of Micro Enterprises for Reintegration of Internally Displaced Persons in Thi Qar Governorate, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

### 3.7. Labour market analysis to determine types of education/training provided

**Indicators:** The key ways in which labour market analysis and statistics have been used to determine types of education/training provided, with special attention to social inclusion in project countries identified. Includes attention to identifying if and how labour such statistics are used to inform vocational and skills training.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Thematic analysis to determine if and how labour market analysis and statistics are used to inform decision making on types of vocational and skills training to be provided. Identification of challenges in using education/vocational/skills statistics and possible ways in which these may influence IE, enhancing livelihoods.

1) Ensure a good *alignment between training and economic opportunities*. Develop a precise strategy to assure training participants have a coherent and successful transition from training to work and that a system is established to provide follow-up support with participants. Promote the establishment of employment opportunities of graduates of TVET in project design by planning linking with the private sector from an early stage.

An analysis of data that the evaluation team collected in the Akazi Kanoze project revealed mixed results regarding alignment between technical skills training and economic opportunities accessed. Those who received skills training did not necessarily access opportunities within the sector for which they were trained, with considerable variation between particular technical sectors. Among sub-grantee partners that took a more active role in facilitating the transition of Akazi Kanoze graduates into economic opportunities, a greater degree of alignment can be seen. There was also evidence that some of the technical training was insufficient for the needs of the sector. Qualitative data collected found that a minority of graduates were still without economic opportunity, or complained of low wages and long hours.  
It should be noted that not all those who successfully accessed an economic opportunity received a complementary training or developed skills for work in specific sectors. Youth who did not receive complementary training in a specific technical area were generally not the principal beneficiaries of the program, as most were still enrolled in formal schooling or had recently graduated from a university course of study when they received the Work Readiness Training. The number of graduates who found an economic opportunity, disaggregated by sector, includes only those who received complementary training in technical skills.  
EDC/Akazi Kanoze estimates that contact was lost with a third of Akazi Kanoze

McLellan, Iain & Bamwesigye, Jackson, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Akazi Kanoze Youth Livelihoods Project (Rwanda), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

<p>graduates after completion of the program and no information was available on their post-training outcomes. This information gap can be traced back to three causes. First, some sub-grantee partners have not attempted to develop a systematic means of preserving contact with their students after graduation. The transient nature of youths in search of economic opportunity has furthermore translated to their relocation throughout the country, resulting in higher cost and levels of effort to track them outside of Kigali. Finally, the principal means by which contact can be maintained with most youth graduates is by mobile telephone, but contact numbers frequently change as youth alternate between service providers or allow existing accounts to fall into disuse.</p> <p>The evaluation stresses the importance of keeping in contact with training participants. Due to the transient nature of youths and the fact their mobile phone numbers change relatively frequently, new strategies are needed to maintain contact with Akazi Kanoze graduates in order to follow-up on their success and to help them identify new economic opportunities. In this regard, the evaluation proposed to use SMS. We believe that by now it would be easier to reach young people through e-mails and Whatsapp, by setting an alert system (that in Rwandan case may exploit the broadband free Wi-Fi, available since 2013).</p>	
<p>The evaluation noted a common weakness in not implementing activities to establish linkages between the recent graduates and private sector employment opportunities.</p> <p>Graduates would clearly have benefitted from having had the opportunity of being exposed to the world of work in practice.</p>	<p>UNIDO, 2015, Reintegration for Liberian Returnees through Skills Training and Job Creation, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.</p>

2) *Carry out analysis of the local labour market* to determine the types of jobs that may be available to graduates of Technical vocational education and training (TVET). When identifying possible areas of TVET, *ensure that the types of training provided will actually result in a decent income* within the local labour and client market.

3) *Involve the private sector in the needs assessment.* This enables the identification of promising economic opportunities and the establishment of initial contacts with employers interested in recruiting youth graduates. Include a private sector specialist among the implementing partner staff as this can further facilitate business community links to an IE related project.

4) *Enable sub-grantee partners (local NGOs, local authorities etc.) to participate* in conducting these market analyses themselves. This can even encourage new contacts between partners and stakeholders that may potentially lead to economic opportunities.

<p>The analysis indicated that it is important to scan the local market, contracting companies and entrepreneurs to see what entry-level jobs are available.</p>	<p>Evalpartners, 2015, Evaluations that make a difference, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Publication released by: EvalPartners; African Development Bank Group; IDB; EES, Covered countries: Sri Lanka, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Kenya, Mexico, Nepal, the Netherlands, Canada.</p>
<p>The evaluation noted that the results in finding employment are encouraging but can be further strengthened through providing better support to students during and after the apprenticeship, and through better identifying areas in which employment can be found more easily.</p>	<p>Van de Velde, Martine, 2013, Skills Development and Employment Services for the Construction Sector in the Gaza Strip – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>Skills development can contribute to employment creation, but it is seldom effective as a standalone strategy. In the evaluations where skills development was found successful, it was combined with another, more institution-oriented strategy (e.g. targeting the labour market system)</p>	<p>ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO,</p>



## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

	Geneva.
The evaluation noted that the income of children in trades who were interviewed during the evaluation was not as high as might be expected. This included children in hairdressing and in agriculture related training. The evaluator asked these children a set of standard questions on levels of sales and income, which indicated that income was quite low in both instances. As is common in the informal economy, they did not calculate their labour as a cost. Rather, they calculated their profit based on sales minus direct costs such as material inputs from the amount they receive from sales. The seven youth in the hairdressers' group indicated that, all together, they have an average of three to four customers per day. Even if their labour is counted as "profit", the income they earn as a group is very low when sub-divided by each child in the group. This information was confirmed from triangulating these findings with inputs from local government officials in the cooperatives, industrial development, and similar sections that were interviewed at Woreda level in Addis Ababa and elsewhere.	Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.
The evaluation concluded that projects must invest in the strategies and mechanisms to create linkages between training and employment and livelihood opportunity. Options should be identified, developed and resourced within the initial assessment and design process.	Gairdner, David; Al-Allaf, Riadh; Mandelik, Florence, 2013, Independent Evaluation, The Republic Of Iraq, Evaluation of Micro Enterprises for Reintegration of Internally Displaced Persons in Thi Qar Governorate, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
The evaluation reports that the Akazi Kanoze model studied markets to identify growth sectors where youth were likely to access economic opportunities, build the capacity of technical training providers to deliver the workforce readiness training to recruited youth, facilitates graduates' access to economic opportunities, then track graduates' outcomes in the working world.	McLellan, Iain & Bamwesigye, Jackson, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Akazi Kanoze Youth Livelihoods Project (Rwanda), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
The evaluation determined that value-adding activities such as food processing should be based on accurate market analysis.	Wolterstorff, Paul, 2014, Final Evaluation of the Project Vocational Education and Training for Inclusive Growth of Tribal Communities in East Indian States of Jharkhand, West Bengal and Orissa, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
The evaluation noted that projects should conduct thorough market analyses and prepare feasibility plans for all proposals that include vocational skills training with the objectives of employment and income generation. Proposals should include a clear and detailed explanation of the support graduates will receive to both secure and maintain employment. IPs that are not technically positioned to undertake a rigorous market analysis should sub- contract a team or another firm to assist with this key step of the program design phase.	Holzaepfel, Erica A., 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of Livelihoods Programs for Refugees in Ethiopia, Final evaluation, Social Impact Inc., Washington, DC, projects: 1) International Rescue Committee (IRC) Livelihoods project; 2) Jesuit Refugee Services (JRS) Livelihoods project; 3) Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) Livelihoods project in Ethiopia.

5) *Promote analysis and understanding of economic growth dynamics and functioning of the labour market* to inform technical assistance on youth employment. Acquire knowledge of the operations of national and local complex organisations, e.g. public administration in general, ministries and department in charge of labour and employment and Public Employment Services. Note that demand for development interventions related to TVET includes labour market assessment, providing support for establishing linkages between training and the labour market, and policy development.

The evaluation noted that future demand for intervention appears to be in the areas of policy development, labour market assessment, and providing the linkages between training and the market.	Gairdner, David; Al-Allaf, Riadh; Mandelik, Florence, 2013, Independent Evaluation, The Republic Of Iraq, Evaluation of Micro Enterprises for Reintegration of Internally
--	---



	Displaced Persons in Thi Qar Governorate, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
ILO's evaluation identified a number of challenges to the provision of quality technical assistance to youth employment policy and programme development. A full understanding of the economic growth dynamics and functioning of the specific labour market is required. It needs to be underpinned by comprehensive knowledge on the operations of complex organisations (public administration in general, ministries and department in charge of labour and employment and Public Employment Services).	Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

6) Analyse labour market needs in such a way that it *allows for a full determination of a wide range of types of technical jobs that may be needed*. This may include in addition to (the usual) furniture carpenters, welders and mechanics whether there is a need for construction workers, plumbers, electricians, heavy machinery operators, carpenters for the construction industry, information technology repair and operation specialists.

The evaluation stated that the project conducted a market needs analysis to determine the types of skills that are needed. Respondents in the market assessment indicated that they had difficulty in finding qualified labour. Skilled mechanics were the most sought after workers. Others included workers in specialised construction services such as construction workers, plumbers, electricians and heavy machinery operators. There was a need for carpenters to not only focus on carpentry businesses, but ways in which they can provide products and services to the wider construction industry. Further, there was a need for workers in specific aspects of appliance repair, for example in repairing computers or printers and others in the information technology industry.	UNIDO, 2014, Integration and progress through protection and empowerment of displaced groups in South Sudan, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
---	---

7) Conduct an *analysis to determine why young people (or others) are unable to find work or start their own business*. What prevents them from entering the labour market and making a living for themselves and their families? What constraints are they facing? This needs to be determined prior to deciding the type of support that may be provided.

The analysis indicated that, before even thinking about an intervention, it is necessary to know why young people (or others) are unable to find work or start their own business. What prevents them from entering the labour market and making a living for themselves and their families? What constraints are they facing? This needs to be determined.	Hempel, Kevin; Fiala, Nathan, 2012, Measuring Success of Youth Livelihoods Interventions: A Practical Guide to Monitoring and Evaluation, Other Evaluation, World Bank, Washington, DC, Project: Northern Uganda Social Action Fund (NUSAF) Youth Opportunities Programme in Uganda.
---	--

8) Consider *limiting the variety of vocational skills training provided in the context of support for refugees*. Projects should particularly limit those that do not have a clear local market. Instead they should focus on small business creation and skill development that can actually support refugees with small, odd jobs, such as food preparation, and which do not require such a substantial investment in equipment and resources.

In the context of refugees, the evaluation concluded, projects should consider limiting the variety of vocational skill trainings they provide, particularly those that do not have a clear local market. Instead they should focus on small business	Holzaepfel, Erica A., 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of Livelihoods Programs for Refugees in Ethiopia, Final evaluation,
---	--

creation and skill development that can actually support refugees with small, odd jobs, such as food preparation, and which do not require such a substantial investment in equipment and resources.

Project should explore income-generating activities that are more dynamic than the standard tailoring, wood-working, and hairdressing skill training programs that are repeatedly implemented in camps. Such ideas might include developing high-value, globally-marketable products with natural, local ingredients that are readily available in Ethiopia, such as honey. Given the current awareness of the plight of the honey bee, products helping to preserve the bee while supporting local honey production could be quite valuable on the international market, or even among high-end shoppers in regional capitols like Addis, Cairo, and Nairobi. Other products that are more basic, but are in high demand on a national level could be produced in the camps and marketed in regional capitols. In speaking with ARRA officials about these ideas, the team found that ideas such as these would be within the legal right of refugees to pursue.

Social Impact Inc., Washington, DC, projects: 1) International Rescue Committee (IRC) Livelihoods project; 2) Jesuit Refugee Services (JRS) Livelihoods project; 3) Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) Livelihoods project in Ethiopia.

## RESEARCH QUESTION 4: APPROACHES TO ENHANCE LIVELIHOODS, EQUITY AND INCLUSION

**Principal research question details:**What (innovative) approaches do national and international entities use to enhance livelihoods, equity and inclusion of people dependent on the informal economy? What are the new strategies adopted by people relying on informal economy activities themselves?

**General finding:**

Note that holistic approaches to projects tend to have better results. A criteria for the level of holistic approaches used in the project, including establishing linkages with various stakeholders, should be included in monitoring programming.

**Summary of recommendations on enabling environment strengthening**

1. Promote and facilitate social dialogue and participation between key stakeholders in the design, planning and dissemination of results on IE related programming. Facilitate formation of associations and other groups of people dependent on the IE. Ensure that well-functioning networks of key stakeholders are created at national, local and community level to strengthen the socio-economic position of people dependent on the IE. Support programming to facilitate awareness raising of people dependent on the IE about their democratic rights in elections and organising. Give marginalised persons a voice in governance and investment decision on issues related to socio-economic development. Design and implement long term methods to continuously share progress, good practices and lessons learned on IE issues using mass media, digital social media, and traditional means.
2. Ensure that the design and implementation of social protection programming specifically includes attention to people dependent on the IE. This should include the design of relevant types of social protection, including access to micro-insurance support specifically oriented to people dependent on the IE. Verify alignment of IE related project activities with available government social protection services. Ensure the input of people from the IE into design and implementation processes of social protection programming and adjust content in line with their evolving needs. Take into consideration that needs of people dependent on the IE may change during their life cycle and that their socio-economic context may also change. As a result, ensure flexibility in social protection programming. Adjust available social protection services over time and for different categories of people dependent on the IE using good practices and lessons learned from experienced IE support groups. Provide support to facilitate access of people dependent on the IE to relevant social protection services while ensuring that service providers have the needed capacities.
3. Include attention to food security issues—such as nutrition education and access to quality food—in programming with people dependent on the IE who have special food security vulnerabilities.
4. Address power imbalances that perpetuate the dependence of vulnerable groups on IE employment. Ensure that planning not only focuses on inclusion of adequate quotas of women/men and other groups in project activities but also pays attention to righting imbalances regarding access to resources to develop economic activities and a voice in decision making. This may include training and mentoring on social and economic empowerment of women as well as people from various vulnerable groups. Include men in awareness raising on women's roles and rights in the IE.

5. Carry out gender analysis and/or other analysis of other vulnerable groups dependent on the IE with regard to their roles and responsibilities in the household and the community and other relevant issues. Include analysis of differences in access to and control over resources and decision-making, factors that constrain or facilitate equal participation of women and men in community development processes and the different capacities, needs and priorities of women and men. Draw on the existing knowledge and capacities of women, men, boys and girls. Make use of existing tools on gender analysis (see body of the report). Use the acquired information to design and implement programming to support vulnerable groups who are dependent on the IE.
6. Ensure that gender issues are well articulated in programme design and implementation taking the different needs of women and men dependent on the IE into account. Where other groups such as youth, people with disabilities, living with or affected by HIV, the elderly, refugees and others are included in IE programming, ensure that their needs are equally considered. Take into account that the needs of these different groups within a single project may differ from each other. Encourage cross-linkages between projects on the IE and other development initiatives oriented to such vulnerable groups.
7. Consider the logistics ability of women and girls, youth, people with disabilities, living with HIV, refugees and the elderly to access support training and other activities organised with people dependent on the IE. Adapt training materials and other means of support so that various groups can access, understand and fully use them in their work in the informal economy and/or for formalising their activities. Support the development of labour saving devices to lighten household and IE related workload of vulnerable groups.
8. Use holistic approaches to address the needs of youth dependent on the IE to reach their full potential through provision of support for access and development of their:
  - General education
  - Technical work as well as behavioural skills such as team work and time management
  - Self-reliance
  - Knowledge of their rights and responsibilities
9. In the case of actions to eliminate hazardous child labour, aside from provision of SBCC, ensure that programming emphasis is placed on:
  - Development of sustainable decent work options for household members
  - Links to and capacity strengthening of available government/non state actors' to provide economic empowerment support to families of child labourers.
  - Supportive legal and policy frameworks
  - Provision of access to available social protection services
10. Support economic empowerment of refugees as well as the communities in which they are situated whenever relevant. Study the contexts in both sending and receiving locations to ensure that appropriate economic empowerment programming is developed. Provide re-entry livelihoods support if and when refugees can return home. Support economic empowerment as well as activities against trafficking and exploitation in post-disaster situations. Pay special attention to address the risks of children who are vulnerable in disasters and refugee situations to trafficking and other worst forms of child labour, including commercial sexual exploitation.

## 4.1. Social dialogue and IE

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on Social dialogue in IE identified.

b) Challenges on Social dialogue in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on social dialogue and IE. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of social dialogue and IE and determine if/how these were overcome.

*1) Promote and facilitate social dialogue* between a range of stakeholders as this contributes to appropriate content, capacity strengthening through knowledge sharing, speedier decision-making and ownership. Dialogue may include rural/or community members, local/regional/national government, civil society and academia representatives, workers and employers organisations.

<p>The evaluation determined that committees played an important role in monitoring as they were included in reviews of the strategy road map and the actual documents produced.</p> <p>In Kenya the project was lauded for the development and implementation of exceptionally good participative processes involving a wide range of stakeholders. Involvement and co-opting of very high level officials from both the Ministry of Labour as well as Employer and Worker organizations in Kenya resulted in achievement of buy-in at the very top levels of the tripartite. This facilitated speedy decision making on key project interventions in Kenya since officials could make binding decisions on behalf of their constituency.</p> <p>There were good participative approaches that have led to real ownership among the stakeholders.</p>	<p>Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The evaluation identified citizen participation, participation of local authorities in decision-making, participation of local associations, and using a good mechanism through the governorate authorities as a good practice.</p>	<p>Hanafi, Hamouda B.; Pipe, Roger D., 2014, Final Performance Evaluation Of The Agriculture Program Of The Community Livelihoods Project (CLP), Final evaluation, USAID Washington, DC.</p>
<p>The project was found to have undertaken many project activities were in response to the emerging needs of the constituents.</p>	<p>Kuzmin, Alexey, 2013, From the Crisis towards Decent and Safe Jobs in Southern Caucasus and Central Asia, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan.</p>
<p>The evaluation found that inclusiveness of the tripartite members in SCORE training is a good approach.</p> <p>The National Tripartite Advisory Committee in project countries is a forum where SECO was able to contribute to SCORE implementation.</p>	<p>Bugnion de Moreta, Christian; Pedraza Isaza, Daniel; Hongman ; Lam Ba Nguyen, Zhang; Owusu; Sandra, Christian Bugnion de Moreta (Lead Evaluator), Daniel Pedraza Isaza, Hongman Zhang, Lam Ba Nguyen, Sandra Owusu, 2012, SCORE - Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality project (WEDGE III, INT/08/06/IRL)57 made a substantial contribution to the participation of women in processes of social dialogue. This helped provide support to established women entrepreneurs, promoted women entrepreneurship in general, promoted the institutionalization of women's participation in social dialogue, and gave women the capacity to take up such roles.</p>	<p>ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

All ILO employment projects should be designed with a broader involvement of social and economic actors in mind.	Jiménez, José Francisco, 2014, ILO-Sida Partnership 2012-2013: National Employment Policies (NEP) and Youth Employment (YE), Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Botswana, Comoros, Lesotho, Liberia, Malawi, Mozambique, Cambodia, Sri Lanka, El Salvador, Kyrgyzstan Yemen. El Salvador, Indonesia, Jordan Zambia.
Evaluations made a strong case for enforcing stakeholders' involvement in order to support ownership and mutual trust, which are regarded as crucial success factors.	Voss, Eckhard; Gospel, Howard; Dornelas, Antonio; Vitols, Katrin, 2013, What works and why? : Results of a synthesis review of social dialogue interventions 2002-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
In countries where political stability is a challenge, the focus on policy and legislative reforms with tripartite involvement contributes to sustained results.	Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region - ILO 2013.
The evaluation determined that it is important to ensure tripartite partners are involved in planning, monitoring and validating research and other information products.	Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers FE - ILO 2014 Paraguay, India, Zambia, Tanzania and The Philippines.
It was determined in the evaluation that the integrated approach promotes a broad concept of social promotion, then the scope of the social dialogue should also be expanded in order to incorporate all this range of groups and institutions that are now part of the concept.	Pacheco Jiménez, José Francisco, 2013, Improving social protection and promoting employment, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic "improving social protection and promoting employment in Burkina Faso, Cambodia and Honduras".
The evaluation noted that considerable efforts must be made to ensure domestic workers themselves have a 'voice' in trade unions with official tripartite negotiations.	Murray, Una, 2014, Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers Swedish funding towards Outcome 5, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Paraguay, India, Zambia, Tanzania and The Philippines.
Evaluations of larger projects related to social dialogue in regions such as Africa, the Americas and Asia, indicate a general trend for social dialogue to become a stronger element in national as well as international development	Voss, Eckhard; Gospel, Howard; Dornelas, Antonio; Vitols, Katrin, 2013, What works and why? : Results of a synthesis review of social dialogue interventions 2002-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation found that the programme succeeded in attracting a balanced group of participants representing policy makers, employers, trade unions and others. The balance between different categories of participants was consistent with around 17-18 participants from the public sector, and the rest from employer organisations, trade unions, and NGOs. The second programme cycle is an exception: for this programme cycle half of the participants (13 persons) represented trade unions. In Kenya the balance in the category of participants enabled a project on youth training based at the employment centre of the Ministry Labour, Social Security and Service to benefit and make use of the efforts in youth training arising from another project based at a NGO. In Mozambique, a project of the Ministry of Planning and Development was based on a project of a previous participant from the same Ministry. The participants' final assessment reports and the interviews undertaken show that collaboration within countries and in some cases also between countries has increased. There is also evidence from the projects in Mozambique related to social dialogue that show in- creased collaboration among the parties on the labour market.	Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.

2) *Reinforce a sense group of identity and cohesion* to enable community groups to strengthen their bargaining power so that they can access their rights.

The evaluation concluded that beneficiaries' bargaining power developed in the form of a collective group personality is an indirect benefit.	Poudyal, Lokendra; Upadhyay, Balkrishna; Karki, Laxmi, 2013, Final Report on the Mid – Term Evaluation of Livelihood Recovery for Peace (LRP/UNDP) Project, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, Kathmandu.
---	---

3) *Include the voice of youth* in discussions related to their development as related to livelihoods/employment creation of people dependent on the IE.

The evaluation determined that it was useful to incorporate youth representatives in discussions so as to enhance their involvement and prospects for long-term ownership and sustainability of programme activities.	Karuga, Stanley; Zimbizi, George, 2013, Skills for Youth Employment and Rural Development in Western and Southern Africa Programme (Zimbabwe Component) – Midterm evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The analysis determined that it is useful to enhance the participation of young people in the formulation of youth employment policies.	Jiménez, José Francisco, 2014, ILO-Sida Partnership 2012-2013: National Employment Policies (NEP) and Youth Employment (YE), Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Botswana, Comoros, Lesotho, Liberia, Malawi, Mozambique, Cambodia, Sri Lanka, El Salvador, Kyrgyzstan Yemen. El Salvador, Indonesia, Jordan Zambia.
The evaluation noted that is beneficial to increase the involvement of the voice of youth in the national policy debate. Workers organisations could undertake an important role through their National Committee of Youth Workers and encourage youth to organise themselves so that they can be helped to create a business.	Johannson Núñez, Renato, 2011, Promotion of youth employment in Mozambique Final Joint Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

4) *Include media organisations* in policy level dialogue to develop messages such as on gender sensitive reporting and the promotion of decent work.

The project was found to have conducted a series of policy level dialogues with senior representatives of national and regional level media organizations. This resulted in 150 policy level representatives to agree on a declaration unanimously signed to promote gender sensitive reporting in their respective organizations.	Jafar, Salmar, 2013, Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
--	---

5) *Pay special attention to promoting joint strategic collaboration between social partners* in low-resource settings as it helps to convert competition into collaboration.

The evaluation noted that strategic collaboration with social partners in areas of common interest is necessary to leverage strengths and outreach. In other words, converting competition into collaboration is the way forward in low-resource settings.	Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Trikha, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the
--	--



	Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
--	---

6) *Consider the importance of the national political context and other contextual issues when organising social dialogue among the social partners.*

<p>The analysis report noted that, rather than the economic situation, it is the national political context and climate in which the social partners and social dialogue operate which contributes significantly to either success and positive outcomes.</p> <p>The analysis indicated that, even though there may be increased social dialogue in some locations, there are also trends that indicate a growing strain on social dialogue. In certain developed and developing countries, social dialogue and sound industrial relations are also under pressure, and there are concerns about the reversal of past positive trends.</p>	<p>Voss, Eckhard; Gospel, Howard; Dornelas, Antonio; Vitols, Katrin, 2013, What works and why? : Results of a synthesis review of social dialogue interventions 2002-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
--	---

7) *Include local stakeholders in the design and validation of projects/actions through social dialogue from the earliest stage. Determining if and when financial compensation for attending meetings is provided needs careful reflection. Wherever possible, compensation should be minimised to ensure local ownership.*

<p>The evaluation found that the design of the joint programme was conducted in a joint manner by the UN agencies; however, a full joint design should have involved national and provincial agencies not only in consultations to validate the proposal prepared by the UN agencies but since the elaboration of the concept note.</p>	<p>Carravilla, Carlos, 2013, Alternatives to migration: Decent Jobs for Filipino youth Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The evaluation recommended that the project plan should be reviewed and revised to accommodate stakeholder objectives that did not appear to be taken into account in the project orientation to ensure that the appropriate activities are prioritized without losing the overall aim of the programme.</p>	<p>Flanagan, Valerie, 2014, Employment creation through small and medium scale enterprise development in Free State – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>In Zambia the responses from evaluation interviewees were mixed. This was mostly because some key stakeholders felt that they were only sufficiently associated half-way through the project because expected financial compensation for participation in the technical committee was not realised. Determining if and when financial compensation for attending meetings is provided needs careful reflection. It is necessary to ensure early direct input from entrepreneur and workers' associations in the relevant sectors.</p>	<p>Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.</p>

8) *Ensure that technical project and other committees are inclusive and have clear terms of reference.*

<p>The evaluation noted that the mechanisms for participatory decision-making should be enhanced: make advisory and technical committees more inclusive and active with clear TORs. The technical committee needs to include representatives of local NGO partners, local trainers and at a later stage the local women beneficiaries. ILO should encourage those stakeholders to join such committee as a way of sharing the governance of the project and in ensuring that project decisions are communicated at all levels.</p>	<p>Summers, Guy, 2013, Palestinian Women's Economic Empowerment Project – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Palestinian Women's Economic Empowerment Project, Occupied Palestinian Territory.</p>
--	--

9) While *participation is important, it should be recognised that it is, by itself, not a sufficient measure to ensure effectiveness and sustainability*. Strengthen capacities of social partners in their particular functions and roles as needed. Capacity strengthening may include covering a wide range of organizational capacity skills (management, decision-making, analysis, bargaining) and knowledge (emerging issues, sector- specific knowledge, etc.).

The evaluation noted that community participation is a necessary, but in itself an insufficient measure to ensure sustainability of improved infrastructure. Greater attention is needed to strengthen the technical capacity of communities to enable them to operate and maintain the facilities established and to harmonize planned new investments with appropriate maintenance programs and budgets.	Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2015, Project Performance Assessment Report Republic of Indonesia, Second Urban Poverty Project, Third Urban Poverty Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington, DC.
The analysis indicated that capacity building is an essential component of strategies to strength processes related to social dialogue. The strengthening of social partners in their particular functions and roles in tripartite mechanisms covers a wide range of organizational capacity skills (management, decision-making, analysis, bargaining) and knowledge (emerging issues, sector- specific knowledge, etc.). While there may be the temptation for technical interventions to offer the social partners similar packages for capacity building, the review shows that there is a need to adapt the strategies to the characteristics of the partners. The review also points to the opportunity offered by interventions on employment promotion to improve the participation of particular groups in social dialogue mechanisms.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013 , Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

10) Ensure that entities that will participate in discussions on issues related to people dependent on the IE, *first hold internal discussions and are sufficiently aware of the issues identified*. If needed address their information gaps.

The evaluation found that, before transferring the tripartite discussion to the national, bi-national or regional level, work must be carried out separately with each sector. It may be problematic to launch the discussions at regional level when the sectors are not prepared internally for the discussion, have information gaps or are not sufficiently sensitized on the issue.	Varela, Javier, 2013, Gender-sensitive Labor Mitigation Policies in the Nicaragua-Costa Rica-Panama and Haiti-Dominican Republic Corridors – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
--	--

11) When reviewing project designs, note that the *duration of projects should be sufficient to ensure that social dialogue* can be adequately implemented.

The short duration of projects was not conducive to the long-term nature of change in processes of social dialogue.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
---	---

12) In programs with refugees, *involve refugees and the host population* well in advance of designing livelihoods programs with people dependent on the IE.

The evaluation noted that, as advocated by UNHCR, contextual understanding will be much improved through consultation with refugees and the host population, and should happen well in advance of the design of livelihoods programs.	Holzaepfel, Erica A.; Jacobsen, Karen, 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of DOS/PRM Livelihoods Programs in Ethiopia and Burundi, Meta-analysis of evaluations,
---	--

	Social Impact Inc, Washington DC.
--	-----------------------------------

13) After stimulating social dialogue among social partners through IE projects, ensure that clear *well organised strategies are in place for strengthened networks* to be self-sustainable.

The evaluation noted that networks among public institutions, social partners and other organisations were formed but on an ad-hoc basis. From interviews undertaken and from observations made during the field mission, in particular during the results seminar in Tanzania in May 2015, it is evident that the programme has contributed to network creation. This has seemingly not been done in an organised way, but simply by the fact that representatives from different organisations were given a chance to meet and start networking during the course of the programme. So far, networking at a national level is dependent on individual initiatives.	Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.
--	---

14) Note that dialogue should not end with a project on livelihoods with people dependent on the IE but rather *include opportunities for stakeholders to share successes and lessons learned* during and after project end.

Different partners expressed to the evaluation team that they regretted the lack of opportunities to learn from other partners and share successes that they had experienced in their programming. This failure to follow through on the "learning aspects" of the program is puzzling because in the Cooperative Agreement the consortium was very explicit as to how it proposed to address learning and knowledge sharing.	Stockton, Gilles; McMillin, John; Desta, Solomon; Beyero, Mesfin; Tadele, Alemneh, 2012, Mid-Term Performance Evaluation of the Pastoral Livelihoods Initiative Phase II- PLI II (Ethiopia), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
---	---

## 4.2. Social inclusion promotion (awareness raising on social inclusion in IE)

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on social inclusion promotion in IE identified.

b) Challenges on social inclusion promotion in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on social inclusion promotion. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion of social inclusion and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) To reach their fullest potential, projects/programmes should *actively address the power imbalance* of and most vulnerable groups of people who are dependent on the IE.

The analysis notes that development programmes can help people living in poverty to benefit from markets and lift themselves out of poverty but many such approaches do not pay attention to power imbalances that perpetuate marginalisation and poverty. To reach their fullest potential, projects/programmes should actively strengthen the power of marginalised smallholders and women. Major events in the market system, induced by changes in policy, regulation, social movements or business models can provide opportunities to intervene and	Sahan, E., and Fischer-Mackay, J., 2011, Making Markets Empower The Poor: Programme perspectives on using markets to empower women and men living in poverty, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Oxfam Discussion Papers, OXFAM, Oxford.
---	---

rebalance power. Market-based programmes should also be complemented by non-market interventions that address poverty and sustainability issues in household and environmental systems.	
---	--

2) Follow a *4-point strategy to support inclusion of marginalised people* so that barriers that perpetuate disadvantageous power dynamics can be eliminated:

- Support producer organisations to develop their market power and encourage them to take progressive measures to ensure equal participation and benefits for women and marginalised producers.
- Support new business models where specialised intermediaries and service providers assist producers, including women to empower them by helping them become more competitive and able to access more lucrative formal markets.
- Make pre-commercial investments : Providing assets and training to support marginalised people who lack the assets and skills necessary to use markets to lift themselves out of poverty.

3) Giving marginalised *groups a voice in governance and investment*. This involves supporting marginalised groups in dealings with governments, and also helping them with any negotiations around pre-commercial investments such as technologies and irrigation; or access to resources such as land rights for women.

The study notes research undertaken by Oxfam, that argues that to support marginalised people, barriers that perpetuate power dynamics should be addressed, and advocates for disrupting markets and rebalancing power via four forms of interventions:	Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.
---	---

- 1) Supporting producer organisations: Assist producer organizations to build the market power of producers, and encourage them to take progressive measures to ensure equal participation and benefits for women and marginalised producers.
- 2) Supporting new business models: There are specialised intermediaries and service providers who fill an important gap in markets for smallholders. They can act as a broker - enabling a poorly organised producer base (smallholders) to connect to sophisticated and modern input and output markets; and support in product quality control, processing, and access to inputs. Development programmes should work with such enterprises to support them so that they are not only commercially efficient, but also empower smallholders, including women, by helping them become more competitive and able to access more lucrative formal markets.
- 3) Making pre-commercial investments: Providing assets and training to support marginalised people who lack the assets and skills necessary to use markets to lift themselves out of poverty.
- 4) Giving marginalised groups a voice in governance and investment: This involves supporting marginalised groups in dealings with governments, and also helping them with any negotiations around pre-commercial investments such as technologies and irrigation; or access to resources such as land rights for women.

4) In project design, *verify the extent to which the project will substantially contribute to increases in incomes* as opposed to only marginally supporting the beneficiaries/community members.

While this may seem obvious many projects simply decide on a range of activities without prioritising those most likely to have high impact.

According to the evaluation, the training provided to women in Kassala is not creating employment for them, it is instead providing them with opportunities to improve their living conditions and nutritional standards, generate a small amount of money to help them have some economic independence and to improve their bargaining power as partners within the family.	Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.
--	--

5) *Clearly identify the beneficiary selection criteria* in the project design document. This should include vulnerability criteria that are agreed to with the major stakeholders. During the project inception period, double check the correct application of selection criteria to ensure that the target community members are actually engaged in and benefit from the project.

The evaluation concluded that the project should more clearly define what is meant by vulnerability, and how this group should be prioritized. This evaluation showed that despite what was recorded in official program documents, vulnerable groups were often not targeted or able to engage in projects. Some projects required physical strength (to repair houses) and others required initial financial contributions (to join the VSLAs). PRM should clarify which segment of society it hopes to assist with livelihoods interventions—e.g. support the middle classes as drivers of economic change? Or to provide a safety net to the worst off?	Evaluating the Effectiveness of Livelihoods Programs for Returned Refugees in Burundi - OE US Gov 20151)
It emerged from the evaluation that Oxfam's project in Mindanao engaged households with higher levels of material wealth, including higher levels of education, higher quantities of cultivated land, and a lower probability of being employed as casual labourer compared with a random selection of people living in neighbouring villages. This suggests that the project was not able to engage with the poorest and most vulnerable households in the area. While more attention should be given to this when targeting project households, the country team is also encouraged to consider the type of interventions that are more effective in reaching and benefiting the poorest and most vulnerable households in the project area.	Lombardini, Simone, 2015, Impact evaluation of the project 'Scaling up sustainable livelihoods in Mindanao', Impact evaluation, OXFAM, Oxford.

6) When designing programming with people dependent on the IE, *promote focus on the rural nonfarm economy*. This should not be to the exclusion of urban communities. Such support provides for poverty reduction of IE operators and workers in rural areas but may also contribute to strengthening rural economies (local economic development) and product/services shortages in rural markets shortages. Such projects can help the

Facilitate a four component strategy to analyse market conditions of particular areas and plan concrete intervention aimed at strengthening the rural nonfarm economy. Such strategy would be composed of:

- Identifying potential drivers of growth which may include financial and personal services, trade and transportation, manufacturing, construction and mining
- Developing rural infrastructure
- Promoting access to markets
- Building human capital.

The study found that, over the last decade, the rural nonfarm economy has attracted increasing attention from researchers and policymakers for its potential to contribute to rural development and its increasing importance as a source of income in rural areas. In poor agrarian economies characterised by low	De Los Rios, Carlos, 2014, Harnessing the Potential of the Nonfarm Economy for Smallholders in Latin America, Thematic evaluation, ELLA Policy Briefly, Practical
---	---

agricultural productivity, rural nonfarm economic activities are seen as an alternative to agriculture for stimulating rural development. In emerging economies, the rural nonfarm economy is expected to absorb households that are unable to participate in capital-intensive modes of production or more demanding markets. Given the relatively low capital requirements for farmers in the nonfarm economy, policymakers in both settings view it as a promising mechanism for stimulating local economic development and contributing to poverty reduction efforts. As highlighted by the paper, in Latin America, nonfarm activities carried out by rural households are distributed between financial and personal services (34%), trade and transportation (23%), manufacturing (22%), and construction, mining and others (21%); similar shares as the ones seen in West Asia and North Africa. Across the region, nonfarm wage employment has experienced significant growth over the last decade, reaching 32% of total rural incomes in 2009, while self-employment income shares have remained stable at 12% of total rural income.

1. Identifying potential drivers of growth: In order to strengthen the rural nonfarm economy, it is first important to determine the key activities and factors that drive economic growth within a particular territory. In areas with large agricultural productivity and trade opportunities, labour and capital can be attracted into complementary nonfarm activities such as tourism and mining. In such contexts, agriculture is the main engine of growth and the main driver of rural nonfarm economies

2. Developing rural infrastructure: Rural nonfarm activities in Latin America are mostly developed around locations close enough to markets of a certain size. As various studies have documented, backing investments in rural infrastructure is extremely important to close the gap between rural areas and big urban ones. As infrastructure improves and market barriers fall with development, rural population become 'closer' to urban areas, and the degree of market interaction enhances, leaking into the rural economy. Also, as rural-urban connectivity improves, rural households become more dependent on urban markets and social networks, and the productivity of rural nonfarm activities often increases as a result. Likewise, improving rural infrastructure increased the participation of nonfarm incomes in the local economy.

3. Promoting access to markets: In order to move poor households from "refuge" nonfarm activities to more productive ones, improving access to agricultural markets is fundamental. Traditionally, producers' associations and cooperatives were established to overcome poor access to markets for smallholder farmers. Three new different approaches were unfolding for the last decade:

- The value chain model, which considers all actors in a particular market system, from input supply through to end market retailers, service providers, and public and private decision-makers in the enabling environment.
- Contract farming, which is a potential means to incorporate small-scale farmers into growing markets for high-value commodities. Since contracts often include the provision of seed, fertilizer and technical assistance for accessing credit and a guaranteed price at harvest, this form of vertical coordination has the potential to address many constraints to small-farm productivity while simultaneously driving development in the nonfarm sector.
- Creation of bio-fairs, ecological markets and organic markets have emerged. These markets provide a platform for producers to sell niche products – such as jams and lotions - to an increasing client base, thereby supporting their diversification into nonfarm activities.

4. Building human capital: Education and training are fundamental to provide smallholders with the new skills and knowledge they require to capitalise on emerging opportunities in the nonfarm sector.

Action, Lima, Evaluation focused on smallholder farmers and rural development in Latin American countries.



## 4.3. Social protection<sup>29</sup>

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on social protection in IE identified.

b) Challenges on social protection in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on social protection; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability; Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of social protection and determine if/how these were overcome.

*1) Include a range of stakeholders related to the IE in capacity strengthening and decision-making on social protection issues as it helps raise their awareness and strengthens their ownership of related processes. This should include government, employers and workers' organisations, and other civil society groups and may include other non-state actors such as experts from academia.*

<p>The evaluation indicated that the variety of actors that benefited from capacity strengthening as well as their involvement in the decision-making process, contributed to raising their awareness about unemployment insurance, and strengthening national ownership of this social protection scheme.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The coordination between various actors within the public administration is considered a key factor in building comprehensive and sustainable social protection systems.</li> <li>▪ The analysis indicated that the ILO's vision on social protection generally requires the consultation and contribution of actors who are not automatically involved in ILO technical interventions, e.g. civil society, private sector, various ministries and public administrations (other than the ministry of labour and/or employment), etc. In particular, the coordination between various actors within the public administration is considered a key factor in building comprehensive and sustainable social protection systems. This is illustrated by an ILO project that took advantage of the management arrangement to contribute to this new vision on social protection.</li> </ul>	<p>ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The report noted that the crisis in social protection for informal workers is so large, and the numbers involved so great, that as a matter of both principle and practicality, a multi-stakeholder approach is needed. Programmes need to include governments, the private sector, and formal and informal workers.</p>	<p>Lund, Francie, WIEGO, 2009, Social Protection and the Informal Economy: Linkages and Good Practices for Poverty Reduction and Empowerment, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OECD, Paris, Good practices extracted from SEWA and StreetNet International projects in India.</p>
<p>The analysis indicated that employers' organizations should continue to periodically assess the enabling environment through enterprise surveys, business barometers and other tools. Workers' organizations should provide services and advice on workers' rights and obligations, labour legislation and social protection for workers in SMEs.</p>	<p>ILO, 2015, Small and medium-sized enterprises and decent and productive employment creation Report IV, ILO-104th Session 2015, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
<p>The project demonstrated the ability of a set of activities, involving national stakeholders in the collection and analysis of relevant information, to debate the potential impact of a minimum set of social security protection benefits, and take the results to policy development. The project shifted thinking from addressing the needs of specific vulnerable groups or populations to considering the social protection needs of all, with universality as the goal even for the minimum</p>	<p>Voss, Eckhard; Gospel, Howard; Dornelas, Antonio; Vitols, Katrin, 2013, What works and why? : Results of a synthesis review of social dialogue interventions 2002-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>

<sup>29</sup> Note that there are also references to social protection in other sections because of the importance of this subject as related to capacity strengthening, formalising the IE and other subjects.



benefits.

2) Promote *discussion in project steering committees or other coordinating bodies on social protection* as a means to enhance the capacities of members and address social protection in addressing the IE.

The evaluation indicated that the social partners expressed their enthusiasm about the role played by the project steering committees, particularly because it enhanced their capacity to tackle social protection and employment issues through social dialogue.

ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

3) Promote the registration of IE workers in social security systems by working directly with IE operators and their workers.

The evaluation found that an innovation of the project has helped demonstrate that the brick kiln workers and their employers could be convinced to register for the social security cards for the workers. Note: Determine if details of this GP are available. Evaluation manager Neetu Lamba

Raouf Ali, Samia, 2013, Empowering Vulnerable Groups through Education, Employment and Training (EET) – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

4) Emphasise the *dissemination of information to people dependent on the IE on social protection* resources that may be available to them. Where associations of workers dependent on the informal economy cannot provide access to social protection themselves, provide support establishing linkages of IE operators and workers with social protection service through exchanges and meetings. Such events can help foster information sharing on good practices and lessons learned.

The evaluation noted that the Kenyan training materials describes key agencies involved in various social protection issues and their roles so that they can be contacted for any further information should the need arise.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

The evaluation noted that an innovation of the project has helped demonstrate that the brick kiln workers and their employers could be convinced to register for the social security cards for the workers.  
The evaluation also noted the successful innovation to link women and men brick kiln workers with the Punjab Employees Social Security Institute (PESSI) of the Government of Punjab.

Raouf Ali, Samia, 2013, Empowering Vulnerable Groups through Education, Employment and Training (EET) – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, ILO 2013, Pakistan.

The evaluation determined that changes in revenue collection and management systems would be more effective and acceptable to the people when they better understand what they are likely to gain from the changes.

Munene, Charles, 2013, Improvement of livelihoods for vulnerable in urban and peri-urban areas of Galkayo – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

StreetNet itself does not get involved in promoting or providing access to social protection. It does however build bridges between organizations, and through exchanges and meetings, vendors are exposed to the different practices in different countries. India's National Alliance of Street Vendors of India, for example, has much to teach others about the legislation on social protection for the unorganized sector. At a meeting of WIEGO affiliates in Durban in 2006, there was much interest from the StreetNet International Council members in the new

Lund, Francie, WIEGO, 2009, Social Protection and the Informal Economy: Linkages and Good Practices for Poverty Reduction and Empowerment, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OECD, Paris, Good practices extracted from SEWA and StreetNet International projects

health insurance scheme in Ghana, now available to streetvendors.

in India.

5) Ensure that project beneficiaries are provided with the best available insurance solutions in line with their needs and their disposable assets. Obtain workers' opinion and insights to understand which option could be considered as the most suitable.

The evaluation concludes that the Harita Programme in Ethiopia made large use of the "weather index insurance" (WII). The WII<sup>30</sup> is a relatively new but innovative approach to insurance provision that pays out benefits on the basis of a predetermined index (e.g. rainfall level) for loss of assets and investments, primarily working capital, resulting from weather and catastrophic events, without requiring the traditional services of insurance concludes assessors. It also allows for quicker and more objective insurance settlement processes to be.

The project made payments contingent on recorded rainfall rather than yields. Basing payments on rainfall eliminated the costly moral hazard problems involved in verifying yields on smallholder farms and therefore made the premiums more affordable. In the event of a seasonal drought, insurance pay-outs were triggered automatically when rainfall dropped below a pre-determined threshold at a pre-determined time during the growing season. HARITA relied on satellite data for rainfall measures.

How to pay for this insurance? In the HARITA team's conversations with farmers, the farmers themselves suggested a solution – they could pay for insurance with their labour. Oxfam America worked with the Relief Society of Tigray and the Government of Ethiopia to build an "insurance-for-work" program on top of the government's "food- and cash-for-work" Productive Safety Net Program (PSNP), a well-established program that serves eight million chronically food-insecure households in Ethiopia. The resulting innovation allowed cash-poor farmers who were PSNP participants the option to work for their insurance premiums on the risk reduction activities. During the 2010 growing season, 80% of farmers who bought insurance were PSNP participants who paid with labour, while in 2012 93% paid with labour in those villages in which farmers had the option to pay with labour. Risk reduction activities began after farmers had purchased insurance since the amount of insurance purchased determined the amount of labour that farmers had to provide.

The evaluation points out that the insurance pay-out may improve livelihoods by allowing farmers to preserve food consumption and/or their asset holdings after a drought and to repay their loans. Farmers who receive an insurance pay-out may not need to sell assets in order to feed their families and to repay loans.

Therefore, farmers may maintain higher yields in subsequent seasons, preserving food security and livelihoods. These effects may also influence migration patterns since men from farming household may be less likely to migrate if livelihoods at home improve.

The second effect is on productive investments and consumption in growing seasons with good rainfall. The threat of drought may cause farmers to invest less in all seasons and to avoid borrowing to finance investments because farmers worry that investments will be wiped out by drought. The promise of an insurance pay-out that will help to repay loans and buy food in case of a drought may enable farmers to increase investments, translating into higher yields, assets, and incomes in good seasons, and therefore improved food security and livelihoods in all seasons.

Madajewicz, Malgosia; Haile Tsegay, Asmelash; Norton, Michael, 2013, Managing Risks to Agricultural Livelihoods: Impact Evaluation of the Harita Program in Tigray, Ethiopia, 2009–2012, Impact evaluation, OXFAM America, Boston.

6) Consider in project design when carrying out livelihood projects with people dependent on the IE in post-emergency contexts that cash grants may be more preferable than direct distribution of

<sup>30</sup>[http://www.ifc.org/wps/wcm/connect/industry\\_ext\\_content/ifc\\_external\\_corporate\\_site/industries/financial+markets/retail+finance/insurance/index+insurance+-+frequently+asked+questions](http://www.ifc.org/wps/wcm/connect/industry_ext_content/ifc_external_corporate_site/industries/financial+markets/retail+finance/insurance/index+insurance+-+frequently+asked+questions)

commodities. Cash grants allow beneficiaries to purchase high quality, highly specific products, and avoid the delays experienced in commodity procurement and distribution. Note that those in authority may be suspicious of cash grants, suggesting that people could not be trusted to spend them appropriately.

The evaluation indicated that beneficiaries almost universally preferred cash grants to distributions of commodities. A range of reasons were given for this, including the ability to purchase high quality, highly specific products, and the delays experienced in commodity procurement and distribution. It was evident that those in authority were very suspicious of cash grants, suggesting that people could not be trusted to spend them appropriately. This concern is not borne out by the fieldwork, or by analysis of the various monitoring data made available to the evaluation team.	Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation, Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.
---	--

7) Ensure that design of activities to support people dependent on the IE are well coordinated with government social protection programmes.

The evaluation noted that intervention on livelihoods is well coordinated with the Government of Liberia's social safety net strategy	ACF International and Welt Hunger Hilfe, 2014, Rapid Food and Livelihoods Security Assessment, Other Evaluation, ACF International and Welt Hunger Hilfe, Berlin – Bonn.
---	--

8) Promote and facilitate the use of multi-stakeholder approaches to develop social protection approaches for people dependent on the informal economy.

The evaluation noted that the crisis in social protection for informal workers is so large, and the numbers involved so great, that as a matter of both principle and practicality, a multi-stakeholder approach is needed. Programmes needs to include governments, the private sector, and formal and informal workers.	Lund, Francie, WIEGO, 2009, Social Protection and the Informal Economy: Linkages and Good Practices for Poverty Reduction and Empowerment, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OECD, Paris, Good practices extracted from SEWA and StreetNet International projects in India.
---	---

9) Support the clear articulation of access to social protection in employment policies, including for people dependent on the IE.

The evaluations stressed that the ILO's vision of social protection includes not only the classic preventive measures (insurance) but devotes more attention to assistance measures for the poorest as well as measures to enhance and stabilize income levels. This new vision on social protection was formulated in the concept of Social Protection Floor (2009) with particular emphasis on the need to better articulate employment policies to guarantee services and social transfers across the life cycle, paying particular attention to vulnerable groups.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
--	--

10) Facilitate the strengthening of *capacities and understanding of the linkages between social protection and employment*. That includes the importance of social protection as an element that contributes to the protection of workers who are dependent on the IE.

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

The evaluation pointed out that advocacy and training on the linkages between social protection and employment is needed in order to design new interventions or new activities. The evaluation found that not all the local stakeholders were convinced that the ILO has full clarity concerning the integrated approach and how both employment and social protection policies can be coordinated. It was said that the ILO still promotes two bodies of policies (one for employment and one for social protection) even though the target population is basically the same. This introduces an element of confusion among local authorities.	Pacheco Jiménez, José Francisco, 2013, Improving social protection and promoting employment, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic "improving social protection and promoting employment in Burkina Faso, Cambodia and Honduras".
Collaboration with local government institutions will be useful in future interventions. Awareness and capacity building of community and local government officers and political authorities will be useful from a long term point of view.	Samaranayake, Mallika R.; Velupillai, Krishna, 2011, Mid-term Evaluation of Outcome 7: "Socio-economic recovery in the North and East" under the UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) 2008-2012 (Sri Lanka), Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, New York.
The evaluation noted that collaboration with the ILO/EU Improving Social Protection and Promoting Employment project, which is implemented as a response to the National Social Protection Strategy (NSPS) of the government of Cambodia has also been very limited.	Mingoen, Harlette, 2012, Social Protection and Gender in Cambodia Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation noted the importance of linking employment, social protection, social dialogue and international labour standards. There is recognition of the inter-dependence of these objectives, which the Declaration describes as "inseparable, interrelated and mutually supportive". Failure to promote any one of these objectives hinders progress towards achieving the others.	Henry, Carla; Dearden, Philip N., 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

11) It is important for donors to *take into consideration the length of time that is needed to build capacity and/or influence policy*, particularly in the lesser known components linked to social protection and workers' rights.

The evaluation noted that for the donors to recognize the time that it takes, for example, to build capacity and/or influence policy, particularly in the lesser-known components linked to job quality, workers' rights and social protection.	Henry, Carla; Dearden, Philip N., 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
---	---

12) *Take into consideration that:*

- Workers dependent on the IE face different vulnerabilities at different periods of their lives, and thus need different mechanisms of social protection at different times
- Donors have a special role to play in exploring the potential of mainstreaming social protection for informal workers into existing formal institutions, while continuing to support innovative ways of building independent institutions where appropriate.
- Facilitate the fostering of dialogues and coordination between organizations of formal and informal workers, governments, and the corporate sector.

The analysis indicated that time is a key variable in social protections framework. The sequencing of the life cycle is important, recognizing that in practical ways, informal workers face different vulnerabilities at different periods of their lives, and thus need different mechanisms of social protection at different times. The coordination between various actors within the public administration is	Lund, Francie, WIEGO, 2009, Social Protection and the Informal Economy: Linkages and Good Practices for Poverty Reduction and Empowerment, General background document on issues in our research matrix,
---	--

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

considered a key factor in building comprehensive and sustainable social protection systems.	OECD, Paris, Good practices extracted from SEWA and StreetNet International projects in India.
The evaluation noted that the case studies indicate the importance and potential results of a dedicated social protection project in all countries, supported by appropriate specialists on Decent Work Teams. All countries need support to improve social protection as an integral and indispensable part of the ILO development assistance package.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

13) Project design in projects directed to people dependent on the IE need to *analyse past and current policies in diverse subject areas that include attention to issues such as social protection* even if these are not included in the explicitly stated outputs and activities.

The evaluation noted that technical cooperation projects often need to go beyond the specific outputs and activities designed in the project document to actually achieve the stated objectives. That is they need to achieve the detailed exploration of past and current public policies in very diverse areas (education, fiscal, enterprise development, social protection, poverty reduction and so on). Such work often requires that technical cooperation projects go beyond the specific outputs and activities designed in the project document to actually achieve the stated objectives.	Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
--	---

14) Note when developing project design that targeted *social protection (including safety nets)* may offer extremely vulnerable people better alternatives than support for micro-credit. A broad analysis of experience targeting destitute and extremely vulnerable people indicates that social safety net programs and investments in infrastructure and production technology may offer better alternatives than microcredit.

The analysis indicated that targeted social safety net programs and investments in infrastructure and production technology offer destitute and extremely vulnerable people better alternatives than microcredit (e.g., food security programs, wage employment in small and medium enterprises).	Consultative Group to Assist the Poor (2006), Good Practice Guidelines for Funders of Microfinance, Meta-analysis of evaluations, CGAP, The World Bank, Washington DC.
Targeted social safety net programs and investments in infrastructure and production technology offer destitute and extremely vulnerable people better alternatives than microcredit, That is safety net in food security programs, wage employment in small and medium enterprises).	Consultative Group to Assist the Poor, 2006, Good Practice Guidelines for Funders of Microfinance, Meta-analysis of evaluations, CGAP, The World Bank, Washington DC.
The thematic evaluation of WFP's programming on livelihoods is increasingly finding itself engaged in debates about the role of food assistance within wider approaches to social protection. This potentially provides a different way of conceptualising livelihoods recovery. As social protection responses to chronic poverty become more widespread there may be opportunities to expand welfare safety nets during periods of crisis and to support transitions from emergency assistance to longer term social protection and safety net programmes.	Harvey, Paul; Burton, Cynthia; Wilkinson, Laura, 2009, Strategic Evaluation of the Effectiveness of WFP Livelihood Recovery Interventions, Thematic evaluation, A Report from the Office of Evaluation, WFP, Brussels, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Colombia, Lesotho, Nepal, Uganda.

15) Ensure that there is *clarity with regard to conditions under which cash or food is provided* in projects that include livelihoods (IE) support in emergency situations. That is, ensure that the conditionality criteria and extent to which they are being met are clear to all stakeholders.

The meta evaluation notes that UNHCR recommends: "Cash/food / rental	Holzaepfel, Erica A.; Jacobsen, Karen, 2015,
--	--

assistance provided by UNHCR and partners should be short-term and conditional and gradually lead to self-reliance activities as part of longer-term development.” However, making assistance conditional, i.e. where assistance is contingent on certain criteria being met (e.g. graduation from a loan program), and what these conditions should be, is controversial and difficult to implement. There is lack of guidance about what is meant by UNHCR in this sentence, and how to implement conditionality. What conditions should be attached to assistance?

Evaluating the Effectiveness of DOS/PRM Livelihoods Programs in Ethiopia and Burundi, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Social Impact Inc, Washington DC.

16) Verify if the *approaches of the Self Employed Women’s Association (SEWA) to life, asset and health insurance* can be adapted to local situations in other countries. Adapt the approaches to local contexts as needed.

The analysis noted as a good practice: the Self Employed Women’s Association’s (SEWA) integrated insurance scheme, or VIMO SEWA, has three components – life insurance, asset insurance and health insurance. It has over 102 000 members and was a response by SEWA to the concerns of members that the majority of what they earn is spent on health costs, and ill health was a major cause of loan default in their savings scheme. The health insurance helps cover the cost of seeking necessary medical attention. In so doing, it helps to avoid further loss of income in addition to that already caused by the illness or injury, such as loss of earnings. The reduction in cost of treatment is an important incentive for workers to seek medical attention when needed rather than risk continuing to work and further compounding health problems

Lund, Francie, WIEGO, 2009, Social Protection and the Informal Economy: Linkages and Good Practices for Poverty Reduction and Empowerment, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OECD, Paris, Good practices extracted from SEWA and StreetNet International projects in India.

## 4.4. Improving food security through enhancing livelihoods of people dependent on IE

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on improving food security in IE identified.

b) Challenges on improving food security in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on improving food security through enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of methods to improve the food security of people dependent on the informal economy and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) Include livelihoods promotion activities with people dependent on the IE in *food security programming as it helps ensure more sustainable nutritional well-being*.

The evaluation concluded that the livelihoods promotion component increased household, mother and children’s dietary diversity, reduced household hunger, and improved mothers’ nutritional status.

Tango International, 2015, SHOUHARDO II Final Quantitative Performance Evaluation SHOUHARDO II Multi-Year Assistance Program (MYAP) in Bangladesh, Impact Evaluation, CARE Bangladesh, Dhaka.

2) *Include nutrition training* in projects for people dependent on the IE wherever this may be relevant.



<p>Through the qualitative fieldwork, the evaluation found good indications that, in comparison with women from control villages, women from Farmer Field School (FFS) households showed remarkably more awareness and knowledge of improved nutrition, including better nutrition for pregnant women and infants, improved cooking methods, and health among others. Basically all women consulted from FFS claimed to apply the different vegetable cooking techniques, such as rinsing vegetables before cutting them, use of lids, boiling drinking water etc. According to the Evaluation, the households' diet has changed from a diet of almost only rice (bhat) and lentil soup (dal) to a diet, richer in vegetables, (more vitamins, minerals, and iron).</p> <p>There are also indications of positive replication and spin-off effects from nutrition and cooking sessions. Discussion with non-FFS households in the FFS villages indicated, that some of the women, who are related to FFS participants or have frequent interactions with women who participated in FFS, have learned and copied from them, concerning improved cooking techniques and also changed/improved diets. To the extent possible some have planted fruit trees or sown more vegetable seed on the homestead or land; seeds that they in many cases had purchased from FFS women.</p>	<p>Schwensen, Carl &amp; Laurence, Alida, 2011, Evaluation of the Farmer Field School Approach in the Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II, Bangladesh, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Project: Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II (ASPS II), Bangladesh.</p>
<p>The evaluation notes that there is a need for awareness raising/sensitisation in relation to nutrition and nutrition-sensitive agriculture both at national political level, but also at community level. At national level agriculture should contribute to food and nutrition security, and nutrition should also be measured as part of agricultural production and productivity.</p>	<p>Sorensen Pernille, Nagel, 2014, Supporting Food Security, Nutrition and Livelihoods in Sub-Saharan Africa - GCP /RAF/454/GER, Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.</p>

- 3) Design *detailed and statistically valid surveys in order to assess food security*, food consumption and dietary diversity of project participants. Only in this way it would be possible to compare new life-styles with those of the rest of population (not involved into the project).

<p>The evaluation shows that three separate sections of a survey allowed assessment of the project's impact on food security, food consumption and dietary diversity (a key objective of the project was to increase food security among supported households).</p>	<p>Bishop, David, 2013, Evaluation of food security and strengthening livelihood options (Zimbabwe), Final evaluation, OXFAM, Oxford.</p>
---	---

- 4) Note that work to sustainably improve the food security of project *participants requires long-term engagement*, linking with Government strategies, and strategically complementing other local development initiatives in the target area in a holistic manner.

<p>The evaluation noted that work to sustainably improve the food security of the project participants requires long-term engagement, linked with Government strategies, and strategically complementing other initiatives in the target area in a holistic manner. This approach should include: preventing depletion of assets from recurrent droughts; improving agricultural productivity (both crop and animal production) through improved technologies; improvement in health conditions of the community; provision of alternative livelihood options (both on-farm and off-farm); and improvement in markets through urban-rural linkages.</p>	<p>Tessema, Ato Tsegahun; Tadess, Beyen; Getahun, Zewditu; Buta, Ato Mengistu, 2008, Meket Livelihood Development Project MLDP (Ethiopia) phase II Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Save the Children UK, Addis Ababa.</p>
---	--

- 5) Take into consideration when assessing the productivity of informal economy operators that all factors that enter into assessing it are taken into account. This would include factors such as food production area, labour, transport, and other logistics.



The Evaluation Team found that there are many obstacles to measuring the productivity and/or profitability of groundnuts and soybean enterprises. Production measured by the number of bags per plot or per household is relatively easy, but measurement requires additional measurement of the land or labour used in production. To address this, the Consortium started a systematic assessment of productivity in 2014 through the Household Annual Beneficiary Agricultural Outcome Survey.	Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.
---	--

- 6) In projects with a food security component, ensure that there is not so much focus on the implementation of project activities (e.g. to improve product marketing) that the actual goal of increasing participants' own household food security is ignored. *Ensure the project includes guidelines for a food security agenda across all its components.*

The evaluation found that the project staff is so occupied with delivery of activities that little time and attention is given to check whether these activities contribute to the project's objective of "food security". How to market agro produce is being discussed more than checking whether enough food is available for participating families. The project has no guidelines for integrating a food security agenda across all its components, selection of livelihood options, crops, storage methods, value addition and topics for capacity building. It is important to ensure that markets are not accessed at the cost of consumption deficits.	Khot, Seemantinee, 2014, Mid-term evaluation of food security through enhanced agricultural production, diversified sources of income, value addition and marketing in Bangladesh (Mymensingh/Sherpur), Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.
The second evaluation states that widespread food insecurity still prevails in many Afghan provinces. The majority of farmers do not produce sufficient crops to meet their households needs and their investments (and subsequent indebtedness) and are primarily associated with meeting their household consumption needs, rather than to develop economic activities. Agricultural development strategies should thus be designed to help farmers diversify their livelihoods to reduce their vulnerability to shocks and empower them to enter the market economy.	Denecke, Harry W., 2013, Support to household food security and livelihood of vulnerable and food insecure farming families - GCP /AFG/061/LUX (Afghanistan), Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.

- 7) Note that *Cash for Work can have a significant impact on stimulating the local market* and thus contribute to improving the food security situation of the target communities.

The evaluation concluded that Cash for Work had a significant impact in stimulating the market and thereby contributing to improving the food security situation of the target communities. The impact would be more sustainable if Cash for Work is regulated based on local food production levels to control inflation and high grain food prices.	Tessema, Ato Tsegahun; Tadess, Beyen; Getahun, Zewditu; Buta, Ato Mengistu, 2008, Meket Livelihood Development Project MLDP (Ethiopia) phase II Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Save the Children UK, Addis Ababa.
---	---

## 4.5. Strengthening IE with attention to gender issues

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on addressing gender issues in IE identified.

b) Challenges on addressing gender issues in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on gender and IE. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation of actions on gender and IE and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Promote the carrying out of gender analysis on IE issues.* This should include analysis to reach an understanding of:

- Gender roles and responsibilities in the household and the community
- Differences in access to and control over resources and decision-making,
- Factors that constrain or facilitate equal participation of women and men in community development processes. the different capacities, needs and priorities of women and men.
- Draw on the existing knowledge and capacities of men, women, boys and girls.

<p>The evaluation recommended a thorough gender analysis, providing an understanding of gender roles and responsibilities in the household and the community, differences in access to and control over resources and decision-making, and factors that constrain or facilitate equal participation of women and men in community development processes. Gender analysis must also examine the different capacities, needs and priorities of women and men for adapting their livelihoods to climate change. Building on this analysis, program interventions must draw on the existing knowledge and capacities of men, women, boys and girls.</p>	<p>Dazé, Webb, Julie; Angie, 2010, Livelihood security in a changing climate: Insights from a program evaluation in Timor Leste, Impact evaluation, Evaluation covers analysis of evaluations of 4 projects in Timor Leste, CARE, Australia.</p>
<p>Among the 17 RNSF supported projects, OXFAM GB Kenya includes a gender analysis.</p>	<p>RNSF Supported project OXFAM GB Kenya</p>
<p>The evaluation notes that, even if women started contributing household production and income after having attended the Farmer Field School From, in the majority of the cases women were not allowed to control income from their vegetable production and needed permission from their husbands before spending it, or would have to hand over the income to their husbands, who would then decide how to spend it. Participating women are still not allowed to go to the markets (bazaar) themselves. Therefore, either their husband or sons will sell at the market, or the women will sell their products at the farm gate, to neighbours, other villagers, or vendors and traders passing by, or change their products to other products or services</p> <p>In terms of savings, relatively few of the FFS women consulted by the Evaluation were saving their own income with a Farmer Club in their own name. In most cases, women's income is spent on daily household consumption purposes, clothes, food, medicine, children's education. This very often leaves the women with no savings of their own, and still dependent on other people in case of divorce, or being abandoned or becoming a widow, although they now produce and earn cash income themselves and therefore could be more economically independent.</p> <p>Likewise in terms of loans, the Evaluation found that, the women who are members of a Farmer Club, and can take loans from there, in most cases seem to take loans and hand them over to their husbands who decide how to spend the money. In the control villages women take loans for their husbands through NGOs. From the control villages it was reported that if husbands fail to return the loans to their wives, women are forced to take other loans to repay the defaulted ones to the NGOs. The only exception to this was the women in female-headed households.</p>	<p>Schwensen, Carl &amp; Laurence, Alida, 2011, Evaluation of the Farmer Field School Approach in the Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II, Bangladesh, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Project: Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II (ASPS II), Bangladesh.</p>
<p>Even where legal systems are in place for women's property rights, lack of knowledge or weak implementation systems can affect their ability to apply their rights. This means that women have less opportunity to derive benefits from the land, use it as collateral to access finance, and hold less bargaining power within the household and community. Two interesting African cases illustrate this situation.</p> <p>- According to a 2009 OECD report, Zimbabwe has the lowest score for women's equal access to land ownership as compared to men's. Although recent campaigns on land rights have meant that women were able to access and</p>	<p>Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and</p>

<p>control land more in recent years, men lease 80% of land. Only 20% of leaseholders in Zimbabwe are landowners or leaseholders, and female –headed households have smaller plots than men. Most agricultural land in Zimbabwe belongs to the state. The Fast Track Land Reform Programme (FTLRP) in 2000 was premised on the need for more equitable access to land - women acquired between 5% and 24% in different districts in the initial allocation (USAID 2012).</p> <p>- Evidence from Ethiopia shows that after a low cost community land registration process, females were found to be more likely to rent out land.. The analysis revealed that the land reform contributed to increased land rental market participation. Female-headed households became more willing to rent out land and making land available for more efficient producers.</p>	<p>Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.</p> <p>OECD, 2009, Aid for Trade at a Glance 2009- Zimbabwe, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OECD, online publication.</p> <p>Holden, S., Deininger, K., and Ghebru, H., 2007, Impact of Land Certification on Land Rental Market Participation in Tigray Region, Northern Ethiopia, Impact evaluation, MPRA Paper, Norwegian University of Life Sciences, Ås.</p>
---	--

2) Develop a multi-dimensional index (analysis) in order to better assess the degree of women/s existing empowerment. Given that women’s empowerment characteristics vary depending on different contexts, such and index should rely on baseline interviews or studies conducted with stakeholders or local experts from the relevant areas.

Main subjects in the Index might build on the Women’s Empowerment in Agriculture Index’ (WEAI) developed by the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative (OPHI) with support from the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI). See <https://www.ifpri.org/weai-training-materials>

Aspects that might be included for an index with women dependent on the IE and extracted from the Women’s Empowerment in Agriculture Index’ (WEAI):

- Self-perception and personal change (self-confidence; self-efficacy; opinion on women’s economic role, gender rights, property rights, freedom of movement, power within the house)
- Personal freedom (personal autonomy, attitude to gender-based violence)
- Domestic violence; knowledge where to go and what to do in the case of violence)
- Access to & control over resources; decisions & influence (control over sexuality)
- Involvement in expenditure-investment-management decisions of the household; influence in women’s group and community decision making)
- Support from Social Network (participation in groups)
- Level of support provided by groups to pursue own initiative)
- Care and unpaid work (ability to redistribute burden of care responsibilities)
- Attitude towards and awareness of care work; women have more time for leisure and socialising.

<p>The evaluation clarifies the kind of approach that was used to assess a multi-dimensional concept, such as women's empowerment. This approach was built on the 'Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index' (WEAI) developed by the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative (OPHI) with support from the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI).</p>	<p>Lombardini, Simone &amp; Yoshikawa, Kanako, 2015, Impact evaluation of the project 'Piloting gender sensitive livelihoods in Karamoja' (Uganda), Impact evaluation, OXFAM's effectiveness review 2014/2015, OXFAM, Oxford.</p>
--	---

Using the WEAI approach, the index used in the evaluation assesses six dimensions of women's empowerment. Several indicators were specified for each of these six dimensions. There is no one generic set of 'women's empowerment' characteristics that are applicable to all contexts. Given this, efforts were made to specify characteristics relevant to the specific area where the survey was carried out through a workshop conducted with a range of project stakeholders, including Oxfam staff, partner organisations and local consultant experts in the area. In particular, the six dimensions and the 26 characteristics identified were: 1) self-perception and personal change (self-confidence; self-efficacy; opinion on women's economic role, gender rights, property rights, freedom of movement, power within the house); personal freedom (personal autonomy, attitude to gender-based violence; domestic violence; knowledge where to go and what to do in the case of violence); access to & control over resources; decisions & influence (control over sexuality; involvement in expenditure-investment-management decisions of the household; influence in women's group and community decision making); Support from Social Network (participation in groups; level of support provided by groups to pursue own initiative); Care and unpaid work (ability to redistribute burden of care responsibilities; attitude towards and awareness of care work; women have more time for leisure and socialising).

3) Use gender audit tools such as the Service Quality Check for Supporting Female and Male Operated Small Enterprises to determine if the organisation providing effective support to people dependent on the informal economy and small enterprises. The tool permits the organisation to identify for improvement in the way in which an organization reaches out to and serves both women and men. Consult – WEAI Training Materials:

[http://www.ilo.ch/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/---emp\\_ent/---ifp\\_seed/documents/instructionalmaterial/wcms\\_248595](http://www.ilo.ch/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/---ifp_seed/documents/instructionalmaterial/wcms_248595)

The evaluation determined that the ILO's Gender Audit tool, was appreciated by the Ministry of Women's Affairs.

Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Trikha, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

The evaluation noted the use of the Service Quality Check for Supporting Female and Male Operated Small Enterprises (FAMOS ) Check which is a tool for doing a self-check of one's own organization. It is normally carried out by an internal team with support from external facilitators. The goal of the self-check is to identify opportunities for improvement in the way in which an organization reaches out to and serves both women and men, i.e. Female And Male Operated Small and micro enterprises.

Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

4) Include in project design *attention to women's empowerment within the household and community*. Household and community empowerment can also be the result of economic empowerment but is best specifically stimulated in conjunction with economic empowerment.

Combining women's economic empowerment with strengthening their empowerment within the household and community can have positive results. The evaluation found strong and significant effects on women's empowerment both within and outside the household. In particular, it found that women in project areas were more likely to report having a greater say in key intra-household decisions, and to take action on public problems. Women in project areas were

Khanna, Madhulika; Kochhar, Nishtha; Palaniswamy, Nethra, 2015, A Retrospective Impact Evaluation of the Tamil Nadu Empowerment and Poverty Alleviation (Pudhu Vaazhvu) Project, Impact evaluation, The Journal of Development

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

more likely to approach the local state, as manifest in the office of the VP president and the Grama Sabha, in order to seek a solution for these problems. In addition, we find strong evidence of increased participation in the deliberative forums of local government. While this increased participation also extends to other households members, the increase is particularly high for women. This result on women's participation in Grama Sabhas.	Studies, 51:9, 1210-1223, DOI: 10.1080/00220388.2015.1028538.
The evaluation noted that impressive changes had occurred among the members of the saving and credit groups, who are by 80% women. These women had changed from the beginning of the project: they have increased self-reliance, act differently, speak up in public, are better able to plan their lives and they support their group members.	Martins, Christine; Khaing, Aye Aye, 2013, Evaluation Report Improved food and livelihood security for poor families in Pauk Township, Dry Zone, Burma / Myanmar, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
Women felt strengthened in their families and communities and attributed this to their own incomes and increased self-confidence.	Melsbach; Gerlind; Joshi, Dilli Raj, 2015, Food Security and Disaster Risk Reduction for Marginalized People in Rural Areas of Eastern Nepal, Implemented by Rural Reconstruction Nepal Evaluation on behalf of Welthungerhilfe, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
Business training leads to a broad range of positive outcomes among women, from improved business practices to increased skills and higher empowerment.	Stangl, Anne; Farley, Kathryn; Sievwright, Kirsty; Brady, Laura; Fritz, Katherine, 2015, Enhancing women's entrepreneurship in Kenya: Initial qualitative assessment of the ILO's GET Ahead business training programme (Kenya), Impact evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

5) In projects with people dependent on the IE, *include a specific component on gender mainstreaming* and ensure that it is well articulated in the project design. Ensure that this includes development of training and policies that take the different needs of female and male operators/workers into account.

The evaluation determined that, by including a specific component on gender mainstreaming and targeting specifically the different needs of female and male entrepreneurs through training and policy development, the project demonstrates its relevance for inclusive private sector development.	Schoen, Christian; Mousaco, Vino, 2013, Business opportunities and support services (BOSS) - Midterm Evaluation (Timor Leste), Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation highly recommended to design and implement future interventions in the Philippines making use of the Gender Mainstreaming Resource Kit (GMRK) developed by the Philippine Commission on Women (PCW) and the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA).	Carravilla, Carlos, 2013, Alternatives to migration: Decent Jobs for Filipino youth Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation noted that a number of returning success factors can be observed in those projects which managed to achieve more in this area. A first condition relates to the need to translate the gender mainstreaming approach into explicit strategies operationalized in all project activities or components. To be able to develop such strategies, project staff and partners need to be supported by methodological (gender analysis, gender budgeting, gender audit) and practical tools (manuals, best practices).	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation determined that there were some challenges in the logical framework did exist, including the lack of an indicator on gender issues. As several stakeholders stated such an indicator would be useful to ensure increased focus on gender issues.	Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
The analysis found a need to reinforce the gender approach and formal gender capacity building. Consider the need to carry out gender analysis and establish a	Rodriguez-Ariza, Carlos, 2014, Typhoon Bopha Philippines: Application of Local Resource-

gender framework for integration in the project log frame.	based Employment Generation Approach (PHI/12/08/AUS) and Joint Response Based Employment Generations and Livelihood Recovery Interventions (PHI/13/03/AUS), Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
Interventions on Equality and Non-Discrimination at Work, including the action oriented study on Gender Equality and Working and Living Conditions of Garment Factory Workers in Cambodia should be more at the forefront, followed by interventions as action oriented responses.	Mingoen, Harlette, 2012, Social Protection and Gender in Cambodia Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation found that the project succeeded in providing women from targeted villages with minimal income. When a woman who never had her own income and is now earning 20 Sudanese Pounds (SDG), she says "this money is mine, I am free to do whatever I want with it" or when another woman says "I don't have to beg my husband for transport money to go and visit my relatives or go to the market; now with what I am earning I can go wherever I want without fear of rejection or denial", these two quotations are qualitative indicators of economic empowerment in a society where women have the freedom to use their income.	Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.

6) *In projects for and with women entrepreneurs, including those operating in the IE, include:*

- Working with government, employers and workers organisation and other from civil society organisations
- Strengthen the capacities of business development service providers including attention to how they can better support women entrepreneurs
- Support cooperatives.

The evaluation found that the ILO's role in the Joint Programme on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in the occupied Palestinian territory was notable. Constituents appreciated the ILO's work in: promoting gender equality with the tripartite partners by increasing the influence of gender advocates and workers' and employers' organisations in decision-making and planning; building the capacities of business development service providers to better mainstream and upstream gender equality considerations for women entrepreneurs; supporting cooperatives to better service low-income women through the provision and management of an integrated grant scheme; and developing and implementing training programmes for women in key areas that are increasingly in demand in the labour market.	Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Trikha, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva. Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.
---	---

7) *Encourage cross linkages between projects on the IE to other development programmes such on HIV, youth employment, gender-based violence and women's empowerment.*

More holistic approaches could include strengthening advocacy skills and including linkages to other programs such as those on HIV, youth employment, gender-based violence and women's empowerment.	Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
--	---



8) Include in economic empowerment projects focus on rights issues including their democratic rights in elections at the ward, county and national level. Ensure that projects participants understand the role and responsibilities of government duty bearers and community members.

The evaluation states that one of the main outcomes of the programme in Kenya was the economic empowerment of women. Those interviewed narrated how they were liberated from depending on hand-outs from their husbands to equal contributors to household income. The majority (80%) of group members supported by the project were women. They benefitted from the training on group dynamics which exposes them to aspects of accountability and transparency. It was from this training module that members learned about the rights issues and how they domesticate them in their daily lives including exercising their democratic rights in elections at the ward, county and national level. They also understood the role and responsibilities of duty bearers and claim holders

Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet & Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.

9) When conducting training in for groups that are composed of types of IE work that are often dominated by men, verify the usefulness of organising women only training groups. Study the local context to determine the need for such separate groups and ensure that training content is adapted to cover women' specific needs.

The evaluation describes Oxfam's project in Limu, Ethiopia. Oxfam worked with partners and local government to develop a Functional Adult Literacy (FAL) programme for smallholders to enhance women's economic leadership, increase production and improve the quality of organic coffee. The programme combined literacy classes with training on agricultural and financial capacity-building. To increase attendance among women smallholders, women-only groups were established and class content was adapted to cover their specific needs and areas of interest and influence.

Sahan, 2011: "Promoting Women's Role In Processing And Trading In The Assosa Enterprise In Ethiopia- Functional Adult Literacy: Sustainable, Women-Focused Capacity- Building In Ethiopia

10) Promote the *registration of associations of women* dependent on the informal economy and the formation/participation of women in trade unions.

The evaluation noted that the project is ensuring women's workers' rights in the informal sector through registration of home based workers and formation of trade unions.

Jafar, Salmar, 2013, Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

11) *Advocate for decentralised institutional strengthening on gender issues* including as it relates to women's IE work issues. This may include assigning staff positions at Ministry of Labour decentralised level and ensuring that such persons are provided with capacities on IE related issues.

In Mozambique a project on increased gender awareness among the staff of the Ministry of Labour led to the creation of a gender unit and gender focal points in each province. Subsequently the ministry was re-organised and the function of gender mainstreaming is likely to be continued. One concrete organisational change is that the Ministry and provinces funded staff positions for gender mainstreaming functions and covered necessary travel costs.

Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.



12) Ensure that gender in IE projects is adequately considered and *not limited to points such as trying to have gender balance in groups or inclusion* or some attention to gender issues in training without considering gender equality and equity causes sufficiently.

The evaluation determined that the project did not focus a great deal on addressing gender issues. This was insufficient and limited to just two main approaches. Attention was paid to ensure that the composition of the committees were as balanced as possible with both women and men. There were some discussions about gender issues in training workshops, particularly as they relate to labour laws, but there was no major focus on gender equality.	Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
---	---

13) *Consider seriously in planning how men will be included* in projects focusing on women's empowerment. Ensure that women in such projects are the primary beneficiaries of services while men can be included in awareness raising aspects. (Note that in some projects men are also beneficiaries in women's empowerment projects). When projects work with particular sectors, ensure that not only sectors that are male dominated are selected.

The evaluation noted that within the women empowerment component, 20% of the beneficiaries were men.	Andersen, Henny; Hamdy Mostafa, Marwa, 2016, Independent mid-term evaluation EGYPT Human security through inclusive socio- economic development in Upper Egypt, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
The evaluation determined that, while the project design did consider the gender dimension as per ILO guidelines, the selection of two sectors which are largely male dominated, did not provide a strong platform for attention to gender issues.	Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.

14) *Take into consideration that because a project has a focus on women workers it does not automatically mean that gender issues are addressed.* Ensure that project includes a focus on a deeper analysis of inequalities in the gender division of labour and the effect of gender on their work.

The evaluation found that many ILO staff and constituents thought gender issues were addressed because the focus was on women workers. This is in contrast to the project focusing on a deeper analysis of inequalities in the gender division of labour, although some individuals and trade unions focused on gender inequalities.	Murray, Una, 2014, Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers Swedish funding towards Outcome 5, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Paraguay, India, Zambia, Tanzania and The Philippines.
--	--

15) *Avoid delays in addressing advocacy and awareness raising* on gender issues in project time lines. Include attention to this issue at the earliest feasible stage.

The evaluation indicated at midterm that work with women parliamentarians, law enforcing agencies is planned for year four this should be reconsidered and can be started now for measuring the outcomes of the project by end of year five.	Jafar, Salmar, 2013, Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
--	---

16) Ensure that women's participation in discussion includes *participation in actual decision-making*. Include indicator(s) that will measure this.

The evaluation concluded that the promotion of women's participation in workplace level decision-making' was partly reached.	Mingoen, Hariette, 2012, Social Protection and Gender in Cambodia Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
Several of the projects among the 17 supported in the RNSF project include special attention to women's actual role in decision-making and not just their participation in discussions.	RNSF supported projects including those of AJPRODHO-JIJUKIRWA Rwanda, CEOSS Egypt, Kenya OXFAM, Young Africa Zimbabwe.

17) Ensure that *SBCC targeting both men and women is conducted* in projects related to women dependent on the IE on issues of equity in control and decision-making of household resources. Ensure that training includes both female and male trainers on women entrepreneurship activities. This helps broaden understanding of the issues between men and women, including among the trainers.

It was found that, with regard to increased incomes for the vulnerable resulting from better productivity, the project should consider the development of sensitisation packages targeting both men and women beneficiaries of the program, focusing on control of and decision making on household resource. In addition, influencing the gender balance in producer organizations to increase women participation will increase program benefits accruing to women.	i-TEC, 2011, Uganda Livelihoods And Enterprises For Agricultural Development (LEAD), Mid Term Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
Inclusion of both men and women as trainers and to participate in women's entrepreneurship development training activities.	Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

18) Ensure *explicit attention to safeguard that women are included in group formation* of associations / cooperatives.

The evaluation determined that, although women have benefited from project interventions through support to various groups, women participation needs to be actively promoted by ensuring that gender is a key criterion for group formation during mobilisation.	i-TEC, 2011, Uganda Livelihoods And Enterprises For Agricultural Development (LEAD), Mid Term Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
Several studies assert that women are often under-represented on the water user associations (WUAs) that make decisions on water schemes; and second, the payment required by WUAs (in cash or in kind) for the use of water is often beyond the means of very poor women. It is therefore often men's priorities in terms of location and use of water supplies that are listened to, and these are often different from those of women. Membership is normally restricted to registered landowners, who very often are men. But a major constraint on women's participation in planning bodies is their lack of time. The growing recognition of the multi-purpose and user nature of water supply projects is also turning attention to the need to increase female membership.	Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.
The evaluation found that women members of the Village Development Committees were not consulted and did not even attend meetings and were not informed/unaware of most decisions made by the male members.	Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP

	/SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.
--	---

19) Be aware that the *actual gender issues that may be identified in a IE project may not always be the most immediately obvious ones.*

Gender issues in a project may not always be the most immediately obvious ones.	Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environment for MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
---	---

20) It should be noted that *simply having tools on gender issues does not mean that gender mainstreaming in IE projects is automatically included.* Other factors that need to be considered are:

- Partnerships with specialised organisations,
- Allocation of sufficient time as it allows for the design, implementation and, when required, adaptation of appropriate and context-based gender mainstreaming strategies.

The mere awareness of the presence of tools is not sufficient to ensure gender mainstreaming. Project staff's previous experience with gender mainstreaming as well as partnerships with specialised organisations, and the allocation of sufficient time are key factors. Time constitutes a major cross-cutting condition as it allows for the design, implementation and, when required, adaptation of appropriate and context-based gender mainstreaming strategies, which are able to induce sustainable effects.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
--	---

21) Note that the *strategies for addressing different vulnerable groups within the same project may need to vary.* The interaction between gender, race, and other categories of difference in individual lives, social practices, institutional arrangements, disaster risks and cultural ideologies may require different approaches. This needs to be taken into account when implementing projects that include a range of types and combinations of vulnerability.

The review included a limited number of interventions combining gender with other vulnerable groups: unemployed youth, working children, people with disabilities, indigenous populations, etc. It was difficult to establish the rationale for addressing women issues in parallel with issues encountered by other groups of population, but the relevant projects seem to indicate that addressing multiple target groups with similar strategies does not work well. One of the weaknesses observed relates to the lack of 'intersectionality', namely, difficulty in addressing the interaction between gender, race, and other categories of difference in individual lives, social practices, institutional arrangements, and cultural ideologies. That analysis noted that, for instance, the project Promotion of Equality of Gender and Race in the informal economy sector in Latin America (RLA/03/52M/UKM) <sup>92</sup> successfully led to the creation of a youth and gender unit within the Ministry of Labour and Employment in Ecuador. The institutionalisation of gender mainstreaming in relevant ministries was a positive development, nevertheless the evaluators noted the risk related to: (...) the thematic dispersion in the unit: ...youth and gender have some elements	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
---	---

<p>in common that are related to discrimination against or the exclusion of significant sectors of society. Nevertheless, there are also differences and specific characteristics in each sector that could lead, under certain circumstances, to one being overshadowed by the other, as unfortunately occurred recently because of the priority that the MTE gave to addressing child labour, to the detriment of gender issues.</p> <p>Only the multi-countries project (Women's Entrepreneurship and Gender Equality: Phase 3) integrated to a certain extent an integrated approach through partnerships with organisations of people living with HIV/AIDS (Ethiopia) or with organisations of women with disabilities (United Republic of Tanzania) in order to mainstream these issues in all of the project's interventions.</p> <p>The evaluation found that analysis for project planning needed to better explore the relationships between hazards and the particular vulnerabilities of women and poorer households. Without this understanding, project design could not react how different shocks and stresses might be affecting particular groups or households differently.</p>	
<p>The evaluation noted that factors that make some groups especially vulnerable are deeper structural and systemic issues, related to social and political marginalisation, cultural rules and norms and inequitable access to resources and services. This means that livelihoods programs must go deeper in analysing and responding to differential vulnerability.</p>	<p>Dazé, Webb, Julie; Angie, 2010, Livelihood security in a changing climate: Insights from a program evaluation in Timor Leste, Impact evaluation, Evaluation covers analysis of evaluations of 4 projects in Timor Leste, CARE, Australia.</p>

22) Support the *development of networks that can help strengthen advocacy* with representatives of parliamentarians, media, duty bearers.<sup>31</sup>

<p>An approach to bridge the gap between the public and policymakers by creating and strengthening a network of women leaders to reach out to over 500 representatives of parliamentarians, media, judiciary and police has not been implemented because a grassroots women's group from amongst the trainees has to be created as a strategy. This network will be initiated during the 4th year of project which will have minimal outcome.</p>	<p>Jafar, Salmar, 2013, Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	--

23) *Review and analyse project training for women engaged in IE work to determine if they are replicable* to other situations.

See for example materials on: <http://www.ilo.org/empent/areas/womens-entrepreneurship-development-wed/lang-en/index.html>

Also consult IESF Library.

<p>The project training in South Africa on action planning for Women's Enterprise Development ED and gender mainstreaming was very useful and brought about concrete results in Mozambique.</p>	<p>Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.</p>
---	--

24) Ensure that all *training for women's economic empowerment is well conceptualised and clear strategies* with structural frameworks are developed and that include a diversity of types of training.

---

<sup>31</sup> Police, labour inspectors, social workers, etc.

At midterm, the evaluation noted that while women's capacity development is a key project outcome it still needed to develop a concept, a strategy and an improved structural framework (financial allocation) regarding women's capacity development, intensify and diversify the training.

Hempel, Hendrik, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation Food security and livelihood support of war and drought affected population in the Red Sea State - Sudan, Midterm or interim evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.

25) Ensure that decisions on project actions, such as the establishment of *women's training centres* should be made strategically and take the need to link training to social empowerment into account.

The evaluation team observed that decisions about the establishment of women training centres were made in a hasty manner without a strategic vision linking training to social empowerment. No provision of facilities for adaptive agro-processing technologies and information.

Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.

26) Ensure that *women are included* in meetings, decision-making and beneficiary registration processes.

The evaluation noted that there is a need for staff to consciously address issues of ensuring adequate inclusion of women in meetings, decision-making and registration processes.

Gourley, Deborah, 2012, Evaluation of NRC Food Security and Livelihoods Projects in Chipinge and Chiredzi Districts, Zimbabwe, 2011-12, Final evaluation, Norwegian Refugee Council, Oslo.

27) Consider in training materials that women's basic level of education may be inadequate to sufficiently understand the materials ideally. *Materials should be adapted prior to training* and not rely on facilitators to adapt them during the training itself as some may not be able to do so adequately.

The evaluation indicated that the low level of initial awareness and basic education of some of the women entrepreneur participants in Mozambique, Lesotho, and Malawi rendered it difficult to effectively reach some of the enterprises. While they may be doing well enough in their business to be growth oriented they may not be sufficiently educated to understand the materials ideally. Some trainers are good at adapting methods during training but others need more guidance on how to do so.

Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa- Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.

28) When planning training on women's empowerment and skills, *take into account possible problems of distance to/from the training venues and how the socio-cultural context affects their participation*. Women's participation in empowerment trainings may be extremely challenging, since women may have to break with traditions to participate.

The evaluation found that women, after having participated in Farmer Field School, have more knowledge and can contribute to household income, food security and improved nutrition. According to the female FFS participants themselves, the relationship with their husbands has definitely improved and they now have more decision-making power in the households in general, especially over small scale investments in production, food, and children's issues, child education and other reproductive responsibilities, including family planning.

Schwensen, Carl & Laurence, Alida, 2011, Evaluation of the Farmer Field School Approach in the Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II, Bangladesh, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Project: Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II (ASPS II), Bangladesh.

<p>However, the FFS seem to have had minimal impact on the gender division of who gets the last word in 'big decision-making' on larger agricultural investments and land ownership, child-marriage, child labour, polygamy, male employment and migration. Men still make the final decision on those issues, although women seem to be more consulted now, than before. There is no evidence that FFS has had any positive impacts, or led to any significant changes, regarding women's mobility and access to markets and the public sphere in general. To be able to participate in the FFS, the women had to be 'pulled' out of their comfort zone/home-stead and obliged to break conservative Purdah rules, often initially against their husbands will, but still within the village. In fact most women said, that if FFS had been held outside their own village area, they would not were allowed to participate.</p>	
<p>ActionAid India (one of 17 IPs) has taken their skills training to the neighbourhoods where women live in cases where women are unable to move far from home to attend such training.</p>	<p>RNSF: Contribution by ActionAid India on Cap4Dev IESF Group.</p>

29) Involving groups of women in extended training programme requires *strict attention to*:

- Women actual involvement in decision making and active participation
- Utility of women training centres and content course
- Geographical needs and habits of participant groups.

<p>Then, the establishment of several women training centres has provided an opportunity for women to come together and meet, this is especially true within closed cultures such as rural Kassala. The potential of using these centres has not been fully explored. In fact it is undermined by adopting the "one package training module" regardless of the location or specificity of the context. For example, training women in al-Gurashi village on biscuit and cake making seems irrelevant and the time, resources and effort could were spent in more training in the preservation of produce by dehydration in a place where horticulture products, in particular onion and tomato, are strongly encouraged by the project, thus linking women directly to production and marketing.</p> <p>Another critical issue concerns geographical areas. It is not logical to have the same training package for women in towns or close to towns as for women in remote rural areas. Needs and habits are so different that training utility has necessarily to be diversified.</p>	<p>Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.</p>
---	---

30) To enhance mainstreaming of gender equality and equity, include in TVET projects:

- Infant day care if needed;
- An analysis of gender dynamics to determine support males in female participants household and means to increase such support if necessary.

<p>The analysis indicated that, to enhance mainstreaming of gender equality and equity, the programme should create a small budget item to: (a) support day baby care facility (crèche) for deserving young women to enhance their effective participation training at the vocational training centres under the QIA component; and (b) carry out a short and focused study on gender dynamics to determine ways and means of eliciting effective and long term "buy-in" of women's (females) participation among the male-spouses.</p>	<p>Karuga, Stanley; Zimbizi, George, 2013, Skills for Youth Employment and Rural Development in Western and Southern Africa Programme (Zimbabwe Component) – Midterm evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	--



The evaluation of the Start and improve your business (Phase III) project in Papua New Guinea (PNG03/02/AUS)90 found that Start Your Own Business programmes which target women need to ensure that husbands understand the benefits of the training and tolerate the disruptions this might cause to the family routine. In one case where this aspect was overlooked, participants faced domestic violence.	ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation noted that the project design lacked a gender needs assessment in order to get the most accurate picture of gender based inequities and gaps relating to the work areas.	Carravilla, Carlos, 2013, Alternatives to migration: Decent Jobs for Filipino youth Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

31) TVET *should include the identification of traditionally male-dominated skills training and job areas in order to increase the opportunities of female trainees on the job market.* Likewise, males may also enter into training that may be dominated by females. *Consider promoting TVET training access in skills not traditionally carried out by either men or women.* While changing the stereotyping of skills may be difficult, breaking the mould can provide more opportunities for both women and men.

The evaluation determined that the ILO and its constituents should identify new ideas to enable girls, especially, to venture into typical male-dominated skills training and job areas in order to increase their opportunities on the job market.	Nycander, Lotta; Riechi, Andrew, 2013, Creating the enabling environment to establish models for child labour free areas in Kenya – Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
The evaluation noted that there were women in the project who had selected male-dominated skills areas such as plumbing. In general however 'gender stereotyping' remains in the selection of skills. While it is of course not easy to break stereotyping, it is also noted that the project did not seem to have explicit efforts seem to made by to encourage women to choose more male-dominated skills areas and vice versa.	UNIDO, 2015, Reintegration for Liberian Returnees through Skills Training and Job Creation, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
Many of the courses offered were traditionally male orientated skills courses such as building construction, welding and carpentry. Due to the initially low rate of enrolment of women in such courses, attempts were made to encourage their participation through holding courses in the evening and adding in courses such as hospitality and product design.	UNIDO, 2014, Integration and progress through protection and empowerment of displaced groups in South Sudan, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
The evaluation found that, while the project met or exceeded its gender-based beneficiary target (50 %) the assessment and design process did not produce a gender strategy to identify obstacles to women's entry into the labour market, or otherwise be economically active. As a result, the counterparts programmed mainly in their zone of comfort (sewing/tailoring), while offering limited innovation or resource allocation on "non-traditional" areas of employment or strategies for moving women into the labour market.	Gairdner, David; Al-Allaf, Riadh; Mandelik, Florence, 2013, Independent Evaluation, The Republic Of Iraq, Evaluation of Micro Enterprises for Reintegration of Internally Displaced Persons in Thi Qar Governorate, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

32) A *gender-aware approach about labour saving technologies and on-farm activities* requires ensuring that women have plenty control over the tools. A gender-transformative approach requires asking whether technologies are designed to meet women's needs and whether women are involved in the innovation systems, both as clients and as providers of innovations. Ergonomically designed equipment for women can reduce strain and make their labour more productive.

<p>It is important to understand gender dimensions of access and control to equipment when introducing new technologies. In general the more valuable the equipment is, the less likely that the woman will have access to it. USAID (2012) found that in Zimbabwe:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Women do not have control or access to agricultural large equipment, in particular tractors, carts, ploughs, wheelbarrows.</li> <li>▪ Traditional gender roles mean that women do not try to use the equipment; and they rely on a son or male member of the family to use the equipment or hire labour out.</li> <li>▪ Many female headed households, in particular widows, lack the financial resources to hire labour.</li> </ul> <p>A joint study by Practical Action and IFAD (Carr and Hartl, 2010) carried a systematic review of programmes and practice over the last three decades. Ergonomically designed equipment for women can reduce strain and make their labour more productive. Tools and equipment appropriate for tasks that women carry out such as planting, weeding and grinding do exist, but there are many barriers to their adoption. Weeding with short-handled hoes is the most punishing and time-consuming task for women; long-handled hoes are available that could reduce the strain of squatting, but in many parts of Africa these are rejected for cultural reasons. Manufacturers of farm implements make different weights of hoes, including very light ones that are better suited to women's needs, but most women are unaware of the full range of available tools.</p>	<p>USAID Zimbabwe, 2012: "Gender Analysis and Assessment for Feed the Future Programming"; Report.</p>
<p>Lighter tools are also available to use with donkeys are also available and generally, unlike with oxen, no taboos exist on women working with donkeys. Time saving can be significant - a donkey-drawn inter-crop cultivator could reduce weeding time per acre from 2 to 4 weeks to 2 to 4 days. However women lack the cash to purchase such equipment and their husbands may see no need to purchase donkeys and equipment for their wives when the work can be done by hand at no cost. In addition, animal draught technologies are seen as being men's domain, and animal traction training courses tend to be restricted to men. Development programmes that have distributed donkeys and donkeys and equipment have not been sustainable due to women's inability to pay for drugs to keep their animals disease free.</p>	<p>Carr, R. M., and Hartl, M., 2010, Lightening the Load: Labour-saving technologies and practices for rural women (African countries), General background document on issues in our research matrix, IFAD, Warwickshire.</p>

### 33) Follow an 8-step strategy to prepare a sound programme enhancing women's access to markets:

- Prepare gender analysis tools
- Undertake a value chain analysis
- Improve micro-macro linkages
- Pursue a life cycle approach
- Support entitlement and capabilities programs
- Promote clustering and networking
- Expand access to credit and financial services
- Address informality.

<p>A study USAID (2005) compiled by focused on enhancing women's access to markets, drew on donor experience to elicit key areas of best practice:</p> <p>1) Use gender analysis tools to design, implement, and evaluate projects and programs. It will enable greater understanding of the inequalities in power that underlie gender- differentiated outcomes in markets and identify points of</p>	<p>Gammage S., Diamond, N. and Packman, M., 2005, Enhancing Women's Access to Markets: An Overview of Donor Programs and Best Practices, Review of multiple projects and/or actions, GATE Analysis</p>
--	--

<p>intervention, as well as strategies to engage potential beneficiaries.</p> <p>2) Undertake a value chain analysis to identify opportunities for women's broader participation in markets. Analysing the global value chain and the rents generated, provides opportunities to target assistance and inputs and provide incentives to reduce the number of intermediaries, increase the bargaining power of producers, and ensure access-appropriate processing technology, storage, and transport facilities enable resource-poor producers to capture more of the value added in the global value chain.</p> <p>3) Improve micro-meso-macro linkages: Linking smaller suppliers and buyers can minimise predatory pricing and monopsony impacts and overcome concerns about volume and production reliability that larger entrepreneurs have towards small entrepreneurs.</p> <p>4) Pursue a life cycle or livelihoods approach: Some interventions and support to increase market access may need to be short-run and agile such as emergency food-for-work programmes. Other programmes may need to create and encourage the expansion of financial instruments and social insurance to mitigate risk, insure inventories, and provide access to pensions and social security.</p> <p>5) Support entitlement and capabilities programs: Successful projects and programs pay attention both to inputs as well as to the individual or group ability to deploy these inputs.</p> <p>6) Promote clustering and networking: Groups of women producers may be able to access services collectively, which they might not be able to purchase as individual entrepreneurs. Additionally, groups requiring the same service are usually in a better negotiating position with potential suppliers or can bargain more effectively with buyers than they could alone.</p> <p>7) Expand access to credit and financial services: Microfinance remains a powerful tool to provide financial resources to the underserved and compensate for the absence of financial markets.</p> <p>8) Address informality. Women cluster in informal markets and face particular barriers to formalising production. Efforts to reduce administrative and regulatory barriers, promote tax reform that can lift burdens on smaller enterprises, and generalise access to social security, pensions, and health-benefits can greatly affect the terms and conditions of women's employment and enhance their security in the informal economy.</p>	<p>Document, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
--	--

*34) Promote and facilitate women's role in small seed enterprises* such as community seed banks and seed fairs, and implement monitoring and evaluation of results to verify income benefits.

<p>DFID's paper reports findings from an FAO, IFAD and World Bank publication (2008) highlighting the following gender issues around access and use of seeds:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Women are increasingly part of small seed enterprises such as community seed banks and seed fairs, and further monitoring and evaluation of results is required to assess the benefits.</li> </ul>	<p>Turrall, Susanne, 2013, <i>A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor</i>, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.</p> <p>Farnworth, C., and Jiggins, J., 2003, <i>Participatory Plant Breeding and Gender Analysis</i>, Thematic evaluation, PPB Monograph No. 4, Centro Internacional de Agricultura Tropical (CIAT), Santiago de Cali (Colombia).</p> <p>Bourdillon, M. F. C.; Hebinck, P.; Hoddinott, J.; Kinsey, W. B.; Marondo, J.; Mudege, N.; Owens, T., 2007, <i>Assessing The Impact Of High-Yield Varieties Of Maize In Resettlement Areas Of Zimbabwe</i>, Impact</p>
---	--

	evaluation, Discussion Paper 181, IFPRI, Washington DC.
--	---

35) In projects where the goal is to establish both individual and group enterprises—such as those that can help finance own women’s group functioning—note that *project design needs to include comprehensive support to cover both individual and sustainable group enterprises*.

The evaluation team is of the opinion that the TVET course has rather compromised its effectiveness regarding gender. This is because training and provision of equipment for women were effective to improve their livelihoods but weak to develop sustainable micro and small enterprises related to the Village Committees and job opportunities about agro processing activities.	Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, “The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation” 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.
---	---

36) Identify methodologies *encouraging simultaneous participation in empowerment programmes of both women and men*. Include awareness raising of participants about shared household decision-making, as well as improving influencing skills and generating confidence in women.

<p>The evaluation focuses on the Gender Action Learning System approach (GALS), used to empower women. GALS is a community-led empowerment methodology aiming to promote economic, social and political transformation of gender justice. The approach involves women and men developing achievable visions for change together, journeys and road maps. The project established 10 women's groups consisting of 40 women members each. The participants were then equipped with tool kits to promote savings and investment opportunities and received training in order to increase knowledge for running small enterprises and businesses. The project also supported women's groups in gaining access to loans to start new business. Women groups selected different vocational skills in existing enterprises that they wanted to develop. These include bakeries, hair dressing, tailoring, hand crafts and poultry-rearing. Equipment and inputs, such as sewing machines, needed to start up the business was also provided. In addition, women's husbands were trained jointly with their wives using the GALS approach. This was expected to improve gender relations and women's rights within the household and community.</p> <p>The evaluation found that project activities conducted using the WEE activities are associated with higher levels of access to savings and credit, group participation, and group decision-making. The evaluation also found some evidence of an increased proportion of contribution to household income. However, there is no evidence of improved control over household assets or improved influence over household decision-making. No evidence of changes was actually recorded on self-efficacy, freedom of movement, personal autonomy and likelihood of experiencing violence.</p>	Lombardini, Simone & Yoshikawa, Kanako, 2015, Impact evaluation of the project 'Piloting gender sensitive livelihoods in Karamoja' (Uganda), Impact evaluation, OXFAM's effectiveness review 2014/2015, OXFAM, Oxford.
--	--

## 4.6. Strengthening IE with attention to youth and children

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on strengthening livelihoods of youth and children in IE identified.

b) Challenges on strengthening livelihoods of youth and children in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on youth and children and IE; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability; Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Ensure that IE projects include attention to the issues of children and youth.* In particular, the importance of their education instead of engaging them in child labour. The involvement of youth is highly associated with results success.

A stronger emphasis on the needs of this vulnerable group is required (children and youth). Through the GRAD project, has organised landless youth to form "cut and carry" forage businesses and beeswax businesses, but it is not clear if this is a widespread component of the program.	Feinstein International Center Friedman School of Nutrition Science and Policy Tufts University Africa Regional Office, 2015, Feed the Future Ethiopia External Mid-Term Performance, Evaluation Report, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.
There is a clear need to focus on innovative models that attract young entrepreneurs and meet their needs through solid business performance and value added, delivered through cooperatives to their members.	Henry, Carla; Dearden, Philip N., 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
For nearly all outcomes, especially on labour market activities and business performance, youth is highly associated with program success. This is largely driven by youth-targeted programs that present strong impacts, such as Uganda's vocational training program (Blattman et al., 2012) and Tunisia's business training for college graduates	Cho, Yoonyoung; Honorati, Maddalena, 2013, Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries: A Meta Regression Analysis, Meta-analysis of evaluations, World Bank Human Development Network Social protection and Labor Unit, Washington DC.

2) *Promote methods such as peer training* where youth are required to share the skills that they learned with other youth.

The "Snowballing" training methodology, in which participants trained are required to share the skills learned with colleagues and unemployed youth has proven to reach many beneficiaries	Johannson Núñez, Renato, 2011, Promotion of youth employment in Mozambique Final Joint Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
--	---

3) *Approach development with young persons holistically* to enable them to reach their full potential. All aspects of their personality and talents should be nurtured. Resources allowing this would entail developing skills of the hands (technical, vocational and entrepreneurial) to make them self-reliant, skills of the heart and mind to live with dignity, skills of the soul to live with purpose (life skills).

The RNSF Implementing Partners Young Africa Zimbabwe understands that for a young person to reach their full potential, all aspects of their personality and talents need to be nurtured. Young Africa aims to empower young people with an integrated approach of training encompassing skills of the hands (technical, vocational and entrepreneurial) to make them self-reliant, skills of the heart and mind to live with dignity, skills of the soul to live with purpose (life skills). Every young person that Young Africa empowers has to participate in skill, life skills and business skills development for us to consider them holistically empowered.	RNSF: Good practices collection from Implementing Partners- Young Africa Zimbabwe, October 2015
--	---

4) When planning youth employment projects, it is important *to identify the target population and the constraints for finding jobs*. Development actions should then be developed that correspond to the identified constraints.

Note possible constraints:

- Basic skills—literacy and numeracy—are the foundation of communication and further skills development processes.
- Technical skills—trade- or job-specific skills range from manual skills to computer literacy.
- Behavioural skills—or non-cognitive skills— consist of a range of personality traits such as motivation, socio-emotional regulation, time management, and the ability to work with others
- Entrepreneurial skills—both the creativity to invent/adopt a new product or process and the business skills to market the idea. These are essential for the self-employed and employees.

The analysis determined that in planning youth employment projects, it is important to identify the target population and the constraints for finding jobs. The analysis noted that it is important to bear in mind that youth are not a homogenous group. Each sub-group has its own set of constraints that hinder entry to the labour market such as differential unemployment rates between young women and men, youth of different ages, rural and urban dwellers. Development actions should then be developed that correspond to the identified constraints.

Note possible constraints:

- 1) Basic skills—literacy and numeracy—are the foundation of communication and further skills development processes.
- 2) Technical skills—trade- or job-specific skills range from manual skills to computer literacy.
- 3) Behavioural skills—or non-cognitive skills— consist of a range of personality traits such as motivation, socio-emotional regulation, time management, and the ability to work with others
- 4) Entrepreneurial skills—both the creativity to invent/adopt a new product or process and the business skills to market the idea.

These are essential for the self-employed and employees.

Social Protection & Labor The World Bank; Children & Youth, 2010, ACTIVE LABOR MARKET PROGRAMS FOR YOUTH, A Framework to Guide Youth Employment Interventions, General background document on issues in our research matrix, World Bank Employment Policy Primer November 2010, No. 16, World Bank, Washington DC.

5) In projects on child labour, in which children often work in the IE, ensure that emphasis is placed on development of sustainable livelihoods for household members. This decreases their dependence on child labour. Ensure that this is combined with awareness raising on child labour but also on the importance of decent work for adults.

Lesson learned from the Philippine experience indicates sustainable livelihoods, combined with awareness raising, is an effective way for children to be assured of proper care and education. Continue building the capacity of those households with child labour through both economic and educational means. The evaluation team notes the importance of increased access to livelihoods and skills development as vital to the reduction of child labour.

Jersild, Amy; Lazo, Lucita, 2013, Towards a child-labour-free Philippines: Building on past gains and addressing challenges – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

6) Ensure that advocacy is implemented to ensure that institutions have mechanisms in place to sustain and scale up programme/project activities on supporting out-of-school (working) youth.



<p>The large EAST project in Indonesia (INS/06/15/NET) led to good results in making out-of-school youths return to school. It failed, however, to convince government counterparts and tripartite partners to establish institutional mechanisms that would sustain and multiply these efforts.</p> <p>Also the ILO project: Promoting the rights and reducing poverty of indigenous and tribal peoples (INT/08/57/DAN). ILO project:</p> <p>Government reportedly did not show much interest in taking over institutional mechanisms or structures created or proposed by the project. These examples highlight the need for better ownership and counterpart involvement before projects of this size are granted. This will increase the chances that newly created, relevant and well-implemented activities outlive the project period, and avoid governments' dependency and inactivity in such projects.</p>	<p>ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
--	--

7) *Anticipate unexpected impacts concerning children should be considered in planning support for women who are dependent on the IE:*

- Children's labour inputs may increase as households' may involve children to sustain their new workloads stemming from increased production activities.
- Child accidents, for example drowning in a country such as Bangladesh<sup>32</sup>, may also occur while mothers attend training sessions. A child care or baby-sitting net should be activated in order to enable women the freedom to participate in training.

<p>In terms of child labour, the evaluation found indications from fieldwork that the work load of the children has also increased, directly or indirectly linked with household's production activities. One reason given for this was that the size of the families is decreasing. In most cases, it appears that the children have to help their parents when they come back from school. In some cases examples were provided of children (primarily boys) being taken out of secondary school to assist their fathers in the fields</p> <p>Another unintended negative impact of FFS was found to be child accidents during women's (mothers') participation in FFS sessions. In two of the FFS villages, the evaluation heard about child drowning accidents that have taken place during women's FFS sessions, due to lack of proper child care and baby-sitting. In many cases, the women choose to bring the children to the FFS sessions. Interviews with the Farmer Trainers confirmed that children do indeed disturb the sessions, and when/if the children are chased away, they seem to be left on their own and are exposed to abuse and accidents.</p>	<p>Schwensen, Carl &amp; Laurence, Alida, 2011, Evaluation of the Farmer Field School Approach in the Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II, Bangladesh, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Project: Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II (ASPS II), Bangladesh.</p>
---	--

## 4.7. Strengthening IE with attention to people affected by HIV

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on strengthening livelihoods of people affected by HIV in IE identified.

b) Challenges on people affected by HIV in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

32 "Bangladesh: drowning accounts for 43% of all deaths in children aged 1-4 years." Fact Sheet Media No 347, Centre Available from <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs347/en/> (Website accessed 908 04 2016)

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on the IE with attention to people affected by HIV; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability; Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Create a secure and accessible environment that enables supports vulnerable groups, such as those affected by HIV, to come forward and participate in the project.*

Mainstream HIV/AIDS awareness in projects with people dependent on the IE.

The evaluation noted that in livelihoods projects there is a need to mainstream HIV/AIDS awareness and create a secure and accessible environment that enables /supports vulnerable groups to come forward and participate in the project.

Gourley, Deborah, 2012, Evaluation of NRC Food Security and Livelihoods Projects in Chipinge and Chiredzi Districts, Zimbabwe, 2011-12, Final evaluation, Norwegian Refugee Council, Oslo.

2) Consider in project design that *organising informal enterprises into associations and cooperatives, helps to provide channels to effectively and efficiently channel resources and messages on HIV.* Include SBCC on HIV in projects with people dependent on the IE.

Where countries are undertaking actions to formalise informal enterprises, which often include organising them into associations and cooperatives, ILOAIDS can more effectively and efficiently channel its resources than in situations where this is not yet being undertaken.

Zegers, Mei, 2014, Responding effectively to the HIV/AIDS epidemic in the world of work: Country programmes – Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Burundi, Cameroon, Chad, Ivory Coast, Democratic Republic of Congo, Ghana, Kenya, Madagascar, Morocco, Mozambique, Namibia, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, South Africa, Zambia, China, Indonesia, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Brazil, Guatemala, Jamaica, Ukraine, Tajikistan.

3) *Reduce the burden of HIV on agricultural households across Africa, by running a 4-points strategy that UNAIDS proposed:*

- Indirect programs, such as training, credit, and access to seeds for rural families need to have special measures to benefit AIDS-affected families since they are often less able to take advantage of these services.
- Promote income-generating activities that are low in input and labour use, close to home, and with a quick cash turnaround (examples include bee-keeping, mushroom cultivation, seed gardens, and poultry).
- Help transition from labour intensive crops such as sugarcane or tea to less labour intensive crops like sweet potatoes.
- Where relevant, help the adoption of labour saving technologies for domestic tasks, particularly water fetching, firewood collection, and food preparation. In places with very high incidence, where HIV/AIDS may even depress local demand for goods and services (and thus for labour), then do not focus on labour-saving technologies and focus instead on cash transfers to promote employment.

The report notes that one of the most devastating effects of HIV was the rise in orphans. The death of both parents can lead to children being looked after by grandparents with impacts on agriculture. There are also vulnerable children who are unable to go to school because of lack of financial support, are caring for infected family members and are undernourished. Traditional community networks are often a source of support but the high number of orphans can overwhelm traditional systems of support. UNAIDS (2006) suggests several options/ measures that could reduce the burden of AIDS on agricultural households across Africa:

- 1) Indirect programs, such as training, credit, and access to seeds for rural families need to have special measures to benefit AIDS-affected families since they are often less able to take advantage of these services.
- 2) Promote income-generating activities that are low in input and labour use, close to home, and with a quick cash turnaround (examples include bee-keeping, mushroom cultivation, seed gardens, and poultry).
- 3) Help transition from labour intensive crops such as sugarcane or tea to less labour intensive crops like sweet potatoes.
- 4) In some cases, help the adoption of labour saving technologies for domestic tasks, particularly water fetching, firewood collection, and food preparation. In places with very high incidence, where HIV/AIDS may even depress local demand for goods and services (and thus for labour), then do not focus on labour-saving technologies and focus instead on cash transfers to promote employment.

Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.

4) Be aware that experience has shown that *poverty reduction programmes/projects can also contribute to reduced HIV incidence in women*. Stimulate attention to HIV prevention in IE programming/projects and link to HIV response actions.

The analysis of experience on HIV prevention and response indicates that women's rights, gender equality and empowerment must be priorities of the AIDS response. Programmes that reduce poverty and violence also can reduce HIV incidence among women.

UNAIDS, 2015, How AIDS changes everything: 15 years, 15 lessons of hope from the AIDS response, Thematic Evaluation, UNAIDS, Geneva

5) *Ensure that people living with or affected<sup>33</sup> by HIV are also included in training groups wherever relevant and support them with the same types of assistance.*

The evaluation positively assesses the project's engagement of those affected and by HIV/AIDS also links them with other service providers for assistance. The module for training that used, especially with regard to group dynamics is used as a mitigation measure to ensure group members affected by the HIV are assisted to fully participate in group activities including establishing and expanding businesses.

Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet & Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.

6) *Launch innovative proposals to improve HIV awareness, prevention and mitigation, linking it to training programmes for people dependent on the IE.*

The study shows how Junior Farmer Field Schools addresses the vulnerability of children and HIV and AIDS orphans in Zimbabwe by partnering with a religious-based non-governmental group and two community organizations. Overall, the project works to build skills of HIV and AIDS vulnerable children in rural areas to

De Souza, R., Heinrich, G., Sebanja, P., Ogden, J., Mauambeta, D., Gelman, N., and Oglethorpe, 2008, Using Innovation To Address HIV, AIDS, And Environment Links:

33 The term "people affected by HIV" denotes individuals who are living with or must care for a person living with HIV.

meet dietary and income needs while also using natural resources sustainably. Its innovation lies in the adaptation of the well-established Farmer Field Schools (FFS) methodology which implements a series of non-formal, participatory, and hands-on activities according to the agricultural production cycle. This project adopted traditional FFS approaches, and added targeted outreach to, and the incorporation of, children. In addition, the project included HIV and AIDS awareness, prevention, and mitigation components, as well as training on basic business skills. Overall, the JFFS program shows potential for enhancing self-confidence and self-reliance among orphans and vulnerable children in rural Zimbabwe. Specific knowledge gained includes information on agricultural production, resource conservation, and HIV/AIDS prevention. JFFS can reduce the burden of individual care-givers by engaging communities more broadly.

Intervention Case Studies From Zimbabwe, Uganda, and Malawi, Review of multiple projects and/or actions, *Population and Environment* 29: 219-246, Springer, New York.

7) *Engage people affected by HIV in non-farm rural activities*, whose financial contribution is minimal but extremely important for the whole community at the same time.

The paper takes the case study of a pilot farming initiative in Homa Bay, Kenya. It argues that once patients are stable, they can effectively be engaged in farming with minimal financial and technical support, resulting in enhanced food security of the affected households. More importantly, it helps to reduce HIV/AIDS-related stigma and improve the individual's self-esteem. The paper recommends the sensitive scaling-up of this approach. However, to ensure effectiveness and wider reach, government needs to view agriculture through an HIV lens and promote a multisectoral approach that recognises the relationship between HIV/AIDS and food security. A number of immediate actions are required to strengthen this relationship, such as increased public investment to augment extension services, subsidise farm inputs, and develop infrastructure including agricultural markets.

Datta, D., and Njuguna, J., 2009, Food security in HIV/AIDS response: Insights from Homa Bay, Kenya, *Journal of Social Aspects of HIV*, Vol. 6, No.4

## 4.8. Strengthening IE with attention to people with disabilities

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on strengthening livelihoods of people with disabilities in IE identified.

b) Challenges on strengthening livelihoods for people with disabilities in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on the IE with attention to people with disabilities; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability; Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Involve people with disabilities in developing national or local strategies* to eradicate poverty.

The evaluation shares the experience of disability organisations in the formulation of Uganda's national poverty reduction strategy paper. Uganda was the first country to develop a poverty reduction strategy plan (PRSP). Disabled people were involved in the development of the third phase of the PRSP/Poverty Eradication Action Plan (PEAP). The research on which this report is based sought to document the experience of the disability movement in its engagement with the development and evolution of the PEAP, and to draw out potential lessons for disability movements in other countries involved in PRSP processes. What is clear is that for DPOs to effectively influence policies, in Uganda and elsewhere in Africa, the policy environment must be conducive to the

Dube, A., 2005, Participation Of Disabled People In The PRSP/PEAP Process In Uganda, Thematic evaluation, Disability Knowledge & Research, DFID, London.

participation and inclusion of disability components in government and other programmes. Of course, disabled people's participation in the formulation of the PRSP in Uganda increased democratic ownership of the process.

2) *Include attention to people with disabilities in programmes/projects with people dependent on the IE. Provide advocacy to stimulate skills training for people with disabilities.*

The evaluation noted that access to skills training for people with disabilities in Ethiopia, Viet Nam and Zambia, has a lasting influence on the employability of the trained people with disabilities.

Reinprecht, Karin, 2013, Promoting rights and opportunities for people with disabilities in employment through legislation (PROPEL) Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Azerbaijan, Botswana, China, Ethiopia, Indonesia, Viet Nam, and Zambia.

3) *Stimulate the media to portray people with disabilities in various occupations including in IE work. Include images of people with disabilities in materials produced by projects oriented towards people dependent on the IE.*

The evaluation indicated that increased and improved media reporting, portraying people with disabilities positively, which inspired some people with disabilities already and might have started to change the attitudes of some members of the public.

Reinprecht, Karin, 2013, Promoting rights and opportunities for people with disabilities in employment through legislation (PROPEL) Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Azerbaijan, Botswana, China, Ethiopia, Indonesia, Viet Nam, and Zambia.

4) *Tackle disability-stigma and involve people with disability in agricultural activities, following 5 key priorities:*

- Promote income-generating and employment opportunities that include people with disabilities 'needs and priorities.
- Update production technologies to meet the requirements of rural workers with disabilities.
- Promote/facilitate occupational health and safety (OSH) in work implemented by people with disabilities who are dependent on the IE, including accident prevention
- Integrate disability issues into national development policies and programmes as related to people dependent on the IE.
- Develop the capacity of civil society organisations and people with disabilities to engage in policy development.

The causes of disability are often directly related to food insecurity and poverty. Malnutrition causes 20 % of disabilities, including stunting and learning disabilities. People with disabilities are frequently excluded from agricultural employment opportunities, or agricultural development programmes as they can be considered incapable of participating and undertaking farming activities. There can also be a stigma about disability being contagious or bringing curses. One source on the issue is a recent Disability and Agriculture edition of the New

New Agriculturist, 2013, Disability and Agriculture, General background document on issues in our research matrix, the Global Forum on Agricultural Research, Rome.

<p>Agriculturist which advocated for more attention on the theme and highlighted key priorities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 1) Income-generating and employment opportunities that include disabled needs and priorities.</li> <li>▪ 2) Agricultural production technologies to be updated to meet the requirements of rural workers with disabilities.</li> <li>▪ 3) Occupational health and safety in agriculture, including accident prevention in agricultural and agro-forestry industries, should be promoted.</li> <li>▪ 4) Disability issues need to be integrated into national rural development policies and programmes.</li> <li>▪ 5) Develop the capacity of civil society organisations and people with disabilities to engage in policy development.</li> </ul>	
--	--

5) *Include post-training support such as job-placement and specialised training for people with disabilities* to retain their employment.

Develop partnerships between entities that can strengthen entrepreneurial skills and business development opportunities for people with disabilities.

<p>1) The evaluation noted that the program should engage post-placement coaching and specialised training to assist people with disabilities to retain their employment, honing skills to promote greater accommodation for disabilities that can further support sustained employment. Moreover, albeit in a more limited sphere, the program should consider partnerships to develop entrepreneurial skills and business development opportunities for people with disabilities.</p> <p>2) Alliance partners, such as SIL, have experienced substantial barriers in their attempts matching training and job-placement activities for disabled people with the private sector demand for labour.</p>	<p>Cambronero, Sergio; Midling, Michael; Molina, Francisco, 2012, Mid-term Evaluation- USAID Improving Access to Employment Program in El Salvador, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.</p>
---	--

## 4.9. Strengthening IE with attention to the elderly

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on strengthening livelihoods of the elderly in IE identified.

b) Challenges on the elderly in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on strengthening IE with attention to the elderly; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability; Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Engage elderly persons in projects* supporting people who are dependent on the IE and recognise that they can draw upon years of experience and knowledge.

<p>One organisation which is very active in programming and campaigning for older people is HelpAge International. They call for focus on the mainstreaming issues for older people, recognising that older people have years of knowledge and experience of agricultural practice, weather patterns and adapting to different climate changes which can be tapped into. Indeed, HelpAge programme aims at including older women and men in agricultural extension programmes, claiming that elderlies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- should be recognised for their substantial knowledge and experience, in order to make credit and agricultural input schemes much more age-inclusive;</li> </ul>	<p>Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and</p>
--	---



<p>- should receive a basic income in the form of pensions; - be engaged in programmes to capture the knowledge and experience of older farmers, women and men, of conservation farming techniques and weather patterns.</p>	<p>Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.</p>
--	---

2) *Recognise the importance of older women's knowledge*, and the new status (i.e. possibilities) women can take on once they become widow.

<p>One programme by Helen Keller International in Burkina Faso recognised the important role of older women in local culture, and trained grandmothers as sources of nutrition advice. Older women that live longer than their husbands are particularly vulnerable and likely to live more years in ill-health. Being a widow can change their status, both socially and legally in terms of access to assets – property and inheritance rights. As noted by Peterman (2012), in Zimbabwe, 56% of women inherited some property from their husbands, only 37% of widows inherited the majority of his assets.</p>	<p>Peterman, A., 2012, <i>Widowhood and Asset Inheritance in Sub-Saharan Africa: Empirical Evidence from 15 Countries</i>, Development policy Review</p>
--	--

## 4.10.Strengthening IE with attention to migrants, refugees, trafficked persons

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on strengthening livelihoods of migrants, refugees, trafficked persons in IE identified.

b) Challenges on strengthening livelihoods of migrants, refugees, trafficked persons in IE identified in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on strengthening IE with attention to migrants, refugees, trafficked persons; Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability; Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation and determine if/how these were overcome.

1) *Implement good practices* that are well established in all programming and which should also be used in *livelihoods programming with refugees dependent on the IE*. These include:

- Regular consultation and interaction with refugees and local communities in program design. This should include the participation of refugees in assessing livelihood challenges and needs and analysing internal and external factors influencing livelihoods.
- Liaise closely and organise coordination with relevant ministries and other national and local authorities, partner agencies and other stakeholders aiming at joint advocacy and programme planning to integrate livelihood services for refugees into the public system
- Through advocacy activities, promote the productive and creative potential of refugees, their skills and talents
- Regular monitoring and impact evaluation
- Testing and pilots of programs, especially those that are designed in headquarters and imported into field settings.

## Learning from Experience: Recommendations of other Development Organizations

- Adapting and customising for all such programs to be fully specific to the situation settings and should be piloted and revised before full funding is allocated.
- Providing clear explanations of the length of the program, related benchmarks, and the planned exit strategy.

<p>The evaluation noted that good practices that are well established in all programming should always be used in livelihoods programming with refugees as well. These include:</p> <p>Regular consultation and interaction with refugees in program design</p> <p>Regular monitoring and impact evaluation</p> <p>Testing and pilots of programs, especially those that are designed in headquarters and imported into field settings.</p> <p>Adapting and customising for all such programs to be fully specific to the situation settings and should be piloted and revised before full funding is allocated.</p> <p>Providing clear explanations of the length of the program, related benchmarks, and the planned exit strategy.</p>	<p>Holzaepfel, Erica A.; Jacobsen, Karen, 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of DOS/PRM Livelihoods Programs in Ethiopia and Burundi, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Social Impact Inc, Washington DC.</p>
<p>The evaluation concluded that it is necessary to involve both local and refugee communities in all aspects of programme planning, implementation and monitoring. Increase interaction with refugee communities and communicate on a regular basis; organise reach-out activities and inform refugees about their livelihood-support options and eligibility criteria.</p> <p>Liaise closely and organise coordination with relevant ministries and other national and local authorities, partner agencies and other stakeholders aiming at joint advocacy and programme planning to The integrate livelihood services for refugees into the public system.</p>	<p>UNHCR, 2011, Promoting Livelihoods and Self-reliance Operational Guidance on Refugee Protection and Solutions in Urban Areas, General background document on issues in our research matrix, UNHCR, Geneva.</p>
<p>A related lesson learned cited in an evaluation of a programme in Ethiopia indicated that it should conduct an extensive situational analysis to understand the existing capacities, as well as needs and priorities of refugee communities. The situational analysis should include participatory assessments to identify the opportunities and challenges for implementing livelihoods activities in the context of the camp and surrounding communities. It should also seek to assess the capabilities, existing assets, skill and knowledge gaps, and aspirations of the refugee community members. Data collected should be disaggregated by nationality, sex, and age. Such a situational analysis should be conducted through partnership with UNHCR, ARRA, and other agencies in country.</p>	<p>Holzaepfel, Erica A., 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of Livelihoods Programs for Refugees in Ethiopia, Final evaluation, Social Impact Inc., Washington, DC, projects: 1) International Rescue Committee (IRC) Livelihoods project; 2) Jesuit Refugee Services (JRS) Livelihoods project; 3) Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) Livelihoods project in Ethiopia.</p>

2) *Include in a contextual assessment in refugee camps* prior to design of development actions the following information:

- How are camps used?
- What was done before in this context?
- What will/will not work based on past experience?
- Note specifically:
  - What kinds of economic capacity building activities are already in place (or were tried before);
  - How both the refugees and the local host population view new or proposed livelihoods programs with refugees who are dependent on the IE;

- Whether the wider market context is appropriate and conducive to the promotion of refugee livelihoods;
- Whether the host government policy context is appropriate and conducive to the promotion of refugee livelihoods.

<p>The evaluation noted that a contextual assessment in a refugee camp situation should include the following information:</p> <p>How are camps used?</p> <p>What was done before in this context?</p> <p>What will/will not work based on past experience?</p> <p>Note specifically:</p> <p>What kinds of economic capacity building activities are already in place (or were tried before);</p> <p>How both the refugees and the local host population view new or proposed livelihoods programs;</p> <p>Whether the wider market context is appropriate and conducive to the promotion of refugee livelihoods;</p> <p>Whether the host government policy context is appropriate and conducive to the promotion of refugee livelihoods.</p>	<p>Holzaepfel, Erica A.; Jacobsen, Karen, 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of DOS/PRM Livelihoods Programs in Ethiopia and Burundi, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Social Impact Inc, Washington DC.</p>
---	---

3) When implementing projects with migrant workers, *include a range of rights-based support mechanisms, both at home and overseas*, with economic empowerment efforts in the sending communities.

<p>The evaluation of a migrant workers project in Indonesia determined that its delivery strategy broke new ground by developing a range of rights-based support mechanisms, both at home and overseas, with economic empowerment efforts in the sending communities.</p>	<p>Mauer, Ralf, 2013, Decent work results and effectiveness of ILO technical cooperation: a meta-analysis of project evaluations, 2011–2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	---

4) *Engage in advocacy to mobilise key stakeholders prior to engaging them to work on high-level labour migration goals.* Such goals may include the signing of bilateral agreements, the development of labour migration policies, the legal framework reform or ILO Conventions ratification.

In migration policies, support the development of a migratory corridor focus, working both in the origin and destination countries where relevant.

<p>The high-level goals in labour migration, such as the signing of bilateral agreements, the development of labour migration policies, the legal framework reform or the ILO Conventions ratification, are very difficult to address for a technical cooperation project if the context conditions are not highly favourable and without a previous tripartite mobilisation of the constituents.</p> <p>The evaluation noted that a labour migration approach with a migratory corridor focus, working both in the origin and destination countries is beneficial.</p>	<p>Varela, Javier, 2013, Gender-sensitive Labor Mitigation Policies in the Nicaragua-Costa Rica-Panama and Haiti-Dominican Republic Corridors – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	---

5) *After a disaster, engage in anti-trafficking awareness raising and support provision of livelihood opportunities* to reduce the push factors for trafficking in persons.

<p>The evaluation found that the project showed strong alignment with the trafficking in persons prevention guidelines, including awareness raising and the provision of</p>	<p>Sequitin, Rosario, 2015, End of Project Evaluation of “Preventing Trafficking in</p>
--	---

livelihood opportunities to Typhoon Haiyan survivors to reduce the push factors for trafficking in persons.	Persons through Sustainable Livelihood Recovery for Typhoon Affected People" Project, Final evaluation, World Vision, Washington DC.
---	--

6) *Provide support to both the host community and the internally displaced persons (IDP) or refugee population at the same time on informal economy activities as relevant in contexts where large IDP populations create an economic burden on the Host Community that might result in conflict.*

The evaluation noted that it is considered a best practice to provide support to both the host community and the IDP or refugee population at the same time in contexts where large IDP populations create an economic burden on the Host Community that might result in conflict.	Gairdner, David; Al-Allaf, Riyadh; Mandelik, Florence, 2013, Independent Evaluation, The Republic Of Iraq, Evaluation of Micro Enterprises for Reintegration of Internally Displaced Persons in Thi Qar Governorate, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
Livelihood programmes that also benefit local populations can address host government concerns about the presence of refugees in cities (economic competition, pressure on resources, etc.) and improve the asylum environment.	UNHCR, 2011, Promoting Livelihoods and Self-reliance Operational Guidance on Refugee Protection and Solutions in Urban Areas, General background document on issues in our research matrix, UNHCR, Geneva.

7) *Ensure that labour migration programmes/projects always include a careful analysis of the socio-cultural, political and economic context in both sending and receiving countries.*

The evaluation noted that a careful context analysis is crucial to ensure viability in labour migration projects, especially in destination countries.	Varela, Javier, 2013, Gender-sensitive Labor Mitigation Policies in the Nicaragua-Costa Rica-Panama and Haiti-Dominican Republic Corridors – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
--	--

8) When analysing livelihoods support options with refugees dependent on IE settings, *determine the most appropriate option for camp settings* by considering a range of aspects:

- Cash for work (CFW) or cash transfers are more effective and easier to implement than other common livelihoods activities such as vocational training
- If the goal is to promote small business enterprise, a mentoring program or partnership creation might be more useful (and take fewer resources) than a training.
- *Exploring alternatives as part of a broader contextual assessment should occur before designing the program*, that takes place prior to the design of refugee livelihoods programs (whether in or outside of camps).

Depending on the goals of the program, some livelihoods activities might not be appropriate or the best option for camp settings. If the goal is simply to improve household income, it might be that programs such as cash for work (CFW) or cash transfers are more effective and easier to implement than other common livelihoods activities such as vocational training. If the goal is to promote small business enterprise, a mentoring program or partnership creation might be more	Holzaepfel, Erica A.; Jacobsen, Karen, 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of DOS/PRM Livelihoods Programs in Ethiopia and Burundi, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Social Impact Inc, Washington DC.
--	--

useful (and take fewer resources) than a training. Exploring alternatives as part of a broader contextual assessment should occur before designing the program, and as part of a larger package of assessments that take place prior to the design of refugee livelihoods programs (whether in or outside of camps).

9) *Carry out more analysis on disaster impact* related to employment/people dependent on the IE. Analysis is needed of:

- Impacts of disasters and trends on the household level employment context (e.g. out-migration, selling labour and advance)
- Broader labour market impacts and trends.
- Gender differences in coping strategies with respect to sustainable livelihoods with people dependent on the IE.

The evaluation noted that some information and analysis was collected by WFP on the impacts of the disaster on the household level employment context (e.g. out-migration, selling labour and advance). This needs to be complemented by greater attention to broader labour market impacts and trends. Gender differences in coping strategies were also not analysed. Assessments in Nepal were framed in the sustainable livelihoods context, examined assets and gender differences in coping strategies and did some limited assessment of labour markets. The evaluation also discussed the challenges that the World Food Programme (WFP) faces when trying to support a shift from relief support to recovery.

Harvey, Paul; Burton, Cynthia; Wilkinson, Laura, 2009, Strategic Evaluation of the Effectiveness of WFP Livelihood Recovery Interventions, Thematic evaluation, A Report from the Office of Evaluation, WFP, Brussels, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Colombia, Lesotho, Nepal, Uganda.

10) *Analyse the employment situation in the host country*, especially the informal economy, as it holds more employment prospects for refugees.

The guidelines indicate that it is advisable to analyse the employment situation in the host country, especially the informal sector as it holds more employment prospects for refugees. Undertake a mapping of factors influencing livelihoods and opportunities. Analyse the information about refugee households' livelihood assets and strategies.

UNHCR, 2011, Promoting Livelihoods and Self-reliance Operational Guidance on Refugee Protection and Solutions in Urban Areas, General background document on issues in our research matrix, UNHCR, Geneva.

11) *Map out available public and private livelihood-support opportunities* with people dependent on the IE in urban areas. Develop effective modalities to enhance access.

The guidelines recommend to map out available public and private livelihood-support opportunities in urban areas. Develop effective modalities to enhance access.

UNHCR, 2011, Promoting Livelihoods and Self-reliance Operational Guidance on Refugee Protection and Solutions in Urban Areas, General background document on issues in our research matrix, UNHCR, Geneva.

12) *In planning support for refugees, develop a plan to move from one level of support to another as people's capacities and needs evolve through time*. Specifically, follow a "graduation approach" to livelihood programming with people dependent on the IE. This should be based on the capacities and related support needs identified for each socio-economic group during the assessment. Gradually reduce the number in need of assistance and livelihood support through the attainment of durable

solutions. Phase out the more costly short-term livelihood support measures gradually while maintaining medium to long-term sustainable livelihood promotion measures.

<p>The guidelines recommend in moving from one level of support to another as people's capacities and needs evolve through time</p> <p>Follow a "graduation approach" to livelihood programming, based on the capacities and related support needs identified for each socio-economic group during the livelihood assessment. Gradually reduce the number in need of assistance and livelihood support through the attainment of durable solutions. Phase out gradually of short-term livelihood provisioning measures that are more costly than medium to long-term sustainable livelihood promotion measures.</p>	<p>UNHCR, 2011, Promoting Livelihoods and Self-reliance Operational Guidance on Refugee Protection and Solutions in Urban Areas, General background document on issues in our research matrix, UNHCR, Geneva.</p>
---	---

13) *Promote the inclusion of all key stakeholders* when engaging in actions to benefit migrant workers.

<p>The commitment of all partners is central to achieve sizeable results for the benefit of migrant workers.</p>	<p>Mahy, Pierre, 2014, Tripartite Action for the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers (ASEAN TRIANGLE project) Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Project: Tripartite Action for the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers (ASEAN TRIANGLE project) in Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Myanmar, Philippines, Thailand and Viet Nam.</p>
--	---

14) Bear in mind when designing projects on migrant labour that *children can also be migrant workers*. Develop mechanisms to address this issue.

<p>The project's area based convergence approach is relevant in the Philippine context, yet certain challenges exist, including addressing migrant child labourers.</p>	<p>Jersild, Amy; Lazo, Lucita, 2013, Towards a child-labour-free Philippines: Building on past gains and addressing challenges – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.</p>
---	---

15) To protect investments post disaster in livelihoods of the poorest IE groups, *provide cash transfer but also additional short-term support to cover the gap in essential needs so that working capital of their livelihoods activities are not affected*. This may include food aid and support to obtain basic household needs kits.

<p>1) To protect investments in livelihoods, the evaluation recommended that the poorest groups can benefit from a cash transfer but also receive additional short-term support to cover the gap in essential needs so that working capital is not affected.</p>	<p>Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation, Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.</p>
<p>The strategic evaluation indicated that most beneficiaries in Bangladesh expressed a desire for more community and/or household level activities to restore or improve their income earning capacity, including home-based FFW/CFW employment opportunities for women, as some faced social criticism for working outside of the home. Eleven months after the cyclone, when asked what would assist communities and households to recover most quickly from a</p>	<p>Harvey, Paul; Burton, Cynthia; Wilkinson, Laura, 2009, Strategic Evaluation of the Effectiveness of WFP Livelihood Recovery Interventions, Thematic evaluation, A Report from the Office of Evaluation, WFP, Brussels, Covered countries: Bangladesh,</p>



<p>disaster, the most common responses the evaluation team received from beneficiaries were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Provide both food aid and cash grants, cash only or FFW/CFW so we have enough to eat and can afford to replace the things we lost at the same time; cash is also less easy for officials to manipulate: "We can better ourselves – we would rather not have to take relief or take out another loan;"</li> <li>- Start livelihoods recovery activities earlier and do them for longer (including SFP);</li> <li>- Provide us with some skills training or other means to get longer-term employment.</li> </ul> <p>The evaluation noted that, in Nepal, when asked what would be the most effective assistance to communities and households to assist them to recover, the most common responses were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Help us to improve our ability to produce more from the land – e.g. vegetables, cereal crops, fruit, livestock rearing;</li> <li>- For women specifically: Introduce technology such as smokeless stoves and grain-grinding mills;</li> <li>- Provide us with some skills training or other means to get longer-term employment.</li> </ul>	<p>Colombia, Lesotho, Nepal, Uganda.</p>
--	--

16) When designing livelihoods projects with refugees dependent on the IE, *take into account the potential of livelihoods strategies developed in asylum settings to be transferable on repatriation.*

<p>The evaluation noted several important points to consider regarding livelihoods support with refugees. The argument is frequently made that refugees who can build and protect their livelihoods assets in asylum countries (and thus become more self-reliant) are more able and likely to return to their home countries when it is safe to do so. This belief is widely held but the evidence base is rather weak. The few studies of the sustainability of repatriation suggest that returnee livelihoods are difficult to rebuild because livelihood strategies developed in the asylum setting are not easily transferable. While increased economic capacity could increase 1) the likelihood and 2) the sustainability of return, there is little hard evidence that this is the case, and the argument could equally be made that self-reliant refugees are more likely to stay in their host environments</p>	<p>Holzaepfel, Erica A.; Jacobsen, Karen, 2015, <i>Evaluating the Effectiveness of DOS/PRM Livelihoods Programs in Ethiopia and Burundi</i>, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Social Impact Inc, Washington DC.</p>
--	--

17) When planning food security programs in disaster/refugee situations—in addition to focusing on measuring food needs and quantifying levels of food insecurity—*consider how food aid could contribute to the recovery of livelihoods of people dependent on the IE.* Include measures on strengthening livelihoods based on assessments and inputs from community members.

<p>The evaluation concluded that there is a tendency for assessments food security programs in disaster/refugee situations to focus on measuring food needs and quantifying levels of food insecurity without considering how food aid could contribute to the recovery of livelihoods.</p>	<p>Harvey, Paul; Burton, Cynthia; Wilkinson, Laura, 2009, <i>Strategic Evaluation of the Effectiveness of WFP Livelihood Recovery Interventions</i>, Thematic evaluation, A Report from the Office of Evaluation, WFP, Brussels, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Colombia, Lesotho, Nepal, Uganda.</p>
---	---

18) Note that there is a *weak evidence base and assessment process for determining disaster recovery needs and when and how to shift activities from relief to recovery objectives.* However, it is commonly recommended to start livelihoods recovery activities early.

19) *Note that in fragile country situations it is particularly important support the rural communities in such a way that they can utilise their own resources and improve their incomes. This will also prevent*

the potential of more conflict from re-emerging. This means transitioning from food distribution to support with livelihoods development as quickly as possible.

<p>The evaluation noted that there is a weak evidence base and assessment process for determining recovery needs and when and how to shift activities from relief to recovery objectives.</p> <p>The evaluation does, however, recommend start livelihoods recovery activities earlier and do them for longer.</p>	<p>Harvey, Paul; Burton, Cynthia; Wilkinson, Laura, 2009, Strategic Evaluation of the Effectiveness of WFP Livelihood Recovery Interventions, Thematic evaluation, A Report from the Office of Evaluation, WFP, Brussels, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Colombia, Lesotho, Nepal, Uganda.</p>
<p>The evaluation noted that, as it is unlikely that South Sudan will develop into a functional and stable democracy very soon, nor that the GoSS will be able to fulfil its responsibilities regarding the rural communities, it is of the utmost importance to support the rural communities in such a way that they can utilise their own resources and improve their livelihoods. This will also prevent the potential of more conflict from re-emerging.</p> <p>It is apparent that in countries where returnees and internally displaced persons face emergency situations, targeted assistance for the most vulnerable is difficult. Because of general food distribution, the potential farmers are often demotivated to produce the staple foods.</p>	<p>Hempel, Hendrik, 2013, Evaluation Report Livelihoods and WASH improvement in the Border State of Northern Bahr el Ghazal, South Sudan, Final evaluation, Weltehungelife, Bonn.</p>

### 4.11. Strengthening IE with attention to general or other specific vulnerable groups

**Indicators:** a) GP and LL on strengthening livelihoods of other vulnerable people in IE identified.

b) Challenges on strengthening livelihoods of other vulnerable people in IE identified and possible means to overcome challenges identified and analysed.

**Data Analysis Methods:** Identification of GP and LL on (other) vulnerable groups and IE. Analysis of GP and LL to determine adaptability and scalability. Identification of challenges identified during promotion and implementation on other vulnerable groups and IE and determine if/how these were overcome.

*1) Promote the preparation and implementation of capacity strengthening of relevant national and local institutions to ensure the effective implementation of policies affecting vulnerable groups through national or local administrations.*

<p>ILO programmes can facilitate and support the preparation and implementation of these policies through national or local administrations. Institutional level involves building the capacity of institutions (such as employment services) to apply specific approaches or methods to different kinds of vulnerable groups, in order to improve their chances for employment, decent work and acceptable standards of living.</p>	<p>ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.</p>
--	--

*2) When providing vulnerable households with tools and useful assets to enhance their livelihoods, spend time and resources to ensure high-quality material and to support receiving persons in properly handling the new tools.*

The evaluation mentions a previous Oxfam study (conducted in June 2009) that pointed out how many of the more vulnerable households in the project areas had sold their livestock in exchange for food and other services. The project set a provision of livestock, aimed to support the rebuilding of livelihood assets through the distribution of fast-breeding small ruminants, such as goats and chickens. Livestock fairs were held in each ward, and each selected household was given a voucher that could be exchanged for an animal. Veterinary specialists were on hand to check the health of the animals prior to purchase, and recipients were trained in basic animal husbandry practices, including breeding, nutrition, disease control and housing. Those receiving livestock were also trained on how to integrate the livestock system into the agricultural system, such as the use of animal manure to improve soil fertility. Further support was provided, including the supply of veterinary kits, drugs and information, education and communication materials.

Bishop, David, 2013, Evaluation of food security and strengthening livelihood options (Zimbabwe), Final evaluation, OXFAM, Oxford.

3) Ensure that *specific local institutions are involved and their capacities built on programmes/projects with vulnerable groups* to help ensure their ownership and sustainability.

The analysis noted that projects targeting vulnerable groups can be successful if local institutions take over their ownership after they end. The analysis stated that a project on Social entrepreneurship in South Africa (SETYSA), (SAF/07/51M/FLA), 105 produced good feedback, but a nationwide multiplier effect is not likely to follow. The evaluator suggests that the decision to locate the project in the ILO Pretoria Office rather than in existing South African institutions could have undermined local ownership and ownership of social entrepreneurship.

ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

4) *Determine if specific approaches or framework specific to the Indigenous Peoples are needed in specific locations where projects may be implemented.*

The ILO project had no detailed preference, approach or framework specific to the Indigenous Peoples. Indigenous organisations in the project areas were empowered in the same way as any other kind of organisation.

Rodriguez-Ariza, Carlos, 2014, Typhoon Bopha Philippines: Application of Local Resource-based Employment Generation Approach (PHI/12/08/AUS) and Joint Response Based Employment Generations and Livelihood Recovery Interventions (PHI/13/03/AUS), Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

5) *Use community-led wealth ranking exercises* to select the most vulnerable beneficiaries instead of using applicants responses against capacity and vulnerability criteria as it can especially to errors of exclusion.

The evaluation noted that community-led wealth ranking exercises are an effective means to select beneficiaries. The initial approach using applicants responses against criteria of capacity and vulnerability was less successful, and led especially to errors of exclusion.

Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation, Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.

## ANNEX OVERVIEW OF CRITERIA FOR SELECTION OF GOOD PRACTICE, LESSONS AND SUMMARY OF RESEARCH MATRIX

The research and monitoring and evaluation matrix is a supplement to the Research Network and Support Facility (RNSF) Logical Framework as included in the ARS Progetti Organisation and Methodology document. It does not replace the Logical Framework.

For each research question, and as relevant, the RNSF project analyses:

- Key strategies from global, regional, and (sub)national strategies to micro level (in the case of entrepreneurs their business approaches)
- Identify what works (GP)
- What does not work or only works somewhat
- Challenges faced and if/how they are overcome
- New trends and how they are being implemented.

Also see Inception Report for details on analysis using a systems approach.

**Table 4. Good practice criteria to be met and description:**

Criteria	Description
<b>1. Effective and successful</b>	A “good practice” has proven its strategic relevance as the most effective way in achieving a specific objective; it has been successfully adopted and has had a positive impact on individuals and/or communities.
<b>2. Innovative and creative</b>	That it is innovative and/or creative in its design and implementation
<b>3. Environmentally, economically and socially sustainable</b>	A “good practice” meets current needs, in particular the essential needs of IE entrepreneurs/workers or potential entrepreneurs/workers, without compromising the ability to address future needs.
<b>4. Gender sensitive</b>	A description of the practice must show how actors, men and women, involved in the process, were able to improve their livelihoods.
<b>5. Technically feasible</b>	Technical feasibility is the basis of a “good practice”. It is easy to learn and to implement
<b>6. Inherently participatory</b>	The good practice involves project stakeholders through meaningful participation and ownership. Participatory approaches are essential as they support a joint sense of ownership of decisions and actions.
<b>7. Replicable and adaptable</b>	A “good practice” should have the potential for replication and should therefore be adaptable to similar objectives in varying situations.

### Lesson learned criteria

The lesson learned must be a description of what was learned from past experience(s) that can be used to inform new planning of strategies and actions. That is, it must be a lesson that can be used to improve information / knowledge for better decision-making and thus contribute to improved program or project performance, outcome, or impact.

Note: The lesson learned can be positive or negative. It can be negative in terms of identifying (an) element(s) that should not be repeated in future planning. It can also include identification of specific issues which need to be taken into account when engaging in planning. These can include contextual issues such as economic, policy, socio-cultural, and/or on equity.

Data collection and analysis are continuous throughout the implementation of the RNSF project implementation. Specific reports and other written materials and/or presentation of results are prepared as important findings are identified and analysed.

### Research Question 1) Enabling environment

What are the key ways to successfully support the enabling environment at national and sub-national level for enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion? This includes legal and policy framework development, institution and capacity strengthening as well as coordination.

1.1.	Global and regional strategies with attention to social inclusion.
1.2.	Advocacy Methods on IE legal and policy framework development.
1.3.	Supportive legal frameworks development, adoption and implementation.
1.4.	Identification of policy frameworks development, adoption and implementation.
1.5.	Key elements in policy frameworks identification
1.6.	Improvement of impact of policy frameworks
1.7.	Institution and capacity strengthening on IE.
1.8.	Organising informal economy groups
1.9.	Value chains and adding value to value chain components
1.10.	Improving linkages between formal and informal economy
1.11.	Coordination and sustainability planning

### Research Question 2) Decent work and enterprise growth

What key elements have been proven to contribute to successful formalisation of growth oriented informal

2.1.	Promotion and implementation of decent work, including through implementation of international labour standards, national labour laws in IE.
2.2.	Formalising work in IE
2.3.	Occupational safety and health (OSH) implementation in IE.
2.4.	Environment and sustainable management & IE

### Research Question 3) Direct actions in communities

What are the key proven direct actions at local level that contribute to the successful enhancement of livelihoods and working conditions for those working in informal economy enterprises with special attention to social inclusion?

3.1.	Social and behaviour change communications. Subject areas: SBCC on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Human rights (including equity) of IE entrepreneurs and workers including right to work.</li> <li>Right to access decent work including implementation of labour laws.</li> <li>Promotion of social norms supportive of enhancing opportunities for those dependent on the informal economy.</li> </ul>
3.2.	Entrepreneurship: Capacity strengthening on starting, improving, growing economic activities.
3.3.	Information Technology (IT) and enhancing of livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion.
3.4.	Leadership, life skills, empowerment training, literacy/numeracy
3.5.	Micro finance
3.6.	Vocational education/skills training
3.7.	Local labour market analysis used to determine types of education/training provided to individuals

### **Research Question 4) What innovative approaches do national and international entities use to enhance livelihoods, equity and inclusion of people dependent on the informal economy?**

In addition: what are the new strategies adopted by people relying on informal economy activities themselves?

Note: This can include the identification of new practices and dynamics that DEVCO or other main organisations operating in (inter)national cooperation for development are currently supporting (or may support during the RNSF project implementation period).

4.1.	Social dialogue and IE
4.2.	Social inclusion promotion (awareness raising on social inclusion in IE)
4.3.	Social protection
4.4.	Improving food security through enhancing the livelihoods of those dependent on the informal economy, with special attention to social inclusion.
4.5.	Strengthening IE with attention to gender issues: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Women</li> <li>Role of men to support women in IE</li> </ul>
4.6.	Strengthening IE with attention to youth and children.
4.7.	Strengthening IE with attention to people affected by HIV.
4.8.	Strengthening IE with attention to people with disabilities.
4.9.	Strengthening IE with attention to the elderly
4.10.	Strengthening IE with attention to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Migrants</li> <li>Refugees</li> <li>Trafficked persons</li> </ul>
4.11.	Strengthening IE with attention to other vulnerable people



## REFERENCES

The reference list is divided in line with the person who was responsible for the analysis of the specific documents cited. The reason is so that readers may contact the person responsible for the analysis in case of any questions on the evidence that was extracted from any particular document.

### **Evaluations and other documents analysed by Mei Zegers:**

ACF International and Welt Hunger Hilfe, 2014, Rapid Food and Livelihoods Security Assessment, Other Evaluation, ACF International and Welt Hunger Hilfe, Berlin - Bonn.

ACUMEN - Cartier Charitable Foundation, International Center for Research on Women, 2015, Women And Social Enterprises: How Gender Integration Can Boost Entrepreneurial Solutions to Poverty, General background document on issues in our research matrix, ACUMEN, New York.

Aiolfi, Luca, 2013, Effective Governance of Labour Migration and its Skills Dimensions, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic “effective Governance of Labour Migration and its Skills Dimensions in Moldova and Ukraine”.

Aitken, Robert, 2013, Developing Energy Enterprises Project in East Africa, Final evaluation, The Global Village Energy Partnership DEEP EA, Nairobi, evaluation on the topic “Developing Energy Enterprises in Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda.

Andersen, Henny; Hamdy Mostafa, Marwa, 2016, Independent mid-term evaluation EGYPT Human security through inclusive socio- economic development in Upper Egypt, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

ARS Progetti: Research Network and Support Facility, Rome, Blog Post on Cap4Dev IESF about the topic “Ethiopians Fighting Against Child Labour”.

Attanasio, Orazio; Guarín, Arlen; Medina, Carlos; Meghir, Costas, 2015, Long Term Impacts of Vouchers for Vocational Training: Experimental Evidence For Colombia, Impact evaluation, National Bureau of Economic Research, Cambridge, MA, USA, impact evaluation on the project “Jovenes en Acción” (JeA), Colombia.

Attanasio, Orazio; Kugler, Adriana; Meghi, Costas, 2011, Subsidizing Vocational Training for Disadvantaged Youth in Colombia: Evidence from a Randomized Trial, General background document on issues in our research matrix, American Economic Journal: Applied Economics 3 (July 2011): 188–220, American Economic Journal: Applied Economics, Nashville Tennessee.

Barca, Valentina; Riemenschneider, Nils, 2012, Livelihoods and Food Security Trust Fund – DELTA 1 Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Multi Donor Livelihood and Food Security Trust Fund (LIFT), Myanmar.

Bugnion de Moreta, Christian; Pedraza Isaza, Daniel; Hongman; Lam Ba Nguyen, Zhang; Owusu; Sandra, Christian Bugnion de Moreta (Lead Evaluator), Daniel Pedraza Isaza, Hongman Zhang, Lam Ba Nguyen, Sandra Owusu, 2012, SCORE - Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

Caldeyro, Martin; Khafagy, Mohamed, 2013, Pro-poor horticulture value chains in Upper Egypt Final Joint Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

Cambronerio, Sergio; Midling, Michael; Molina, Francisco, 2012, Mid-term Evaluation-USAID Improving Access to Employment Program in El Salvador, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

Carravilla, Carlos, 2013, Alternatives to migration: Decent Jobs for Filipino youth Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

Cho, Yoonyoung;Honorati, Maddalena, 2013, Entrepreneurship Programs in Developing Countries: A Meta Regression Analysis, Meta-analysis of evaluations, World Bank Human Development Network Social protection and Labor Unit, Washington DC.

Consultative Group to Assist the Poor (2006), Good Practice Guidelines for Funders of Microfinance, Meta-analysis of evaluations, CGAP, The World Bank, Washington DC.

Dazé, Webb, Julie; Angie, 2010, Livelihood security in a changing climate: Insights from a program evaluation in Timor Leste, Impact evaluation, Evaluation covers analysis of evaluations of 4 projects in Timor Leste, CARE Australia, Melbourne.

Dhewa, Charles, 2016, Making knowledge needs visible through agricultural markets, General background document on issues in our research matrix, eMKambo, Knowledge Transfer Africa, Harare Zimbabwe.

Do, Evaluan, 2013, Gobernanza de la migración laboral y su vínculo con el desarrollo en Mali, Mauritania y Senegal – Evaluación final, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic: “Governance of labour migration and its links to Development in Mali, Mauritania and Senegal”.

Easterling, Tom; Foster, Brian; Delia Casco, Rita, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the USAID/Nicaragua Employment and Enterprise (E&E) Activity, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.

Sustainable Enterprise Programme - ILO (2014) Enabling Environment for Sustainable Enterprises. Available from the ILO Sustainable Enterprise Programme. ILO, Geneva.

Evalpartners, 2015, Evaluations that make a difference, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Publication released by: EvalPartners; African Development Bank Group; IDB; EES, Covered countries: Sri Lanka, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Kenya, Mexico, Nepal, the Netherlands, Canada.

FAizul, Kabir; Kabir, Golam, 2015, Digital Early Warning Systems to Save the Lives and Livelihoods of Communities of Bangladesh (DEWS), Final evaluation,Digital Early Warning Systems to Save the Lives and Livelihoods of Communities of Bangladesh (DEWS), Dhaka.

Feinstein International Center Friedman School of Nutrition Science and Policy Tufts University Africa Regional Office, 2015, Feed the Future Ethiopia External Mid-Term Performance, Evaluation Report, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.

Ferrari, Florence, 2015, Search For Common Ground (SFCG): Land Programming in Rwanda Final evaluation «Umurage w'Ejo, the Legacy for Tomorrow project: Land and Livelihood in

- Rwanda», and Midterm evaluation « Strengthen citizen participation around sensitive issues in order to prevent conflict in the Great Lakes Region», Midterm or interim evaluation, and Final evaluation, European Union & Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Brussels and The Hague, Projects: 1) Umurage w'Ejo, the Legacy for Tomorrow project: Land and Livelihood in Rwanda ; 2) Strengthen citizen participation around sensitive issues in order to prevent conflict in the Great Lakes Region, Rwanda.
- Flanagan, Valerie, 2014, Employment creation through small and medium scale enterprise development in Free State – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
- Gairdner, David; Al-Allaf, Riyadh; Mandelik, Florence, 2013, Independent Evaluation, The Republic Of Iraq, Evaluation of Micro Enterprises for Reintegration of Internally Displaced Persons in Thi Qar Governorate, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
- Global Migration Group, 2014, Migration and Youth – Challenges and Opportunities, Meta-analysis of evaluations, United Nations Children's Fund, online publication.
- Gourley, Deborah, 2012, Evaluation of NRC Food Security and Livelihoods Projects in Chipinge and Chiredzi Districts, Zimbabwe, 2011-12, Final evaluation, Norwegian Refugee Council, Oslo.
- Guardian, Edgar, 2014, Livelihood Restoration, Protection and Sustainable Empowerment of Vulnerable Peasant Communities in Sindh Province - Joint Midterm Review Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Guzman, Francisco L. et al, 2014, Independent evaluation of ILO Decent Work Country Programme Strategies and Activities in North Africa: 2010-2013, Thematic evaluation, ILO. Geneva, Covered countries: Algeria, Egypt, Eritrea, Libya, Morocco, South Sudan, Sudan and Tunisia.
- Guzman, Francisco L.; Lissner, Lothar; Zayzon, Réka, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy on occupational safety and health: Workers and enterprises benefit from improved safety and health conditions at work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
- Hall, Samuel, 2014, Evaluating IOM's Return and Reintegration Activities for Returnees and Other Displaced Populations Afghanistan, Meta-analysis of evaluations, IOM, Geneva.
- Hanafi, Hamouda B.; Pipe, Roger D., 2014, Final Performance Evaluation Of The Agriculture Program Of The Community Livelihoods Project (CLP), Final evaluation, USAID Washington, DC.
- Hanife Kurt; Nashashibi, Rana, 2013, Gender equality and women's empowerment in Palestine - Final Joint Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
- Harvey, Paul; Burton, Cynthia; Wilkinson, Laura, 2009, Strategic Evaluation of the Effectiveness of WFP Livelihood Recovery Interventions, Thematic evaluation, A Report from the Office of Evaluation, WFP, Brussels, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Colombia, Lesotho, Nepal, Uganda.
- Hempel, Hendrik, 2013, Evaluation Report Livelihoods and WASH improvement in the Border State of Northern Bahr el Ghazal, South Sudan, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.

- Hempel, Hendrik, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation Food security and livelihood support of war and drought affected population in the Red Sea State - Sudan, Midterm or interim evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
- Hempel, Kevin; Fiala, Nathan, 2012, Measuring Success of Youth Livelihoods Interventions: A Practical Guide to Monitoring and Evaluation, Other Evaluation, World Bank, Washington, DC, Project: Northern Uganda Social Action Fund (NUSAF) Youth Opportunities Programme in Uganda.
- Henry, Carla; Dearden, Philip N., 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote sustainable enterprises and decent work, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
- Heritage Resource, Incorporated, 2013, Improved livelihoods of empowered Namibian rural communities through cultural tourism - Final Joint Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Hoffman, Ilse, 2013, Evaluation of the project "Conflict sensitive transitional aid to stabilize sustainable livelihoods in Karamoja, Northeast Uganda", Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
- Holzaepfel, Erica A; Howe, Kimberly, 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of Livelihoods Programs for Returned Refugees in Burundi, Final evaluation, Social Impact Inc., Washington DC, Projects: 1) World Relief (WR) Livelihoods project; 2) Christian Outreach for Relief and Development (CORD) Livelihoods project; 3) Food for the Hungry (FH) Livelihoods project in Burundi.
- Holzaepfel, Erica A., 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of Livelihoods Programs for Refugees in Ethiopia, Final evaluation, Social Impact Inc., Washington, DC, projects: 1) International Rescue Committee (IRC) Livelihoods project; 2) Jesuit Refugee Services (JRS) Livelihoods project; 3) Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) Livelihoods project in Ethiopia.
- Holzaepfel, Erica A.; Jacobsen, Karen, 2015, Evaluating the Effectiveness of DOS/PRM Livelihoods Programs in Ethiopia and Burundi, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Social Impact Inc, Washington DC.
- Hsu, Lee-Nah, 2013, Improving safety and health at work through a Decent Work agenda, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Honduras, Malawi, Republic of Moldova, Ukraine, Zambia.
- i-TEC, 2011, Uganda Livelihoods And Enterprises For Agricultural Development (LEAD), Mid Term Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
- IFAD, 2015, Lessons learned Youth access to rural finance: Inclusive rural financial services, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Lessons Learned series is prepared by the IFAD Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD, Rome.
- ILO, 2015, Small and medium-sized enterprises and decent and productive employment creation Report IV, ILO-104th Session 2015, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
- ILO, 2014, Decent work results of ILO employment promotion interventions: lessons learned from evaluations, 2003-2013, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

- Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2013, Project Performance Assessment Report Tunisia Agricultural Support Services Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC.
- Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2014, Project Performance, Assessment Report Ghana Rural Financial Services Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC.
- Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2015, Project Performance Assessment Report India Ten Million Women and Counting: An Assessment of World Bank Support for Rural Livelihood Development in Andhra Pradesh, India, Final evaluation, World Bank, Washington DC, Projects: Andhra Pradesh District Poverty Initiatives Project; Andhra Pradesh Rural Poverty Reduction Project.
- Independent Evaluation Group - IEG Public Sector Evaluation, 2015, Project Performance Assessment Report Republic of Indonesia, Second Urban Poverty Project, Third Urban Poverty Project, Impact evaluation, World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Jafar, Salmar, 2013, Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
- Jersild, Amy, 2014, Good Governance through Labour Administration and Labour Inspection – Final Evaluation, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: China, Costa Rica, Indonesia, Lebanon, Namibia, South Africa, Ukraine, Vietnam.
- Jersild, Amy; Lazo, Lucita, 2013, Towards a child-labour-free Philippines: Building on past gains and addressing challenges – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Jersild, Amy; Takahashi, Taeko, 2013, Greener Business Asia Project – Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Thailand and Philippines.
- Jiménez, José Francisco, 2014, ILO-Sida Partnership 2012-2013: National Employment Policies (NEP) and Youth Employment (YE), Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Botswana, Comoros, Lesotho, Liberia, Malawi, Mozambique, Cambodia, Sri Lanka, El Salvador, Kyrgyzstan Yemen. El Salvador, Indonesia, Jordan Zambia.
- Johannson Núñez, Renato, 2011, Promotion of youth employment in Mozambique Final Joint Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
- Kabeer, Naila; Milwars, Kirsty and Sdarshan, Ratna, 2013, Organising women workers in the informal economy; General background document on issues in our research matrix, Routledge, London.
- Karuga, Stanley; Zimbizi, George, 2013, Skills for Youth Employment and Rural Development in Western and Southern Africa Programme (Zimbabwe Component) – Midterm evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Kavanagh, Frank; Ognjanov, Galjina; Petrera, Francesco, 2010, Youth Employment Partnership in Serbia (YEPS), Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

- Khanna, Madhulika; Kochhar, Nishtha; Palaniswamy, Nethra, 2015, A Retrospective Impact Evaluation of the Tamil Nadu Empowerment and Poverty Alleviation (Pudhu Vaazhvu) Project, Impact evaluation, The Journal of Development Studies, 51:9, 1210-1223, DOI: 10.1080/00220388.2015.1028538.
- Kronik, Jakob; Hays, Jennifer, 2012, Promoting and Implementing the Rights of the San Peoples of the Republic of Namibia - Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Kuzmin, Alexey, 2013, From the Crisis towards Decent and Safe Jobs in Southern Caucasus and Central Asia, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan.
- Lassine, Bamba, 2015, Good practices collection from Implementing Partners Part 1 AVSI (Civil Society / NGO) - 12 October 2015, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Research Network and Support Facility, Rome, Project: Projet integre d'appui a l'autonomisation des artisans de Côte d'Ivoire.
- Le Ry, Jean-Michel; Mibulumukini Kibuka, Dieudonné, 2014, Évaluation finale du projet République Démocratique du Congo: Appui au programme national de reconstruction de la RDC pour le rétablissement des conditions de vie et la consolidation de la paix, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
- Lightfoot, Michael; Rose, Aimee; Wafeq, Mainsha; Kamal, Burhamuddin; Santos, Ronald, 2015, Final Performance Evaluation and Sustainability Assessment of the Building Livelihoods and Trade (BLT) Activity, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
- Lund, Francie, WIEGO, 2009, Social Protection and the Informal Economy: Linkages and Good Practices for Poverty Reduction and Empowerment, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OECD, Paris, Good practices extracted from SEWA and StreetNet International projects in India.
- Mahy, Pierre, 2014, Tripartite Action for the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers (ASEAN TRIANGLE project) Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Project: Tripartite Action for the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers (ASEAN TRIANGLE project) in Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Myanmar, Philippines, Thailand and Viet Nam.
- Management Systems International, 2012, Women's Economic Empowerment: Balochistan, Final Evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
- Management Systems International (MSI), 2012, Women's Economic Empowerment: Balochistan Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
- Martin, John, 2014, Delivering Decent Work Results: a Meta-analysis of 15 ILO Decent Work Country Programme Reviews, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
- Martins, Christine; Khaing, Aye Aye, 2013, Evaluation Report Improved food and livelihood security for poor families in Pauk Township, Dry Zone, Burma / Myanmar, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.



- Mauer, Ralf, 2013, Decent work results and effectiveness of ILO technical cooperation: a meta-analysis of project evaluations, 2011–2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.
- McGowan, Aidan, 2015, Informal Economy Good Practices: Safe Threads Ethiopia, Other
- McKay, Claudia and Pickens, Mark, 2010, Branchless Banking 2010: Who's Served? At What Price? What's Next?, General background document on issues in our research matrix, CGAP, The World Bank, Washington DC.
- Melsbach; Gerlind; Joshi, Dilli Raj, 2015, Food Security and Disaster Risk Reduction for Marginalized People in Rural Areas of Eastern Nepal, Implemented by Rural Reconstruction Nepal Evaluation on behalf of Welthungerhilfe, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
- Mendez England & Associates, 2012, Final Evaluation of Business Environment Improvement (BEI) Project, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC, Covered countries: Kazakhstan, the Kyrgyz Republic (KR), Tajikistan.
- Mendez England & Associates, 2012, Final Performance Evaluation of USAID's "Cambodia Micro, Small And Medium-Sized Enterprises II/Business Enabling Environment" Project, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
- Meuer, Heike, 2015, Final Evaluation Report Enhancing food security and nutrition in and around Monrovia and Tubmanburg - "UPANI" in Liberia, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
- Mingoen, Hariette, 2012, Social Protection and Gender in Cambodia Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
- Mitchel, Lucy; Takahashi, Taeko T., 2012, Green Jobs in Asia – Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Indonesia, Nepal, Philippines, Sri Lanka.
- Mode, Matteo, 2014, Evaluation of ACF's Livelihood Projects in Abkhazia funded by UNHCR in 2011-2013, Final evaluation, ACF International, UNHCR, Geneva, Projects: 1) Vocational Training, Small Business start-up opportunities and promotion of Small-Holders' Association in Abkhazia, Samegrelo and Imereti - January-December 2011; 2) Support to livelihoods through agriculture and small business development - January-December 2012; 3) Improving self-reliance of vulnerable families through provision of IGA grants -January- December 2013 in Abkhazia (partially recognised as an independent state).
- Mountfield, Ben; Dalmau, Agnes, 2010, Evaluation Report for Spanish Red Cross Evaluation of Livelihoods Projects Sri Lanka Tsunami Specific Plan, Final evaluation, Spanish Red Cross, Madrid.
- Moussa Lam, Djibril, 2015, Good practices collection from Implementing Partners Part 1, Aide au Développement Gembloux (Civil Society / NGO) - 9 October 2015, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Research Network and Support Facility, Rome, Project: Offre de Services Intégrés en milieu Rural pour l'Inclusion Sociale (OSIRIS), Senegal.
- Mucheru-Karuri, Margaret; Krebs, Johann; Siddiqi, Abdul Bari, 2015, Final Performance Evaluation: Agricultural Credit Enhancement (Ace) Program in Afghanistan, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

- Mukurazita, Enet, 2015, Good practices collection from Implementing Partners Part 1, Young Africa Zimbabwe – October 2015, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Research Network and Support Facility, Rome, Project: Accelerated access to vocational skills training and decent employment in Zimbabwe.
- Munene, Charles, 2013, Improvement of livelihoods for vulnerable in urban and peri-urban areas of Galkayo – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Murray, Una, 2014, Making Decent Work a Reality for Domestic Workers Swedish funding towards Outcome 5, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Paraguay, India, Zambia, Tanzania and The Philippines.
- Newkirk, James, 2013, Edible oil value chain enhancement in Ethiopia Final Evaluation of the Joint Programme, Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Nycander, Lotta; Riechi, Andrew, 2013, Creating the enabling environment to establish models for child labour free areas in Kenya – Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Okumura, Yuka, 2013, Improving decent work opportunities for youth through knowledge and action (Work4Youth), Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Cambodia, Nepal, Samoa, Viet Nam - Armenia, Kyrgyzstan, FYR Macedonia, Republic of Moldova, Russian Federation, Ukraine - Brazil, Colombia, El Salvador, Jamaica, Peru - Egypt, Jordan, Occupied Palestinian Territories, Tunisia, Benin, Liberia, Madagascar, Malawi, Togo, Uganda, United Republic of Tanzania, Zambia.
- Pacheco Jiménez, José Francisco, 2013, Improving social protection and promoting employment, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Evaluation Summary on the topic “improving social protection and promoting employment in Burkina Faso, Cambodia and Honduras”.
- Poudyal, Lokendra; Upadhyay, Balkrishna; Karki, Laxmi, 2013, Final Report on the Mid – Term Evaluation of Livelihood Recovery for Peace (LRP/UNDP) Project, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, Kathmandu.
- Price, Jonathan, 2013, Community-Based Emergency Employment (Cash-for-Work) and Reconstruction Project (Philippines) – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Pringsulaka, Pamornrat, 2013, Enhancing Rural Access Project, Timor-Leste Independent Mid-Term Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Raoof Ali, Samia, 2013, Empowering Vulnerable Groups through Education, Employment and Training (EET) – Final Evaluation Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Reinprecht, Karin, 2013, Promoting rights and opportunities for people with disabilities in employment through legislation (PROPEL) Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, ILO, Geneva, Covered countries: Azerbaijan, Botswana, China, Ethiopia, Indonesia, Viet Nam, and Zambia.
- Resseguie, Robert; Hendricks, Larry; Nizami, Zareef; Paaeez, Waheedullah, 2011, Mid-Term Evaluation of Rural Finance and Cooperative Development Program- RUFCOD (Afghanistan), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.

- Rodriguez-Ariza, Carlos, 2014, Typhoon Bopha Philippines: Application of Local Resource- based Employment Generation Approach (PHI/12/08/AUS) and Joint Response Based Employment Generations and Livelihood Recovery Interventions (PHI/13/03/AUS), Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Rodríguez, Abelardor; Engels, Jeffrey; Mucha, Noreen; Malunga, Chiku, 2015, The Feed the Future Integrating Nutrition in Value Chains Project (Malawi) Performance Evaluation Final Report, Final evaluation, USAID, Washington, DC.
- Rum Ali, Mohamad; Young, Andrew, 2013, Independent Evaluation: Realizing minimum living standards for disadvantaged communities through peace building and village based economic development (Indonesia), Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
- Samaranayake, Mallika R.; Velupillai, Krishna, 2011, Mid- term Evaluation of Outcome 7: “Socio-economic recovery in the North and East” under the UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) 2008-2012 (Sri Lanka), Midterm or interim evaluation, UNDP, New York.
- Schoen, Christian; Mousaco, Vito, 2013, Business opportunities and support services (BOSS) - Midterm Evaluation (Timor Leste), Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.
- Sequitin, Rosario, 2015, End of Project Evaluation of “Preventing Trafficking in Persons through Sustainable Livelihood Recovery for Typhoon Affected People” Project, Final evaluation, World Vision, Washington DC.
- Social Impact, Inc. Corporate Office, 2011, Empowering Municipalities Through Local Economic Development (EMLED) & Municipal Capacity Building And Service Delivery Program (TAMKIN) Program Evaluation (Lebanon), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
- Social Protection & Labor The World Bank; Children & Youth, 2010, ACTIVE LABOR MARKET PROGRAMS FOR YOUTH, A Framework to Guide Youth Employment Interventions, General background document on issues in our research matrix, World Bank Employment Policy Primer November 2010, No. 16, World Bank, Washington DC.
- Stangl, Anne; Farley, Kathryn; Sievwright, Kirsty; Brady, Laura; Fritz, Katherine, 2015, Enhancing women’s entrepreneurship in Kenya: Initial qualitative assessment of the ILO’s GET Ahead business training programme (Kenya), Impact evaluation, ILO Geneva.
- Stockton, Gilles; McMillin, John; Desta, Solomon; Beyero, Mesfin; Tadele, Alemneh, 2012, Mid-Term Performance Evaluation of the Pastoral Livelihoods Initiative Phase II- PLI II (Ethiopia), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
- Sullivan, Frank; Apiyo, Regina; Mtoka, Samuel; Musila, F., 2014, Performance Evaluation of the Scaling Up Conservation And Livelihoods Efforts in Northern Tanzania Project, Final evaluation, USAID - Development Training Services, Inc., Washington DC.
- Summers, Guy, 2013, Palestinian Women’s Economic Empowerment Project – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva, Palestinian Women’s Economic Empowerment Project, Occupied Palestinian Territory.

Sustineo Pty Ltd (Ms Sue Allan and Ms Mary Mertin-Ryan, 2014, Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reform in Bangladesh (TVET-R) – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

Tango International, 2015, SHOUHARDO II Final Quantitative Performance Evaluation SHOUHARDO II Multi-Year Assistance Program (MYAP) in Bangladesh, Impact Evaluation, CARE Bangladesh, Dhaka.

Tessema, Ato Tsegahun; Tadess, Beyen; Getahun, Zewditu; Buta, Ato Mengistu, 2008, Mekele Livelihood Development Project MLDP (Ethiopia) phase II Evaluation Report, Final evaluation, Save the Children UK, Addis Ababa.

Thakur, Mini; Pandey, Brajesh; Trikha, Divya; Kumar, Poorvaja, 2013, Independent evaluation of the ILO's strategy to promote decent work in the Arab region: a cluster evaluation of Jordan, Lebanon and the Occupied Palestine Territory: 2008-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

UNAIDS, 2015, How AIDS changes everything: 15 years, 15 lessons of hope from the AIDS response, Thematic Evaluation, UNAIDS, Geneva.

UNHCR, 2011, Promoting Livelihoods and Self-reliance Operational Guidance on Refugee Protection and Solutions in Urban Areas, General background document on issues in our research matrix, UNHCR, Geneva.

UNICEF, 2015, Fact Sheet: the Right to Participation. New York: UNICEF. United Nations (2009), Convention on the Rights of the Child. CRC/C/GC/12 1 July 2009. Committee on the Rights of the Child Fifty-first Session, Geneva, 25 May; 12 June 2009.

UNIDO, 2014, Integration and progress through protection and empowerment of displaced groups in South Sudan, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

UNIDO, 2015, Reintegration for Liberian Returnees through Skills Training and Job Creation, Final Evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.

USAID, 2014, Ending extreme poverty in fragile contexts, Review of multiple projects and/or actions, Getting to Zero: A USAID discussion series, USAID, Washington DC.

Van de Velde, Martine, 2013, Skills Development and Employment Services for the Construction Sector in the Gaza Strip – Final Evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

Van Noord, H; Asmoro, P., 2013, Green Livelihood Access for Central Kalimantan's Inclusive Environmental Response to Climate Change- GLACIER (Indonesia), Final Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

Varela, Javier, 2013, Gender-sensitive Labor Mitigation Policies in the Nicaragua-Costa Rica-Panama and Haiti-Dominican Republic Corridors – Midterm Evaluation, Midterm or interim evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO, Geneva.

Voss, Eckhard; Gospel, Howard; Dornelas, Antonio; Vitols, Katrin, 2013, What works and why? : Results of a synthesis review of social dialogue interventions 2002-2012, Meta-analysis of evaluations, ILO, Geneva.

- Wicander, S;Coad, L., 2015, Learning our Lessons A Review of Alternative Livelihood Projects in Central Africa: Review of multiple projects and/or actions, International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources,Gland, Switzerland.
- Wolterstorff, Paul, 2014, Final Evaluation of the Project Vocational Education and Training for Inclusive Growth of Tribal Communities in East Indian States of Jharkhand, West Bengal and Orissa, Final evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
- Wolterstorff, Paul, 2015, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Project Promote and Strengthen Enterprises and Market Systems in Drought-Prone ASAL Areas in Kenya, Midterm or interim evaluation, Welthungerhilf, Bonn.
- The World Bank (2016), World Bank Business Environment Snapshots. Available from <http://rru.worldbank.org/besnapshots/Website> accessed May 15, 2016.
- Yousif, Fatima; Berthe, Elizabeth; Maiyo, Jacinta; Morawczynski, Olga, 2013, Best Practices in Mobile Microfinance, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Grameen Foundation; Institute For Money, Technology & Financial Inclusion, University of California, Irvine.
- Zegers, Mei, 2012, Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality-Southern Africa-Final Evaluation, Final evaluation, ILOGeneva, Covered countries: Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa.
- Zegers, Mei, 2014, Independent Final Evaluation Law-Growth Nexus Phase II: Labour Law and the Enabling Business Environmentfor MSMEs in Kenya and Zambia, Final evaluation, ILO, Geneva.
- Zegers, Mei, 2014, Responding effectively to the HIV/AIDS epidemic in the world of work: Country programmes – Final evaluation, Evaluation Summary, ILO,Geneva, Covered countries: Burundi, Cameroon, Chad, Ivory Coast, Democratic Republic of Congo, Ghana, Kenya, Madagascar, Morocco, Mozambique, Namibia, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, South Africa, Zambia, China, Indonesia, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Brazil, Guatemala, Jamaica, Ukraine, Tajikistan.
- Zegers, Mei, 2015, External Independent Interim Evaluation of Country Level Engagement and Assistance to Reduce (CLEAR) Child Labor Project, Midterm or interim evaluation, US Department of Labor, Washington DC, Covered countries: Bangladesh, Paraguay, Philippines, Suriname, Uganda.
- Zegers, Mei, 2016, Independent Final Evaluation of Ethiopians fighting against Child Exploitive Labor (E-Face), Final Report, US Department of Labor, O'Brien & Associates International, Washington DC.
- Zerhusen, Dirk, 2014, Sustainable Poverty Reduction and Food Security through Climate Change-Adapted Potato Production in Zerafshan Valley (Tajikistan), Impact Evaluation, Welthungerhilfe, Bonn.
- Zerhusen, Dirk, 2014, Evaluation Final Report Sustainable Poverty Reduction and Food Security through Climate Change-Adapted Potato Production in Zerafshan Valley, Final evaluation.

**Evaluations and other documents analysed by Vittorio Giorgetti:**

- Al Allaf, Riadh; Gairdner, David; Mandelik, Florence, 2012, Promotion of micro industries for accelerated and sustainable livelihood recovery – Ninewa Governate of Iraq (MISP-V), Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
- Alkire, S., Meinzen-Dick, R., Peterman, A., Quisumbing, A., Seymour, G., and Vaz, A., 2013, The Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OPHI Working Paper.58, OPHI (Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative), Oxford.
- Bangui, Cécile, 2014, Mid-term Evaluation of the Integrated Food Security Project in Kassala: Sudan (IFSP-Kassala) – GCP /SUD/069/CAN, Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO, Rome.
- Barrett, C., 2008, Smallholder market participation: Concepts and evidence from Eastern and Southern Africa, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Food Policy 33, USAID, Washington DC.
- Beck, G. & Davies, I., 2013, The Lead-Firm Model: Connecting smallholders to high-value markets in Tanzania, Final project/program report, Oxfam (online publication).
- Bellemare, M. F., 2012, As you sow, so shall you reap: The welfare impacts of contract farming, Thematic evaluation, World Development Volume 40 - Issue 7, Elsevier World Development, Amsterdam.
- Bernard, T., D.J. Spielman, A. S. Taffesse, & E. Gabre-Madhin, 2010, Cooperatives for Staple Crop Marketing: Evidence from Ethiopia, Impact evaluation, Research Monographs, International Food Policy Research Institute, Washington DC.
- Bishop, David, 2013, Evaluation of food security and strengthening livelihood options (Zimbabwe), Final evaluation, OXFAM, Oxford.
- Boly, A., 2015, On the benefits of formalization, panel evidence from Vietnam, Meta-analysis of evaluations, UN WIDER Paper 2015/038, United Nations University World Institute for Development Economics Research, Helsingfors (Finland).
- Bourdillon, M. F. C.; Hebinck, P.; Hoddinott, J.; Kinsey, W. B.; Marondo, J.; Mudege, N.; Owens, T., 2007, Assessing The Impact Of High-Yield Varieties Of Maize In Resettlement Areas Of Zimbabwe, Impact evaluation, Discussion Paper 181, IFPRI, Washington DC.
- Bruhn, M., 2011, License to Sell: The Effect of Business Registration Reform on Entrepreneurial Activity in Mexico, Review of multiple projects and/or actions, Review of Economics and Statistics, MIT, Chicago.
- Buhl-Nielsen Eric, Oskarsson Bertil, 2015, Evaluation of Swedish International Training Programme (ITP) 288, "The Role of Labour Market Policies in Poverty Alleviation" 2009-2015, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya and Mozambique.
- Bulteimer Bernd, Bakhtani Naserullah, 2013, Initiating Participatory Forestry in Support to Sustainable Livelihoods in Afghanistan - GCP /AFG/052/GER, Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.



- Carr, R. M., and Hartl, M., 2010, Lightening the Load: Labour-saving technologies and practices for rural women (African countries), General background document on issues in our research matrix, IFAD, Warwickshire.
- Chamberlin, J. & Jayne, T.S, 2012, Unpacking the Meaning of 'Market Access': Evidence from Rural Kenya, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Volume 41, January 2013, Pages 245–264, Elsevier World Development, Amsterdam.
- Datta, D., and Njuguna, J., 2009, Food security in HIV/AIDS response: Insights from Homa Bay, Kenya, Impact evaluation, Vol. 6, No.4, Journal of Social Aspects of HIV.
- De Los Rios, Carlos, 2014, Harnessing the Potential of the Nonfarm Economy for Smallholders in Latin America, Thematic evaluation, ELLA Policy Briefly, Practical Action, Lima, Evaluation focused on smallholder farmers and rural development in Latin American countries.
- De Mel, Suresh; McKenzie, David; Woodruff, Christopher, 2012, The demand for, and consequences of formalization among informal firms in Sri Lanka, Impact evaluation, IZA, Bonn, Field experiment in Sri Lanka about formalisation and its consequences.
- De Souza, R., Heinrich, G., Sebanja, P., Ogden, J., Mauambeta, D., Gelman, N., and Oglethorpe, 2008, Using Innovation To Address HIV, AIDS, And Environment Links: Intervention Case Studies From Zimbabwe, Uganda, and Malawi, Review of multiple projects and/or actions, Population and Environment 29: 219-246, Springer, New York.
- Deininger, K., S. Jin, & M. Sur, 2009, Sri Lanka's rural non-farm economy: Removing constraints to pro-poor growth, Final project/program report, Volume 35, Issue 12, Elsevier World Development, Sri Lanka.
- Denecke, Harry W., 2013, Support to household food security and livelihood of vulnerable and food insecure farming families - GCP /AFG/061/LUX (Afghanistan), Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.
- Dodo Aleke, Kiara Japhet & Baaru Mary, 2014, Enterprise Development for Rural Families Programme in Kenya, Final Report, Final evaluation, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Hand in Hand Eastern Africa's Enterprise Development for Rural Families (EDRF), Kenya.
- Dube, A., 2005, Participation Of Disabled People In The PRSP/PEAP Process In Uganda, Thematic evaluation, Disability Knowledge & Research, DFID, London.
- Evaluation Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Denmark, 2014, Evaluation of DANIDA Business to Business Programme 2006-2011, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Mali, Benin, China, Vietnam, Uganda, Bangladesh.
- Fajnzylber & Montes-Rojas, 2009, Does Formality Improve Micro-Firm Performance? Quasi-Experimental Evidence from the Brazilian SIMPLES Programme, Thematic evaluation, IZA, Bonn.
- Fajnzylber, P., W. Maloney and G. Montes Rojas, 2009, Releasing constraints to growth or pushing on a string? Policies and performance of Mexican micro-firms, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Journal of Development Studies.

- Fan, S. & Rao, N., 2003, Public spending in developing countries: trends, determination, and impact, Meta-analysis of evaluations, EPTD Discussion Paper, International Food Policy Research Institute, Washington DC.
- Farnworth, C., and Jiggins, J., 2003, Participatory Plant Breeding and Gender Analysis, Thematic evaluation, PPB Monograph No. 4, Centro Internacional de Agricultura Tropical (CIAT), Santiago de Cali (Colombia).
- Freguin-Gresh, S. d'Haese, M. & Anseeuw, W., 2012, Demythifying contract farming: Evidence from rural South Africa, Agrekon, Meta-analysis of evaluations, AGREKON- Volume 51, Issue 3, Agricultural Economics Association of South Africa (AEASA), Pretoria (South Africa).
- Gammage S., Diamond, N. and Packman, M., 2005, Enhancing Women's Access to Markets: An Overview of Donor Programs and Best Practices, Review of multiple projects and/or actions, GATE Analysis Document, USAID, Washington DC.
- Grunewald, Matthias, 2013, Small Farmer Livelihoods and Income Enhancement in Baghlan Province, Afghanistan – GCP /AFG/053/GER, Final evaluation, FAO, Rome, Project: FAO Rehabilitation of the Sugar Industry in Baghlan Afghanistan.
- Holden, S., Deininger, K., and Ghebru, H., 2007, Impact of Land Certification on Land Rental Market Participation in Tigray Region, Northern Ethiopia, Impact evaluation, MPRA Paper, Norwegian University of Life Sciences, Ås.
- Huang, J. & Reardon, T., 2008, Patterns in and determinants and effects of farmers' marketing strategies in developing countries. Regoverning Markets Small-scale producers in modern agrifood markets, Meta-analysis of evaluations, IIED, London.
- Karlan, D., & Zinman, J., 2007, Credit Elasticities in Less-Developed Economies: Implications for Microfinance, Thematic Evaluation, American Economic Review, 98(3): 1040-68 AEAWeb.
- Kenyon, T. & E. Kapaz, 2005, The Informality Trap, Thematic evaluation, World Bank Viewpoint Series, Note 301, World Bank, New York.
- Khot, Seemantinee, 2014, Mid-term evaluation of food security through enhanced agricultural production, diversified sources of income, value addition and marketing in Bangladesh (Mymensingh/Sherpur), Midterm or interim evaluation, FAO Rome.
- Loayza, N.V., L. Servén and N. Sugawara, 2010, Informality in Latin America and the Caribbean, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Policy Research Working Paper 4888, World Bank, Washington DC.
- Lombardini, Simone & Yoshikawa, Kanako, 2015, Impact evaluation of the project 'Piloting gender sensitive livelihoods in Karamoja' (Uganda), Impact evaluation, OXFAM's effectiveness review 2014/2015, OXFAM, Oxford.
- Lombardini, Simone, 2015, Impact evaluation of the project 'Scaling up sustainable livelihoods in Mindanao', Impact evaluation, OXFAM, Oxford.

- Madajewicz, Malgosia; Haile Tsegay, Asmelash; Norton, Michael, 2013, Managing Risks to Agricultural Livelihoods: Impact Evaluation of the Harita Program in Tigray, Ethiopia, 2009–2012, Impact evaluation, OXFAM America, Boston.
- Mc Culloch, 2009, Rural investment climate in Indonesia”; Rural Investment Climate in Indonesia, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore.
- McLellan, Iain & Bamwesigye, Jackson, 2012, Mid-Term Evaluation of the Akazi Kanoze Youth Livelihoods Project (Rwanda), Midterm or interim evaluation, USAID, Washington DC.
- New Agriculturist, 2013, Disability and Agriculture, General background document on issues in our research matrix, the Global Forum on Agricultural Research, Rome.
- OECD, 2009, Aid for Trade at a Glance 2009- Zimbabwe, General background document on issues in our research matrix, OECD, online publication.
- Orbicon A/S; GHK Consulting Limited; Pinto Consulting GmbH, 2011, Evaluation of the Danish Neighbourhood Programme with a focus on the Economic Development Portfolio, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Covered countries: Armenia, Kosovo, Serbia.
- Oxford Policy Management, 2014, Evaluation of the Business Sector Advocacy Fund Ghana, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen.
- Peterman, A., 2012, Widowhood and Asset Inheritance in Sub-Saharan Africa: Empirical Evidence from 15 Countries, Meta-analysis of evaluations, Volume 30, Issue 5, Development Policy Review.
- Rahman, A., 2014, Investment Climate Reforms and Job Creation in Developing Countries: What Do We Know and What Should We Do?, Thematic evaluation, World Bank Policy Research Working Paper, World Bank, New York.
- Reardon, T., 2012, The Quiet Revolution in Staple Food Value Chains in Asia: Enter the Dragon, the Elephant, and the Tiger, Meta-analysis of evaluations, International Food Policy Research Institute, Manila, Covered countries: East Asian countries.
- Sahan, E., and Fischer-Mackay, J., 2011, Making Markets Empower The Poor: Programme perspectives on using markets to empower women and men living in poverty, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Oxfam Discussion Papers, OXFAM, Oxford.
- Sahin, Sila; Prowse, Martin; Wigh, Nadia, 2014, Agriculture and Private Sector: Agriculture and growth evidence paper series, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Collection of studies concerning agricultural reforms and projects in several countries.
- Schwensen, Carl & Laurence, Alida, 2011, Evaluation of the Farmer Field School Approach in the Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II, Bangladesh, Final evaluation, Danida, Copenhagen, Project: Agriculture Sector Programme Support Phase II (ASPS II), Bangladesh.
- SIDA, 2013, From Paper to Practice: Learning from the journeys of inclusive business start-ups, Final project/program report, SIDA, Stockholm, Project: SIDA Innovation Against Poverty (IAP).

- Sorensen Pernille, Nagel, 2014, Supporting Food Security, Nutrition and Livelihoods in Sub-Saharan Africa - GCP /RAF/454/GER, Final evaluation, FAO, Rome.
- Stuart, G., Ferguson, M. & Cohen, M., 2011, Microfinance & Gender: Some Findings from the Financial Diaries in Malawi, Final project/program report, Microfinance Opportunities, Washington.
- Turrall, Susanne, 2013, A Study of Evidence in Mainstreaming Social Inclusion into Programmes Promoting Agricultural Productivity and Access to Markets among the Rural Poor, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID Rapid Desk-Based Review, DFID, London, Collection of projects and insights about: gender and agricultural productivity \ Gender and Access to Markets \ Vulnerable Social Groups Inclusion in several countries.
- UNIDO, 2014, Promoting livelihoods in North Eastern India: The cane and bamboo networking project, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
- UNIDO, 2015, Productive work for youth in Armenia – supporting young entrepreneurs, Midterm or interim evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
- UNIDO, Iraqi Programme, 2010, Enterprise Development and Investment Promotion Project, Final evaluation, UNIDO, Vienna.
- USAID, 2012, Gender Analysis and Assessment for Feed the Future Programming, General background document on issues in our research matrix, USAID Zimbabwe, Harare (Zimbabwe).
- Wanjala, Mathews Chirasha, 2011, Water vendors associations in informal settlements, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DEW Point Enquiry No.A0415, DEW, Northampton, Collection of studies concerning water supply in informal settlements in urban areas and water vendors associations, Covered countries: Tanzania, Kenya, Sudan, Ghana, Uganda.
- White, Simon & Fortune, Peter, 2015, Business Environment Reform and Poverty, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Evaluation on projects and reforms concerning labour law, tax system, administration and business registration rules, Covered countries: Mexico, Sri Lanka, Uganda, Vietnam, Brazil, Bolivia, Algeria, Indonesia, Zambia, Bangladesh, Ghana, Tanzania, India.
- White, Simon & Fortune, Peter, 2015, Business Environment Reform and Investment Promotion and Facilitation, Meta-analysis of evaluations, DFID, London, Evaluation on studies highlighting how firms react to reforms concerning business environment, Covered countries: Bolivia, China, Indonesia.
- Wiggins, S. & Keats, S., 2012, Leaping and Learning, Linking Smallholders to Markets in Africa, General background document on issues in our research matrix, Draft Report, Overseas Development Institute, London.
- World Bank, 2013, Growing Africa. Unlocking the Potential of Agriculture, General background document on issues in our research matrix, World Bank, New York.

Zeng, Meng, 2013, Impact Evaluation of the Small Loan Component of IFRC/RCSC Livelihood Recovery Project In Sichuan, Impact evaluation, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, Geneva.

**Cover photo:** Subhadraben, one of millions of informal workers in India, makes beedis (a type of cigarette) in the alley outside her house in Ahmedabad. Photo by WIEGO



---

## LEARNING FROM EXPERIENCE (part 2)

This volume covers an analysis of good practices and lessons learned extracted from 202 non-EC funded projects. They include 171 mid-term, final, and impact evaluations as well as meta evaluations of large numbers of projects. Projects from Africa, Asia, Latin America and Eastern Europe were reviewed. Funding and implementing agencies of the analysed projects included the ILO, World Bank, USAID, DFID, WFP, UNIDO and FAO.

The good practices and lessons learned with their corresponding concrete recommendations are organised in line with the RNSF Research Matrix.

The recommendations are related to the following areas: enabling environment; decent work and enterprise growth; direct actions in communities; approaches to enhance livelihoods, equity and social inclusion.

The Research, Network and Support Facility (RNSF) is a European Union-funded project to improve knowledge on ways to enhance the livelihoods of people in the informal economy and to increase the social inclusion of vulnerable groups. It supported 15 projects in 13 countries funded by the EU Thematic Programme "Investing in People" and conducted research, identified best practices and facilitated information sharing and networking on the Informal Economy. RNSF research findings are organized in four levels: 1) Theories and concepts around the Informal Economy and related topics; 2) Approaches and recommendations from institutions and worldwide stakeholders working on the topic of the Informal Economy; 3) Good practices and lessons learned arising from the projects supervised by the RNSF team, as well as from other projects on the informal economy funded by the EU; 4) Thematic Monographies on Key Topics that combine theoretical analysis, presentation of successful cases, and recommendations.

All volumes are available here: <https://europa.eu/capacity4dev/rnsf-mit>